

# Government Defeat in Lords on European Union (Withdrawal) Bill

Wednesday 16/05/2018

On 16/05/2018 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the European Union (Withdrawal) Bill: To insert a clause requiring the Secretary of State to propose primary legislation establishing a duty on public authorities to apply principles of EU environmental law after exit day, and to establish an independent public body to ensure compliance.

This was defeat number 31 in the parliamentary session.

| Breakdown of Votes      | For Govt   | Against Govt | Total      | No vote    |
|-------------------------|------------|--------------|------------|------------|
| <b>Conservative</b>     | 203        | 7            | 210        | 34         |
| <b>Labour</b>           | 0          | 138          | 138        | 52         |
| <b>Liberal Democrat</b> | 0          | 86           | 86         | 12         |
| <b>Crossbench</b>       | 28         | 54           | 82         | 103        |
| <b>Bishops</b>          | 1          | 1            | 2          | 25         |
| <b>Other</b>            | 12         | 8            | 20         | 22         |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>244</b> | <b>294</b>   | <b>538</b> | <b>248</b> |

## Conservative Votes with the Government

|                                   |   |                             |
|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| Lord Agnew of Oulton              | Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon                   | Baroness Anelay of St Johns |
| Earl Arran                        | Lord Ashton of Hyde                       | Viscount Astor              |
| Lord Astor of Hever               | Earl Attlee                               | Lord Baker of Dorking       |
| Lord Balfe                        | Lord Bates                                | Baroness Berridge           |
| Baroness Bertin                   | Lord Black of Brentwood                   | Lord Blackwell              |
| Lord Blencathra                   | Baroness Bloomfield of Hinton<br>Waldrist | Lord Borwick                |
| Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone | Lord Bourne of Aberystwyth                | Lord Brabazon of Tara       |
| Viscount Bridgeman                | Lord Bridges of Headley                   | Lord Brougham and Vaux      |
| Baroness Browning                 | Baroness Buscombe                         | Baroness Byford             |
| Lord Caine                        | Earl Caithness                            | Lord Callanan               |
| Lord Carrington of Fulham         | Earl Cathcart                             | Lord Cavendish of Furness   |
| Lord Chadlington                  | Baroness Chalker of Wallasey              | Baroness Chisholm of Owlpen |
| Lord Coe                          | Lord Colwyn                               | Lord Cope of Berkeley       |
| Earl Courtown                     | Baroness Coultie                          | Lord Crathorne              |
| Lord De Mauley                    | Lord Dixon-Smith                          | Lord Dobbs                  |
| Lord Duncan of Springbank         | Earl Dundee                               | Lord Dunlop                 |
| Baroness Eaton                    | Viscount Eccles                           | Baroness Eccles of Moulton  |
| Lord Elton                        | Baroness Evans of Bowes Park              | Lord Fairfax of Cameron     |
| Baroness Fairhead                 | Baroness Fall                             | Lord Farmer                 |
| Lord Faulks                       | Lord Fink                                 | Lord Finkelstein            |
| Baroness Finn                     | Lord Flight                               | Baroness Fookes             |
| Lord Forsyth of Drumlean          | Lord Framlingham                          | Lord Freud                  |
| Lord Gardiner of Kimble           | Baroness Gardner of Parkes                | Lord Garel-Jones            |
| Lord Geddes                       | Lord Gilbert of Panteg                    | Lord Glenarthur             |

