

# Government Defeat in Lords on Legal Aid, Sentencing and Punishment of Offenders Bill

Monday 05/03/2012

On 05/03/2012 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Legal Aid, Sentencing and Punishment of Offenders Bill: To require the Lord Chancellor to ensure that the process for appointing the Director of Legal Aid Casework guarantees his or her independence.

This was defeat number 37 in the parliamentary session.

<b>Breakdown of Votes</b>	<b>For Govt</b>	<b>Against Govt</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>No vote</b>
<b>Conservative</b>	118	1	119	98
<b>Labour</b>	0	174	174	64
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	60	2	62	28
<b>Crossbench</b>	14	32	46	140
<b>Bishops</b>	0	0	0	27
<b>Other</b>	3	3	6	25
<b>Total</b>	<b>195</b>	<b>212</b>	<b>407</b>	<b>382</b>

## **Conservative Votes with the Government**

Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon	Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Earl Arran
Lord Ashton of Hyde	Lord Astor of Hever	Earl Attlee
Lord Ballyedmond	Lord Bates	Baroness Berridge
Lord Blencathra	Lord Boswell of Aynho	Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone
Viscount Bridgeman	Lord Brittan of Spennithorne	Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville
Lord Brougham and Vaux	Baroness Browning	Baroness Buscombe
Baroness Byford	Earl Caithness	Earl Cathcart
Lord Colwyn	Lord Cope of Berkeley	Earl Courtown
Lord Crickhowell	Baroness Cumberlege	Lord De Mauley
Lord Deben	Lord Denham	Lord Dixon-Smith
Lord Dobbs	Baroness Eaton	Viscount Eccles
Lord Edmiston	Lord Elton	Lord Fink
Lord Flight	Baroness Fookes	Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Framlingham	Lord Fraser of Carmyllie	Lord Freud
Lord Gardiner of Kimble	Baroness Gardner of Parkes	Lord Geddes
Lord Glendonbrook	Lord Gold	Lord Goodlad
Viscount Goschen	Lord Green of Hurstpierpoint	Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach
Lord Hamilton of Epsom	Baroness Hanham	Lord Henley
Baroness Heyhoe Flint	Lord Higgins	Lord Hill of Oareford
Earl Home	Baroness Hooper	Lord Howard of Rising
Lord Howe of Aberavon	Earl Howe	Lord Hunt of Wirral
Lord James of Blackheath	Baroness Jenkin of Kennington	Lord Jenkin of Roding
Lord Jopling	Lord Lamont of Lerwick	Lord Lingfield
Earl Liverpool	Lord Luke	Lord Macfarlane of Bearsden

Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market  
Lord Marlesford  
Lord Naseby  
Baroness O’Cathain  
Lord Ribeiro  
Lord Ryder of Wensum  
Earl Selborne  
Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia  
Lord Sheikh  
Lord Skelmersdale  
Lord Stewartby  
Lord Taylor of Holbeach  
Lord Trimble  
Viscount Ullswater  
Lord Wasserman  
Viscount Younger of Leckie

Lord Maples  
Lord Mayhew of Twysden  
Baroness Newlove  
Lord Popat  
Lord Risby  
Lord Sassoon  
Lord Selkirk of Douglas  
Baroness Sharples  
Baroness Shephard of Northwold  
Lord Spicer  
Baroness Stowell of Beeston  
Lord Trefgarne  
Lord True  
Baroness Verma  
Lord Wei

Lord Marland  
Baroness Morris of Bolton  
Lord Norton of Louth  
Baroness Rawlings  
Lord Roberts of Conwy  
Baroness Seccombe  
Lord Selsdon  
Lord Shaw of Northstead  
Earl Shrewsbury  
Baroness Stedman-Scott  
Lord Strathclyde  
Viscount Trenchard  
Lord Tugendhat  
Lord Wade of Chorlton  
Baroness Wheatcroft

