



SPECIAL MEETING OF ACADEMIC BOARD

18 May 2017

MINUTES

PRESENT¹:

Provost (*Chair*)

Professor Bas Aarts; Professor Dario Alfe; Professor Robin Ali; Ms Wendy Appleby; Professor Erik Arstad; Professor Jonathan Ashmore; Professor Tomaso Aste; Professor Kristin M. Bakke; Professor Maria S. Balda; Professor Chris Barker; Professor Gillian Bates; Professor Benjamin Baum; Professor Matthew Beaumont; Dr Yasminah Beebeejaun; Professor Stephan Beck; Professor Jonathan Bell; Professor Vittorio L Bellotti; Professor Andrew Bevan; Dr Jason Blackstock; Professor Ann Blandford; Professor Martin Bobak; Mr Timothy Bodley-Scott; Professor Helen Birch; Professor Stephanie Bird; Professor David Bowler; Professor Frances Brodsky; Professor Jeremy Brown; Professor Rob Brownstone; Professor Victor Buchli; Professor Neil Burgess; Professor Jon Butterworth; Professor Franco Cacialli; Professor Joseph Cain; Dr Ben Caplin; Professor Matteo Carandini; Ms Bonita Carboo; Professor Claire Carmalt; Professor Richard Catlow; Professor Lucie Clapp; Professor Rachel Chambers; Professor Guillaume Charras; Professor Kwang Choy; Dr Elisabete Cidre; Professor Shamshad Cockcroft; Professor David Coen; Dr Alun R. Coker; Professor Marjan Colletti; Professor John Collinge; Professor Susan Collins; Professor Stephen Colvin; Professor Marc-Olivier Coppens; Mr Mark Crawford; Professor Marcos Cruz; Professor Stuart Cull-Candy; Ms Sonja Curtis; Professor Daniel Cutler; Professor Nicola Countouris; Professor Gregory Dart; Professor Pamela Davidson; Professor Stephen W Davies; Professor Julio Davila; Professor Brian Day; Professor Izzat Darwazeh; Professor Robertus De Bruin; Dr Rachele De Felice; Professor Dina D'Ayala; Professor Robertus A. M. de Bruin; Professor Jan Derry; Dr Vanessa Diaz; Professor Simon Dixon; Professor Annette Dolphin; Professor Chris Donlan; Ms Elizabeth Dow; Professor Michael Duchen; Professor Dorothy Duffy; Professor Piet Eeckhout; Dr Karen Edge; Professor Susan E. Evans; Professor Mark Farrant; Professor Ariberto Fassati; Professor Helen Fielding; Professor Margot Finn; Professor Andrew J Fisher; Professor Elizabeth Fisher; Professor Maria Fitzgerald; Professor Mark Ford; Professor Becky Francis; Professor Eric Fraga; Dr Richard Freeman; Nick Freemantle; Dr Martin Fry; Professor Mary Fulbrook; Professor Nick Gallent; Dr Andrew Gardner; Professor Sebastian Gardner; Professor Asterios Gavriilidis; Professor Hazel G Genn; Professor Francesco Luigi Gervasio; Professor Alasdair Gibb; Professor Adam Gibson; Dr Deborah Gill; Professor Derek Gilroy; Dr Lesley Jane Gourlay ; Professor Ivan Gout; Professor Andrew G. Green; Professor Alistair Greig; Professor Hugh Griffiths; Dr Jennifer Griffiths; Dr Paul Groves; Professor Helen Hackett;

¹ An attendance sheet was circulated for signature at the meeting. Any colleagues present who did not sign the sheet and whose names are therefore not recorded as present are invited to notify the AB Secretary's office (e-mail – academic.services@ucl.ac.uk) so that their names can be included in the record when these Minutes are confirmed at the next scheduled meeting of AB.

