

ACADEMIC BOARD – SPECIAL MEETING

This meeting of Academic Board was inquorate. The meeting proceeded on the basis that there were no matters for approval and that members were being invited to advise UCL Council

Tuesday 14 June 2016

MINUTES

PRESENT¹:

Provost (*Chair*)

Ms Wendy Appleby; Professor Nick Brook; Professor Jon Butterworth; Professor Lucie Clapp; Dr Karen Edge; Dr Agapi Emmanouilidou; Professor Susan Evans; Dr Martin Fry; Dr Hugh Goodacre; Dr Paul Groves; Professor Robert Kleta; Mr Rex Knight; Professor Martin Koltzenburg; Professor Susan Kuechler-Fogden; Dr Andrew Logsdail; Dr Helga Lúthersdóttir; Professor Sandy MacRobert; Dr Margaret Mayston; Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia; Ms Suguna Nair; Professor John Porter; Professor Rosalind Raine; Professor Patricia Salinas; Professor Ralf Schoepfer; Professor Anthony Segal; Professor Andrea Sella; Professor Sonu Shamdasani; Professor Lucia Sivilotti; Professor Sacha Stern; Dr Fiona Strawbridge; Dr Sherrill Stroschein; Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson; Professor Semir Zeki.

In attendance: Dr Elettra Carbone; Mrs Lori Houlihan; Mr Geoff Lang; Dame DeAnne Julius (Chair of Council); Mr Nick McGhee (Acting Secretary); Ms Chandan Shah; Mr Simon To.

Apologies for absence were received from: Dame Nicola Brewer; Professor Frances Brodsky; Professor Matteo Carandini; Dr Celia Caulcott; Dr Sofia Christou-Savina; Professor John Collinge; Dr Jason Davies; Professor Annette Dolphin; Professor Elizabeth Dow; Professor Andrew Eder; Dr Melanie Ehren; Ms Ava Fatah gen. Schieck; Professor Bryony Franklin; Dr Richard Freeman; Professor Mary Fulbrook; Professor Dilly Fung; Dr Haidy Geismar; Professor Dame Hazel Genn; Professor Xavier Golay; Professor Graham Hart; Dr Evangelos Himonides; Professor David Lomas; Mr Murilo Lubambo de Melo; Professor Gesine Manuwald; Dr Helen Matthews; Professor Usha Menon; Dr Jennifer Mindell; Professor Henrietta Moore; Professor John Mullan; Professor Andrew Nevins; Professor Barbara Pedley; Professor Sarah Price; Professor Stephen Quirke; Professor Geraint Rees; Professor Jonathan Roiser; Professor Mala Shah; Professor Robert Sheil; Professor Lorraine Sherr; Professor Richard Simons; Dr Jolene Skordis-Worrall; Professor Anthony Smith; Dr Hazel Smith; Dr Junwang Tang; Ms Olga Thomas; Ms Emanuela Tilley; Professor Rosemary Varley; Professor Thomas Voit; Mr Nigel Waugh; Dr Gavin Winston; Professor Ian Chi Kei Wong.

¹ An attendance sheet was circulated for signature at the meeting. Any colleagues present who did not sign the sheet and whose names are therefore not recorded as present are invited to notify the AB Secretary's office (e-mail – academic.services@ucl.ac.uk) so that their names can be included in the record when these Minutes are confirmed at the next scheduled meeting of AB.

Key to abbreviations

AB	Academic Board
AGWG	Academic Governance Working Group
CERG	Council Effectiveness Review Group
CUC	Committee of University Chairs
SMAB	Special Meeting of Academic Board
SMT	Senior Management Team
UCLU	UCL (Students') Union

1 COUNCIL EFFECTIVENESS REVIEW REPORT

[SMAB PAPER 5-01, 2015-16]

- 1.1 **Received** – presentations from Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia, Chair of the AGWG, and Mr Rex Knight, Vice-Provost (Operations), summarising the process and the recommendations of the AGWG and the CERG respectively.
- 1.2 The proposals contained in the paper would be considered by Council at its meeting on 12 July 2016. The purpose of the current meeting was to canvass the views of AB members in order that these could be conveyed to Council via the minutes.
- 1.3 AB discussed the issue identified in the report of the relative lack of diversity in the elected constituency to Council, and the most appropriate mechanisms for tackling this. The specific recommendations outlined in Appendix 14 had been developed by the CERG after consideration of practice elsewhere, including in UCLU. As set out in the report, however, these recommendations would be submitted to Council as a record of discussion, rather than for approval. Instead, recommendation [j] proposed that Academic Board be invited to consider and propose a mechanism to ensure that its six elected members included at least one from each of UCL's four Schools, and at least two from each gender. If the recommendation was approved by Council, the matter would come back to AB in the autumn. AB members noted the difference between descriptive and substantive representation and cited a number of problematic issues around quotas. There was some suggestion that a more light-touch approach, in which the candidacy of individuals with (unspecified) protected characteristics would be encouraged, was likely to be preferred.
- 1.4 Individual members expressed a view that effectiveness reviews should be carried out by an external body. The Chair of Council reported that this had been considered, in light of discussion at a CUC event which had suggested that practice was approximately evenly split across the sector, with a tendency to appoint external reviewers whenever a particular kind of change was being sought. As the previous effectiveness review had been external, and as the Chair had been appointed relatively recently and had little invested in the current arrangements, an internal process with an external member on the group had been considered appropriate in this case.
- 1.5 It was suggested that the membership of the CERG should have included a Professor.
- 1.6 In response to a query from a member the Provost stated that Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker was a temporary member of SMT as he was Acting Dean, and that there was no provision in the regulations for temporary arrangements such as when a member of Council becomes an Acting Dean.

- 1.7 In response to a query from an AB member, the Secretary to Council confirmed that Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker had resigned from Council in recent days following formal approval of his appointment as a Dean, and that an election notice to fill a casual vacancy in the professorial constituency would be issued shortly.
- 1.8 A member of AB had submitted a number of comments in writing in advance of the meeting, including (in addition to issues referred to above), that the amendments to Regulation 2.2 ought also to include (a) a statement that elected members of Council were barred from becoming SMT members until they had stood down from Council, and (b) that in the circumstances of a temporary absence from Council of more than two meetings, the person appointed to the temporary vacancy would be the person with the next highest vote in the relevant election.

2 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

- 2.1 The next Meeting of AB would be held on **Wednesday 5 October 2016** at **2.05pm**.

NICK MCGHEE
Academic Services
June 2016