MEETING OF ACADEMIC BOARD

Wednesday 24th October 2018

MINUTES

PRESENT:
President and Provost (Chair)

Dr Ali Abolfathi; Dr Bojan Alekov; Professor Jonathan Ashmore; Dr Paul Ayris; Dr Elinor Bailey; Mr Malcolm Bailey; Dr Jyoti Belur; Professor Stephanie Bird; Professor Ann Blandford; Dame Nicola Brewer; Dr Geraldine Brodie; Ms Cathy Brown; Professor Stella Bruzzi; Professor Jon Butterworth; Ms Elizabeth Carter; Dr Evangelia Chrysikou; Dr Elisabete Cidre; Dr Coziana Ciurtin; Professor Lucie Clapp; Ms Amy Clemens; Dr Alun Coker; Ms Sonja Curtis; Dr Jason Davies; Dr Lee De-Wit; Dr Vanessa Diaz; Professor Snezana Djordjevic; Ms Dominique Drai; Professor Frances Edwards; Professor Susan Evans; Dr Russell Evans; Professor Elizabeth Fisher; Dr Richard Freeman; Dr Rachael Frost; Dr Martin Fry; Dr Tommaso Gabrieli; Dr Andrew Gardner; Dr Claire Garnett; Dr Hugh Goodacre; Professor Serge Guillias; Dr Lucia Gunning; Mr Martin Hall; Dr Eleanore Hargreaves; Dr Jennifer Hazelton; Dr Borja Legarra Herrero; Dr Vicky Hilborne; Mr Jack Hindley; Dr Arne Hofmann; Professor Katherine Holt; Ms Lori Houlihan; Dr Thomas Kador; Dr Lily Kahn; Professor Brad Karp; Ms Leigh Kilpert; Dr Franz Kiraly; Dr Tom Kitching; Mr Rex Knight; Ms Katherine Koulle; Dr Christopher Leung; Dr Dewi Lewis; Dr Helga Luthersdottir; Professor Sandy MacRobert; Mr Simon Mahony; Ms Bella Malins; Dr Nephtali Marina-Gonzalez; Dr Margaret Mayston; Dr Claire McAndrew; Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia; Professor Usha Menon; Dr Susan Moore; Professor Ruth Morgan; Ms Ema Muk-Pavic; Professor Michael Munday; Professor Moses Oketch; Professor Enrico Palandri; Dr Anne Peasey; Professor Alan Penn; Ms Carmai Pestell; Professor Hynek Pikhart; Dr Michael Porter; Dr Stephen Potts; Professor David Price; Professor Sarah Price; Ms Oksana Pyzik; Professor Geraint Rees; Dr Carol Rivas; Professor Helen Roberts; Dr Anna Roffey; Professor Sasha Roseneil; Dr Suzanna Ruddy; Dr Benet Salway; Professor Joanne Santini; Professor Ralf Schoepfer; Professor David Shanks; Professor Elizabeth Shepherd; Dr Beatrice Sica; Dr Bill Sillar; Professor Michael Singer; Professor Lucia Sivilotti; Professor Joy Sleeman; Professor Anthony Smith; Professor Alice Sullivan; Dr Kristza Szendroi; Dr Andrew Thomson; Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker; Dr Ahmed Toosy; Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson; Dr Hans van de Koot; Dr Nalini Vittal; Dr Bella Vivat; Dr Jo Waller; Professor Susan Ware; Dr Hannah Williams; Professor Andrew Wills; Dr Paola Zaninotto; Dr Martijn Zwijnenburg.

