



COUNCIL

16th November 2018

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dame DeAnne Julius (*Chair*)

Professor Michael Arthur (<i>President and Provost</i>)	Mr Dominic Blakemore
Professor Lucie Clapp	Professor Annette Dolphin
Dr Martin Fry	Professor Patrick Haggard
Ms Lindsay Nicholson	Mr Turlogh O'Brien
Professor Hynek Pikhart	Mr Mahmud Rahman
Lord Sharkey	Mr Philip Sturrock (<i>Treasurer</i>)
Mr Justin Turner QC	Professor Andrew Wills
Baroness Valentine (<i>Vice-Chair</i>)	

In attendance: Ms Wendy Appleby (Secretary to Council); Ms Anne Marie O'Mullane (Assistant Secretary to Council); *For minutes 26 - 46:* Mr Phil Harding (Director of Finance & Business Affairs); *For minutes 26 – 32 and 43 - 46:* Mr Rex Knight (Vice-Provost (Operations)); *For minutes 26 – 29 and 43 - 44:* Professor Anthony Smith (Vice-Provost (Education and Student Affairs)); Professor David Lomas (Vice-Provost (Health)); *For minute 29:* Mr Derfel Owen, Director of Academic Services; *For minute 30:* Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker, Dean of the Faculty of Engineering.

Apologies for absence were received from: Farooq Dean; Dr Andrew Gould; Ms Sarah Whitney; Dame Nicola Brewer; Dr Celia Caulcott; Mr Ms Lori Houlihan; Professor David Price.

Key to abbreviations used in these Minutes:

AB	Academic Board
AC	Academic Committee
COO	Chief Operating Officer
EIB	European Investment Bank
ERC	European Research Council
FTE	Full Time Equivalent
GCAB	Governance Committee of Academic Board
GDPR	EU General Data Protection Regulations
GEO	Global Engagement Office
IfWH	Institute for Women's Health
JEP	Joint Evaluation Panel
NPV	Net Present Value
NSS	National Student Survey
OIA	Office for the Independent Adjudicator
OfS	Office for Students
ONS	Office for National Statistics

OIA	Office for the Independent Adjudicator
PAMELA	Pedestrian Accessibility Movement Environment Laboratory
PEARL	Person Environment Activity Research Laboratory
PKU	Peking University
SLC	Student Loans Company
SMT	Senior Management Team
SRS	Student & Registry Services
STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics
UCEA	University Council for Educational Administration
UCU	University and College Union
USS	University Superannuation Scheme
UUK	Universities UK
VFM	Value for Money
VP	Vice-Provost

24. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

24.1 No interests were declared.

25. MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

25.1 **Approved:** The minutes of the meeting held on 10th October 2018 [*Council Minutes 1-23, 2018-19*].

26. MATTERS ARISING

26A Late Summer Assessments [*Minute 4B.1, 2018-19*]

26A.1 A Council member raised that some students had experienced a delay in receipt of their loan from the SLC due to the timing of the release of late summer assessment results. The Registrar & Head of SRS, Ms Wendy Appleby, was not aware of a problem, however, advised that she would raise the matter with the Director of Academic Services.

26B GDPR Training [*Minute 7.3, 2018-19*]

26B.1 The Secretary to Council, Ms Wendy Appleby, had circulated details on how to access the GDPR training to Council members. Council members were encouraged to complete the training when they had an opportunity.

26C Academic Board discussion on the improvement of student engagement and student satisfaction [*Minute 6.7, 2018-19*] [*Paper 2-19, 2018-19*]

26C.1 **Received:** The unconfirmed extract minutes from the meeting of AB (24th October 2018) where the report on Principal Theme 2, “A global leader in the integration of research and education, underpinning an inspirational student experience” was considered.

- 26C.2 The VP (Education & Student Affairs), Professor Anthony Smith, advised that there had been free-flowing discussion at AB. It had been clear that AB members felt that there had been a lot of changes made in a short period of time. It was acknowledged that balancing the need for change and the capacity for change was a common challenge for many organisations. Council noted that there had also been constructive discussion at AC.
- 26C.3 Council was reminded that UCL was starting from a position of strength. The aim was to change cultures where needed to enable achievement of the ambitious objectives set out in UCL 2034 as the strongest student experience scores were found in departments that genuinely put students at the heart of what they do. Council would also consider the report on Enabler A, “Giving Our Students the Best Support” and Schools would be asked to report explicitly on the student experience and their TEF pilot outcomes. This would provide a further opportunity to consider the steps being taken to improve student engagement and student satisfaction.

