

Government Defeat in Lords on Covert Human Intelligence Sources (Criminal Conduct) Bill

Wednesday 13/01/2021

On 13/01/2021 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Covert Human Intelligence Sources (Criminal Conduct) Bill: To prohibit criminal conduct authorisations from authorising covert human intelligence sources to commit serious criminal offences.

This was defeat number 77 in the parliamentary session.

| Breakdown of Votes | For Govt | Against Govt | Total | No vote |
|-------------------------|------------|--------------|------------|------------|
| Conservative | 224 | 4 | 228 | 29 |
| Labour | 2 | 140 | 142 | 36 |
| Liberal Democrat | 0 | 78 | 78 | 10 |
| Crossbench | 38 | 57 | 95 | 82 |
| Bishops | 0 | 1 | 1 | 25 |
| Other | 20 | 19 | 39 | 26 |
| Total | 284 | 299 | 583 | 208 |

Conservative Votes with the Government

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Lord Agnew of Oulton | Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon | Baroness Altmann |
| Baroness Anelay of St Johns | Lord Arbuthnot of Edrom | Earl Arran |
| Lord Ashton of Hyde | Lord Astor of Hever | Viscount Astor |
| Lord Baker of Dorking | Lord Balfe | Baroness Barran |
| Lord Barwell | Lord Bates | Lord Bellingham |
| Baroness Berridge | Baroness Bertin | Lord Bethell |
| Lord Black of Brentwood | Lord Blackwell | Baroness Blackwood of North Oxford |
| Lord Blencathra | Baroness Bloomfield of Hinton Waldrist | Lord Borwick |
| Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone | Lord Bourne of Aberystwyth | Lord Brabazon of Tara |
| Baroness Brady | Viscount Bridgeman | Lord Bridges of Headley |
| Lord Brougham and Vaux | Baroness Browning | Lord Brownlow of Shurlock Row |
| Baroness Buscombe | Lord Caine | Earl Caithness |
| Lord Callanan | Lord Carrington of Fulham | Earl Cathcart |
| Lord Chadlington | Baroness Chalker of Wallasey | Baroness Chisholm of Owlpen |
| Lord Choudrey | Lord Clarke of Nottingham | Lord Colgrain |
| Lord Colwyn | Earl Courtown | Baroness Coultie |
| Lord Crathorne | Baroness Cumberlege | Lord Davies of Gower |
| Lord De Mauley | Lord Deben | Lord Deighton |
| Lord Duncan of Springbank | Earl Dundee | Lord Dunlop |
| Baroness Eaton | Baroness Eccles of Moulton | Viscount Eccles |
| Baroness Evans of Bowes Park | Lord Fairfax of Cameron | Baroness Fairhead |
| Baroness Fall | Lord Farmer | Lord Fellowes of West Stafford |
| Lord Fink | Baroness Finn | Baroness Fleet |