|                                 |                                    |                               |
|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Lord Glendonbrook               | Lord Gold                          | Baroness Goldie               |
| Lord Goodlad                    | Viscount Goschen                   | Lord Grade of Yarmouth        |
| Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach   | Lord Hague of Richmond             | Lord Hamilton of Epsom        |
| Baroness Hanham                 | Baroness Harding of Winscombe      | Lord Harris of Peckham        |
| Lord Hayward                    | Baroness Helic                     | Lord Henley                   |
| Lord Higgins                    | Lord Hill of Oareford              | Baroness Hodgson of Abinger   |
| Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts  | Lord Holmes of Richmond            | Earl Home                     |
| Baroness Hooper                 | Lord Horam                         | Lord Howard of Rising         |
| Lord Howard of Lympne           | Earl Howe                          | Lord Howell of Guildford      |
| Lord Hunt of Wirral             | Lord James of Blackheath           | Baroness Jenkin of Kennington |
| Lord Jopling                    | Lord Keen of Elie                  | Lord King of Bridgwater       |
| Lord Kirkham                    | Lord Kirkhope of Harrogate         | Lord Lamont of Lerwick        |
| Lord Lang of Monkton            | Lord Lansley                       | Lord Leigh of Hurley          |
| Lord Lexden                     | Earl Lindsay                       | Lord Lingfield                |
| Earl Liverpool                  | Lord Livingston of Parkhead        | Marquess of Lothian           |
| Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market | Lord Mackay of Clashfern           | Lord Magan of Castletown      |
| Lord Mancroft                   | Baroness Manzoor                   | Lord Marland                  |
| Lord Marlesford                 | Lord Maude of Horsham              | Lord McColl of Dulwich        |
| Baroness McGregor-Smith         | Lord McInnes of Kilwinning         | Duke of Montrose              |
| Baroness Morris of Bolton       | Lord Moynihan                      | Lord Naseby                   |
| Lord Nash                       | Baroness Neville-Jones             | Baroness Neville-Rolfe        |
| Baroness Newlove                | Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne | Baroness Noakes               |
| Lord Northbrook                 | Lord Norton of Louth               | Lord O'Shaughnessy            |
| Baroness O'Cathain              | Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes          | Lord Palumbo                  |
| Baroness Pidding                | Lord Polak                         | Lord Papat                    |
| Lord Price                      | Lord Prior of Brampton             | Lord Rana                     |
| Baroness Rawlings               | Baroness Redfern                   | Lord Ribeiro                  |
| Viscount Ridley                 | Lord Robathan                      | Baroness Rock                 |
| Lord Rotherwick                 | Lord Ryder of Wensum               | Lord Saatchi                  |
| Lord Sassoon                    | Baroness Scott of Bybrook          | Baroness Seccombe             |
| Earl Selborne                   | Lord Selkirk of Douglas            | Lord Selsdon                  |
| Lord Sheikh                     | Baroness Shephard of Northwold     | Lord Sherbourne of Didsbury   |
| Lord Shinkwin                   | Earl Shrewsbury                    | Lord Skelmersdale             |
| Lord Smith of Hindhead          | Lord Spicer                        | Baroness Stedman-Scott        |
| Lord Sterling of Plaistow       | Lord Strathclyde                   | Baroness Stroud               |
| Baroness Sugg                   | Lord Suri                          | Lord Swinfen                  |
| Lord Taylor of Holbeach         | Lord Tebbit                        | Lord Trefgarne                |
| Viscount Trenchard              | Lord Trimble                       | Lord True                     |
| Lord Tugendhat                  | Viscount Ullswater                 | Baroness Vere of Norbiton     |
| Baroness Verma                  | Lord Wakeham                       | Lord Waldegrave of North Hill |
| Baroness Warsi                  | Lord Wasserman                     | Lord Wei                      |
| Lord Whitby                     | Baroness Wilcox                    | Baroness Williams of Trafford |
| Lord Wolfson of Aspley Guise    | Baroness Wyld                      | Lord Young of Graffham        |
| Lord Young of Cookham           | Viscount Younger of Leckie         |                               |

#### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

|                       |                            |                              |
|-----------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|
| Lord Bowness          | Lord Deben                 | Lord Green of Hurstpierpoint |
| Lord Patten of Barnes | Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn | Duke of Wellington           |
| Baroness Wheatcroft   |                            |                              |

---

#### **Labour Votes with the Government**

##### **Labour Votes against the Government**

|                              |                   |                                |
|------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|
| Baroness Adams of Craigielea | Lord Adonis       | Lord Alli                      |
| Lord Anderson of Swansea     | Baroness Andrews  | Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top |
| Lord Bach                    | Baroness Bakewell | Lord Bassam of Brighton        |
| Lord Beecham                 | Lord Berkeley     | Baroness Blackstone            |