Matters for Discussion

27. PROVOST’S BUSINESS

27A Estates Developments

- 27A.1 The Bloomsbury Theatre had re-opened, delivering a very high quality facility, and the Student Centre hoarding had come down. The Student Centre was due to open in February 2018.

27B Pay Dispute

- 27B.1 The 2018 national pay negotiations concluded over the summer without agreement between UCEA and the trade unions. UCL implemented the final offer of 2% in August pay. UCU had balloted for a mandate for industrial action but did not reach the requisite ballot result of 50% in favour of industrial action. A new round of discussions on 2019 pay would begin shortly.

27C Pensions

- 27C.1 The consultation response on the JEP Report recommendations, agreed by Council had been submitted to UUK. The vast majority of employers had supported the recommendations contained in the JEP Report. Many employers, like UCL, had responded that they would like to have a better understanding of risk. It now seemed likely that there would be a USS valuation in 2018 which would be completed by 2019.

27D PKU

27D.1 Hao Ping, Party secretary of PKU, had been appointed the President of PKU, replacing Lin JinHua. PKU was a strategic partner of UCL and the Provost was due to visit PKU the following week. UCL would continue to monitor developments.

27E Brexit

27E.1 The Brexit Mitigation Group had examined all the technical notices and an action plan would now be developed by the GEO. The Provost has recorded a video, aimed primarily at supporting EU staff and students, that is ready to be used in the event of a precipitate “no deal” Brexit that would be released on the 29 March 2019. Support continued to be provided to EU employees and their families in the form of guidance, immigration loans for employees to access immigration legal advice, and reimbursement of fees for settled status applications. The question remained, if the UK was not eligible to receive Horizon Europe funding, would the British government develop a support plan?

27F Augar Report

27F.1 Media reports had indicated that Philip Augar’s report would recommend the cutting of fees to £6.5k with top-ups for STEM degrees. The Russell Group was working on garnering third party support for the important role of universities in society and the economy. Some members of the Russell Group would be meeting with Philip Augar on the 4 December 2018. There was discussion of the potential move to £6.5k fees and the impact of Brexit on EU students in 2019 and 2020. It was also noted that the ONS was due to publish its decision on how student loans should appear in public finances.

27G Applications for 2019

27G.1 UCL had seen a 9.9% increase in home student applications and a 15.4% increase in international student applications, on top of last year’s 18% rise. EU applications were up by 1.5%. This boded well for the future, enabling further increases in the quality of the undergraduate intake. There were possibly several reasons for this strength: a flight to excellence, falling currency and the draw of London.

28. ANNUAL REPORT AND FINANCIAL STATEMENTS

[Paper 2-21, 2018-19]

28.1 **Considered:** the Annual Report and Financial Statements for the year ended 31 July 2018. The Director of Finance & Business Affairs, Mr Phil Harding, advised that the audit had been substantially completed and an unqualified

audit opinion on the Group and UCL's financial and subsidiary financial statements had been received from the external auditors.

- 28.2 Council noted a final amendment to the 2017-18 Annual Report and Financial Statements following tail-end audit procedures on the 'Remuneration of higher paid staff' salary bandings disclosure. There was a misstatement identified in the Emoluments of the Provost and President which had been adjusted. This impacted the Median Pay calculation disclosure which was also adjusted from 8.0 to 9.3. It was also explained that the reporting of remuneration of higher paid staff was on a basic salary and FTE basis, as per requirements set by the OfS. As a consequence, part-time staff had their reported salary grossed up; this affected 120 individuals.
- 28.3 Council noted the changes that been made to the Annual Report and Financial Statements following their consideration by Audit Committee and Finance Committee, particularly, the inclusion of additional text to highlight the combined impact of non-recurring items within the year and UCL's underlying operating surplus once these non-recurring items had been extracted. Council discussed the importance of explaining the reasons for the higher reported surplus to the wider UCL community and the Provost confirmed that a message was due for release to AB.
- 28.4 Audit Committee and Finance Committee were thanked for their work in considering the Financial Statements. Council congratulated the Finance Division on the preparation of the Annual Report and Financial Statements which contained many improvements over previous years to streamline and clarify the textual explanations.

RESOLVED: *on the recommendation of Finance Committee*

- 28.5 **To approve the audited Financial Statements, covering both the commentary and figures for the year 2017-18.**

29. **ANNUAL ASSURANCE RETURN TO THE OFFICE FOR STUDENTS**

[Paper 2-22, 2018-19]

29A **Quality Assurance of the student experience (Annex A)**

- 29A.1 **Approved:** The annual assurance return to the Office for Students on the basis of a report detailing the institutional assurance and governance measures in place to assure and enhance the quality of UCL's academic programmes. A number of typos would be corrected for the archive copy of the report.