In attendance: Mr Derfel Owen (Secretary to Academic Board); Anne Marie O’Mullane; Mr David Burrows (Slade School of Fine Art); Mr Phil Harding (Director of Finance and Business Affairs).
Apologies for absence were received from: Ms Ana Abram; Professor James Bainbridge; Professor Gianluca Baio; Dr Michael Baron; Professor Wendy Best; Dr Herve Borriion; Ms Louise Brown; Ms Nadia Bukhari; Professor D'Maris Coffman; Dr Martin Davies; Professor Julio Davila; Dr Rachele De Felice; Professor Jan Derry; Ms Evelyn Eguridu; Professor Mark Emberton; Professor Becky Francis; Professor Nikolaos Gonis; Professor Helen Hackett; Dr Andrew Harris; Dr Anja Heilmann; Dr Evangelos Himonides; Mr Ambrose Hogan; Professor Robert Kleta; Dr Sandra Leaton Gray; Professor Wei Li; Dr Claire Lindsay; Dr William Locke; Professor David Lomas; Dr Elvira Mambetisaeva; Professor Gesine Manuwald; Dr Anna Mavrogianni; Professor Robert Mills; Professor Jenny Mindell; Professor Henrietta Moore; Dr Mark Newman; Dr Joanne Pearce; Dr Rosie Peppin Vaughan; Professor Greta Rait; Ms Fiona Ryland; Professor Andreas Schaefer; Professor Lorraine Sherr; Ms Jamie Smith; Professor Kaila Srai; Professor Sacha Stern; Dr Tse-Hui Teh; Professor Alan Thompson; Mr Simon To; Ms Louise Vink; Professor Sarah Walker; Dr Carla Washbourne; Mr Michael Wozniak; Professor Dominic Wyse; Dr Jinghao Xue; Professor Tarek Yousry; Dr Stan Zochowski.

Key to abbreviations

| AB       | Academic Board                        |
| AC       | Academic Committee                    |
| EdComm   | Education Committee                   |
| GCAB     | Governance Committee of Academic Board|
| HE       | Higher Education                      |
| HEIs     | Higher Education Institutions         |
| ISD      | Information Services Division         |
| JEP      | Joint Evaluation Panel                |
| OIA      | Office for the Independent Adjudicator|
| OVPESA   | Office for the Vice-Provost (Education & Student Affairs) |
| SMT      | Senior Management Team                |
| SU       | Student Unions                        |
| USS      | Universities' Superannuation Scheme   |
| UUK      | Universities UK                       |
| VP       | Vice-Provost                          |
| WG       | Working Group                         |

PRELIMINARY BUSINESS

1. TERMS OF REFERENCE, CONSTITUTION AND MEMBERSHIP 2018-19  
   [Papers 2-01-2-02, 2018-19]
   1.1 Received: AB’s term of reference, constitution and membership for the session 2018-19.

2. ACADEMIC COMMITTEE TERMS OF REFERENCE, CONSTITUTION  
   [Paper 2-03, 2018-19]
   2.1 Received: AC terms of reference and constitution for the session 2018-19.
3. GCAB TERMS OF REFERENCE AND CONSTITUTION
[Papers 2-04, 2018-19]

3.1 Received: GCAB’s terms of reference and constitution for the session 2018-19.

4. COMMISSION OF INQUIRY TERMS OF REFERENCE
[Papers 2-05, 2018-19]

4.1 Received: The terms of reference for the Commission of Inquiry.

4.2 Approved: The request of the Commission of Inquiry, which met on the 17th October 2018, to include the underlined text from the original motion text establishing the Commission of Inquiry, to the terms of reference:

The Commission of inquiry was established by Academic Board to review the problems reported in UCL’s governance, decision-making, and strategic direction, and to establish their accuracy and causes and, where necessary, to make recommendations for AB to approve a way forward, addressing any genuine problems, in light of academic values and UCL’s academic mission, and in the spirit of transparency and accountability to the academic body.

5. COMMISSION OF INQUIRY MEMBERSHIP
[Papers 2-06, 2018-19]

5.1 Received: A note on the membership the Commission of Inquiry member.

5.2 Approved: The request to use one of the existing vacancies from the Heads of Academic Unit constituency so that Dr Helga Luthersdottir could be appointed to the Commission of Inquiry. AB requested that elections be run to fill the remaining vacancies on the Commission of Inquiry.

