



## Academic Board

Wednesday 12 May 2021<sup>1</sup>

### MINUTES

**Present:** Dr Michael Spence, President and Provost (Chair).

Dr Ali Abolfathi; Professor David Abraham; Mr Adnan Ali; Dr Mark Altaweel; Dr Seth Anziska; Ms Wendy Appleby; Dr Manuel Arroyo-Kalin; Professor Jonathan Ashmore; Professor David Atkinson; Professor David Attwell; Dr Paul Ayris; Professor Jurg Bahler; Professor Maryse Bailly; Dr Emily Baker; Dr Simon Banks; Professor Kathryn Batchelor; Professor Polina Bayvel; Professor Jonathan Bell; Professor Jeff Bezemer; Professor Robert Biel; Professor Stephanie Bird; Dr Matthew Blain; Professor Brad Blitz; Professor David Bogle; Professor Rachel Bowlby; Professor Annie Britton; Dr Geraldine Brodie; Professor Clare Brooks; Ms Annabel Brown; Dr Nicole Brown; Professor Jamie Brown; Professor Robert Brownstone; Dr Suzy Buckley; Professor Vishwanie Budhram-Mahadeo; Professor Neil Burgess; Dr Helene Burningham; Professor Gaetano Burriesci; Professor Jonathan Butterworth; Mr Tadhg Caffrey; Professor Nauro Campos; Professor Licia Capra; Professor Matteo Carandini; Professor Claire Carmalt; Professor Michael Cheetham; Professor Kwang Choy; Dr Evangelia Chrysikou; Professor Beverley Clark; Dr Alun Coker; Professor John Collinge; Professor Susan Collins; Professor Claire Colomb; Professor Barbara Conradt; Professor Anthony Costello; Professor Anna Cox; Ms Sonja Curtis; Dr Maria D'Argenio; Professor Anthony David; Dr Lucy Davies; Dr Nathan Davies; Professor Nathan Davies; Professor Sally Day; Professor Dina D'Ayala; Professor Michelle De Haan; Professor Bert De Reyck; Professor Rohan de Silva; Professor Marc Deisenroth; Professor Andreas Demosthenous; Professor Vanessa Diaz; Professor Paul Dodds; Ms Dominique Draï; Professor Paulo Drinot; Professor Ian Eames; Professor Frances Edwards; Professor Michael Ehrenstein; Professor Mark Emberton; Ms Ecem Ergin; Professor Joanna Evans; Dr Russell Evans; Professor Susan Evans; Ms Pascale Fanning-Tichborne; Professor Ariberto Fassati; Ms Ava Fatah; Professor Federico Federici; Dr Javier Fernandez Garcia; Professor Delmiro Fernandez-Reyes; Dr Liory Fern-Pollak; Professor Patrizia Ferretti; Professor Andrew Fisher; Professor Maria Fitzgerald; Mr James Ford; Professor Eric Fraga; Dr Bettina Friedrich; Dr Martin Fry; Professor Dorian Fuller; Professor Jonathan Gale; Professor Haidy Geismar; Professor Mark Geller;

---

<sup>1</sup> This meeting was held via videoconference due to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic.

