



30 October 2017

**SPECIAL MEETING
ACADEMIC BOARD**

MINUTES

PRESENT¹:

Professor Anthony Smith (Chair)
Provost

Professor Bas Aarts; Ms Sarah Al-Aride; Ms Wendy Appleby; Professor Jonathan Ashmore; Dr Paul Ayriss; Professor Stavroula Balabani; Dr Simon Banks; Professor Andrew Barry; Professor Stephan Beck; Professor Sarah Bell; Professor Sven Bestmann; Professor Martin Bobak; Professor Daniel Bracewell; Professor Wendy Bracewell; Professor Steve Bramwell; Professor Detlef Bockenhauer; Professor Annie Britton; Professor John Brodholt; Professor Eric Brunner; Professor Neil Burgess; Dr Ben Campkin; Professor Matteo Carandini; Professor Claire Carmalt; Professor Richard Chandler; Professor Lucie Clapp; Dr Ben Clifford; Professor David Coen; Professor John Collinge; Professor Susan Collins; Professor Alun Coker; Professor Andrew Copp; Professor Francesca Cordeiro; Mr Mark Crawford; Professor Stuart Cull-Candy; Professor Robertus De Bruin; Professor Mohan Edirisinghe; Professor Piet Eeckhout; Professor Susan E. Evans; Professor Suzanne Farid; Professor Michael Farrant; Professor Patrizia Ferretti; Professor Margot Finn; Professor Andrew Fisher; Professor Maria Fitzgerald; Dr Richard Freeman; Dr Martin Fry; Professor Mary Fulbrook; Professor Alex Galis; Dr Haidy Gaismar; Professor Jonathan Gale; Dr Andrew Gardener; Professor Asterios Gavrilidis; Dr Deborah Gill; Professor Derek Gilroy; Ms Emer Girling; Professor Xavier Golay; Mr Andrew Grainger; Professor Serge Guillas; Professor Stephen Hailes; Professor Susan Hamilton; Professor Michael Hanna; Dr Pia Hardelid; Professor John Harris; Professor Graham Hart; Professor Michael Heinrich; Professor Benjamin G Heydecker; Professor Michael Hoare; Dr Arne Hofmann; Professor Martin Holbraad; Professor David Isenberg; Professor Glen Jeffery; Professor Kate Jones; Dr Elizabeth Jury; Professor Anthony Kenyon; Dr Amal Khanolkar; Professor Robert Kleta; Professor Josef Kittler; Dr Patty Kostkova; Dr. Sarabajaya Kumar; Professor Gloria Laycock; Professor Paola Lettieri; Ruth Lovering; Professor Paola Lettieri; Professor David Lomas; Dr Helga Luthersdottir; Ms Collette Lux; Professor Sandy MacRobert; Professor; Professor John Martin; Professor Mark Maslin; Dr Cristina Massaccesi; Dr Margaret Mayston; Desmond McMorrow; Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia; Professor Francesca Medda; Professor Neil Millar; Professor Robert Mills; Professor John Mitchell; Professor Henrietta Moore; Professor Jonathan Montgomery; Professor Ruth Morgan; Professor Sharon Morris; Rear

¹ An attendance sheet was circulated for signature at the meeting. Any colleagues present who did not sign the sheet and whose names are therefore not recorded as present are invited to notify the AB Secretary's office (e-mail – academic.services@ucl.ac.uk) so that their names can be included in the record when these Minutes are confirmed at the next scheduled meeting of AB.

