

# Government Defeat in Lords on Healthcare (International Arrangements) Bill

Tuesday 12/03/2019

On 12/03/2019 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Healthcare (International Arrangements) Bill: To limit the scope of the bill, allowing the Secretary of State to only make reciprocal healthcare payment arrangements with countries in the EU and the European Economic Area, and not with countries in the rest of the world.

This was defeat number 49 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of Votes	For Govt	Against Govt	Total	No vote
<b>Conservative</b>	190	0	190	57
<b>Labour</b>	0	127	127	58
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	79	79	17
<b>Crossbench</b>	26	46	72	114
<b>Bishops</b>	1	2	3	26
<b>Other</b>	9	8	17	28
<b>Total</b>	<b>226</b>	<b>262</b>	<b>488</b>	<b>300</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

Lord Agnew of Oulton	Baroness Altmann	Baroness Anelay of St Johns
Earl Arran	Lord Ashton of Hyde	Viscount Astor
Lord Astor of Hever	Earl Attlee	Lord Balfe
Baroness Barran	Lord Bates	Baroness Berridge
Baroness Bertin	Lord Black of Brentwood	Baroness Blackwood of North Oxford
Lord Blencathra	Baroness Bloomfield of Hinton Waldrist	Lord Borwick
Lord Bourne of Aberystwyth	Lord Bowness	Lord Brabazon of Tara
Baroness Brady	Viscount Bridgeman	Lord Bridges of Headley
Lord Brougham and Vaux	Baroness Browning	Baroness Buscombe
Baroness Byford	Earl Caithness	Lord Callanan
Lord Carrington of Fulham	Earl Cathcart	Lord Cavendish of Furness
Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Baroness Chisholm of Owlpen	Lord Colgrain
Lord Colwyn	Lord Cooper of Windrush	Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Cormack	Earl Courtown	Baroness Couttie
Baroness Cumberlege	Lord Dixon-Smith	Lord Dobbs
Lord Duncan of Springbank	Lord Dunlop	Baroness Eaton
Baroness Eccles of Moulton	Viscount Eccles	Lord Elton
Baroness Evans of Bowes Park	Lord Fairfax of Cameron	Baroness Fairhead
Baroness Fall	Lord Farmer	Lord Faulks
Lord Fink	Lord Finkelstein	Baroness Finn
Lord Flight	Baroness Fookes	Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Fraser of Corriegarth	Lord Freeman	Lord Gardiner of Kimble

Baroness Gardner of Parkes	Lord Garel-Jones	Lord Geddes
Lord Gilbert of Panteg	Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glendonbrook
Baroness Goldie	Lord Goodlad	Lord Green of Hurstpierpoint
Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach	Viscount Hailsham	Lord Hamilton of Epsom
Baroness Hanham	Lord Harris of Peckham	Lord Haselhurst
Lord Hayward	Baroness Helic	Lord Henley
Lord Hill of Oareford	Baroness Hodgson of Abinger	Lord Holmes of Richmond
Earl Home	Baroness Hooper	Lord Horam
Lord Howard of Rising	Lord Howard of Lympne	Earl Howe
Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Hunt of Wirral	Lord James of Blackheath
Baroness Jenkin of Kennington	Lord Jopling	Lord Keen of Elie
Lord Kirkham	Lord Kirkhope of Harrogate	Lord Lamont of Lerwick
Lord Lang of Monkton	Lord Lansley	Lord Leigh of Hurley
Lord Lexden	Lord Lilley	Earl Lindsay
Lord Lingfield	Lord Lucas	Lord Lupton
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market	Lord Mackay of Clashfern	Lord Magan of Castletown
Lord Mancroft	Baroness Manzoor	Lord Marland
Lord Marlesford	Lord Maude of Horsham	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness McGregor-Smith	Lord McInnes of Kilwinning	Baroness Meyer
Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morris of Bolton	Lord Moynihan
Lord Naseby	Baroness Neville-Rolfe	Baroness Newlove
Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne	Baroness Noakes	Lord Northbrook
Lord Norton of Louth	Lord O'Shaughnessy	Baroness O'Cathain
Lord Patten	Lord Pickles	Baroness Pidding
Lord Popat	Lord Porter of Spalding	Lord Price
Lord Randall of Uxbridge	Baroness Rawlings	Lord Reay
Baroness Redfern	Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn	Lord Ribeiro
Viscount Ridley	Lord Risby	Lord Robathan
Baroness Rock	Lord Rotherwick	Lord Sassoon
Baroness Sater	Baroness Scott of Bybrook	Baroness Seccombe
Earl Selborne	Lord Selkirk of Douglas	Lord Sheikh
Baroness Shephard of Northwold	Lord Sherbourne of Didsbury	Lord Shinkwin
Earl Shrewsbury	Lord Smith of Hindhead	Baroness Stedman-Scott
Lord Strathclyde	Baroness Stroud	Baroness Sugg
Lord Suri	Lord Swinfen	Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord Trefgarne	Viscount Trenchard	Lord Trimble
Lord True	Lord Tugendhat	Baroness Verma
Lord Wakeham	Baroness Warsi	Lord Wasserman
Lord Wei	Duke of Wellington	Baroness Wheatcroft
Lord Whitby	Baroness Wilcox	Lord Willetts
Baroness Williams of Trafford	Baroness Wylde	Lord Young of Cookham
Viscount Younger of Leckie		

#### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

---

#### **Labour Votes with the Government**

##### **Labour Votes against the Government**

Baroness Adams of Craigielea	Lord Adonis	Lord Allen of Kensington
Lord Anderson of Swansea	Baroness Andrews	Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top
Baroness Bakewell	Lord Bassam of Brighton	Lord Beecham
Lord Berkeley	Lord Blunkett	Lord Bradley
Lord Bragg	Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe	Lord Brookman
Lord Browne of Ladyton	Baroness Bryan of Partick	Lord Campbell-Savours
Lord Carter of Coles	Lord Cashman	Baroness Chakrabarti
Lord Christopher	Lord Clarke of Hampstead	Baroness Cohen of Pimlico

Lord Collins of Highbury	Baroness Corston	Baroness Crawley
Lord Cunningham of Felling	Baroness Donaghy	Baroness Drake
Lord Dubs	Lord Elder	Lord Evans of Watford
Lord Faulkner of Worcester	Lord Filkin	Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Baroness Golding	Lord Gordon of Strathblane	Baroness Goudie
Lord Grantchester	Lord Griffiths of Burry Port	Lord Grocott
Lord Hain	Viscount Hanworth	Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Haskel	Lord Haughey	Lord Haworth
Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town	Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill	Baroness Henig
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon	Lord Hollick	Lord Howarth of Newport
Lord Hoyle	Lord Hughes of Woodside	Lord Hunt of Chesterton
Lord Irvine of Lairg	Baroness Jay of Paddington	Baroness Jones of Whitchurch
Lord Jones	Lord Judd	Lord Kennedy of Southwark
Baroness Kennedy of Cradley	Lord Kinnock	Baroness Kinnock of Holyhead
Lord Knight of Weymouth	Baroness Lawrence of Clarendon	Lord Layard
Lord Lea of Crondall	Lord Leitch	Lord Lennie
Lord Liddle	Baroness Lister of Burtersett	Lord Livermore
Baroness Mallalieu	Lord Mandelson	Baroness Massey of Darwen
Lord Maxton	Lord McAvoy	Lord McConnell of Glenscorrodale
Baroness McDonagh	Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton
Lord McNicol of West Kilbride	Lord Monks	Baroness Morgan of Huyton
Lord Morgan	Lord Morris of Aberavon	Baroness Morris of Yardley
Lord Murphy of Torfaen	Baroness Osamor	Lord Pendry
Baroness Pitkeathley	Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede	Lord Prescott
Baroness Prosser	Lord Puttnam	Baroness Quin
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Baroness Rebeck	Lord Reid of Cardowan
Lord Rooker	Lord Rowlands	Baroness Sherlock
Viscount Simon	Lord Smith of Leigh	Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Lord Snape	Lord Soley	Lord Stevenson of Balmacara
Lord Stone of Blackheath	Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean	Baroness Taylor of Bolton
Baroness Thornton	Lord Tomlinson	Lord Touhig
Lord Tunnicliffe	Lord Watson of Invergowrie	Lord West of Spithead
Baroness Wheeler	Baroness Whitaker	Lord Whitty
Lord Williams of Elvel	Lord Wood of Anfield	Baroness Young of Old Scone
Lord Young of Norwood Green		