Professor Dame Hazel Genn; Professor Alasdair Gibb; Professor Adam Gibson; Professor Deborah Gill; Professor Richard Gilson; Professor Xavier Golay; Dr Hugh Goodacre; Mr James Gorridge; Professor Lesley Gourlay ; Dr Ryan Grammenos; Ms Emma Grant; Professor Ann Griffin; Dr Anne Grydehoj; Professor Dabo Guan; Professor Francois Guesnet; Professor David Guile; Professor Serge Guillas; Dr Lucia Patrizio Gunning; Professor Helen Hackett; Professor Patrick Haggard; Professor Stephen Hailes; Professor Susan Hamilton; Professor Michael Hanna; Mr Jesper Hansen; Professor Graham Hart; Professor Stephen Hart; Professor Kirsten Harvey; Professor Michael Heinrich; Professor Evangelos Himonides; Professor Michael Hoare; Professor Daniel Hochhauser; Dr Christine Hoffmann; Professor Arne Hofmann; Professor Martin Holbraad; Professor Jane Holder; Professor Andrew Hudson-Smith; Professor John Hyman; Dr Dan Jagger; Mr Rafid Jawad; Professor Helene Joffe; Professor Adrian Jones; Professor Philip Jones; Professor Anthony Julius; Dr Thomas Kador; Professor Lily Kahn; Dr Jens Kandt; Dr John Kelsey; Mr Joshua Kerr; Professor Robert Killley; Dr Maki Kimura; Professor John King; Professor Robert Kleta; Professor Martin Koltzenburg; Professor Patty Kostkova; Ms Katherine Koulle; Mr Dimitrios Kraniotis; Dr Fiona Kyle; Dr Danielle Lamb; Professor Alena Ledeneva; Dr Borja Legarra Herrero; Professor Paola Lettieri; Professor Caren Levy; Professor Wei Li; Professor Astrid Limb; Professor Christoph Lindner; Professor Alison Lloyd; Dr Helga Lúthersdóttir ; Ms Collette Lux; Ms Xuanyi Ma; Dr Isabel Mackay; Professor Sandy MacRobert; Professor Mairead MacSweeney; Professor Eleanor Main; Dr Elvira Mambetisaeva; Dr Giulio Marini; Dr Juliana Martins; Dr Claire McAndrew; Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia; Professor Susan Michie; Professor John Mitchell; Professor Sara Mole; Ms Joanne Moles; Professor Maxine Molyneux; Ms Laure Montangerand; Professor Sharon Morris; Professor Vivek Mudera; Professor John Mullan; Professor Veronique Munoz-Darde; Professor Steven Murdoch; Professor Mirco Musolesi; Professor Florian Mussgnug; Ms Marga Navarrete; Dr Helene Neveu Kringelbach; Dr Mark Newman; Professor Thanh Nguyen; Dr Nikolitsa Nomikou; Dr Alex Norori-McCormac; Dr Abel Nyamapfene; Dr Ademola Odunsi; Professor Martin Oliver; Professor Norbert Pachler; Professor Enrico Palandri; Professor Amos Paran; Professor Jayne Parker; Professor Ivan Parkin; Dr Thomas Peach; Professor Paola Pedarzani; Professor James Phillips; Professor Ann Phoenix; Professor Hynek Pikhart ; Professor Deenan Pillay; Dr Jeffrey Pittaway; Professor Sarah Price; Professor David Price; Professor David Pym; Professor Stephen Quirke; Professor Shamima Rahman; Dr Joana Ramalho; Professor Margaret Rawes; Professor Geraint Rees; Professor Jane Rendell; Professor Ferruccio Renzoni; Professor William Richardson; Professor Miguel Rio; Dr Carol Rivas; Professor Helen Roberts; Dr Tristan Robinson; Dr Flaminia Ronca; Professor Sasha Roseneil; Dr Suzanne Ruddy; Professor Yvonne Rydin; Ms Fiona Ryland; Professor Joanne Santini; Professor Prince Saprui; Dr Tim Scanlon; Professor Ralf Schoepfer; Professor Stephanie Schorge; Professor Eloise Scottford; Professor Toby Seddon; Professor Lion Shahab; Professor Maryam Shahmanesh; Professor Sonu Shamdasani; Professor David Shanks; Dr Ala'a Shehabi; Professor Robert Sheil; Dr Michael Short; Ms Maria Sibiryakova; Mr Justin Siefker; Professor

Talvinder Sihra; Dr Bill Sillar; Professor Angus Silver; Professor Michael Singer; Professor Lucia Sivilotti; Professor Sam Smidt; Mr Andy Smith; Professor Anthony Smith; Professor Samuel Solomon; Professor Pam Sonnenberg; Professor Eva Sorensen; Professor Umber Soueid; Professor Catalina Spataru; Professor Kalia Srai; Dr Uta Staiger; Dr Karen Stepanyan; Professor Claudio Stern; Professor Sacha Stern; Professor Michael Stewart; Mr William Stewart; Dr Sherrill Stroschein; Ms Joanna Stroud; Professor Judith Suissa; Dr Bugra Susler; Mr Bryan Taylor; Professor Irving Taylor; Professor Francesco Saverio Tedesco; Professor Cheryl Thomas; Professor Geraint Thomas; Professor Olga Thomas; Professor Alan Thompson; Professor Jon Thomson; Dr Amy Thornton; Dr Eleanor Tillett; Professor Jordan Timothy; Professor Nigel Titchener-Hooker; Professor John Tomaney; Professor Ahmed Toosy; Professor Jose Torero Cullen; Mr Martyn Towner; Professor Andrea Townsend-Nicholson; Professor Georgios Tsakos; Ms Helen Tsui; Professor Jayant Vaidya; Professor Liz Varga; Mr Clive Vassell; Professor Laura Vaughan; Professor Steven Vaughan; Professor Yiannis Ventikos; Dr Nalini Vittal; Dr Bella Vivat; Ms Yasmin Walker; Dr Ryan Wang; Professor Johanna Waters; Mr Patrick White; Ms Breege Whiten; Professor Amanda Williams; Professor Duncan Wilson; Professor James Wilson; Professor Stephen Wilson; Ms Izabella Wodzka; Professor Selina Wray; Professor Dominic Wyse; Professor Christopher Yeo; Dr Sophie Zadeh; Dr Stan Zochowski.

