



## COUNCIL

Wednesday 13<sup>th</sup> March 2019

### MINUTES

*PRESENT:*

Dame DeAnne Julius (*Chair*)

|   |   |
|---|---|
| Professor Michael Arthur ( <i>President and Provost</i> ) | Professor Lucie Clapp                   |
| Professor Annette Dolphin                                 | Dr Martin Fry                           |
| Dr Andrew Gould   | Professor Patrick Haggard               |
| Mr Turlogh O'Brien  | Mr Mahmud Rahman                        |
| Lord Sharkey  | Mr Philip Sturrock ( <i>Treasurer</i> ) |
| Mr Justin Turner QC                                       | Ms Sarah Whitney                        |
| Baroness Valentine ( <i>Vice-Chair</i> )                  | Professor Andrew Wills                  |

*In attendance:* Ms Wendy Appleby (Secretary to Council); Ms Anne Marie O'Mullane (Assistant Secretary to Council); *For minutes 78 – 85 and 88- 93:* Dr Celia Caulcott (VP (Enterprise & London)); *For minutes 75- 85 and 87-93 :* Mr Phil Harding (Director of Finance & Business Affairs); Ms Fiona Ryland (COO); *For minutes 75 – 85 and 87 – 93:* Professor David Lomas (VP (Health)); Professor David Price (VP (Research)); *For minute 87:* Professor Alan Thompson (Dean of the Faculty of Brain Sciences); Michael Schuitevoerder (Programme Director for the Institute of Neurology/Dementia Research Institute programme); Professor Mike Hanna (Director, Queen Square Institute of Neurology); Mr Roger Tuke, Assistant Director (IoN/DRI); *For minutes 79 and 87* Ms Francesca Fryer.

*Key to abbreviations used in these Minutes:*

|      |  |
|------|--|
| AC   | Academic Committee                         |
| COO  | Chief Operating Officer                    |
| DRI  | Dementia Research Institute                |
| FBA  | Finance & Business Affairs                 |
| IoE  | Institute of Education                     |
| IWGB | Independent Workers Union of Great Britain |
| JEP  | Joint Evaluation Panel                     |
| PGR  | Postgraduate Research                      |
| QS   | Quadrelli Symonds                          |
| USS  | Universities Superannuation Scheme         |
| UUK  | Universities UK                            |
| VP   | Vice-Provost                               |

Apologies for absence were received from: Mr Dominic Blakemore; Mr Farooq Dean; Professor Hynek Pikhart; Ms Lindsay Nicholson; Dame Nicola Brewer, and Professor Anthony Smith.

### **73. DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

**73.1** No interests were declared.

### **74. MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

74.1 Approved: The minutes of the meeting held on 24<sup>th</sup> January 2019 *Council Minutes 47-72, 2018-19* subject to the following changes being made to the minutes:

- *For Minute 54.5:* add that the School reports should include an overview of PGR Student Satisfaction scores.
- *For Minute 65.2:* The position with respect to the decants and their costing was queried however on checking it has been confirmed that the Minute was accurate as written and did not require amendment.

|                               |
|-------------------------------|
| <b>Matters for Discussion</b> |
|-------------------------------|

### **75. PROVOST'S BUSINESS**

#### **75A QS World University Rankings**

75A.1 UCL had performed strongly in the QS World University subject rankings. UCL's IoE had maintained its number one spot for 'education' for the 6th year running and the Bartlett had reached number one for 'architecture & the built environment'. Only one other UK university, Oxford, had more number one ranked subjects. A further eight subjects at UCL were ranked in the world top 10.

#### **75B Dean of the Bartlett Faculty of the Built Environment**

75B.1 A full international search had taken place for the next Dean of the Bartlett to succeed Professor Alan Penn. The Interview Panel recommended the appointment of Professor Christoph Lindner, Dean of the College of Design at the University of Oregon, as the next Dean of the Bartlett. The interview Panel comprised of the Provost, the VP (Research), the VP (Education), the Dean of the Faculty Engineering, the Dean of Arts & Humanities, five members of the Bartlett and two external assessors. The terms of appointment had only been agreed with Professor Lindner three working days before the meeting of Council. Therefore the appointment was not included in the Council agenda papers as it was necessary to confirm Professor Lindner's intention to accept the position before requesting Council's approval to confirm the appointment on the recommendation of the Provost. Council agreed that the approval of the appointment would be made by Chair's action.

