



HUMAN RESOURCES POLICY COMMITTEE

Wednesday 26 March 2014

MINUTES

Present:

Professor Michael Arthur (Chair)
Professor Stephen Caddick
Professor Richard Catlow
Professor Mary Collins
Professor Anthony Finkelstein
Professor Mary Fulbrook
Professor Dame Hazel Genn
Mr Phil Harding
Professor Graham Hart
Mr Rex Knight
Professor David Lomas
Professor David Price
Professor Anthony Smith
Professor Sir John Tooke

Apologies for absence were received from: Professor Alan Penn, Professor Alan Thompson and Professor Jo Wolff.

In attendance: Ms Dilly Fung (Director, CALT - for Minute 17); Mr Gary Hawes (Secretary); Mr Geoff Lang (Director, Director, Policy and Planning, Human Resources); Mr Nigel Waugh (Director of Human Resources)

Key to abbreviations

CALT Centre for the Advancement of Learning and Teaching
HEA Higher Education Academy
HRPC Human Resources Policy Committee
IoE Institute of Education
JCNG Joint Consultative and Negotiating Group
PGTA Postgraduate Teaching Assistant
QAA Quality Assurance Agency
TLHPE Postgraduate Certificate in Teaching and Learning in Higher and Professional Education

15 MINUTES OF 15 JANUARY 2014 MEETING

Confirmed:

15.1 The Minutes of the previous meeting of HRPC held on 15 January 2014 [*HRPC Mins.10-14, 15.1.14*].

16 MATTERS ARISING

16.1 There were no matters arising from the previous meeting's Minutes.

17 UCL ARENA PROGRAMME

Received:

- 17.1 The report at HRPC 3-1 (13-14), introduced by the Director of CALT.

Reported:

- 17.2 From September 2014, the UCL Arena programme would provide an inclusive and coherent but flexible suite of developmental events and activities for UCL staff whose role involved teaching, supervising and/or supporting students' learning. The programme, which had been accredited by the HEA, would aim to build on excellence at UCL in teaching, supervision, education leadership and wider aspects of academic practice and would be underpinned by the principle of sharing expertise across departments and Faculties. The programme would also provide UCL with the scope to shape staff developmental activities around research-based teaching in a way that would enable it to meet its own strategic priorities.
- 17.3 The programme would feature special provision for PGTAs *via* the UCL Arena One strand, including mandatory Gateway Workshops, designed to prepare PGTAs for teaching responsibilities and introduce them to methods in and approaches to teaching and learning, and an optional Teaching Associate Programme aimed at PGTAs with a more substantive teaching role. Based on their attendance of the Teaching Associate Programme, participants would have the opportunity to apply for a UCL Arena Associate Fellowship as well as the nationally recognised HEA Associate Fellowship. While PGTA participation in the Gateway Workshops offered through the UCL Arena One strand would constitute the minimum required attendance of a professional development activity required by the QAA, it was also proposed that UCL faculties should be required to supplement this with appropriate additional support for their PGTAs equating to three hours of further development, guidance and/or mentoring.
- 17.4 Other strands of the UCL Arena programme would include:
- UCL Arena Two – which would give Lecturer and Teaching Fellows staff on probation the opportunity through the Academic Practice Pathway to fulfil their probationary requirements and gain a recognised practice-based teaching qualification in the form of an HEA Fellowship. The Academic Practice Pathway had been developed in full discussion and consultation with the IoE and would give probationary staff the option to choose between this route or the existing TLHPE route for gaining their teaching qualifications.
 - UCL Arena Open – an open programme of events and activities for more experienced staff who were involved in teaching and/or supporting students' learning or leading on teaching, based on investigating approaches to research-based educational practice in subject disciplines through peer dialogue and teaching observations. This would give participants the opportunity to apply for HEA Associate Fellowship, Fellowship or Senior Fellowship, to gain formal professional recognition for their experience and expertise.
- 17.5 The Director of CALT also drew attention to the following:
- Early-career researchers who were also designated roles as PGTAs would have the option of participating in the programme through the UCL Arena One or UCL Arena Open routes.
 - CALT would welcome expressions of interest from UCL colleagues in being enlisted to serve as potential contributors to the delivery of the UCL Arena programme.

- While resources were in place for the start-up of the programme, it might be necessary to review these at the end of the first or second year.

