



## ACADEMIC BOARD

Wednesday 22 May 2013

## MINUTES

*PRESENT<sup>1</sup>:*

President and Provost (*Chair*)

Professor Jonathan Ashmore, Mr Malcolm Bailey, Dr Bob Barber, Dr Judith Beniston, Dr Stephanie Bird, Ms Julie Black, Mr Bob Blizzard, Mr Matthew Bowles, Professor Wendy Bracewell, Professor Erik Burman, Mr Peter Cadley, Mrs Sue Chick, Mr Edwin Clifford-Coupe, Mr Ben Colvill, Professor Tessa Crompton, Dr, Vanessa Diaz, Professor Simon Dixon, Dr Caroline Essex, Dr Martin Fry, Mr Sam Gaus, Professor Michael Gilbey, Dr Hugh Goodacre, Ms Natasha Gorodnitski, Dr George Grimble, Professor Muki Haklay, Professor Michael Heinrich, Dr Mark Hewitson, Dr Katherine Holt, Mr Rex Knight, Dr Dilwyn Knox, Professor Susanne Kord, Professor Axel Korner, Professor Cecile Laborde, Dr Antonio Lazzarino, Professor Andy Leak, Dr Dewi Lewis, Ms Helga Luthersdottir, Dr Merle Mahon, Professor Gesine Manuwald, Dr Jann Matlock, Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia, Dr Maria Novella Mercuri, Mr Dante Micheaux, Dr Jennifer Mindell, Dr John Mitchell, Professor Maxine Molyneux, Mrs Cheryl Newsome, Dr Caroline Newton, Professor John O'Keefe, Dr Nick Ovenden, Miss Laura Parrett, Mr Frank Penter, Mr Tim Perry, Dr Hynek Pikhart, Mrs Kuen Yip Porter, Dr Sophia Psarra, Professor Jane Rendell, Professor Jennifer Robinson, Dr Seb Savory, Professor Ralf Schoepfer, Dr Stephanie Schorge, Dr Chris Scotton, Professor Sonu Shamdasani, Professor Elizabeth Shepherd, Professor Lorraine Sherr, Dr Joe Simpson, Professor Lucia Sivilotti, Professor Anthony Smith, Dr Christina Smith, Dr Sarah Snyder, Professor Sacha Stern, Professor Iain Stevenson, Dr Sherrill Stroschein, Professor Peter Swaab, Dr Andrea Townsend-Nicholson, Mr Andrew Turton, Ms Susan Ware, Professor Claire Warwick, Dr Thomas Wilks, Dr Andrew Wills, Dr Gavin Winston, Professor Jo Wolff, Professor Ian Zachary.

*In attendance:* Mr Jason Clarke (*Secretary*), Mrs Eleanor Day, Mr Dominique Fourniol, Ms Abigail Gann, Mr Nick McGhee, Miss Nafisa Wagley, Mr Nigel Waugh.

*Apologies for absence were received from:* Ms Sarah Alleemudder, Professor Francois Balloux, Professor Graziella Branduardi Raymont, Professor Franco Cacialli, Professor Stephen Caddick, Dr Ben Campkin, Professor Chris Carey, Mr Francesco D'Aiuto, Professor Robert Chambers, Professor Mary Collins, Professor Bryony Dean Franklin, Professor Tariq Enver, Professor Anthony Finkelstein, Professor Francesco Gervasio, Professor Helen Hackett, Professor Harry Hemingway, Professor Paul Longley, Professor Charles Marson, Dr Sara Mole, Professor Barbara Pedley, Professor Alan Penn, Mr Andrew Pink, Professor Stephen Quirke, Dr Kerstin Sailer, Dr Ernest Schonfield, Dr Ruth Siddall, Ms Olga Thomas, Professor Russell Viner, Professor Bryan Williams, Dr Katherine Woolf, Professor Kwee Yong, Professor Michael Worton.

### *Key to abbreviations*

|      |                                  |
|------|----------------------------------|
| AB   | Academic Board                   |
| AC   | Academic Committee               |
| HRPC | Human Resources Policy Committee |

<sup>1</sup> An attendance sheet was circulated for signature at the meeting. Any colleagues present who did not sign the sheet and whose names are therefore not recorded as present are invited to notify the AB Secretary's office (e-mail – [h.lilley@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:h.lilley@ucl.ac.uk)) so that their names can be included in the record when these Minutes are confirmed at the next scheduled meeting of AB.