Professor Helen Hailes; Professor Sue Hamilton; Professor Alison Hardcastle; Dr Andrew J Harris; Professor Kenneth Harris; Professor Alister Hart; Professor John A Hartley; Professor Kirsten Harvey; Professor Nigel Harvey; Professor Robert Harvey; Ms Melissa Hazen; Professor Valerie Hazan; Professor Jenny Head; Professor Jem Hebden; Professor Michael Heinrich; Professor Harry Hemingway; Professor Ian Hepburn; Professor Theo Hermans; Professor Benjamin Heydecker; Professor Robert S Heyderman; Professor Simon Hillson; Dr Evangelos Himonides; Professor Aroon Hingorani; Professor Robin Hirsch; Dr Andrea Hodgetts; Dr Arne Hofmann; Professor Martin Holbraad; Ms Caroline Holden; Professor Jonathan A. Holmes; Professor Bart Hoogenboom; Mrs Lori Houlihan; Professor Stephen P Hunt; Dr Hynek Pikhart; Professor Glen Jeffery; Professor Kate Jeffrey; Professor Kristjan Jessen; Professor Helene Joffe; Professor Francis Johnson; Dr Elizabeth Jury; Professor Prof. Benjamin Kaplan; Professor Robert Kleta; Mr Rex Knight; Mr Tom Knight; Professor Jonathan Knowles; Professor Martin Koltzenburg; Professor Susan Kuechler-Fogden; Professor Yaroslav Kurylev; Professor Ofer Lahav; Professor Marie Lall; Professor Diana Laurillard; Professor Andrew Leak; Professor Alexander Leff; Professor Louis Lemieux; Professor George Letsas; Professor Paola Lettieri; Professor Caren Levy; Professor Glyn Lewis; Professor Alison Lloyd; Professor Marilena Loizidou; Professor David Lomas; Professor Mark Lowdell; Professor Robert Lumley; Professor Philip Luthert; Professor Gary J Lye; Professor Mark Lythgoe; Professor Gary McCulloch; Professor Sandy MacRobert; Professor Gesine Manuwald; Dr Jenny Marie; Professor Alexi Marmot; Professor John Martin; Professor Karl Matter; Professor Michael Martin; Dr Colin Marx; Professor Karl Matter; Dr Margaret J Mayston; Professor Alastair McClelland; Professor Eamon McCrory; Professor Robb McDonald; Professor Christopher McGregor; Professor Chris McManus; Professor Paul F. McMillan; Dr Saladin D Meckled-Garcia; Professor Francesca Medda; Professor Philip G. Meredith; Professor Kevin J Middlebrook; Professor Neil Mitchell; Professor John Morton; Professor Stephen E Moss; Professor Vivek Mudera; Professor John Mullan; Professor Jan-Peter Muller; Professor Veronique Munoz-Darde; Dr Charlene Murphy; Mr David E Newton; Professor Thanh T Nguyen; Professor Ryan Nichol; Professor Shinichi Ohnuma; Professor John O'Keefe; Dr Kit F Opie; Professor Daniel Osborn; Professor Norbert Pachler; Professor Sandip Patel; Professor Paola Pedarzani; Professor Jason Peacey; Dr Andy Pearce; Dr Anne Peasey; Professor Barbara Pedley; Professor Alan Penn; Professor Arthur Petersen; Professor Konstantinos Petrides; Professor Franck Pichaud; Professor Kholoud Porter; Professor David Price; Professor Stephen D. Price; Professor Sarah L Price; Professor Saul Purton; Professor Stephen Quirke; Professor Geraint Rees; Professor Neil Rennie; Professor Ferruccio Renzoni; Professor Peter Rich; Mr William Richardson; Professor Helen Roberts; Professor Sue Rogers; Professor Gary Rubin; Professor Meg Russell; Ms Fiona Ryland; Professor Ruben Saakyan; Professor Maneesh Sahani; Professor Patricia Salinas; Dr Benet Salway ; Professor Vieri Samek-Lodovici; Professor Rose Marie San Juan; Professor Nader Saffari; Professor Andreas Schaefer; Mr Hunter Schone; Professor Ralf Schoepfer; Professor Anthony W Segal; Professor Andrea Sella; Professor David Selwood; Professor Sonu Shamdasani; Professor David Shanks; Professor Ricky A Sharma; Professor Bob Sheil; Professor Stephen Shennan; Professor Elizabeth Shepherd; Professor Graham Shields-Zhou; Professor Alexander Shluger; Professor Talvinder Sihra; Dr David Sim; Professor Richard Simons; Professor Michael Singer; Dr Bill Sillar; Professor Lucia Sivilotti; Professor Trevor Smart; Professor Anthony Smith; Professor Kenneth Smith; Dr Hazel Smith; Dr Reecha Sofat; Professor Alan Sokal; Professor Eva Sorensen; Dr Pilar Garcia Souto; Professor Jane Sowden; Professor Sarah Spurgeon; Professor Kaila Srail; Dr. Helen R. Stagg; Professor Andrew Stahl; Professor James Steele; Professor Judith Stephenson; Professor Claudio D. Stern; Professor Sacha Stern; Dr Rhiannon Stevens; Professor Michael Stewart; Professor Andrew Stockman; Professor Melvyn Stokes; Professor Lars Stixrude; Professor Neil Strachan; Dr Sherrill Stroschein; Professor Judith Suissa; Professor Peter Swaab; Dr Kriszta Szendroi; Professor Nicolas Szita; Professor Philippa Talmud; Professor Jeremy Tanner; Professor Peter Taylor; Professor Melissa Terras; Dr Emanuela Tilley; Professor Nigel J Titchener-Hooker; Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson; Professor Chronis Tzedakis; Professor Bart Vanhaesebroeck; Hans van de Koot; Professor Gert van der Heijden; Professor