6. MINUTES OF 2nd MAY 2018

6.1 The minutes of the 2nd May 2018 meeting were approved.

7. MINUTES OF 14th MAY 2018

7.1 The minutes of the 14th May 2018 meeting were approved.

8. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES
[Papers 2-07, 2018-19]

8.1 Chair’s Action Report

Received a report on action taken by the Chair on behalf of AB following a consultation with AB to approve the interpretation of category (f) of the
membership of the AB Commission of Inquiry “Elected members of AB (6)” as 6 members elected by and from the whole membership of AB.

9. MINUTES OF 3rd OCTOBER 2018

9.1 The minutes of the 3rd October 2018 meeting were approved.

10. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

[ Papers 2-07, 2018-19 ]

10.1 The Chair confirmed that Council had agreed to accept the JEP recommendations, and was prepared to accept an employer contribution of 20.1% for the maintenance of existing benefits. This response would be submitted to UUK before the consultation concluded on the 30th October 2018. The Director of Finance & Business Affairs, Mr Phil Harding, provided an update on possible next steps following the conclusion of the consultation on the JEP consultation.

10.2 The Chair confirmed that Council had received the minutes of AB’s meeting and noted the comments and suggestions that went further than the specific consultation questions. Council agreed that deductions made from the salary of staff who participated in strike action should not be re-paid as it would set a precedent for future actions. Council agreed it would not be appropriate for UCL to pay the increase in the employee’s contribution as it was important to maintain the 65/35 split in contributions. This principle should also apply to any future “pension holiday”. Council had taken this decision against the backdrop of the balloting taking place for industrial action on pay. AB members expressed disappointment with Council’s decision.

Matter for Discussion

11. PROVOST’S BUSINESS

[ Papers 2-08, 2018-19 ]

11A Enrolment

11A.1 There had been a very strong recruitment round this year at undergraduate and postgraduate level. There were 5,563 UG student enrolments. While there had been a drop in UG UK students, there had been an increase in EU and International UG student enrolments. These numbers were secured without needing to adjust or soften UCL’s entry requirements.

11B Applications

11B.1 The first indications of student applications for 2019 entry appeared to be a buoyant with an increase in applications of 10.9% compared to the same point last year and an increase of 26% compared to the same point 2 years ago.
First National Teaching Fellowship Award

Dr Jenny Marie, UCL Arena, has been awarded a National Teaching Fellowship by the Higher Education Academy; a first for UCL. AB congratulated Dr Marie for this significant achievement.

Hult Prize

Four UCL students, had won the 2018 HULT prize. They beat over 2000 teams worldwide to be awarded $1 million to make their business idea a reality. With the support of UCL Innovation and Enterprise, they founded a company which offered rice farmers an innovative way of funding the efficient treatment of rice crops. AB congratulated the students for their excellent achievement.

PRINCIPAL THEME TWO REPORT: VICE-PROVOST (EDUCATION & STUDENT AFFAIRS) ANNUAL REPORT TO COUNCIL

The Chair decided to take this item out of order, as Council at its meeting on the 10th October 2018 had requested a report from AB on proposals to improve student engagement and satisfaction.

Received: An update on progress towards achieving Principal Theme 2, “A global leader in the integration of research and education, underpinning an inspirational student experience” from the VP (Education & Student Affairs), Professor Anthony Smith.

Professor Smith reported on progress with delivery of key actions that supported progress for this theme and achievement of the UCL Education Strategy. There was an increase in teaching space capacity and study spaces, however, there was more work to be done. Improvements had been made to the student records system as a result of a huge effort by many staff and there was now a definitive and reliable record of modules offered at UCL. This would enable a single source of truth for key processes such as assessment and timetabling as well as being beneficial for students when selecting modules. An update was provided on subject-level TEF and the Annual Student Experience Review process where OVPESA had met with every department to discuss how best to support departments’ needs.