**29 MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF 20 FEBRUARY 2013**

***Confirmed:***

29.1 The Minutes of the meetings of AB held on 20 February 2013 [*AB Mins.18-28, 20.02.2013*].

**30 MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES [*see also Minutes 32 and 33 below*]**

**30A Council approval of Academic Board recommendations [*AB Min.25, 20.02.13*]**

***Noted:***

30A.1 At its meeting on 10 April 2013, Council had approved, on the recommendation of AB, the Graduate School's Annual Report for 2011-12.

**30B Demographic information on academic staff appointments [*AB Min.26.2, 20.02.13*]**

***Noted:***

30B.1 The AB Secretary was discussing with officers in the Human Resources Division an appropriate mechanism for presenting to AB demographic information on academic staff appointments.

**31 AWARDS TO UCL STAFF**

***Noted:***

31.1 At AB 3-18 (12-13) a note on the award of major prizes *etc* to members of the academic community of UCL since the previous meeting of AB.

**32 REFORM OF STATUTE 18 – REPORT FROM THE ACADEMIC BOARD WORKING GROUP**

***Noted:***

32.1 At its last meeting, AB noted that the Working Group on Statute 18, which had been set up following the special meetings of AB held in November 2012 and January 2013, would be submitting its report to AB at its May 2013 meeting and to Council thereafter.

32.2 An executive summary of the report at AB 3-19 (12-13), with the following Annexes:

- Annexe 1: Report of the Working Group;
- Annexe 2: Light-touch Amendments, Statute 18;
- Annexe 3: Thematic Analysis of the Online Feedback on Statute 18 Reform;
- Annexe 4: A Derivation of Criteria for Success in Statute 18 Reform.

32.3 An oral report and presentation by Professor Lucie Clapp, Chair of the Working Group.

***Reported:***

32.4 In developing its proposals the Working Group had been mindful of the issues which had been identified as necessitating the review of the Statute, namely: the need to modernise

procedures in line with changes to employment legislation; the requirement to maintain the principle of justice and fairness; and the need to ensure that any reform did not negatively affect the current arrangements for protection of academic freedom. In addition, the Working Group had taken account of the following issues arising out of the consultation process on the reform: a perceived transfer of statutory protection from governance bodies to management; the proposed withdrawal of the right to legal representation in internal hearings and tribunals. In the view of the Working Group, it was important that oversight of academic activities was given a status within the instruments of government of the university. Furthermore, in guaranteeing academic staff the freedom to bring forward and test hypotheses without consideration of any impact on their career, the Statute helped to maintain UCL's international competitiveness against other institutions with similar provisions.

- 32.5 Recommendation 2 of the Working Group's proposals updated the Statute in order to comply with current employment law. Recommendation 3 was designed to address the principle of fairness through the insertion of the sentence '*The provisions of this Statute shall apply to any member of staff with comparable academic employment duties to those staff named in 3(1)(a) above irrespective of the title of their position.*' In the view of the Working Group, Statute 18 would be fit for purpose once these amendments had been made.
- 32.6 Professor Clapp noted that the Working Group had identified a wider problem in the restricted definition of academic staff groups at Statute 18 3(1)(a). The groups concerned were defined by job title rather than by role, whereas the creation in recent years of titles such as, for example, 'Professorial Research Associate' or 'Teaching Fellow' had resulted in a significant increase in the number of staff carrying out academic activities but not benefitting from the protection afforded by the Statute.

**Discussion:**

- 32.7 In response to a question, Professor Clapp noted that although the issue of academic staff nomenclature fell outside the Terms of Reference of the Working Group, it had become clear to the Working Group that this was an issue closely bound up with any discussion of a review of Statute 18. AB members drew attention to a lack of consistency in the use of such titles across the institution and a consequent lack of clarity to students.
- 32.8 The Provost noted that a comprehensive review of the nomenclature of senior academic posts might now be timely, notably in view of the lack of recognition outside the UK of the distinction between 'Senior Lecturer' and 'Reader'. Although proposals for such a review had not been met with universal approbation in the past [*AB minute 43, 2004-05 refers*], it was clear that in the context of the current discussion there was a strong case for revisiting the issue. The Provost also suggested that the criteria for promotion could usefully be reviewed as a part of this process, alongside reconsideration of the appropriate reflection of teaching, enabling and outreach activities in the promotion process, and the impact of this on questions of gender equality. There was strong support from members of AB for a review of both academic nomenclature and the promotion criteria as suggested by the Provost.
- 32.9 The Provost proposed that the recommendations of the Working Group be taken forward to Council and he invited AB to indicate its support for that proposal by a show of hands. The proposal was endorsed overwhelmingly by AB.