| | | |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Lord Flight | Baroness Fookes | Lord Forsyth of Drumlean |
| Lord Framlingham | Lord Freud | Baroness Fullbrook |
| Lord Gardiner of Kimble | Baroness Gardner of Parkes | Lord Garnier |
| Lord Geddes | Lord Gilbert of Panteg | Lord Glenarthur |
| Lord Gold | Baroness Goldie | Lord Goldsmith of Richmond Park |
| Lord Goodlad | Viscount Goschen | Lord Grade of Yarmouth |
| Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach | Lord Grimstone of Boscobel | Lord Hague of Richmond |
| Lord Hamilton of Epsom | Lord Hammond of Runnymede | Lord Harris of Peckham |
| Lord Haselhurst | Lord Hayward | Baroness Helic |
| Lord Henley | Lord Herbert of South Downs | Baroness Hodgson of Abinger |
| Lord Holmes of Richmond | Baroness Hooper | Lord Horam |
| Lord Howard of Lympne | Lord Howard of Rising | Earl Howe |
| Lord Howell of Guildford | Lord Hunt of Wirral | Lord James of Blackheath |
| Baroness Jenkin of Kennington | Lord Johnson of Marylebone | Lord Keen of Elie |
| Lord King of Bridgwater | Lord Kirkham | Lord Kirkhope of Harrogate |
| Lord Lamont of Lerwick | Lord Lancaster of Kimbolton | Lord Lang of Monkton |
| Lord Lansley | Lord Leigh of Hurley | Lord Lexden |
| Lord Lilley | Earl Lindsay | Lord Lingfield |
| Earl Liverpool | Lord Livingston of Parkhead | Marquess of Lothian |
| Lord Lucas | Lord Mancroft | Baroness Manzoor |
| Lord Marland | Lord Marlesford | Lord McColl of Dulwich |
| Baroness McGregor-Smith | Lord McInnes of Kilwinning | Baroness McIntosh of Pickering |
| Lord McLoughlin | Lord Mendoza | Baroness Meyer |
| Baroness Mone | Duke of Montrose | Baroness Morgan of Cotes |
| Baroness Morris of Bolton | Baroness Morrissey | Lord Moylan |
| Lord Moynihan | Lord Nash | Baroness Neville-Jones |
| Baroness Neville-Rolfe | Baroness Newlove | Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne |
| Baroness Noakes | Lord O'Shaughnessy | Lord Parkinson of Whitley Bay |
| Lord Patten | Baroness Penn | Lord Pickles |
| Baroness Pidding | Lord Polak | Lord Popat |
| Lord Porter of Spalding | Lord Price | Lord Rana |
| Lord Randall of Uxbridge | Lord Ranger | Baroness Rawlings |
| Lord Reay | Baroness Redfern | Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn |
| Lord Ribeiro | Viscount Ridley | Lord Risby |
| Lord Robathan | Baroness Rock | Lord Rose of Monewden |
| Lord Rotherwick | Lord Saatchi | Baroness Sanderson of Welton |
| Lord Sarfraz | Lord Sassoon | Baroness Sater |
| Baroness Scott of Bybrook | Baroness Seccombe | Lord Selkirk of Douglas |
| Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia | Lord Sharpe of Epsom | Lord Sheikh |
| Baroness Shephard of Northwold | Lord Sherbourne of Didsbury | Baroness Shields |
| Lord Shinkwin | Earl Shrewsbury | Lord Smith of Hindhead |
| Lord Spencer of Alresford | Baroness Stedman-Scott | Lord Sterling of Plaistow |
| Lord Stewart of Dirleton | Lord Strathclyde | Baroness Stroud |
| Baroness Sugg | Lord Suri | Lord Swinfen |
| Lord Taylor of Holbeach | Lord Tebbit | Lord Trefgarne |
| Viscount Trenchard | Lord Trimble | Lord True |
| Lord Tugendhat | Viscount Ullswater | Lord Vaizey of Didcot |
| Baroness Vere of Norbiton | Baroness Verma | Lord Vinson |
| Lord Wakeham | Lord Wasserman | Lord Wei |
| Lord Wharton of Yarm | Lord Whitby | Lord Willetts |
| Baroness Williams of Trafford | Lord Wolfson of Tredegar | Baroness Wylde |
| Lord Young of Graffham | Viscount Younger of Leckie | |

Conservative Votes against the Government

| | | |
|----------------|-------------------|-------------------------------|
| Lord Cormack | Viscount Hailsham | Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbots |
| Baroness Warsi | | |

