

# Government Defeat in Lords on Covert Human Intelligence Sources (Criminal Conduct) Bill

Monday 11/01/2021

On 11/01/2021 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Covert Human Intelligence Sources (Criminal Conduct) Bill: To insert a requirement that persons granting authorisations permitting covert human intelligence sources to participate in criminal conduct not only believe, but reasonably believe, that the authorisation is necessary and proportionate.

This was defeat number 74 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of Votes	For Govt	Against Govt	Total	No vote
<b>Conservative</b>	219	1	220	0
<b>Labour</b>	0	134	134	0
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	79	79	0
<b>Crossbench</b>	27	52	79	0
<b>Bishops</b>	0	0	0	0
<b>Other</b>	13	16	29	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>259</b>	<b>282</b>	<b>541</b>	<b>0</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

Lord Agnew of Oulton	Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon	Baroness Altmann
Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Lord Arbuthnot of Edrom	Earl Arran
Lord Ashton of Hyde	Lord Astor of Hever	Lord Balfe
Baroness Barran	Lord Barwell	Lord Bates
Lord Bellingham	Baroness Berridge	Baroness Bertin
Lord Bethell	Lord Black of Brentwood	Lord Blackwell
Baroness Blackwood of North Oxford	Lord Blencathra	Baroness Bloomfield of Hinton Waldrist
Lord Borwick	Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone	Lord Bourne of Aberystwyth
Lord Brabazon of Tara	Baroness Brady	Viscount Bridgeman
Lord Bridges of Headley	Baroness Browning	Lord Brownlow of Shurlock Row
Baroness Buscombe	Lord Caine	Earl Caithness
Lord Callanan	Lord Carrington of Fulham	Earl Cathcart
Lord Chadlington	Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Baroness Chisholm of Owlpen
Lord Choudrey	Lord Clarke of Nottingham	Lord Coe
Lord Colgrain	Lord Colwyn	Lord Cormack
Earl Courtown	Baroness Couttie	Lord Crathorne
Baroness Cumberlege	Lord Davies of Gower	Lord De Mauley
Lord Deben	Lord Deighton	Lord Dobbs
Lord Duncan of Springbank	Earl Dundee	Lord Dunlop
Baroness Eaton	Baroness Eccles of Moulton	Viscount Eccles
Baroness Evans of Bowes Park	Lord Fairfax of Cameron	Baroness Fairhead
Baroness Fall	Lord Farmer	Lord Fellowes of West Stafford

Lord Fink	Lord Finkelstein	Baroness Finn
Baroness Fleet	Lord Flight	Baroness Fookes
Lord Forsyth of Drumlean	Lord Framlingham	Lord Freud
Baroness Fullbrook	Lord Gardiner of Kimble	Baroness Gardner of Parkes
Lord Garnier	Lord Geddes	Lord Gilbert of Panteg
Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glendonbrook	Lord Gold
Baroness Goldie	Lord Goldsmith of Richmond Park	Lord Goodlad
Viscount Goschen	Lord Grade of Yarmouth	Lord Greenhalgh
Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach	Lord Grimstone of Boscobel	Lord Hague of Richmond
Lord Hamilton of Epsom	Lord Harris of Peckham	Lord Haselhurst
Lord Hayward	Lord Henley	Lord Herbert of South Downs
Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts	Baroness Hodgson of Abinger	Lord Holmes of Richmond
Baroness Hooper	Lord Horam	Lord Howard of Rising
Earl Howe	Lord Hunt of Wirral	Baroness Jenkin of Kennington
Lord Jopling	Lord Keen of Elie	Lord King of Bridgwater
Lord Kirkham	Lord Kirkhope of Harrogate	Lord Lamont of Lerwick
Lord Lancaster of Kimbolton	Lord Lang of Monkton	Lord Lansley
Lord Leigh of Hurley	Lord Lexden	Lord Lilley
Earl Lindsay	Lord Lingfield	Earl Liverpool
Lord Livingston of Parkhead	Lord Lucas	Lord Mackay of Clashfern
Lord Mancroft	Baroness Manzoor	Lord Marland
Lord Marlesford	Lord Maude of Horsham	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness McGregor-Smith	Lord McInnes of Kilwinning	Lord McLoughlin
Lord Mendoza	Baroness Meyer	Baroness Mone
Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morgan of Cotes	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Morrissey	Lord Moylan	Lord Moynihan
Lord Naseby	Lord Nash	Baroness Neville-Jones
Baroness Newlove	Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne	Baroness Noakes
Lord Northbrook	Lord Norton of Louth	Lord O'Shaughnessy
Lord Parkinson of Whitley Bay	Baroness Penn	Lord Pickles
Baroness Pidding	Lord Polak	Lord Poptat
Lord Porter of Spalding	Lord Price	Lord Rana
Lord Randall of Uxbridge	Lord Ranger	Lord Reay
Baroness Redfern	Lord Ribeiro	Viscount Ridley
Lord Risby	Lord Robathan	Baroness Rock
Lord Rose of Monewden	Lord Rotherwick	Baroness Sanderson of Welton
Lord Sassoon	Baroness Sater	Baroness Scott of Bybrook
Baroness Seccombe	Lord Selkirk of Douglas	Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia
Lord Sharpe of Epsom	Lord Sheikh	Baroness Shephard of Northwold
Lord Sherbourne of Didsbury	Baroness Shields	Lord Shinkwin
Earl Shrewsbury	Lord Smith of Hindhead	Lord Spencer of Alresford
Baroness Stedman-Scott	Lord Sterling of Plaistow	Lord Stewart of Dirlerton
Lord Strathclyde	Baroness Stroud	Baroness Sugg
Lord Suri	Lord Swinfen	Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord Tebbit	Lord Trefgarne	Viscount Trenchard
Lord True	Lord Tugendhat	Viscount Ullswater
Lord Vaizey of Didcot	Baroness Vere of Norbiton	Baroness Verma
Lord Vinson	Baroness Warsi	Lord Wei
Lord Wharton of Yarm	Lord Whitby	Lord Willetts
Baroness Williams of Trafford	Lord Wolfson of Tredegar	Baroness Wylde
Lord Young of Cookham	Lord Young of Graffham	Viscount Younger of Leckie

#### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

Viscount Hailsham

---

#### **Labour Votes with the Government**

**Labour Votes against the Government**

Lord Adonis	Lord Allen of Kensington	Lord Alli
Baroness Amos	Lord Anderson of Swansea	Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top
Lord Bach	Baroness Billingham	Baroness Blower
Lord Blunkett	Lord Boateng	Lord Bradley
Lord Bragg	Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe	Lord Browne of Ladyton
Baroness Bryan of Partick	Lord Campbell-Savours	Baroness Chakrabarti
Viscount Chandos	Baroness Clark of Kilwinning	Lord Clark of Windermere
Baroness Cohen of Pimlico	Lord Collins of Highbury	Baroness Corston
Baroness Crawley	Lord Davidson of Glen Clova	Lord Davies of Stamford
Lord Davies of Brixton	Lord Davies of Oldham	Baroness Donaghy
Lord Donoughue	Baroness Drake	Lord Dubs
Lord Eatwell	Lord Elder	Lord Falconer of Thoroton
Lord Faulkner of Worcester	Lord Filkin	Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Baroness Gale	Lord Giddens	Baroness Golding
Baroness Goudie	Lord Grantchester	Lord Griffiths of Burry Port
Lord Grocott	Viscount Hanworth	Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Haskel	Lord Haughey	Lord Haworth
Baroness Hayman of Ullock	Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town	Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill
Lord Hendy	Baroness Henig	Baroness Hilton of Eggardon
Lord Hollick	Lord Howarth of Newport	Lord Hoyle
Lord Hunt of Kings Heath	Lord Hutton of Furness	Baroness Jay of Paddington
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch	Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws	Lord Kennedy of Southwark
Baroness Kingsmill	Lord Knight of Weymouth	Baroness Lawrence of Clarendon
Lord Layard	Lord Lennie	Lord Levy
Baroness Liddell of Coatdyke	Lord Lipsey	Baroness Lister of Burtersett
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein	Baroness Mallalieu	Lord Mandelson
Baroness Massey of Darwen	Lord McAvoyn	Lord McConnell of Glenscorrodale
Baroness McDonagh	Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton
Lord McNicol of West Kilbride	Lord Mendelsohn	Lord Mitchell
Lord Monks	Baroness Morgan of Huyton	Baroness Morris of Yardley
Lord Morris of Aberavon	Lord Murphy of Torfaen	Baroness Nye
Baroness Osamor	Lord Pendry	Baroness Pitkeathley
Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede	Lord Prescott	Baroness Primarolo
Baroness Prosser	Lord Puttnam	Baroness Quin
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Baroness Rebuck	Lord Robertson of Port Ellen
Lord Rooker	Lord Rosser	Baroness Royall of Blaisdon
Lord Sawyer	Baroness Sherlock	Lord Sikka
Viscount Simon	Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill	Baroness Smith of Basildon
Lord Snape	Lord Stevenson of Balmacara	Baroness Taylor of Bolton
Lord Touhig	Lord Triesman	Lord Tunnicliffe
Lord Turnberg	Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe	Lord Watson of Invergowrie
Lord Watts	Lord West of Spithead	Baroness Wheeler
Baroness Whitaker	Lord Whitty	Baroness Wilcox of Newport
Lord Wills	Lord Winston	Lord Wood of Anfield
Lord Woodley	Baroness Young of Old Scone	