While Council had welcomed the progress that had been made in performance on NSS scores it had been concerned with the pace of improvement in performance and the variability in performance across the institution. This was particularly in the context of the introduction of Subject-Level TEF. Council recognised there needed to be a culture change if performance was to be of the magnitude required.

During discussion the following points were made:

- Change fatigue: There had been a lot of change initiatives recently and academic units felt the need for a period of stability.
• **Student representation:** There was a need for better partnership with democratically elected students with a need for deeper involvement in management and department levels as well as enhanced cooperation on the strategy to improve the student experience. It was characteristic of high-performing HEIs to have a strong SU which had excellent relationships with the HEI and for this to be reflected in the relationship at Faculty and Department level.

• **Assessment and feedback:** Students often didn’t recognise that they were getting feedback and how to use it. It was necessary to engage in a dialogue with students to address misunderstandings and understand student expectations. UCL Arena Assessment and Feedback myth-busting event was found to be quite useful.

• **The need for autonomy to retain best practice:** Changes to student representation system in a particular department had caused some difficulties. A one size fits all approach did not always work. It was confirmed that the OVPESA Office would be respectful of the need for frameworks to allow for best practice to be retained.

• **Lecture Cast:** Following queries on the establishment of an AB working group, it was confirmed that a Project Board had been established on Lecture Cast led by Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson and Professor Andrew Wills. The Project Board was made up of academic and professional services staff. The Project Board would be focussing on what was technically possible and a policy on use. The working group would report to AB and EdComm. It was clarified that there had been a commitment in the Education Strategy for Lecture Cast use to be expanded rather than there being an approved Lecture Cast Policy.

• **Module Codes:** Changes to module codes had been confusing and there had been a loss of valuable information due to the change without a clear articulation of the benefits of the change. The Director of Academic Services thanked staff for their assistance in supporting this change and acknowledged the amount of work involved for staff. The change in module codes was required in order to use the functionality of the student records system appropriately and to enable enhancements in key processes such as building class lists, linking with Moodle, managing assessment and progression processes. Benefits from this change would include improve functionality for assessment and sharing of marks.

• **Proposed 2U agreement:** There was a query on the revenue stream for the proposed 2U agreement which was intended to deliver an online MBA. It was also queried whether the material would be produced and owned by UCL academic staff. While it was not appropriate to comment on specifics of the revenue shares, it was confirmed that there was a clear revenue stream and that the material was produced and owned by UCL staff.

• **Module evaluation:** Feedback was provided on the value of Department’s engaging in module evaluation and fine grain student surveys to identify and address issues. Such an exercise had allowed one department to identify variations in the quality of provision and to take appropriate action.

12.6 Professor Smith confirmed that he would welcome further feedback from AB members on this matter.
13. DRAFT ACADEMIC BOARD STANDING ORDERS
[Papers 2-09, 2018-19]

13.1 **Received:** A set of draft Standing Orders of AB, produced by GCAB, which were intended to clarify the practice of the Academic Board and provide certainty where there have been gaps in the rules, their interpretation, or application.

13.2 The Secretary of Council had written to the Chair of GCAB outlining concerns whether certain standing orders conflicted with the Charter and Statutes. Clarification had also been sought on the wording of some of the standing orders. The Chair of AB found it to be not a good use of AB time to go through the Standing Orders line-by-line at this stage. Instead, the matter would be taken off line and the Secretary of Council would work with the authors of the Standing Orders to ensure these concerns were addressed in advance of the second reading of the Standing Orders in February 2019.

14. RE-APPOINTMENT OF THE DEAN OF STUDENTS (ACADEMIC)
[Papers 2-08, 2018-19]

14.1 **Received:** A paper on the proposed re-appointment of Professor Anthony Smith, VP (Education & Student Affairs) as the Dean of Students (Academic) for a term extending from 1 October 2017 (retrospectively) to 30 September 2021 inclusive.

14.2 GCAB had produced a memo with a set of recommendations for AB’s consideration:

- To expand the scope of the WG on Charter and Statutes to produce a report to AB on the future of the Office of Dean of Students (Academic), with recommendations;

- To recommend the reappointment of the VP (Education & Student Affairs) as Dean of Students (Academic) for a total of two years (last and current academic year), and re-consider its position once the report by the WG had been received.