Labour Votes with the Government

Lord Rooker Lord West of Spithead

Labour Votes against the Government

| | | |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Lord Adonis | Lord Alli | Baroness Amos |
| Lord Anderson of Swansea | Baroness Andrews | Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top |
| Lord Bach | Baroness Bakewell | Lord Bassam of Brighton |
| Lord Berkeley | Baroness Billingham | Baroness Blower |
| Lord Boateng | Lord Bradley | Lord Bragg |
| Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe | Lord Browne of Ladyton | Baroness Bryan of Partick |
| Lord Campbell-Savours | Lord Carter of Coles | Baroness Chakrabarti |
| Viscount Chandos | Lord Clark of Windermere | Baroness Clark of Kilwinning |
| Baroness Cohen of Pimlico | Lord Collins of Highbury | Baroness Corston |
| Baroness Crawley | Lord Cunningham of Felling | Lord Davidson of Glen Clova |
| Lord Davies of Brixton | Lord Davies of Oldham | Lord Davies of Stamford |
| Baroness Donaghy | Lord Donoughue | Baroness Drake |
| Lord Dubs | Lord Eatwell | Lord Elder |
| Lord Falconer of Thoroton | Lord Faulkner of Worcester | Lord Foulkes of Cumnock |
| Baroness Gale | Lord Giddens | Lord Glasman |
| Baroness Golding | Baroness Goudie | Lord Griffiths of Burry Port |
| Lord Grocott | Lord Hain | Lord Harris of Haringey |
| Lord Haskel | Lord Haughey | Lord Haworth |
| Baroness Hayman of Ullock | Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town | Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill |
| Lord Hendy | Baroness Henig | Baroness Hilton of Eggardon |
| Lord Hollick | Lord Howarth of Newport | Lord Hoyle |
| Baroness Hughes of Stretford | Lord Hunt of Kings Heath | Lord Hutton of Furness |
| Baroness Jay of Paddington | Baroness Jones of Whitchurch | Lord Jones |
| Lord Jordan | Lord Judd | Lord Kennedy of Southwark |
| Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws | Lord Kestenbaum | Baroness Kingsmill |
| Lord Knight of Weymouth | Baroness Lawrence of Clarendon | Lord Layard |
| Lord Leitch | Lord Lennie | Lord Levy |
| Baroness Liddell of Coatdyke | Lord Liddle | Lord Lipsey |
| Baroness Lister of Burtersett | Lord MacKenzie of Culkein | Baroness Mallalieu |
| Lord Mandelson | Baroness Massey of Darwen | Lord McAvoy |
| Lord McConnell of Glenscorrodale | Baroness McDonagh | Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall |
| Lord McKenzie of Luton | Lord Mendelsohn | Lord Monks |
| Baroness Morgan of Huyton | Baroness Morris of Yardley | Lord Murphy of Torfaen |
| Baroness Nye | Baroness Osamor | Lord Parekh |
| Lord Pendry | Baroness Pitkeathley | Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede |
| Lord Prescott | Baroness Primarolo | Baroness Prosser |
| Baroness Quin | Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale | Baroness Rebuck |
| Lord Robertson of Port Ellen | Lord Rosser | Lord Rowlands |
| Baroness Royall of Blaisdon | Lord Sawyer | Baroness Sherlock |
| Lord Sikka | Viscount Simon | Baroness Smith of Basildon |
| Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill | Lord Soley | Lord Stevenson of Balmacara |
| Baroness Taylor of Bolton | Baroness Thornton | Lord Touhig |
| Lord Tunnicliffe | Lord Turnberg | Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe |
| Lord Watson of Invergowrie | Lord Watts | Baroness Wheeler |
| Baroness Whitaker | Lord Whitty | Baroness Wilcox of Newport |
| Lord Wills | Lord Winston | Lord Wood of Anfield |
| Lord Woodley | Baroness Young of Old Scone | |

Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government

Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government

| | | |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|
| Lord Alderdice | Lord Allan of Hallam | Baroness Bakewell of Hardington Mandeville |
| Baroness Barker | Lord Beith | Baroness Benjamin |
| Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury | Baroness Bowles of Berkhamsted | Lord Bradshaw |
| Baroness Brinton | Lord Bruce of Bennachie | Lord Burnett |
| Baroness Burt of Solihull | Lord Campbell of Pittenweem | Lord Chidgey |
| Lord Clement-Jones | Lord Dholakia | Baroness Doocey |
| Baroness Featherstone | Lord Foster of Bath | Lord Fox |
| Baroness Garden of Frognal | Lord German | Lord Goddard of Stockport |
| Lord Greaves | Baroness Grender | Baroness Hamwee |
| Baroness Harris of Richmond | Baroness Humphreys | Lord Hussain |
| Baroness Hussein-Ece | Baroness Jolly | Lord Jones of Cheltenham |
| Baroness Kramer | Lord Lee of Trafford | Baroness Ludford |
| Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames | Lord McNally | Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer |
| Lord Newby | Baroness Northover | Lord Oates |
| Lord Paddick | Lord Palmer of Childs Hill | Baroness Parminter |
| Baroness Pinnock | Lord Purvis of Tweed | Baroness Randerson |
| Lord Razzall | Lord Redesdale | Lord Rennard |
| Lord Roberts of Llandudno | Baroness Scott of Needham Market | Lord Scriven |
| Lord Sharkey | Baroness Sheehan | Lord Shipley |
| Baroness Smith of Newnham | Lord Stephen | Lord Stoneham of Droxford |
| Lord Storey | Lord Strasburger | Baroness Suttie |
| Lord Taverne | Lord Taylor of Goss Moor | Lord Teverson |
| Baroness Thomas of Winchester | Lord Thomas of Gresford | Baroness Thornhill |
| Viscount Thurso | Lord Tope | Baroness Tyler of Enfield |
| Lord Tyler | Lord Verjee | Lord Wallace of Saltaire |
| Baroness Walmsley | Lord Willis of Knaresborough | Lord Wrigglesworth |