Discussion:

17.6 HRPC welcomed and supported the proposed introduction of the UCL Arena programme, including:

- The introduction of UCL Arena One for PGTAs and mandating the attendance of PGTAs at Gateway Workshops and the requirement for faculties/departments to provide appropriate additional support for PGTAs (see Minute 17.3 above);
- The minor change to UCL's existing Induction and Probation Policy proposed at Appendix 2 of HRPC 3-1 (13-14) to describe the Academic Practice Pathway option provided by UCL Arena Two alongside the existing TLHPE programme option;
- The promotion of the UCL Arena Open programme to all UCL staff and endorsement of the opportunity that it would provide for colleagues who were leaders in education-related roles to gain reward and recognition for their successful leadership practice through a HEA Senior Fellowship.

17.7 It was agreed that it would be important to champion and promote the UCL Arena programme to achieve buy-in from UCL faculties and departments and to ensure that information on the programme and its developmental opportunities was cascaded down to all staff. To this end, it was proposed that Faculty Head of Department meetings (or other Faculty 'roadshow' type events) could be used to help to disseminate information on the programme and facilitate discipline-specific feedback. Other fora and media for introducing and promoting the programme to staff could also include the Provost's Learning and Teaching Taskforce meetings, *The Week @UCL*, and the Introduction to UCL staff induction programme.

17.8 Other points raised during discussion included the following:

- A number of UCL departments had already developed initial training workshops for PGTAs. In these instances, there would need to be a dialogue between CALT colleagues and these areas around the complementarity of these programmes with UCL Arena One.
- It would be important to ensure that opportunities for involvement in the UCL Arena programme were extended to clinical staff and external professionals who were involved in delivering and supporting teaching on UCL programmes and that the programme was flexible in providing pathways/opportunities for these staff.
- There would be opportunities to link the UCL Arena programme with UCL's staff appraisal and promotion processes. The programme might also be useful for helping to inform criteria around the different levels of teaching that were linked to academic staff promotion.

18 PERFORMANCE, DEVELOPMENT AND CAREER PLANNING FRAMEWORK

Received:

18.1 The discussion paper at HRPC 3-2 (13-14), introduced by the Director, Policy and Planning, Human Resources.

Reported:

18.2 The paper at HRPC 3-2 (13-14) invited the initial views of HRPC on a proposed performance, development and career planning framework for UCL staff which would

be aimed at assisting managers and staff across UCL to have meaningful, focused discussions around performance, personal development and career planning.

18.3 The paper proposed initial discussion on the following possible elements that might make up such a framework:

- A revised staff appraisal process
- A new career pathways framework
- A core behaviours framework
- Performance ratings and links to reward
- Other perceived 'pain points' in the current performance management and staff development processes at UCL which need to be addressed.

18.4 Feedback from members of HRPC would be used to inform a more detailed proposal for consideration by HRPC at its next scheduled meeting in July 2014. Although no timescales were currently envisaged, there would also be the opportunity for wider staff consultation on the proposals within UCL in due course

Discussion:

18.5 While a number of different views were expressed during discussion, there was general agreement that:

- It would be necessary in the first instance to discuss and address issues around policy and process in relation to staff appraisal and performance management before focusing on the specifics of content. This would include discussions around the expected role of Heads of Department and other senior managers in staff appraisal and performance management, along with training and support requirements for this;
- The development of a staff performance, development and career planning framework would involve a significant agenda of work which would need to be implemented in phases;
- There should be a requirement of annual appraisal for all staff as a basis for transparent and consensual discussion and review around objective setting and performance;
- Use of the option for 360 degree appraisal should be further explored, as should the option for introducing a more performance-related approach for staff on Grades 1-9 (although there was no support for introducing performance ratings or linking performance to pay);
- It might be helpful to assign a working group to consider issues around the current staff appraisal process;
- There should be further discussions around addressing the perceived lack of career progression pathways for professional support staff.

RESOLVED:

18.6 That members of HRPC be invited to submit their further views and comments on discussion paper at HRPC 3-2 (13-14) to the Director of HR outside the meeting.

ACTION: HRPC members

19 INTERNSHIP AND SICKNESS ABSENCE POLICY

Received:

19.1 The report at HRPC 3-3 (13-14), introduced by the Director of HR.

Reported:

- 19.2 Proposed revisions to UCL's Sickness Absence Policy and Internship Policy had been the subject of consultation with the JCNG over the course of a series of meetings held between November 2013 and March 2014. Proposed revisions to the Sickness Absence Policy had also been subject to full staff consultation, while proposed changes to the Internship Policy had been subject to limited consultation with UCL Heads of Department. Full details of this consultation, including a summary of staff feedback and responses to this, were set out at [HRPC 3-3 \(13-14\)](#).
- 19.3 Following the final consultation meeting with the JCNG, UCL's recognised trade unions continued to express disagreement over the reduction of the formal stages of the Sickness Absence process from a four-stage procedure to a three-stage procedure. However, it was not proposed to reinstate a four-stage procedure as one of the main purposes of the review had been to streamline the policy following concerns that the current process was too protracted. UCL's trade unions had, however, expressed broad support for the proposed changes to UCL's Internship Policy, including the payment of interns.
- 19.4 Subject to HRPC approval of the proposed changes to UCL's Sickness Absence Policy and Internship Policy, it was proposed to communicate changes to UCL staff through formal notification through Exchange and *The Week@UCL*. Briefings on the changes would also be offered through HR Consultancy Services in liaison with faculty or professional services management.

