



ESTATES MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

Wednesday 18 September 2013

MINUTES

PRESENT:

President and Provost (*Chair*)
Professor Stephen Caddick
Professor Richard Catlow
Professor Mary Collins
Mr Andrew Grainger
Mr Phil Harding
Professor Graham Hart
Mr Rex Knight
Professor David Lomas
Professor Alan Penn
Professor David Price
Professor Anthony Smith
Mr Dave Smith
Professor Alan Thompson
Professor Jo Wolf

In attendance: Mr Jason Clarke (Secretary) and Ms Valerie Hogg.

Apologies for absence were received from Professor Mary Fulbrook, Professor Dame Hazel Genn and Professor Sir John Tooke.

Key to abbreviations

CABE	Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment
EAC	Estates Approval Committee
EMC	Estates Management Committee
FC	Finance Committee
F&BA	Finance & Business Affairs
MAPS	Mathematical and Physical Sciences
UCLHT	UCL Hospital Trust

Preliminary Business

1 TERMS OF REFERENCE, CONSTITUTION AND 2013-14 MEMBERSHIP

Noted:

- 1.1 The terms of reference, constitution and 2013-14 membership of EMC at EMC 1-1 (13-14).

- 1.2 Since the last meeting on 5 June 2013, Professor Michael Arthur, President and Provost, and Professor Mary Fulbrook, Dean of the Faculty of Social and Historical Sciences, had both become members of EMC.
- 1.3 Professor Michael Worton, Vice-Provost (International), would be standing down from EMC at the end of the month on his retirement from UCL.

Reported:

- 1.4 The Provost, having welcomed members to the first meeting of the session, reported that he would be commissioning a review of the processes by which estates projects are assessed and prioritised prior to their submission to EMC. Discussions with a number of colleagues had revealed a perception that it is the Estates Approval Committee which undertakes a comprehensive review of estates proposals, whereas that body only examines the technical aspects of such proposals. There was a need for a separate estates prioritisation group, which would include representation from the Vice-Provosts and Deans and Estates, to review proposals in detail prior to them being submitted to EMC. The Provost would be inviting the Vice-Provost (Operations) to chair a scoping group to develop proposals for the composition and *modus operandi* of the new group. This initiative was intended to result in the articulation of a set of agreed and transparent principles which would guide prioritisation decisions, ensure academic involvement in estates prioritisation processes, and strengthen collective decision-making within EMC.

Discussion:

- 1.5 EMC strongly supported the Provost's proposal for reviewing and enhancing estates prioritisation structures and processes.

2 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 5 JUNE 2013

Confirmed:

- 2.1 The Minutes of the meeting of EMC held on 5 June 2013 [*EMC Mins. 59-70, 5.6.13*]

3 MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

3A Finance Committee and Council approval of recommendations from EMC

Noted:

- 3A.1 At its meeting on 5 June 2013, EMC approved the following proposals which were subsequently referred to, and approved by, Finance Committee at its meeting on 19 June 2013 and then Council at its meeting on 9 July 2013:

- Refurbishment and Extension of Bentham House and Hillel House;
- Refurbishment of the Anatomy Building (Phases 3-7).

As agreed at the last meeting [*see EMC Minutes 63.4 and 64.3*] the Director of Finance & Business Affairs had discussed and resolved outstanding issues relating to the business cases supporting the above proposals with relevant colleagues prior to their submission to FC.

3A.2 The proposal for the refurbishment of the Wolfson Teaching Laboratories in the School of Pharmacy, which had been approved by EMC at its last meeting, would be submitted to FC for approval in due course once further work had been undertaken.

3B Guidance for faculties on the preparation of business cases to support submissions to EMC [EMC Min. 63.7, 5.6.13]

Noted:

3B.1 Guidance for faculties on the preparation of business cases to support submissions being made to EMC is currently being reviewed and updated by F&BA. The updated guidance should be available on the F&BA web pages by the end of October 2013.

Discussion:

3B.2 It was suggested that the template for preparing business cases to support estates-related proposals should be reviewed as part of the scoping project for the new estates prioritisation group referred to above. It was suggested further that the relationship between School Estates Boards and the new group and, in turn, EMC could also be reviewed as part of this work.