Crossbench Votes with the Government

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Lord Bichard | Lord Botham | Viscount Brookeborough |
| Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood | Lord Butler of Brockwell | Baroness Butler-Sloss |
| Lord Cameron of Dillington | Lord Carlile of Berriew | Lord Carrington |
| Lord Chartres | Earl Cork and Orrery | Lord Craig of Radley |
| Viscount Craigavon | Baroness Deech | Earl Erroll |
| Lord Evans of Weardale | Lord Field of Birkenhead | Baroness Finlay of Llandaff |
| Lord Geidt | Lord Grabiner | Lord Green of Deddington |
| Lord Greenway | Baroness Hallett | Lord Hannay of Chiswick |
| Lord Hogan-Howe | Lord Houghton of Richmond | Lord Janvrin |
| Lord Kakkar | Lord Laming | Baroness Manningham-Buller |
| Lord Patel | Lord Powell of Bayswater | Lord Ravensdale |
| Lord Skidelsky | Lord Smith of Kelvin | Lord Stirrup |
| Lord Thurlow | Lord Wilson of Tillyorn | |

Crossbench Votes against the Government

| | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Lord Aberdare | Lord Anderson of Ipswich | Lord Berkeley of Knighton |
| Baroness Boycott | Lord Broers | Baroness Brown of Cambridge |
| Baroness Bull | Baroness Campbell of Surbiton | Lord Carey of Clifton |
| Baroness Cavendish Little Venice | Earl Clancarty | Baroness Clark of Calton |
| Viscount Colville of Culross | Baroness Coussins | Baroness Cox |
| Lord Crisp | Baroness D'Souza | Lord Eames |
| Baroness Falkner of Margravine | Lord Freyberg | Baroness Greengross |
| Baroness Grey-Thompson | Lord Harries of Pentregarth | Lord Hastings of Scarisbrick |
| Baroness Hayman | Baroness Hogg | Lord Hope of Craighead |
| Lord Jay of Ewelme | Lord Kerslake | Baroness Kidron |
| Lord Kilclooney | Lord Krebs | Lord Macdonald of River Glaven |
| Baroness Masham of Ilton | Baroness Meacher | Baroness Murphy |

| | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Baroness Neuberger | Baroness O'Loan | Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve |
| Lord Pannick | Baroness Prashar | Lord Ramsbotham |
| Lord Rees of Ludlow | Lord Ricketts | Lord Rowe-Beddoe |
| Lord Russell of Liverpool | Earl Sandwich | Duke of Somerset |
| Baroness Stern | Lord Stern of Brentford | Lord Thomas of Cwmgiedd |
| Lord Walker of Aldringham | Baroness Watkins of Tavistock | Lord Wilson of Dinton |
| Lord Woolf | Lord Woolley of Woodford | Baroness Young of Hornsey |

Bishop Votes with the Government

Bishop Votes against the Government

Bishop of Durham

Other Votes with the Government

| | | |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Lord Austin of Dudley | Lord Browne of Belmont | Lord Dodds of Duncairn |
| Lord Empey | Baroness Fox of Buckley | Lord Gadhia |
| Lord Hay of Ballyore | Baroness Hoey | Lord Kalms |
| Lord Lupton | Lord Mann | Lord McCrea Magherafelt and Cookstown |
| Lord Moore of Etchingham | Lord Morrow | Lord Pearson of Rannoch |
| Lord Rogan | Baroness Stowell of Beeston | Baroness Stuart of Edgbaston |
| Lord Taylor of Warwick | Lord Walney | |

Other Votes against the Government

| | | |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Baroness Bennett of Manor Castle | Lord Bhatia | Baroness Blackstone |
| Lord Bowness | Lord Brennan | Lord Cashman |
| Baroness Jones of Moulsecoomb | Baroness Kennedy of Cradley | Lord Lea of Crondall |
| Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate | Lord Patel of Bradford | Baroness Ritchie of Downpatrick |
| Lord Smith of Finsbury | Lord Stone of Blackheath | Baroness Tonge |
| Lord Truscott | Baroness Uddin | Lord Wallace of Tankerness |
| Lord Wigley | | |

Ref: 2361