**Conservative Votes against the Government**

Lord Newton of Braintree

**Labour Votes with the Government**

-

**Labour Votes against the Government**

Baroness Adams of Craigielea  
Lord Anderson of Swansea  
Lord Bach  
Lord Bassam of Brighton  
Lord Bilston  
Lord Boateng  
Lord Bradley  
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe  
Lord Campbell-Savours  
Lord Clark of Windermere  
Baroness Corston  
Lord Davies of Oldham  
Lord Donoughue  
Lord Elder  
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  
Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland  
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen  
Lord Goldsmith  
Baroness Gould of Potternewton  
Lord Grenfell  
Viscount Hanworth  
Lord Hart of Chilton  
Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town  
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon  
Lord Howarth of Newport  
Lord Hoyle  
Lord Hunt of Kings Heath  
Baroness Jay of Paddington  
Lord Jones  
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws  
Baroness King of Bow  
Lord Kirkhill  
Lord Lea of Crondall  
Lord Liddle

Lord Adonis  
Baroness Andrews  
Baroness Bakewell  
Lord Berkeley  
Baroness Blackstone  
Lord Borrie  
Lord Bragg  
Lord Brookman  
Lord Carter of Coles  
Lord Clinton-Davis  
Lord Davies of Stamford  
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde  
Baroness Drake  
Lord Evans of Watford  
Lord Faulkner of Worcester  
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock  
Lord Giddens  
Lord Gordon of Strathblane  
Lord Graham of Edmonton  
Lord Griffiths of Burry Port  
Lord Harris of Haringey  
Lord Haskel  
Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill  
Lord Hollick  
Baroness Howells of St Davids  
Lord Hughes of Woodside  
Lord Irvine of Lairg  
Lord Joffe  
Lord Jordan  
Lord Kennedy of Southwark  
Lord King of West Bromwich  
Lord Knight of Weymouth  
Lord Levy  
Lord Lipsey

Lord Ahmed  
Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top  
Lord Barnett  
Lord Bhattacharyya  
Baroness Blood  
Lord Boyd of Duncansby  
Lord Brennan  
Lord Browne  
Viscount Chandos  
Lord Collins of Highbury  
Lord Davies of Coity  
Baroness Donaghy  
Lord Dubs  
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting  
Lord Filkin  
Baroness Gale  
Baroness Golding  
Baroness Goudie  
Lord Grantchester  
Lord Grocott  
Lord Harrison  
Lord Haworth  
Baroness Henig  
Baroness Hollis of Heigham  
Lord Howie of Troon  
Baroness Hughes of Stretford  
Lord Janner of Braunstone  
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch  
Lord Judd  
Lord Kestenbaum  
Baroness Kinnock of Holyhead  
Lord Layard  
Baroness Liddell of Coatdyke  
Baroness Lister of Burterset

Lord Lymgne	Lord Macdonald of Tradeston	Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein	Baroness Mallalieu	Lord Maxton
Lord McAvoxy	Lord McConnell of Glenscorrodale	Baroness McDonagh
Lord McFall of Alcluith	Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton
Lord Mitchell	Lord Monks	Lord Morgan
Baroness Morgan of Huyton	Lord Morris of Handsworth	Baroness Morris of Yardley
Lord Morris of Aberavon	Baroness Nye	Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan
Lord Patel of Bradford	Lord Patel of Blackburn	Lord Pendry
Baroness Pitkeathley	Lord Plant of Highfield	Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede
Lord Prescott	Baroness Prosser	Lord Radice
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Lord Rea	Lord Reid of Cardowan
Baroness Rendell of Babergh	Lord Richard	Lord Rosser
Lord Rowlands	Baroness Royall of Blaisdon	Lord Sawyer
Baroness Scotland of Asthal	Lord Sewel	Lord Sheldon
Baroness Sherlock	Viscount Simon	Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Baroness Smith of Basildon	Lord Snape	Lord Soley
Lord Stevenson of Balmacara	Lord Stone of Blackheath	Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean
Baroness Taylor of Bolton	Lord Temple-Morris	Baroness Thornton
Lord Tomlinson	Lord Toughig	Lord Triesman
Lord Tunnicliffe	Lord Turnberg	Baroness Turner of Camden
Baroness Wall of New Barnet	Lord Warner	Baroness Wheeler
Baroness Whitaker	Lord Whitty	Baroness Wilkins
Lord Williams of Elvel	Lord Wills	Lord Winston
Lord Wood of Anfield	Lord Woolmer of Leeds	Lord Young of Norwood Green