---

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government****Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Alderdice	Lord Allan of Hallam	Baroness Bakewell of Hardington Mandeville
Baroness Barker	Lord Beith	Baroness Benjamin
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury	Baroness Bowles of Berkhamsted	Lord Bradshaw
Baroness Brinton	Lord Bruce of Bennachie	Lord Burnett
Baroness Burt of Solihull	Lord Campbell of Pittenweem	Lord Clement-Jones

Lord Dholakia	Baroness Doocey	Baroness Featherstone
Lord Foster of Bath	Lord Fox	Baroness Garden of Frognal
Lord German	Earl Glasgow	Lord Goddard of Stockport
Lord Greaves	Baroness Grender	Baroness Hamwee
Baroness Harris of Richmond	Baroness Humphreys	Lord Hussain
Baroness Hussein-Ece	Baroness Janke	Baroness Jolly
Lord Jones of Cheltenham	Baroness Kramer	Lord Lee of Trafford
Baroness Ludford	Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames	Lord McNally
Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer	Lord Newby	Baroness Northover
Lord Oates	Lord Paddick	Lord Palmer of Childs Hill
Baroness Parminter	Baroness Pinnock	Lord Purvis of Tweed
Baroness Randerson	Lord Razzall	Lord Redesdale
Lord Rennard	Lord Roberts of Llandudno	Baroness Scott of Needham Market
Lord Scriven	Lord Sharkey	Baroness Sheehan
Lord Shipley	Baroness Smith of Newnham	Lord Stoneham of Droxford
Lord Storey	Lord Strasburger	Lord Stunell
Baroness Suttie	Lord Taverne	Lord Taylor of Goss Moor
Lord Teverson	Baroness Thomas of Winchester	Lord Thomas of Gresford
Baroness Thornhill	Viscount Thurso	Lord Tope
Baroness Tyler of Enfield	Lord Tyler	Lord Verjee
Lord Wallace of Saltaire	Baroness Walmsley	Lord Willis of Knaresborough
Lord Wrigglesworth		

---

#### **Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Lord Bichard	Lord Botham	Lord Boyce
Baroness Butler-Sloss	Lord Carey of Clifton	Lord Carlile of Berriew
Lord Carrington	Lord Chartres	Viscount Colville of Culross
Baroness Cox	Viscount Craigavon	Lord Curry of Kirkharle
Lord Dannatt	Earl Erroll	Baroness Finlay of Llandaff
Lord Grabiner	Lord Greenway	Lord Hogan-Howe
Lord Kilclooney	Lord Ramsbotham	Lord Ravensdale
Lord Richards of Herstmonceux	Lord Smith of Kelvin	Lord Stirrup
Lord Thurlow	Lord Walker of Aldringham	Viscount Waverley

#### **Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Aberdare	Lord Adebowale	Lord Alton of Liverpool
Lord Anderson of Ipswich	Lord Best	Baroness Boycott
Baroness Bull	Baroness Cavendish Little Venice	Earl Clancarty
Lord Craig of Radley	Lord Crisp	Lord Cromwell
Baroness Deech	Baroness D'Souza	Lord Field of Birkenhead
Lord Freyberg	Baroness Grey-Thompson	Lord Harries of Pentregarth
Lord Hastings of Scarisbrick	Baroness Hayman	Baroness Hollins
Lord Hope of Craighead	Lord Janvrin	Lord Kakkar
Lord Kerr of Kinlochard	Lord Kerlake	Lord Laming
Lord Macdonald of River Glaven	Lord Macpherson of Earl's Court	Lord Mair
Baroness Masham of Ilton	Baroness Meacher	Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Baroness O'Loan	Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve	Lord Pannick
Lord Patel	Baroness Prashar	Lord Rees of Ludlow
Lord Russell of Liverpool	Earl Sandwich	Duke of Somerset
Lord Stern of Brentford	Lord Thomas of Cwmgiedd	Lord Trevethin and Oaksey
Lord Vaux of Harrowden	Baroness Watkins of Tavistock	Duke of Wellington
Lord Wilson of Dinton	Lord Woolley of Woodford	Baroness Worthington
Baroness Young of Hornsey		

---

#### **Bishop Votes with the Government**

#### **Bishop Votes against the Government**

---

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Austin of Dudley

Lord Empey

Lord Hay of Ballyore

Lord Morrow

Baroness Stuart of Edgbaston

Lord Browne of Belmont

Lord Faulks

Baroness Hoey

Lord Pearson of Rannoch

Lord Dodds of Duncairn

Lord Gadhia

Lord McCrea Magherafelt and  
Cookstown

Lord Rogan

**Other Votes against the Government**

Baroness Bennett of Manor Castle

Lord Brennan

Baroness Kennedy of Cradley

Baroness Ritchie of Downpatrick

Baroness Tonge

Lord Wigley

Baroness Blackstone

Lord Cashman

Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate

Lord Smith of Finsbury

Baroness Uddin

Lord Bowness

Baroness Jones of Moulsecoomb

Lord Patel of Bradford Ref: 2355

Lord Stone of Blackheath

Lord Wallace of Tankerness