|                               |                                 |                                 |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Lord Blunkett                 | Lord Boateng                    | Lord Bradley                    |
| Lord Bragg                    | Lord Brennan                    | Lord Brookman                   |
| Lord Campbell-Savours         | Lord Carter of Coles            | Lord Cashman                    |
| Baroness Chakrabarti          | Viscount Chandos                | Lord Christopher                |
| Lord Clark of Windermere      | Lord Collins of Highbury        | Baroness Corston                |
| Baroness Crawley              | Lord Cunningham of Felling      | Lord Darling of Roulanish       |
| Lord Davies of Oldham         | Lord Davies of Stamford         | Lord Desai                      |
| Baroness Donaghy              | Baroness Drake                  | Lord Drayson                    |
| Lord Dubs                     | Lord Elder                      | Lord Falconer of Thoroton       |
| Lord Faulkner of Worcester    | Lord Foulkes of Cumnock         | Baroness Gale                   |
| Lord Giddens                  | Lord Glasman                    | Baroness Golding                |
| Lord Gordon of Strathblane    | Baroness Goudie                 | Lord Grantchester               |
| Lord Griffiths of Burry Port  | Lord Grocott                    | Lord Hain                       |
| Viscount Hanworth             | Lord Harris of Haringey         | Lord Haskel                     |
| Lord Haworth                  | Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town | Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill |
| Baroness Henig                | Baroness Hilton of Eggardon     | Lord Hollick                    |
| Baroness Hollis of Heigham    | Lord Hoyle                      | Lord Hughes of Woodside         |
| Lord Hunt of Chesterton       | Lord Hutton of Furness          | Lord Irvine of Lairg            |
| Baroness Jay of Paddington    | Baroness Jones of Whitchurch    | Lord Jones                      |
| Lord Judd                     | Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws   | Lord Kennedy of Southwark       |
| Baroness Kennedy of Cradley   | Baroness Kingsmill              | Baroness Kinnock of Holyhead    |
| Lord Kinnock                  | Lord Knight of Weymouth         | Baroness Lawrence of Clarendon  |
| Lord Layard                   | Lord Lea of Crondall            | Lord Lennie                     |
| Baroness Liddell of Coatdyke  | Lord Liddle                     | Lord Lipsey                     |
| Baroness Lister of Burtersett | Lord MacKenzie of Culkein       | Lord Mandelson                  |
| Baroness Massey of Darwen     | Lord Maxton                     | Lord McAvoy                     |
| Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall  | Lord McKenzie of Luton          | Lord Mendelsohn                 |
| Lord Monks                    | Lord Moonie                     | Lord Morris of Aberavon         |
| Baroness Morris of Yardley    | Lord Morris of Handsworth       | Lord Murphy of Torfaen          |
| Lord Parekh                   | Lord Pendry                     | Baroness Pitkeathley            |
| Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede    | Lord Prescott                   | Baroness Primarolo              |
| Lord Puttnam                  | Baroness Quin                   | Lord Radice                     |
| Lord Rea                      | Baroness Rebuck                 | Lord Reid of Cardowan           |
| Lord Rogers of Riverside      | Lord Rooker                     | Lord Rosser                     |
| Lord Rowlands                 | Lord Sawyer                     | Baroness Sherlock               |
| Viscount Simon                | Baroness Smith of Basildon      | Lord Snape                      |
| Lord Stevenson of Balmacara   | Lord Stone of Blackheath        | Baroness Taylor of Bolton       |
| Lord Tomlinson                | Lord Touhig                     | Lord Triesman                   |
| Lord Tunncliffe               | Lord Turnberg                   | Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe |
| Lord Watson of Invergowrie    | Baroness Wheeler                | Baroness Whitaker               |
| Lord Whitty                   | Lord Williams of Elvel          | Lord Winston                    |
| Lord Wood of Anfield          | Lord Young of Norwood Green     | Baroness Young of Old Scone     |

---

#### Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government

##### Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government

|  |                                    |                                |
|--|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Lord Addington                             | Lord Alderdice                     | Lord Allan of Hallam           |
| Baroness Bakewell of Hardington Mandeville | Baroness Barker                    | Lord Beith                     |
| Baroness Benjamin                          | Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury | Baroness Bowles of Berkhamsted |
| Baroness Brinton                           | Lord Bruce of Bennachie            | Lord Burnett                   |
| Baroness Burt of Solihull                  | Lord Campbell of Pittenweem        | Lord Chidgey                   |
| Lord Clement-Jones                         | Lord Cotter                        | Lord Dholakia                  |
| Baroness Doocey                            | Baroness Falkner of Margravine     | Baroness Featherstone          |
| Lord Foster of Bath                        | Lord Fox                           | Baroness Garden of Frognal     |
| Lord German                                | Earl Glasgow                       | Lord Goddard of Stockport      |