Phiroze Vasunia; Professor Yiannis Ventikos; Professor Essi Viding; Professor Gabriella Vigliocco; Professor Serena Viti; Professor Bridget Wade; Professor Lucy Walker; Mr Martin Walsh; Professor Paul Warburton; Ms Susan Ware; Professor Li Wei; Professor David Wengrow; Professor Todd Whitelaw; Professor Bryan Williams; Dr Andrew Wills; Professor Stephen Wilson; Professor John Wood; Professor Nicholas Wood; Dr. Alison Wright; Professor Derek Yellon; Professor Christopher Yeo; Professor Ian Zachary; Professor Mehrdad Zanganeh

In attendance: Mr Derfel Owen (Secretary to Academic Board); Ms Siobhan Fitzgerald (Academic Services); Ms Sandra Hinton (Academic Services); Mr Richard Akerele (Academic Services).

Apologies for absence were received from: Dr Joerg T Albert; Professor Jim Anderson; Professor Timothy R Arnett; Professor David Attwell; Professor Jürg Bähler; Professor James Bainbridge; Professor Stephen Ball; Professor Richard Bellamy; Professor Michael Berkowitz; Professor Wendy Best; Professor Martin Birchall; Sarah-Jayne Blakemore; Dame Nicola Brewer; Professor Chris R. Brewin; Professor Simon Cane; Professor Robert Carter; Dr Mike Cheetham; Professor Olga Ciccarelli; Professor Brian Collins; Ms Tricia Combs; Professor Tessa Crompton; Dr Melanie Ehren; Professor Carol Dezateux; Pauline Dodi; Professor David Dobson; Professor Michael Duchen; Professor Andrew Eder; Dr Karen Edge; Professor Alison Fuller; Professor Naomi Fulop; Ms Christine Gaston; Professor Mark Geller; Professor Xavier Golay; Professor Nikolaos Gonis; Professor Elizabeth Graham; Ms Jessica Gramp; Dr Sandra Leaton Gray; Professor Toby Greany; Professor Nicholas D.E. Greene; Professor John Greenwood; Professor Paul D Griffiths; Professor Serge Guillas; Professor Patrick Haggard; Professor George Hamilton; Professor Peter Hansford; Professor Mark Hewitson; Professor Stefan Howorka; Professor Giandomenico Iannetti; Professor David Isenberg; Professor Kate Jeffery; Professor Carey Jewitt; Professor Brad Karp; Dr. Sarabajaya Kumar; Professor Yaroslav Kurylev; Professor Marie Lall; Professor Alison Lloyd; Professor Georgina Mace; Professor Anson W. Mackay; Dr Merle Mahon; Professor Usha Menon; Professor Carlo Marinelli; Professor Mark Marsh; Professor Charles Marson; Professor Juan Pedro Martinez-Barbera; Professor Mark Maslin; Dr Anna Mavrogianni; Professor Usha Menon; Professor Michel Michaelides; Professor Susan Michie; Dr Jennifer Mindell; Professor Paul Mitchell; Professor Sara Mole; Professor Gudrun Moore; Professor Huw Morris; Professor Peter Mullany; Professor Elizabeth Murray; Professor Andrew Nunn; Professor Colm O'Cinneide; Professor Enrico Palandri; Professor Rachael Pearson; Mr Richard Pettinger; Dr Inés Pineda-Torra; Professor Stephen Quirke; Professor Anisur Rahman; Professor Thilo Rehren; Professor Toby Richards; Professor Eleanor Robson; Professor Jonathan Roiser; Professor Dmitri A. Rusakov; Professor Giampietro Schiavo; Professor Anette Schrag; Professor Clare Selden; Professor Mala M. Shah; Dr Lion