**75C University of London Act**

75C.1 The University of London Act had received Royal Assent which would enable member institutions to seek university status. UCL had applied for this status along with the other member institutions.

**75D Brexit**

75D.1 UCL was as ready as possible for a 'No deal' Brexit. Funds were being identified for potential costs associated with Erasmus.

**75E Correspondence from IWGB**

75E.1 Correspondence for the attention of Council had been received from IWGB requesting the end of outsourcing for security staff. The Director of HR would lead a review considering the costs and benefits to UCL for all outsourced contracts in order to understand the full implications. UCL would work with Unison which was a recognised union; IWGB was not a recognised union. Issues highlighted in the correspondence would also be investigated.

**75F Augar Report**

75F.1 There was an expectation that the Augar Report would be delayed.

**76. USS CONSULTATION ON 2018 VALUATION**

*[Paper 4-61, 2018-19]*

76.1 **Considered:** Proposals for the 2018 valuation of the USS and a proposed response from UCL to UUK's consultation with employers. Mr Phil Harding, Director of FBA, outlined the consultation process that UCL undertook with staff. UUK were aware that Council was meeting on 13th March 2018 and had given a dispensation for UCL's response to be submitted after the deadline of 13<sup>th</sup> March 2019.

76.2 During discussion it was noted that some USS members doubted the validity of the valuation methodology and the commencement of the de-risking exercise. There were also concerns about the affordability of the scheme for individuals due to the increase of contributions resulting from the application of the joint cost-sharing rule 76.4 of the USS scheme. If significant numbers opted out of the pension scheme it would result in an increased deficit. In order to avoid the contribution increase in October 2019, the valuation would need to be concluded in July. The wording of the draft response was considered and possible amendments to it discussed, however, it was agreed to leave the draft wording unchanged.

**RESOLVED:**

76.3 **To approve UCL's draft consultation response on proposals for the 2018 valuation of the USS for submission to UUK.**

## **77. UCL FINANCIAL UPDATE**

*[Paper 4-62, 2018-19]*

- 77.1 **Received:** A UCL Financial Update which provided the first forecast for 2018-19 based on actuals for four months of the current financial year. The out-turn was broadly on track with the budget and had been discussed at the Finance Committee.

## **78. ANNUAL REPORT ON PRINCIPAL THEME THREE, ADDRESSING GLOBAL CHALLENGES**

*[Paper 4-65, 2018-19]*

- 78.1 **Received:** A report on progress and constraints in delivering Principal Theme Three, Addressing Global Challenges. Professor David Price, VP (Research), outlined the outstanding performance of UCL researchers noting that UCL ranked sixth based on the average rankings of global league tables for the third consecutive year. There had been significant progress with Principal Theme Three's specific objectives. Some of the key challenges included the limited resources to enable cross-disciplinarity and to address societal problems, the need to improve support for research, Brexit, changes to the research funding landscape and REF. There were queries on the outcome of the Wellcome Trust audit and it was noted that there were actions being taken in response. A follow up meeting with Wellcome Trust would be held 6 months after the progress meeting in January 2019.
- 78.2 Council welcomed the great progress made in delivering Principal Theme Three and extended its congratulations to UCL's researchers on the results achieved.

## **79. ANNUAL REPORT ON ENABLER E, SUSTAINABLE ESTATE**

*[Paper 4-66, 2018-19]*

*[Ms Francesca Fryer, Director of Estate]*

- 79.1 **Received:** A report on progress made to date on Enabler E, Maintaining a Sustainable Estate to meet our aspirations. Ms Francesca Fryer, Director of Estates provided an overview of key highlights, challenges and risks. UCL was in Year 5 of its capital development programme and there had been some big completions recently such as the Student Centre and Bloomsbury Theatre. There had been improvements in the volume and quality of teaching space resulting from developments such as the refurbishment of teaching spaces in Torrington Place. However, there was still progress to be made in this area. In 2017/18, UCL had reduced its carbon emissions by 7%. While there had been work to keep all stakeholders informed of developments, it was recognised that the approaches used could be improved. The TOPs Transformer Operations would assist with improving communications at an individual building level. Council welcomed the report and commended all those involved for their hard work.