29B **Annual Assurance Return Annex B**

- 29B.1 **Approved:** the submission of the completed version Annual Assurance Return Annex B as set out in *Paper 2-22 section 2* to the OfS.

29C Audit Committee Report (including Internal Audit Report)

29C.1 **Considered:** The Audit Committee's annual report which covered the work of the Audit Committee in the year 1 August 2017 – 31 July 2018 and the Internal Audit Report. The Audit Committee was satisfied with the adequacy and effectiveness of UCL's internal control systems in place during that year. Audit Committee was also satisfied that UCL had in place for such year effective arrangements for:

- risk management, control and governance
- economy, efficiency and effectiveness (VFM)
- the management and quality assurance of data submitted to the Higher Education Statistics Agency, the Student Loans Company, HEFCE, the Office for Students, Research England and other bodies.

29C.2 In reaching these opinions on internal controls and in discharging its responsibilities, the Committee had relied on reports from KPMG and the Head of Internal Audit Opinion which was one of: 'Significant assurance with minor improvement opportunities'. Audit Committee was satisfied with the management responses to the recommendations arising from the internal audits conducted during 2017-18. Recommendations from internal audits were being actively tracked and very few were overdue. The Committee had also received an annual report on value-for-money from the Director of Finance and Business Affairs for the year ended 31 July 2018.

RESOLVED:

29C.3 **To approve the Audit Committee annual report, year ending 31 July 2018.**

29D Financial Commentary

29D.1 **Considered:** the OfS Annual Accountability Return: Financial Commentary. The paper and annexes, which had been prepared in OfS format, compared the forecast for 2017-18 submitted to the OfS in August 2018 and the actual outturn for 2017-18.

RESOLVED: *on the recommendation of Finance Committee*

29D.2 **To approve submission of the Financial Commentary to support the statutory accounts to the OfS.**

30. PROJECT PEARL

[Paper 2-25, 2018-19]

[Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker, Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, attended for this item]

30.1 **Considered:** the Business Case for the Project PEARL proposal that would replace and build upon the work of the Faculty's current research facility

PAMELA. The Dean of the Faculty of Engineering Sciences, Professor Titchener-Hooker gave an overview of PEARL and its suitability for location at Dagenham. Two option studies had been undertaken by UCL, one at HereEast and one at Dagenham. HereEast was rejected as it would have been too disruptive to existing UCL faculties and other occupants; in addition the footprint was inadequate. The preferred option was a bespoke building on the Londoneast-uk development site close to Dagenham East tube station.

- 30.2 It was noted that PEARL would encourage local people into the facility; the facility would be made available for community activities via schools and community groups. It would also offer excellent opportunities for apprenticeships and provide some employment in the local area.
- 30.3 Council members welcomed this development as UCL would have a world-leading facility for experimentation and evaluation of science and engineering relevant to the urban environment and its interactions with people.

Resolved: on the recommendation of Finance Committee

- 30.4 **To approve the location of PEARL in Dagenham.**
- 30.5 **To approve the capital budget of £46.8m to develop the scheme (offset by £9.0m equipment grant) on the understanding that 1) the capital programme would be re-prioritised to accommodate this amount and 2) that further funds be canvassed from other parties.**
- 30.6 **To approve UCL operating costs, at £1.7m per annum site operating costs and £0.2m per annum UCL central costs, totalling £52.6m over 22 years, with an estimated NPV of £5.8m.**

31. CODE OF PRACTICE ON FREEDOM OF SPEECH

[Paper 2-26, 2018-19]

- 31.1 **Considered:** The Code of Practice on Freedom of Speech which was for approval and the associated Procedure for Managing Events that include External Speakers. The Registrar and Head of SRS, Ms Wendy Appleby, outlined a number of changes that had been made to the Code of Practice and associated Procedure following input from GCAB and AB. These included a clarification in paragraph 24 of the Code of Practice that the provision related to day-to-day operations, a change in paragraph 16 to include all protected characteristics and the correction of a typo in paragraph 30.
- 31.2 Council discussed the draft Code of Practice and the associated Procedure. It was clarified that the requirement for an independent chair had been deleted from the Code of Practice following input from AB and GCAB. It could be imposed, if needed, as an event condition as set out in Appendix 2

to the procedure. It was confirmed that the web-link for the booking system would be included once the Code of Practice was approved.