Shahab; Professor Atul Singhal; Professor David Skuse; Professor Volker Sommer; Dr Kriszta Szendroi; Professor Stuart Taylor; Ms Olga Thomas; Professor Juergen Thurow; Professor Derek A Tocher; Professor John Tomaney; Professor Nick Tyler; Professor Laura Vaughan; Professor Hans van Wees; Professor Sarah Walker; Professor Lucy Wedderburn; Professor Graham F Welch; Professor Robert West; Dr Norman Williams; Dr James Wilson; Professor Maria Wyke; Professor Ziheng Yang; Dr Stan W Zochowski

Key to abbreviations

AB	Academic Board
AC	Academic Committee
DfE	Department for Education
EU	European Union
GES	Global Engagement Strategy
HE	Higher Education

HEFCE	Higher Education Funding Council for England
NSS	National Student Survey
QAA	Quality Assurance Agency
REF	Research Excellence Framework
SMT	Senior Management Team
TEF	Teaching Excellence Framework
ULCU	University College London Union
VP	Vice-Provost

Matter for discussion

59 ACADEMIC BOARD REPRESENTATION IN INFORMING DECISIONS OVER THE CURRENT AND FUTURE TRAJECTORY OF UCL

[PAPER 5-01, 2016-17]

- 59.1** ***Received*** – an oral introduction from the Provost.
- 59.2** The Provost explained that the Special Meeting had been called in response to issues raised by a group of senior academics, resulting in the motion to establish a special Governance Committee of Academic-Board. The Provost welcomed the initiative on the agenda and the opportunity to discuss the effectiveness of Academic Board; though he had worked with Senates in the past and considered them the most effective model for academic engagement, he confirmed that he was happy to work with an improved Academic Board, and was not seeking to create an Academic Senate.
- 59.3** ***Received*** – a presentation from Professor Derek Gilroy, Head of Centre for Clinical Pharmacology, a representative of the signatories of the letter calling for the Special Meeting.
- 59.4** The purpose of the meeting and the proposed role of the Governance Committee was outlined. It was noted that 22 signatories from across different Faculties and Schools called for the Special Meeting after reviewing the results of a survey sent to Academic Board members. It was stressed that the Governance Committee would be accountable to and in the service of Academic Board, with no independent powers. The purpose of the Governance Committee would be to pre-scrutinise and digest material for discussion at Academic Board, thereby guiding Academic Board on which matters required further, focussed attention. The aim of this would be to enhance the engagement of members of Academic Board with matters requiring academic input, and enable more focussed and detailed scrutiny of these matters.
- 59.5** There was significant agreement of the need to review how Academic Board worked, however a number of members expressed concern about the proposal to establish a Governance Committee and wanted instead an opportunity to consider alternatives. It was felt that the proposed action of pre-processing or reviewing material for Academic