## **80. UCL INNOVATION & ENTERPRISE REPORT**

*[Paper 4-67, 2018-19]*

- 80.1 **Received:** A report on progress on the UCL strategy for innovation and enterprise: Transforming Knowledge and Ideas into Action. Dr Celia Caulcott provided an overview of key achievements and challenges. The Innovation & Enterprise group had recently been reorganised and final recruitments had been made. The partnerships team included sector focussed specialists who provided a new route for businesses to engage at an institutional or sub-institutional level. There had been IPOs for two UCL spin-out companies: Autolus Therapeutics Ltd; and MeiraGTx Holdings PLC. Preliminary preparations had been made for the KEF. It was recognised that one of the challenges was that UCL lacks a coherent set of policies and processes required to support innovation. Considerable effort was being made to address this issue. The report was welcomed by Council. Council members who had visited Base KX, praised the students and staff involved. There were queries about the revenue opportunities from Autolus. This matter had been considered by Finance Committee on February 28 2019 and it was recommended that Council members who had queries contact the VP for additional briefing due to the complexity of the details.

## **81. ADDRESSING ANTISEMITISM AT UCL**

*[Paper 4-68, 2018-19]*

- 81.1 **Received:** A paper on the development of an action plan to address antisemitism at UCL, and on the proposal that UCL should adopt the IHRA working definition of anti-Semitism. Ms Lori Houlihan, VP (Advancement) and Interfaith Champion advised that some students did not feel they could report incidents of antisemitism as they felt the incidents would not be addressed. The request for adoption of the IHRA definition had come from the Jewish community as they felt it would signal that the matter of anti-Semitism was being taken seriously. A survey had been circulated to Jewish students and within two days there had been a large number of responses with examples of anti-Semitism. The survey results would be circulated to Council members. Ms Houlihan provided an overview of the IHRA Definition and some of the key objections to the definition. Briefing sessions would be made available to Council members with Professor Anthony Julius, the Jewish Society and the drafters of the letter to Council signed by 41 AB members who were not in favour of the IHRA definition being introduced. These briefing sessions would take place in advance of Council's consideration of a full proposal at a future meeting.
- 81.2 During discussion the following points were raised: it was important that concrete action was taken to address anti-Semitism as the definition by itself was likely not to be effective should it be adopted; it was critical that the time gap between the final decision of Council and implementation of the decision was as short as possible; it would therefore be necessary that Council considered a detailed proposal for action. There was a risk that, should the definition be adopted, individuals would have different expectations about what it would achieve unless an action programme was specified.
- 81.3 The Provost provided an overview of the AB meeting where the discussion on this subject was particularly heated. A diverse range of opinions had been

expressed on the definition and AB had agreed to establish a working group. It was important that the working group tried to identify solutions to address the problem as a whole rather than only developing a new definition. A possible approach to mitigate concerns on the application of the IHRA definition on anti-Semitism inhibiting freedom of speech and academic freedom would be to produce an annual report on the operation of the Freedom of Speech Policy and its associated procedure.

|   |
|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Matters for approval or information</b></p> |
|---|

**82. STUDENTS' UNION UCL FINANCIAL STATEMENTS FOR 2018-19**

*[Paper 4-74, 2018-19]*

- 82.1 **Received:** The Students' Union UCL Financial Statements for 2017-18 for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> July 2018.

**83. TUITION FEES FOR 2020-21**

*[Paper 4-75, 2018-19]*

- 83.1 **Received:** A report on the approach to the setting of tuition fees across unregulated programmes for UK, EU and overseas students in the academic year 2020-21 which was approved by Finance Committee at its meeting on the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2019.

**84. MINUTES OF ACADEMIC BOARD**

*[Paper 4-76, 2018-19]*

- 84.1 **Received:** The minutes of AB on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2018 and 14<sup>th</sup> November 2018.

**85. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

- 85.1 The date of the next Council Meeting is **Thursday 2 May 2019 at 9:30am followed in the afternoon by the Council Away Day**; the venue was to be advised.

Wendy Appleby  
Secretary to Council  
March 2019