14.3 The Secretary to Council outlined the role of the Dean of Students. The role had always sat within the management framework. As the role of the VPESA had responsibility for improving the student experience, it was appropriate for the VPESA to have this role.

14.4 AB supported the recommendations of GCAB. The Secretary to Council would convey these views to Council.

**Matters for approval or information**
15. PROPOSED UCL POLICY ON NAMING OR RE-NAMING OF UNIVERSITY BUILDINGS AND SPACES

[Paper 2-17, 2018-19]

15.1 Received: a proposed policy for recommendation to Council on naming or re-naming of university buildings and spaces.

16. RE-NAMING OF THE INSTITUTE FOR WOMEN’S HEALTH

[Paper 2-18, 2018-19]

16.1 Received: A proposal for recommendation to Council, to change the name of the “UCL Institute for Women’s Health” (IfWH) to the “UCL Elizabeth Garrett Anderson Institute for Women’s Health” with effect from the 1st October 2018.

17. PROPOSED CHANGE TO THE REGULATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT

[Paper 2-21, 2018-19]

17.1 Received: A proposal to make changes to the Regulations for Management.

18. ELECTED MEMBERSHIP OF COUNCIL

[Paper 2-22, 2018-19]

18.1 Received: An update on the arrangements with respect to Professor Pikhart’s Council membership.

19. STUDENT COMPLAINTS PROCEDURE

[Paper 2-23, 2018-19]

19.1 Received: Proposal for the amendment to the Student Complaints Procedure at the request of the OIA.

20. STUDENT SUSPENSIONS AND EXCLUSIONS

[Paper 2-24, 2018-19]

20.1 Received: The report of student suspensions and exclusion in the academic year 2017-18.

21. MINUTES OF COUNCIL

[Paper 2-25, 2018-19]

21.1 Received: The Council minutes for the meeting held on the 5th June 2018.

22. MINUTES OF ACADEMIC COMMITTEE

[Paper 2-26, 2018-19]

22.1 Received: The Academic Committee minutes for the meeting held on the 20th February 2018.
23. **MINUTES OF GCAB**  
*[Paper 2-27. 2018-19]*

23.1 **Received:** The minutes of GCAB held on 21\(^{st}\) February 2018 and 23\(^{rd}\) April 2018.

24. **AWARDS AND PRIZES TO UCL STAFF**  
*[Paper 2-28. 2018-19]*

24.1 **Received:** Details of awards, appointments, elections and honours relating to UCL staff since the last report to UCL.

25. **LIST OF RECENT APPOINTMENTS**  
*[Paper 2-29. 2018-19]*

25.1 **Received:** A list of appointments (i) of Heads of Academic Departments, and (ii) to established Chairs tenable at UCL.

26. **CHAIR’S ACTION (INCLUDING ACADEMIC BOARD WORKING GROUPS ON ESTABLISHED CHAIRS AND RELATIONSHIPS)**  
*[Paper 2-30. 2018-19]*

26.1 **Received:** A note of action taken by the Chair on behalf of Academic Board since the last report.

27. **DATES OF MEETINGS IN THE COMING YEAR**

27.1 The Provost decided to convene a further meeting of Academic Board in order to consider the remaining items of business that were timed out. The Academic Board secretariat will be

27.2 Upcoming scheduled meetings for Academic Board were as follows:

- **Wednesday 6 February 2019 2.05 – 4.00pm, Christopher Ingold Building, Auditorium XLG2**
- **Wednesday 15 May 2019 2.05 – 4.00pm, Christopher Ingold Building, Auditorium XLG2**

**DERFEL OWEN**  
Director of Academic Services and Secretary to Academic Board  
Tel: 0203 1088209, UCL ext. 58209  
Email: d.owen@ucl.ac.uk  
7 November 2018