- 31.3 A member of Council advised that the critical question in relation to the associated Procedure was whether the requirement that requests for space including an external speaker must be made at least 10 working days in advance interfered with freedom of speech. Following discussion it was agreed that the wording of paragraph 17 would begin with the phrase, “Where reasonably practicable...”.
- 31.4 It was noted that the Code of Practice and Procedure would be brought back for consideration via AB in a year’s time; this would offer an opportunity to understand how the Code of Practice and associated Procedure operated in practice.

RESOLVED:

- 31.5 **To approve the revised Code of Practice on Freedom of Speech subject to the following subject to the following changes:**
- a clarification in paragraph 24, that the provision related to day-to-day operations;
 - a change in paragraph 16, to include all protected characteristics; and
 - a correction of a typo in paragraph 30.
- 31.6 **To note the associated Procedure for Managing Events that include External Speaker; paragraph 17 would be amended to begin with the phrase, “Where reasonably practicable...”**

32. ANNUAL PREVENT RETURN TO THE OFFICE FOR STUDENTS

[Paper 2-27, 2018-19]

- 32.1 **Noted:** An update on UCL’s implementation of the Prevent Duty from the Registrar and Head of SRS, Ms Wendy Appleby. In excess of 350 key student facing staff had received face-to-face training in 2017/18. A lot of work had been undertaken on the room booking procedure and a new room booking system had been introduced; this would make the process more consistent and robust. Two incidents had been discussed with the OfS during the course of the 2017/18 academic year.

RESOLVED:

- 32.2 **To approve the signing of the accountability declaration for submission to the Office for Students.**

33. ANNUAL REPORT ON ENABLER A, GIVING OUR STUDENTS THE BEST SUPPORT

[Paper 2-28, 2018-19]

- 33.1 This item was deferred until the next meeting due to time constraints.

34. RE-APPOINTMENT OF THE DEAN OF STUDENTS

[Paper 2-30, 2018-19]

34.1 Council discussed the recommendation of AB to re-appoint the VP (Education & Student Affairs) as Dean of Students for a two year period, so that the outcome of the Charter and Statutes Working Group recommendations on the role of the Dean of Students could be taken into consideration when making a decision on an appointment to the role of the Dean of Students. Council noted that a two-year reappointment would not preclude consideration in due course of whatever recommendations might emerge from the AB Working Group.

RESOLVED: *following a vote*

34.2 To re-appoint Professor Anthony Smith, VP (Education & Student Affairs) as Dean of Students (Academic) for a term extending from 1 October 2017 (retrospectively) to 30 September 2020 inclusive.

<p>Matters for approval or information</p>

35. RE-NAMING OF THE INSTITUTE FOR WOMEN'S HEALTH

[Paper 2-31, 2018-19]

35.1 **Approved:** The proposal to change the name of the 'UCL Institute for Women's Health' (IfWH) to the 'UCL Elizabeth Garrett Anderson Institute for Women's Health' with retrospective effect from 1st October 2018.

36. PROPOSED UCL POLICY ON NAMING OR RENAMING OF UNIVERSITY BUILDINGS AND SPACES

[Paper 2-32, 2018-19]

36.1 **Approved:** The proposed UCL Policy on Naming or Renaming of University Buildings and Spaces.

37. CHANGES TO THE REGULATIONS FOR MANAGEMENT

[Paper 2-33, 2018-19]

37.1 **Approved:** The proposed changes to section 11 of the Regulations for Management.

38. STUDENT COMPLAINTS PROCEDURE

[Paper 2-34, 2018-19]

38.1 **Approved:** The proposed amendment to the Student Complaints Procedure following a suggestion from the OIA.

39. HEALTH & SAFETY REPORT/UCL HEALTH & SAFETY POLICY

[Paper 2-35, 2018-19]

39.1 **Received:** The UCL Health and Safety Committee Annual Report 2017/18 and the Health & Safety Policy 2018/19.

40. ACADEMIC COMMITTEE REPORT

[Paper 2-35, 2018-19]

40.1 **Received:** The Academic Committee Report for 2017/18.

41. MINUTES OF AUDIT COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE

[Paper 2-35, 2018-19]

41.1 **Received:** The confidential minutes of Audit Committee (12 October 2018) and Finance Committee (27th September 2018)

42. DATE OF THE NEXT MEETING

42.1 The next meeting was scheduled for **Thursday 24th January 2019** at 2pm in the Council Room.

Wendy Appleby
Secretary to Council
November 2018