Admiral Neil Morisetti; Professor John Mullan; Dr Charlene Murphy; Dr Mark Newman; Professor Rumana Omar; Dr Kit Opie; Professor Norbert Pachler; Professor Angeli Panagiota; Professor Ivan Parkin; Professor Sandip Patel; Professor Jason Peacey; Dr Anne Peasey; Professor Paola Pedarzani; Mr Richard Pettinger; Dr Hynek Pikhart; Professor Andrew Pomiankowski; Professor Kholoud Porter; Professor David Price; Professor Sally Price; Professor David Pym; Dr Kieran Reed; Professor Geraint Rees; Professor Jane Rendell; Mr William Richardson; Professor William Richardson; Professor Stuart Robson; Ms Fiona Ryland; Dr Benet Salway; Professor Giampietro Schiavo; Professor Ralf Schoepfer; Professor Jonathan Schott; Professor Anthony Segal; Professor Mala Shah; Professor Sonu Shamdasani; Professor David Shanks; Professor Richard Simons; Professor Talvinder Sihra; Professor Angus Silver; Professor Lucia Sivilotti Professor Michael Singer; Professor Rosalind Smyth; Professor Sarah Spurgeon; Professor Andrew Stahl; Professor Judith Stephenson; Professor Claudio Stern; Professor Judith Suissa; Professor Peter Swaab; Professor Nicolas Szita; Professor Junwang Tang; Professor Alan Thompson; Mr John Thomson; Dr Emanuela Tilley; Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker; Professor Derek Tocher; Professor Megan Vaughan; Dr Rosie Peppin Vaughan; Professor Yiannis Ventikos; Dr Nalini Vittal; Mr Martin Walsh; Dr Normal Williams; Professor Andrew Wills; Professor Nicholas Wood; Professor Ian Wood; Professor Richard Wortley; Professor Alison Wright; Professor Christopher Yeo; Professor Semir Zeki.

In attendance: Ms T Anderson; Mr Derfel Owen (Secretary to Academic Board); Ms Emily Bushby ; Ms Bex Caygill; Anne Marie O'Mullane; Professor Anthony Goldstone; Ms Emma Gribble; Mr Philip Harding; Ms Dominique Hua; Professor Steve Jones; Dr Darren Nesbeth; Mr Adrain Punaks; Ms Sonal Shah; Professor Philippa Talmud;

Apologies for absence were received from: Professor James Bainbridge; Professor Stephanie Bird; Dr Dame Nicola Brewer; Dr Clare Brooks; Dr Rachel De Felice; Professor Maria De Iorio; Dr Vanessa Diaz; Professor Simon Dixon; Dr Karen Edge; Dr Melanie Ehren; Professor Nicholas Freemantle; Professor Dilly Fung; Professor Nikolaos Gonis; Professor Helen Hackett; Professor Jenny Head; Dr Evangelos Himonides; Professor Dame Anne Johnson; Mr Rex Knight; Mr Tom Knight; Professor Martin Koltzenburg; Dr Sandra Leaton Gray; Dr Dewi Lewis; Professor Alejandro Madrigal; Professor Gesine Manuwald; Professor Charles Marson; Dr Margaret Mayston; Professor Usha Menon; Professor Jenny Mindell; Professor Stephen Quirke; Professor Enrico Palandri; Professor Alan Penn; Professor Peg Rawes; Professor Helen Roberts; Professor Dmitri Rusakov; Professor Trevor Smart; Dr Helen Stagg; Dr Uta Staiger; Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson; Professor Gabriella Vigliocco; Professor Sarah Walker

Key to abbreviations

AB	Academic Board
DFPO	Design, Build, Finance and Operate (DFPO) arrangement
RPIF	Research Partnership Investment Fund

1. UCL East

1.1 AB noted that the Provost had relinquished the Chair in order to answer questions posed by AB members. The Vice-Provost (Education & Student Affairs) chaired the meeting.

Presentation by Professor Maria Fitzgerald

- 1.2 Professor Maria Fitzgerald, one of the signatories to the letter requesting a special meeting of Academic Board, set out the reasoning for requesting such a meeting. Professor Fitzgerald noted that this was the first time that there was a meeting of AB dedicated to discussing UCL East. It was a duty of Academic Board to consider this matter and provide advice to Council. The meeting was intended to support a fact-based debate focussing on financial transparency and academic governance.
- 1.3 Professor Fitzgerald raised a number of queries including the potential impact on standards, and the impact on student and staff of having sites so far apart.
- 1.4 Professor Fitzgerald outlined that AB need to understand the financial case for UCL East and the need for financial transparency as well as the academic rationale for UCL East and the intended benefits to the university, students and the academic community. It was noted that a number of the questions posed in the letter calling for the special meeting had been addressed in a document circulated by the Provost on the morning of the meeting and expected that this would allow further time for discussion and contributions from members of AB.

Provost Response

- 1.5 The Provost thanked AB for the opportunity to respond to questions about UCL East and to present the academic vision for the development. It was noted that the Provost had supplied a set of answers to the questions posed in the letter, shortly in advance of the meeting. The Provost amplified this response by outlining the vision and strategic importance of UCL East as a cornerstone of UCL 2034.