RESOLVED:

- 19.5 That the revised UCL Sickness Absence and Internship policies be approved and the changes communicated to UCL staff.

ACTION: HR colleagues

20 PROFESSORIAL PAY AND GENDER

Received:

- 20.1 The report at [HRPC 3-4 \(13-14\)](#), introduced by the Director of HR.

Reported:

- 20.2 The report at [HRPC 3-4 \(13-14\)](#) provided an analysis of the latest professorial pay data to determine the current gender equal pay gap within each professorial band as well as across all bands.
- 20.3 The analysis generally confirmed that there had been very positive movement to reduce gender equal pay gaps in the UCL professorial bands since 2011. Within each professorial band, there were no longer any significant gender pay gaps in terms of the standard equal pay definition of work of equal value. The gender equal pay gap within Band 2 had reduced from 5.2% as of October 2012 to 2.4% currently – largely as a result of targeted pay awards – while in Bands 1 and 3 there were now small gaps in favour of women professors (0.4% and 2.4% respectively).
- 20.4 Across the entire professoriate (irrespective of bands) the gender equal pay gap had increased very marginally from 5.8% to 6.0%, largely owing to the increase in the number of women professors who had been promoted to Band 1 and who were on lower professorial pay rates for the time being, as well as to the overall distribution of

professors between bands. However, these findings took account of base academic salaries excluding market supplements and allowances as the main indicator of equal pay. When total academic salaries inclusive of market supplements and allowances were taken into account, this gap was more substantial (9.1% rather than 6%), although this had decreased from the 2012 figure of 9.8%.

- 20.5 While there would be the option of eliminating the overall gender pay gap across the different professorial bands, it was not recommended to do this in one move. Instead, the recommended option would be for Deans to seek to address genuine equal pay cases within bands (and in particular Band 2) and to look to longer term measures to ensure that more female professors moved through the professorial banding structure.

Discussion:

- 20.6 The following main points were noted during discussion:

- Efforts to eliminate the gender equal pay gap across the different professorial bands would be costly and complicated, and would have the undesirable effect of creating substantial in-band gaps and giving rise to local inequities. In light of this, the preferred option would be to ensure that there was no gender bias in pay within each of the professorial bands;
- It was noted that giving Deans discretion to make targeted pay awards in exceptional cases with a view to addressing gender pay inequalities had been very helpful and had worked well. The consensus was that this arrangement should be continued.
- It would be desirable for HRPC to consider issues around market supplements and allowances in relation to professorial pay and gender and for this to be informed by relevant data. It might also be desirable to undertake an analysis of external candidates who were appointed as UCL professors with a view to determining whether there were any gender pay issues in this area.
- Following on from the work that had been undertaken by HR colleagues around professorial pay and gender, it was next planned to undertake a similar analysis of pay and gender in respect of Grade 10 professional services staff.

RESOLVED:

- 20.7 That Deans of Faculty be again granted discretion to consider performance-related pay awards of up to 5% in individual cases where this was felt to be merited with a view to further reducing the professorial gender equal pay gap in Band 2.

ACTION: Deans of Faculty

21 UCL POLICY IN RESPONSE TO THE POSSIBLE MARKING BOYCOTT BY UCU MEMBERS

Reported:

- 21.1 The Director of HR confirmed that UCL's policy in response to the possibility of industrial action short of a strike by members of the UCU on 28 April 2014 would be to withhold 100% of the pay of staff who participated in the industrial action. This was part of a uniform sector approach being taken by the vast majority of HE institutions that would be affected by this potential industrial action.

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Noted:

22.1 The next meeting of HRPC in the current session was scheduled as follows:

Wednesday 9 July 2014, 8:30am, South Wing G12 Council Room

[Secretary's note: this meeting was subsequently rescheduled for Wednesday 25 June at 8.15am]

GARY HAWES

Academic Support Officer (and Committee Operations Co-ordinator)

Academic Services

Student and Registry Services

[telephone 020 7679 8592, UCL extension 28592, email: g.hawes@ucl.ac.uk]