Board to discuss was unwelcome, as it would filter-out material where accessing everything was preferable and necessary for full-engagement in an on-going dialogue by members of AB.

- 59.6** Some members commented that it was the responsibility of members of Academic Board to make themselves aware of and keep pace with the issues being discussed at Academic Board by fully preparing for meetings and thereby actively engaging in the process. Some agreed that the volume of papers circulated before the meetings were too great for academic staff to review thoroughly, and that this prohibited their full engagement, but suggested that an earlier circulation of material would resolve this issue, rather than the production of a briefing document by a Governance Committee. Counter to this, a number of members commented that they would welcome the addition of a Governance Committee that would pre-scrutinise papers and proposals, and it was suggested that this would encourage more engagement with Academic Board because it would allow more members to engage.
- 59.7** A number of members commented that there was a divergence between the academic community and the Senior Management Team, and that better communications, earlier opportunities to discuss major developments, and more frequent meetings of AB would narrow the gap. There were concerns that the motion to form a Governance Committee would not alone resolve the problems that had been identified, and that more debate about how to better engage academics, while respecting their busy schedules of teaching and research activities, was required.
- 59.8** Some members commented that they were not in favour of a Governance Committee because of its potential to be politicised and give greater powers to the few, rather than engaging the many. There were concerns that a Governance Committee would endorse the views of those members of Academic Board that were most actively involved, rather than finding ways to engage the wider community of academic staff at UCL, and a worry that this would lead to less engagement overall. A counter view was put forward suggesting that the proposed Governance Committee would be democratically elected and transparent, and would complement and serve Academic Board to assist its members and thereby encourage more engagement and involvement.
- 59.9** It was suggested that the proposed Governance Committee would be able to advise on the pace of business and decision making, ensuring that decisions were not rushed through and not fully scrutinised.
- 59.10** The Chair called for a show of hands and there was a majority in favour of the proposal as follows:

RESOLVED:

That Academic Board resolves to establish a special Governance Committee of Academic Board (as a sub-committee of AB, under Statute 7(12)) to: i) Advise Academic Board on the running and structure of the Board, including proposing standing orders for its own running to Academic Board, and scrutinising strategic decisions that impact academic work at UCL, and ii) Improve the representation of the views of Academic Board on matters affecting the academic work of UCL to the Senior Management Team and to Council.

Membership of this committee, the quorum of which shall be 10, shall be as follows:

- a. Any person formerly (but not currently) elected to Council from AB within the last 6 years and who is still at UCL shall be invited to attend *ex officio* as a voting member;
- b. 9 members elected from the professorial membership of AB as voting members;
- c. 6 members elected from the non-professorial membership of AB as voting members;
- d. 3 student members selected by the UCL Union from the AB student representatives in any one year, as voting members;
- e. 2 members of Academic Committee elected by that committee, as voting members;
- f. Any expert persons invited by the committee to assist in its deliberations, as non-voting members.
- g. The committee shall elect its own chairperson.

UCL Professional services shall arrange for election of this committee within 6 weeks of this meeting.

59.11 The Provost thanked members for their attendance and the good spirit of the debate.

60 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

60.1 The next Academic Board meeting will be held on:

Wednesday 11th Oct 2017

DERFEL OWEN

Director of Academic Services and Secretary to Academic Board

Tel: 0203 1088209, UCL ext. 58209

Email: d.owen@ucl.ac.uk

23 May 2017