**33 SCHEDULE OF DELEGATED POWERS – REVISION**

**Noted:**

- 33.1 A paper from the AB Secretary at AB 3-20 (12-13).

**Reported:**

- 33.2 A paper on the delegation of AB's powers (which had proposed replacing the current Schedule of Delegated Powers<sup>2</sup> with an updated version in order to reflect a number of organisational and other changes which had taken place since the Schedule was approved in November 2008) had been submitted to the AB meeting of 20 February 2013 [*AB Minute 22, 2012-13*]. At that meeting, it had been noted that a further paper would be submitted once consideration had been given to a number of issues which had been raised by AB members, relating principally to the proposed delegation of certain powers to HRPC. The paper at AB 3-20 (12-13) included additional background information on the Schedule, further detail on the operation of HRPC and a revised proposal for the operation of the proposed delegation to HRPC.

**Discussion:**

- 33.3 The convenor of the AB non-professorial group expressed concern, on behalf of the group, that the HRPC had a narrower membership than had been the case with the former Academic Staff Appointments and Promotions Committee, and furthermore that the composition of HRPC was not Athena Swan compliant. The Provost noted this as an important issue, whilst drawing the attention of AB to the fact that responsibility for matters of promotion lay with the Academic Promotions Committee.
- 33.4 It was noted that Council had taken the decision to disestablish the Appointment and Promotions Committee without prior reference to AB, although this had affected the exercise of the delegated powers of AB. An AB member suggested that the remit of the HRPC would overlap with the issues of job titles and promotion discussed previously [*Minute 32 refers.*] The Provost noted that he would envisage that any future review of academic titles would be discussed by AB.
- 33.5 Concern was expressed by some AB members that they had not had adequate time to consider or reach a view on the proposals set out in AB 3-20 (12-13) as the paper had been circulated after the agenda for the meeting.
- 33.6 The Provost agreed that in light of the issue which had been raised with regard to the diversity of the membership of HRPC (on which advice would need to be sought) and the concerns of members that there had been insufficient time to consider the proposals adequately due to the late circulation of the paper, the officers would withdraw the paper and that he would brief his successor on this issue, with a view to the matter being brought back to AB in due course.

**34 FACULTIES AND ACADEMIC UNITS OF UCL**

**Noted:**

- 34.1 Proposals for the establishment of academic units of UCL as set out in the note at AB 3-21 (12-13).

**RECOMMENDED to Council:**

- 34.2 That the proposals for the establishment of academic units of UCL as set out in the note at AB 3-21(12-13) be approved.

---

<sup>2</sup> Available from the AB web pages at <http://www.ucl.ac.uk/ras/acs/governance/committees/ab>

## 35 LEAD OFFICERS REPORTS

**Noted:**

- 35.1 At its meeting on 6 July 2010, Council approved proposals for a rationalisation of UCL's formally established committees. One of the recommendations approved by Council was that in certain cases where a standing committee was to be disestablished a 'Lead Officer' arrangement would be put in place. Under such an arrangement, the officer(s) with key responsibility for an area previously covered by a standing committee would, *inter alia*, prepare an annual report on developments within that area, which would then be submitted to AC, AB and Council.
- 35.2 Lead Officer reports on the following areas:
- AB 3-22 (12-13): Careers and Employability;
  - AB 3-23 (12-13): Student Accommodation;
  - AB 3-24 (12-13): Student Welfare Co-ordination.

These reports had been endorsed by AC at its meeting on 9 May 2013 and would be submitted to Council at its meeting on 9 July 2013.

**Approved and RECOMMENDED to Council:**

- 35.3 Lead Officers' reports on (i) Careers and Employability, (ii) Student Accommodation, and (iii) Student Welfare Co-ordination at AB 3-22 (12-13) - AB 3-24 (12-13).