Matters for Discussion

4 ESTATES AND FUNDING STRATEGY – PROGRESS REPORT

Received:

4.1 The above report at EMC 1-2 (13-14) introduced by the Director of F&BA.

Reported:

4.2 The above report updated EMC on progress with the development of the Strategy since the last meeting. EMC was reminded that the Strategy was intended to deliver three key outcomes: (i) a prioritised, deliverable and affordable capital programme for the next decade and beyond which would respond to institutional and faculty plans; (ii) a funding model that would ensure financial sustainability; and (iii) plans for enhanced operational performance which would enable UCL to invest in its infrastructure over the long term.

4.3 A further update on progress would be made available in late October, with a view to reports then being made to FC and Council in November.

Discussion:

4.4 During the Committee's discussion of the report at EMC 1-2 (13-14), the following points were noted:

- There was a need to ensure that the Estates and Funding Strategy was developed as part of UCL's broader institutional strategy and that it took full account of UCL's plans in terms of staff and student numbers, and new academic initiatives.

- There was also a need to improve institutional-level evaluation of School and Faculty plans to ensure that together they would enable UCL to meet its overall strategic objectives.
- It was proposed that there should be greater academic representation on the group that was developing the Strategy.
- Scheduling of committee business should ensure that there is sufficient time for senior managers (*ie* the Vice-Provosts and Deans) to discuss and consider the academic implications of estates- or estates-funding-related issues before concrete proposals are agreed and submitted to FC and to Council.
- The Provost noted that he intends to review UCL's current academic and financial planning processes, to ensure that UCL has in place a robust and integrated planning process which will enable proper evaluation of Faculty and School plans to be undertaken, in order to ensure that those plans deliver sustainable academic development over the long term.

RESOLVED:

- 4.5 That EMC welcome the report at EMC 1-2 (13-14).

[ACTION: Phil Harding – to note]

5 DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Received:

- 5.1 The above report at EMC 1-3 (13-14), presented by the Director of Estates.

Reported:

- 5.2 It was anticipated that more detailed reports on the New Student Centre, Wates House, and the Wilkins Complex and Wilkins North Terrace would be submitted to the next meeting of EMC.

Discussion:

- 5.3 During EMC's discussion of the Director's report, the following points were noted:

- The critical importance of the refurbishment of the Kathleen Lonsdale Building for maintaining current academic research and other activities within a number of the MAPS departments was noted.
- While UCLHT was competing with UCL for space within the local area, there were also potentially attractive opportunities for UCL and UCLHT to collaborate on estates-related matters to their mutual benefit.
- On the issue of the Gower Place Practice, it was noted that the partners are in negotiation with the University of London about moving to the University of London Union building in 2014-15.
- Different views were expressed as to the recent publicity relating to New Hall in Caledonian Road. Whilst it was recognised that UCL had not had complete control over the design of the facade of the building, it was agreed that, in future, UCL

should give consideration to the reputational implications of building design-related issues. The Director of Estates reminded EMC that an outline proposal for a peer review-based, design review panel had been submitted to the Committee at the end of last year. Since then, the opportunity had arisen for UCL to seek advice from CABE and they had been involved in the design of the New Student Centre. It was agreed that mechanisms for ensuring peer review of major projects should be kept under review. The Dean of the Faculty of the Built Environment noted that relevant colleagues from his Faculty would be willing to be consulted informally on project design issues.

RESOLVED:

- 5.4 That EMC welcome the report at EMC 1-2 (13-14).

[ACTION: Andrew Grainger – to note]

Matters for Approval

6 CATERING CONTRACT REVIEW

Received:

- 6.1 The above paper at EMC 1-4 (13-14), relating to the granting of a new contract for catering and hospitality services following the ending of the current contracts in January 2014.

RESOLVED:

- 6.2 That EMC approve the paper at EMC 1-4 (13-14).

[ACTION: Andrew Grainger – to note]

Matters for Information

7 GOWER STREET HEAT AND POWER – SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTE

Noted:

- 7.1 The above report at EMC 1-5 (13-14).

8 HS2 AND EUSTON LOCAL PLAN REPRESENTATIONS

Noted:

- 8.1 The above report at EMC 1-6 (13-14).

9 ESTATES PORTFOLIO SERVICES

Noted:

- 9.1 The above report at EMC 1-7 (13-14).

10 CAPITAL PROJECTS DASHBOARD

Noted:

- 10.1 The above report at EMC 1-8 (13-14).

11 ESTATES APPROVAL COMMITTEE – MINUTES AND DECISIONS

Noted:

- 11.1 Minutes of the most recent meeting of the EAC at EMC 1-9 (13-14).

12 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Noted:

- 12.1 The next meeting will be on **Wednesday 30 October 2013** at **8.30am** in the **Council Room**.