**In attendance:** Dr Clare Goudy; Ms Freya Markwell; Mr Nick McGhee (Secretary); Ms Magda Morawska; Ms Rachel Port; Ms Olivia Whiteley.

**Apologies:** Dr Declan Chard, Professor Andrew Davenport, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Laurence Lovat, Professor Gesine Manuwald, Professor Moses Oketch, Dr Michaela Pollock, Professor John Potter, Dr Stephen Potts, Professor Elizabeth Shepherd, Professor Trevor Smart, Professor Sarah Walker, Professor Ananth Viswanathan.

## **Part I: Preliminary Formal Business**

### **45 ACADEMIC BOARD MINUTES – 17 MARCH 2021**

45.1 AB discussed the wording of Minute 42A.2 following a suggestion that this be revised to include additional detail. It was agreed that an amended version of the minute would be circulated and brought back to the meeting of 2 June for approval.

### **46 MATTERS ARISING**

46.1 A member asked for an update on the response to the Jewish Society's decision not to make a nomination to the Working Group. The Jewish Society had explained their reasons in a letter circulated to Academic Board on 13

April. These reasons had included the fact that, on reflection, the Society considered that it would be unreasonable to appoint a member to a body the mandate of which conflicted with their own expressed preference to retain the IHRA definition. The reasons cited did not relate to the membership of the Working Group, which had not at that point been confirmed. As Academic Board had resolved to establish the Working Group, the Provost was of the view that it should proceed with its business, although it should be encouraged to ensure that the Jewish student voice was heard in that process.

## **Part II: Matters for Discussion**

### **47 PROVOST'S BUSINESS (Paper 6-34)**

- 47.1 The Provost highlighted the elements of the paper relating to business that would be coming to Academic Board in the near future, including a discussion about institutional strategy and consultation on plans for changes to the management committee structure.
- 47.2 One fundamental element of the strategy conversation would be discussions with the UCL community about the future size and shape of the university. This would need to take account of a number of interdependent considerations, including the need to provide sufficient physical capacity and maintain the estate, the role of online delivery, the composition of the student body, and the implications for the institution's financial sustainability.

### **48 CODE OF CONDUCT FOR RESEARCH (Paper 6-35)**

- 48.1 Professor David Price, Vice-Provost (Research, Innovation and Global Engagement), presented the item.
- 48.2 UCL was commencing a consultation process on the proposed revisions to the Code. The draft had been discussed with Legal Services, the campus trade unions, the students' union, the Deans and research boards, and was now submitted to Academic Board for comment. A wider consultation would take place over the summer with a view to sign-off by the Research Governance Committee and the University Management Committee by the end of the calendar year.
- 48.3 The Code had not been updated since 2013, during which period the legislative environment had changed significantly. The revised Code did not impose any new requirements; rather, it constituted a distillation of the current position, drawing together the most salient features of relevant governmental, legal and UCL sources, and highlighting best practice. The terms 'must', 'should' and 'expected to' therefore reflected the nature of those existing requirements or expectations in UCL or external policy, or in law. As the Code was a summary document, a certain level of detail (such as the timelines

which had to be observed) would not be restated in the Code itself, but this would cross-refer the relevant policies and procedures where appropriate.

- 48.4 AB discussed the question of individual and institutional responsibility, for example in the context of the requirement for staff to be aware of the policies and procedures of partner institutions. It was noted that staff in the school-level Research Coordination Offices were available to advise on such issues.
- 48.5 Members drew attention to the need to prepare for a thorough roll-out of the Code once approved, including the provision of training for research students. Professor Price confirmed that significant publicity was intended around the launch of the revised Code, and that training was under development.
- 48.6 It was intended that the final form of the Code would be an easily-navigated web-page with dropdown menus. The Provost noted that there was scope for improvement in the accessibility of UCL policy and hoped to take concrete steps towards clarifying the obligations on members of staff.

