

# Government Defeat in Lords on Justice and Security Bill [HL]

Wednesday 21/11/2012

On 21/11/2012 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Justice and Security Bill [HL]: To require that the court be satisfied when ordering a closed material procedure that the harm to national security caused by disclosure of material outweighs the public interest in fair and open justice.

This was defeat number 5 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of	For Govt	Against Govt	Total	No vote
<b>Conservative</b>	129	3	132	81
<b>Labour</b>	0	133	133	91
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	11	54	65	25
<b>Crossbench</b>	18	44	62	114
<b>Bishops</b>	0	5	5	20
<b>Other</b>	2	8	10	22
<b>Total</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>247</b>	<b>407</b>	<b>353</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon	Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Earl Arran
Lord Ashcroft	Lord Ashton of Hyde	Lord Astor of Hever
Earl Attlee	Lord Bates	Lord Black of Brentwood
Lord Blencathra	Viscount Bridgeman	Lord Brittan of Spennithorne
Lord Brougham and Vaux	Baroness Browning	Baroness Byford
Earl Caithness	Earl Cathcart	Lord Chadlington
Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Lord Colwyn	Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Cormack	Earl Courtown	Lord Crathorne
Lord Crickhowell	Lord De Mauley	Lord Dixon-Smith
Lord Dobbs	Baroness Eaton	Baroness Eccles of Moulton
Viscount Eccles	Lord Eden of Winton	Lord Faulks
Lord Feldman of Elstree	Lord Flight	Baroness Fookes
Lord Forsyth of Drumlean	Lord Fowler	Lord Framlingham
Lord Fraser of Carmyllie	Lord Freeman	Lord Freud
Lord Gardiner of Kimble	Baroness Gardner of Parkes	Lord Garel-Jones
Lord Geddes	Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glentoran
Lord Goodlad	Viscount Goschen	Lord Green of Hurstpierpoint
Lord Hamilton of Epsom	Baroness Hanham	Lord Harris of Peckham
Lord Henley	Lord Heseltine	Baroness Heyhoe Flint
Lord Hill of Oareford	Baroness Hooper	Lord Howard of Rising
Earl Howe	Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Hunt of Wirral
Lord James of Blackheath	Lord Jenkin of Roding	Baroness Jenkin of Kennington
Lord Jopling	Lord King of Bridgwater	Lord Kirkham
Baroness Knight of Collingtree	Lord Lexden	Earl Lindsay
Lord Lingfield	Earl Liverpool	Lord Luke
Lord Magan of Castletown	Lord Mancroft	Lord Marland
Lord Marlesford	Lord Mayhew of Twysden	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Duke of Montrose	Lord Moore of Lower Marsh	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Lord Moynihan	Lord Naseby	Baroness Neville-Jones
Baroness Newlove	Lord Northbrook	Lord Norton of Louth
Baroness O' Cathain	Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes	Lord Patten
Baroness Perry of Southwark	Lord Popat	Baroness Rawlings
Lord Ribeiro	Lord Risby	Lord Roberts of Conwy
Lord Saatchi	Lord Sanderson of Bowden	Lord Sassoon
Baroness Seccombe	Lord Selkirk of Douglas	Lord Selsdon

Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia  
Lord Sheikh  
Lord Spicer  
Baroness Stowell of Beeston  
Lord Trefgarne  
Lord Tugendhat  
Lord Wakeham  
Baroness Wheatcroft

Baroness Sharples  
Baroness Shephard of Northwold  
Baroness Stedman-Scott  
Lord Strathclyde  
Lord Trimble  
Viscount Ullswater  
Baroness Warsi  
Baroness Wilcox

Lord Shaw of Northstead  
Earl Shrewsbury  
Lord Stewartby  
Lord Taylor of Holbeach  
Lord True  
Baroness Verma  
Lord Wasserman  
Viscount Younger of Leckie

#### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

Baroness Berridge

Lord Campbell of Alloway

Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts

#### **Labour Votes with the Government**

-

#### **Labour Votes against the Government**

Baroness Adams of Craigielea  
Lord Anderson of Swansea  
Lord Bassam of Brighton  
Lord Bradley  
Lord Brookman  
Lord Carter of Coles  
Lord Clinton-Davis  
Baroness Crawley  
Lord Davies of Stamford  
Lord Desai  
Lord Dubs  
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting  
Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland  
Lord Gilbert  
Baroness Gould of Potternewton  
Lord Grocott  
Lord Harrison  
Lord Haworth  
Baroness Henig  
Lord Howarth of Newport  
Lord Hoyle  
Lord Irvine of Lairg  
Lord Jones  
Lord Kennedy of Southwark  
Lord Knight of Weymouth  
Lord Lympe  
Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate  
Lord McAvoy  
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall  
Baroness Morgan of Huyton  
Lord Morris of Handsworth  
Lord Patel of Blackburn  
Baroness Pitkeathley  
Lord Prescott  
Lord Richard  
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon  
Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill  
Lord Stevenson of Balmacara  
Baroness Taylor of Bolton  
Lord Tomlinson  
Lord Tunnicliffe  
Baroness Wheeler  
Baroness Wilkins  
Lord Wood of Anfield  
Lord Young of Norwood Green