---

#### **Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

##### **Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Alderdice	Baroness Bakewell of Hardington Mandeville
Baroness Barker	Lord Beith	Baroness Benjamin
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury	Baroness Bowles of Berkhamsted	Lord Bradshaw
Baroness Brinton	Lord Bruce of Bennachie	Baroness Burt of Solihull
Lord Campbell of Pittenweem	Lord Chidgey	Lord Clement-Jones
Lord Cotter	Lord Dholakia	Baroness Doocey
Baroness Featherstone	Lord Foster of Bath	Lord Fox
Baroness Garden of Frognal	Lord German	Earl Glasgow
Lord Goddard of Stockport	Lord Greaves	Baroness Grender
Baroness Hamwee	Baroness Harris of Richmond	Baroness Humphreys
Lord Hussain	Baroness Hussein-Ece	Baroness Janke
Baroness Jolly	Baroness Kramer	Lord Lee of Trafford
Baroness Ludford	Baroness Maddock	Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames
Lord McNally	Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer	Lord Newby
Lord Oates	Lord Palmer of Childs Hill	Baroness Parminter
Baroness Pinnock	Lord Purvis of Tweed	Baroness Randerson

Lord Razzall	Lord Redesdale	Lord Rennard
Lord Roberts of Llandudno	Baroness Scott of Needham Market	Lord Scriven
Baroness Sheehan	Lord Shipley	Lord Shutt of Greetland
Baroness Smith of Newnham	Lord Steel of Aikwood	Lord Stephen
Lord Stoneham of Droxford	Lord Storey	Lord Stunell
Baroness Suttie	Lord Taverne	Lord Taylor of Goss Moor
Lord Teverson	Lord Thomas of Gresford	Baroness Thomas of Winchester
Baroness Thornhill	Lord Tope	Lord Tyler
Baroness Tyler of Enfield	Lord Verjee	Lord Wallace of Saltaire
Lord Wallace of Tankerness	Baroness Walmsley	Lord Willis of Knaresborough
Lord Wrigglesworth		

---

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Lord Best	Lord Bew	Lord Boyce
Baroness Butler-Sloss	Lord Cameron of Dillington	Lord Carey of Clifton
Lord Carrington	Viscount Colville of Culross	Baroness Cox
Lord Eames	Earl Erroll	Lord Fellowes
Lord Greenway	Lord Harries of Pentregarth	Baroness Hollins
Lord Kakkar	Lord Kilclooney	Lord Luce
Lord Mawson	Lord Palmer	Lord Pannick
Lord Patel	Lord Ramsbotham	Lord St John of Bletso
Lord Walker of Gestingthorpe	Lord Woolf	

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Aberdare	Lord Alton of Liverpool	Lord Armstrong of Ilminster
Lord Birt	Baroness Boothroyd	Baroness Bull
Lord Butler of Brockwell	Lord Chartres	Earl Clancarty
Baroness Coussins	Lord Craig of Radley	Viscount Craigavon
Baroness D'Souza	Lord Dykes	Baroness Emerton
Baroness Greengross	Lord Hannay of Chiswick	Earl Hay of Kinnoull
Baroness Hayman	Lord Hope of Craighead	Baroness Howe of Idlicote
Lord Janvrin	Lord Jay of Ewelme	Lord Judge
Lord Kerr of Kinlochard	Baroness Kidron	Lord Laming
Earl Listowel	Lord Lisvane	Lord Macpherson of Earl's Court
Countess of Mar	Baroness Masham of Ilton	Baroness Meacher
Baroness Murphy	Baroness O'Loan	Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve
Baroness Prashar	Lord Russell of Liverpool	Earl Sandwich
Lord Singh of Wimbledon	Baroness Stern	Lord Trees
Lord Vaux of Harrowden	Viscount Waverley	Lord Wilson of Tillyorn
Lord Wilson of Dinton		

---

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

Bishop of Chester

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

Bishop of Bristol                      Bishop of Lincoln

---

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Browne of Belmont	Lord Empey	Lord Gadhia
Lord Hay of Ballyore	Lord Inglewood	Lord Maginnis of Drumglass
Lord Morrow	Lord Rogan	Lord Stevens of Ludgate

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Bhatia	Baroness Blackstone	Lord Lipsey
Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate	Lord Paul	Baroness Tonge
Lord Truscott	Lord Wigley	