#### 49 **RESEARCH MISCONDUCT PROCEDURE – REVISION** (Paper 6-37)

- 49.1 Wendy Appleby, Registrar and Head of Student and Registry Services, introduced the paper.
- 49.2 Proposed amendments to the Research Misconduct Procedure had been discussed at Academic Board in February 2020 [AB Minute 32, 2019-20] and it had been intended that a further paper be brought back in the summer. That process had been delayed by the pandemic as well as by delays in the anticipated release of a revised procedure by the UK Research Integrity Office (UKRIO), which was still awaited. It was nevertheless proposed that a number of amendments be made at this stage in light of experience of the procedure in recent years, and that this be reviewed again in due course once the UKRIO procedure was available.
- 49.3 It was clarified that the role of the named person at the initial assessment stage was to consider the allegation against the definition of misconduct in research, and that there was the option to take expert advice where this was unclear. In view of the impact on academics even of a referral to the screening stage, it was important that there was an option to close off mistaken or even malicious allegations.
- 49.4 In respect of potential conflicts of interest on the part of the Named Person, it was noted that paragraph C4 provided for the Vice-Provost (Research, Innovation and Global Engagement) or nominee to assume the role of Named Person in such circumstances.
- 49.5 Comments had recently been received from Legal Services and would be fed into the next revision of the Procedure. It would then be taken back to the Research Governance Committee for approval.

## 50 ACADEMIC BOARD STANDING ORDERS (Paper 6-38)

- 50.1 Dr Saladin Meckled-Garcia (GCAB) presented the item.
- 50.2 This was the second reading of the proposed amendments, the first having been on 10 February 2021 [AB Minute 24, 2020-21]. The proposed changes focussed on the arrangement for online meetings and included a new amendment on accessibility. The amendments also addressed the issue of expectations of members' behaviour.
- 50.3 AB discussed the statement in draft Standing Order 15(i) that 'Meetings of the Board shall normally be conducted in person', querying whether the experience of AB meetings over the past year, and particularly the marked rise in attendance, did not suggest that AB should at least consider the merits of continuing to hold some or all meetings online even once social distancing restrictions were lifted. It was confirmed that this paragraph had been included because there was no explicit provision in the Charter and Statutes allowing for electronic meetings. It was agreed that, although the draft made sense in the current statutory context, it would be useful to consult with Academic Board members on the issue with a view to revisiting this when possible.
- 50.4 AB discussed the proper use of the 'chat' feature in Zoom in view of the proposed restrictions in Standing Order 15(viii). Some members thought that the chat function made a positive contribution to the culture of AB, and in particular to the range of view expressed. It was agreed that comments in the chat line should not feed into the formal record as reflected in the Minutes, but that the word 'only' should be removed from the draft.
- 50.5 AB discussed the proposed Standing Order 15(x), which appeared to conceive of debates as necessarily involving members speaking for or against a proposition. AB discussed whether this should be amended to read 'where there is a *binary* debate', but it was still not clear whether this change would adequately address the issue of a diversity of views in a wider debate. It was therefore agreed that 15(10) would be removed from the update (with consequent renumbering), pending a reconsideration of this issue in the future. In the interim, the Provost undertook to seek to ensure that a diversity of views was heard in any discussion at Academic Board.

### **RESOLVED**

- 50.6 **That the proposed amendments to the Standing Orders be adopted with effect from the academic year 2021/22, subject to (i) the removal of the word 'only' from the draft of Standing Order 15(viii), and (ii) the removal of the draft Standing Order 15(x), with consequent renumbering.**

### **Part III: Other Business for approval or Information**

**51 INNOVATION AND ENTERPRISE INTERIM STRATEGY (Paper 6-39)**

51.1 Academic Board received paper.

**52 LEAD OFFICER REPORT: CAREERS AND EMPLOYABILITY (Paper 6-40)**

52.1 Academic Board received the paper.

**53 ACADEMIC BOARD MEMBERSHIP UPDATE (Paper 6-41)**

53.1 Academic Board received the updated membership list.

**54 MINUTES OF OTHER COMMITTEES (Paper 6-42)**

54.1 Academic Board received the minutes of other committees.

**55 DATE OF THE NEXT MEETING**

55.1 2 June 2021 at 2.05-4.00pm.

Nick McGhee  
Secretary to Academic Board  
Email: [n.mcghee@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:n.mcghee@ucl.ac.uk)