|                              |                               |                                  |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Lord Greaves                 | Baroness Grender              | Baroness Hamwee                  |
| Baroness Harris of Richmond  | Baroness Humphreys            | Lord Hussain                     |
| Baroness Hussein-Ece         | Baroness Janke                | Lord Jones of Cheltenham         |
| Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope    | Baroness Kramer               | Lord Lee of Trafford             |
| Lord MacLennan of Rogart     | Baroness Maddock              | Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames   |
| Lord McNally                 | Lord Newby                    | Baroness Northover               |
| Lord Paddick                 | Lord Palmer of Childs Hill    | Baroness Parminter               |
| Baroness Pinnock             | Lord Purvis of Tweed          | Baroness Randerson               |
| Lord Razzall                 | Lord Redesdale                | Lord Rennard                     |
| Lord Roberts of Llandudno    | Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank   | Baroness Scott of Needham Market |
| Lord Scriven                 | Lord Sharkey                  | Baroness Sheehan                 |
| Lord Shipley                 | Lord Shutt of Greetland       | Baroness Smith of Newnham        |
| Lord Steel of Aikwood        | Lord Stephen                  | Lord Stoneham of Droxford        |
| Lord Storey                  | Lord Strasburger              | Lord Stunell                     |
| Baroness Suttie              | Lord Taverne                  | Lord Teverson                    |
| Lord Thomas of Gresford      | Baroness Thomas of Winchester | Baroness Thornhill               |
| Viscount Thurso              | Lord Tope                     | Lord Tyler                       |
| Baroness Tyler of Enfield    | Lord Vallance of Tummel       | Lord Verjee                      |
| Lord Wallace of Saltaire     | Lord Wallace of Tankerness    | Baroness Walmsley                |
| Lord Willis of Knaresborough | Lord Wrigglesworth            |                                  |

---

#### **Crossbench Votes with the Government**

|                                   |                           |                                  |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood | Baroness Cox              | Lord Craig of Radley             |
| Viscount Craigavon                | Lord Dannatt              | Baroness Deech                   |
| Lord Eames                        | Earl Erroll               | Lord Green of Deddington         |
| Lord Greenway                     | Earl Hay of Kinnoull      | Lord Hogan-Howe                  |
| Lord Hope of Craighead            | Lord Hylton               | Lord Judge                       |
| Lord Kilclooney                   | Lord Laming               | Lord Luce                        |
| Earl Lytton                       | Lord Palmer               | Lord Phillips of Worth Matravers |
| Lord Ramsbotham                   | Viscount Slim             | Lord St John of Bletso           |
| Lord Thurlow                      | Lord Trevethin and Oaksey | Lord Turnbull                    |
| Lord Woolf                        |                           |                                  |

#### **Crossbench Votes against the Government**

|                           |                                 |                               |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Lord Aberdare             | Lord Berkeley of Knighton       | Lord Best                     |
| Lord Bilimoria            | Lord Birt                       | Baroness Brown of Cambridge   |
| Lord Butler of Brockwell  | Baroness Butler-Sloss           | Baroness Campbell of Surbiton |
| Earl Clancarty            | Viscount Colville of Culross    | Lord Cromwell                 |
| Lord Curry of Kirkharle   | Lord Dear                       | Baroness D'Souza              |
| Lord Dykes                | Baroness Finlay of Llandaff     | Baroness Greengross           |
| Baroness Grey-Thompson    | Lord Hannay of Chiswick         | Lord Harries of Pentregarth   |
| Baroness Hayman           | Baroness Howe of Idlicote       | Lord Jay of Ewelme            |
| Lord Kerr of Kinlochard   | Baroness Kidron                 | Lord Krebs                    |
| Baroness Lane-Fox of Soho | Earl Listowel                   | Lord Loomba                   |
| Lord Low of Dalston       | Countess of Mar                 | Baroness Masham of Ilton      |
| Lord Mitchell             | Baroness Neuberger              | Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve  |
| Lord Pannick              | Lord Patel                      | Baroness Prashar              |
| Lord Rees of Ludlow       | Lord Ricketts                   | Lord Rowe-Beddoe              |
| Lord Russell of Liverpool | Earl Sandwich                   | Duke of Somerset              |
| Baroness Stern            | Lord Stevens of Kirkwhelpington | Lord Trees                    |
| Lord Warner               | Baroness Watkins of Tavistock   | Lord Wilson of Dinton         |
| Lord Wilson of Tillyorn   | Baroness Worthington            | Baroness Young of Hornsey     |

---

#### **Bishop Votes with the Government**

Bishop of Chester

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

Bishop of Leeds

---

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Browne of Belmont

Lord Empey

Lord Gadhia

Lord Hay of Ballyore

Lord Kalms

Lord Pearson of Rannoch

Lord Rogan

Lord Stevens of Ludgate

Lord Stoddart of Swindon

Baroness Stowell of Beeston

Lord Taylor of Warwick

Lord Willoughby de Broke

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Bhatia

Baroness Jones of Moulsecoomb

Lord Oakeshott of Seagrove Bay

Lord Patel of Bradford

Lord Smith of Finsbury

Baroness Tonge

Lord Truscott

Baroness Uddin

Ref: 2143