Presentation by Paola Lettieri, Academic Director of UCL East

- 1.6 Professor Paola Lettieri, Academic Director of UCL East, presented on plans for the phased development of academic activities at UCL East. Information was provided on design plans for the buildings including timelines for delivery and the number of academic staff and students that would be based at UCL East.
- 1.7 Professor Lettieri outlined the academic vision for UCL East and plans for how it would be brought to life, responding to the ambitions and demands of the academic community to grow and build upon UCL's areas of research strength and expand into new and emerging areas; it was noted that the majority of UCL's Faculties were involved in the plans. It was also noted that the plans for UCL East aligned with the Government's Industrial Strategy.
- 1.8 Professor Lettieri provided information on the financial costings for Phase 1 of UCL East. AB noted that Finance Committee posed a challenge to revisit the overall costs of the project or to work out how it would be managed within the overall capital development programme envelope. As a result, The total financial envelope approved by Finance Committee was £426 million. Professor Lettieri provided details on external funding; £100 million from Government, £50 million from philanthropy, and a £30million capital receipt from a Design, Build, Finance and Operate (DBFO) arrangement for Pool St West, coupled with RPIF funding. Based on receiving the total amount of planned external funding, the cost to UCL would be £245 million. The capital costs of building Pool St West would also be borne by the DBFO provider.

- 1.9 It was agreed that there was not enough time to hear from academics who were working on developing programmes intended for delivery at UCL East. A number of Academic Board members expressed disappointment, but the Chair noted the need to take questions and comments from the floor.
- 1.10 There were queries on the number of students planned for Phase One at UCL East and whether there would be redistribution of staff from UCL East and the costs involved in recruiting world leading staff. It was confirmed that the costings for recruitment of staff had been factored in. Students at UCL East (c. 4,000) would result in an increase in overall student numbers for UCL (46,000).
- 1.11 A query was raised on the increase in projected costs for the two buildings, Marshgate 1 and Pool Street West, citing an earlier procurement document that projected a cost of £120million for the building work. The Provost explained that this was a misinterpretation of the documentation; that particular document was a design tender document that outlined the likely cost for building the shell and core only, it did not include the cost of other requirements such as internal design, fit out (e.g. lecture theatres, specialized spaces for the research labs, a part basement, an extra floor), professional fees, tender price inflation, contingency, or VAT, design and management fees.
- 1.12 Concerns were raised about the DBFO Agreement and the potential loss of income and control over the quality of services provided to UCL staff and students. The Provost pointed to similar DBFO initiatives entered into by London universities and the terms of any agreement would be negotiated carefully with a clear focus on high quality provision. The capital injection that would be gained by entering into DBFO agreement would mean that UCL would not need to reprioritise its existing capital programme.
- 1.13A query was raised on how the student experience of students who would undertake study on both sites would be managed. The Vice Dean (Education) of Engineering spoke of his experience of designing and modelling timetables for a programme that would be delivered as a dual site programme.
- 1.14 A query was raised about UCL's approach to modelling risk and whether a worst case scenario had been developed to ensure that the full extent of the risks were understood and mitigated. The Director of Finance and Business Affairs noted that there had been significant stress tests of each of the underlying assumptions and assurances had been provided to Finance Committee on these grounds.
- 1.15A query was raised on whether there was enough student accommodation factored into the design. The Provost set out the full range of accommodation being developed at the site, including the University of London and other private provision.
- 1.16A query was raised on Student Union involvement in UCL East. Professor Lettieri confirmed that there had been involvement of the Student Union in UCL East and there are now members on the steering group and users groups.
- 1.17 A query was raised on why options in the Bloomsbury area were not being explored. The Provost noted the costs involved in renting space in Bloomsbury and purchasing property on the open market were significantly higher than any on the UCL East site.

Show of Hands

- 1.18 Some members of AB requested an extension to the discussion due to the length of time spent on presentations. However, the Chair noted that the meeting was out of

time, that members would need to leave to attend to other commitments and that the specifics of the request for the meeting should be respected. A show of hands was called where AB endorsed:

- a) the financial management,
- b) the academic principles, and
- c) the geographical location

of UCL East.

1.19 The Chair asked whether members would like to count the show of hands, but members did not feel this was necessary as the outcome was clear.