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Alderdice	Lord Allan of Hallam
Lord Ashdown of Norton-sub-Hamdon	Lord Avebury	Baroness Benjamin
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury	Lord Bradshaw	Baroness Brinton
Lord Burnett	Lord Carlile of Berriew	Lord Chidgey
Lord Clement-Jones	Lord Cotter	Lord Dholakia
Baroness Doocey	Lord Dykes	Lord Fearn
Baroness Garden of Frognal	Lord German	Earl Glasgow
Baroness Hamwee	Baroness Harris of Richmond	Lord Hussain
Baroness Hussein-Ece	Lord Jones of Cheltenham	Baroness Kramer
Lord Loomba	Lord Macdonald of River Glaven	Baroness Maddock
Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames	Lord McNally	Lord Newby
Baroness Northover	Lord Oakeshott of Seagrove Bay	Lord Palmer of Childs Hill
Baroness Parminter	Baroness Randerson	Lord Razzall
Lord Rennard	Lord Roberts of Llandudno	Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank
Baroness Scott of Needham Market	Lord Sharkey	Baroness Sharp of Guildford
Lord Shipley	Lord Shutt of Greetland	Lord Smith of Clifton
Lord Steel of Aikwood	Lord Stoneham of Droxford	Lord Storey
Lord Teverson	Lord Thomas of Gresford	Baroness Thomas of Winchester
Lord Tyler	Baroness Tyler of Enfield	Lord Wallace of Saltaire
Lord Wallace of Tankerness	Baroness Walmsley	Lord Willis of Knaresborough

**Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Baroness Linklater of Butterstone	Lord Phillips of Sudbury
-----------------------------------	--------------------------

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Baroness Boothroyd	Viscount Brookeborough	Baroness Butler-Sloss
Lord Cobbold	Lord Craig of Radley	Viscount Craigavon
Lord Greenway	Lord Hannay of Chiswick	Lord Jay of Ewelme
Lord Kakkar	Lord Laming	Lord Martin of Springburn
Lord Patel	Lord Sutherland of Houndwood	

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Aberdare	Lord Alton of Liverpool	Lord Armstrong of Iliminster
Lord Bilimoria	Earl Clancarty	Viscount Colville of Culross
Baroness Coussins	Lord Elystan-Morgan	Viscount Falkland
Lord Fellowes	Lord Hennessy of Nympsfield	Baroness Howe of Idlicote
Lord Hylton	Lord Kerr of Kinlochard	Lord Low of Dalston
Baroness Masham of Ilton	Baroness Meacher	Viscount Montgomery of Alamein
Baroness Morgan of Drefelin	Lord Neill of Bladen	Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve
Lord Palmer	Lord Pannick	Baroness Prashar
Lord Ramsbotham	Lord Rowe-Beddoe	Lord Scott of Foscote
Baroness Stern	Lord Stevens of Kirkwhelpington	Lord Walpole
Lord Walton of Detchant	Baroness Young of Hornsey	

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

-

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

-

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Empey	Lord Laird	Lord Maginnis of Drumglass
------------	------------	----------------------------

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Browne of Belmont	Lord Rooker	Lord Smith of Finsbury
------------------------	-------------	------------------------

Ref: 1621