## 36 ACADEMIC STAFF ELECTIONS TO COUNCIL

**Noted:**

- 36.1 The Council officers had been reviewing, in consultation with the AB members concerned, the current arrangements and timetable for the election of academic staff members of AB to serve on Council. At its meeting on 10 April 2013, Council approved, in principle, new arrangements for the timing of those elections, subject to those proposals (including details of transitional arrangements) being put to AB. A note from the Secretary to Council and the Secretary to AB setting out the new arrangements was at AB 3-25 (12-13).

**Approved:**

- 36.2 The proposals for academic staff elections to Council at AB 3-25 (12-13).

## 37 DATES OF MEETINGS 2013-14

**Noted:**

- 37.1 Regulation for Management 3.9 provided that:

The dates of Ordinary Meetings of the Academic Board in any one year shall be settled before the commencement of that year.

**Approved:**

37.2 That Academic Board meetings be held on the following dates in the academic year 2013-14:

- **Wednesday 23 October 2013**
- **Wednesday 19 February 2014**
- **Wednesday 21 May 2014**

**38 APPOINTMENTS**

**Noted:**

38.1 The list of recent appointments (i) of Deans of Faculty, (ii) of Heads of Academic Departments and (iii) to established Chairs and Readerships tenable at UCL at AB 3-26 (12-13).

**39 ACTION TAKEN BY THE CHAIR ON BEHALF OF ACADEMIC BOARD**

**39A Academic Board Working Groups on Established Chairs and Readerships**

**Noted:**

39A.1 The Chair of AB had taken action on behalf of AB to approve the membership of the ABWGs listed at <sup>\*3</sup> AB 3-27 (12-13).

**39B Established Chairs and Readerships**

**Noted:**

39B.1 The Chair of AB had taken action on behalf of AB in relation to the following established Chairs and Readerships:

- that Professor James Anderson, Professor of Organic Chemistry in the Department of Chemistry, be appointed to the established Alexander Williamson Chair of Chemistry with effect from 1 March 2013;
- that the Chair of Macroeconomics in the Department of Economics held by Professor Orazio Attanasio be renamed the Jeremy Bentham Chair of Economics with effect from 1 May 2013;
- that a Chair of Economics in the Department of Economics, currently held by Professor Andrew Chesher, be renamed the William Stanley Jevons Chair of Economics and Economic Measurement with effect from 1 May 2013.

---

<sup>3</sup> An appendix reference preceded by an asterisk indicates that, for the sake of economy, the document was not issued with the Agenda but will be filed with these Minutes.

### **39C Suspension of students in accordance with UCL Statute 11(3)**

***Noted:***

39C.1 UCL Statute 11(3) provided that the Provost shall have the power:

...in accordance with Regulations made by the Council on the advice of the Academic Board, to suspend a Student from any or all of his or her studies in the College and to exclude a Student from the College and its precincts and other buildings and premises owned or occupied by the College. In the case of suspension or exclusion for reasons other than academic insufficiency the Provost shall report such suspension or exclusion to the Academic Board and to the Council and shall ensure that appropriate action is taken forthwith under disciplinary or other appropriate procedure.

39C.2 In session 2011-12 one student was suspended and in session 2012-13 five students were suspended in accordance with the above.

### **40 TERM DATES 2014-15**

***Noted:***

40.1 The most recently agreed set of term dates confirmed by the Director of Registry and Academic Services, for academic session 2014-15, was as follows:

- 22 September 2014 – 12 December 2014
- 12 January 2015 – 27 March 2015
- 27 April 2015 – 12 June 2015

### **41 ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **41A Valete**

41A.1 The convenor of the non-professorial members group drew the attention of AB to the fact that this was the last meeting of AB due to be chaired by Professor Malcolm Grant. AB members warmly thanked Professor Grant for his work as President and Provost over the last ten years. The Provost paid tribute to the dedication of staff across the university and concluded by expressing his hope that UCL would give his successor, Professor Michael Arthur, the same generous degree of support as it had afforded him over the past decade.

### **42 DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

***Noted:***

42.1 The next meeting of AB would be on **Wednesday 23 October 2013 at 4.00pm** (venue to be confirmed).

JASON CLARKE  
Secretary to Academic Board  
June 2013