Lord Adonis  
Lord Bach  
Lord Berkeley  
Lord Bragg  
Lord Browne  
Lord Christopher  
Lord Collins of Highbury  
Lord Cunningham of Felling  
Lord Davies of Coity  
Baroness Donaghy  
Lord Elder  
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock  
Baroness Golding  
Lord Grantchester  
Viscount Hanworth  
Lord Hart of Chilton  
Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town  
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon  
Baroness Howells of St Davids  
Baroness Hughes of Stretford  
Baroness Jay of Paddington  
Lord Judd  
Lord King of West Bromwich  
Lord Lea of Crondall  
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston  
Baroness Mallalieu  
Baroness McDonagh  
Lord McKenzie of Luton  
Lord Morgan  
Baroness Nye  
Lord Patel of Bradford  
Lord Plant of Highfield  
Baroness Prosser  
Lord Rosser  
Baroness Sherlock  
Baroness Smith of Basildon  
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean  
Lord Temple-Morris  
Lord Touhig  
Baroness Turner of Camden  
Baroness Whitaker  
Lord Williams of Elvel  
Lord Woolmer of Leeds

Lord Ahmed  
Baroness Bakewell  
Lord Bilston  
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe  
Lord Campbell-Savours  
Lord Clark of Windermere  
Baroness Corston  
Lord Davies of Oldham  
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde  
Lord Donoughue  
Lord Evans of Parkside  
Lord Faulkner of Worcester  
Baroness Gale  
Lord Goldsmith  
Lord Griffiths of Burry Port  
Lord Harris of Haringey  
Lord Haskel  
Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill  
Baroness Hollis of Heigham  
Lord Howie of Troon  
Lord Hughes of Woodside  
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch  
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws  
Lord Kirkhill  
Lord Levy  
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein  
Lord Maxton  
Lord McFall of Alcluith  
Lord Mitchell  
Baroness Morris of Yardley  
Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan  
Lord Pendry  
Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede  
Lord Radice  
Lord Rowlands  
Viscount Simon  
Lord Soley  
Lord Taylor of Blackburn  
Baroness Thornton  
Lord Triesman  
Lord Warner  
Lord Whitty  
Lord Wills  
Baroness Worthington

#### **Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

Baroness Garden of Frognal  
Lord Newby  
Baroness Randerson  
Lord Wallace of Tankerness

Baroness Maddock  
Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne  
Lord Sharkey  
Lord Wallace of Saltaire

Lord McNally  
Baroness Northover  
Lord Stoneham of Droxford

**Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Alderdice	Lord Ashdown of Norton-sub-Hamdon
Lord Avebury	Baroness Barker	Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury
Lord Bradshaw	Baroness Brinton	Lord Burnett
Lord Chidgey	Lord Clement-Jones	Lord Cotter
Lord Dholakia	Baroness Doocey	Baroness Falkner of Margravine
Lord German	Lord Goodhart	Lord Greaves
Baroness Hamwee	Lord Hussain	Baroness Jolly
Lord Jones of Cheltenham	Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope	Baroness Kramer
Lord Lee of Trafford	Lord Lester of Herne Hill	Baroness Linklater of Butterstone
Lord Macdonald of River Glaven	Lord Maclennan of Rogart	Earl Mar and Kellie
Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames	Baroness Parminter	Lord Phillips of Sudbury
Lord Razzall	Lord Rennard	Lord Roberts of Llandudno
Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank	Lord Roper	Baroness Scott of Needham Market
Lord Shipley	Lord Shutt of Greetland	Lord Smith of Clifton
Lord Steel of Aikwood	Lord Stephen	Lord Strasburger
Lord Taverner	Lord Teverson	Baroness Thomas of Winchester
Lord Thomas of Gresford	Lord Tordoff	Lord Tyler
Baroness Tyler of Enfield	Baroness Walmsley	Lord Willis of Knaresborough

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Lord Armstrong of Ilminster	Lord Bew	Lord Butler of Brockwell
Viscount Colville of Culross	Lord Condon	Viscount Craigavon
Baroness Deech	Lord Janvrin	Lord Kakkar
Lord Lloyd of Berwick	Baroness Manningham-Buller	Lord Mawson
Baroness Meacher	Lord Palmer	Lord Powell of Bayswater
Lord Sutherland of Houndwood	Lord Thomas of Swynnerton	Lord Wright of Richmond

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Aberdare	Lord Bichard	Lord Bilimoria
Baroness Boothroyd	Baroness Butler-Sloss	Lord Cameron of Lochbroom
Lord Carswell	Earl Clancarty	Lord Cobbold
Baroness Coussins	Lord Elystan-Morgan	Baroness Emerton
Viscount Falkland	Lord Freyberg	Baroness Greengross
Baroness Grey-Thompson	Lord Hannay of Chiswick	Lord Harries of Pentregarth
Baroness Hayman	Baroness Kidron of Angel in the London borough of Islington	Lord Kilclooney
Lord Laming	Lord Low of Dalston	Earl Lytton
Countess of Mar	Lord Martin of Springburn	Baroness Masham of Ilton
Lord May of Oxford	Baroness O'Loan	Lord Owen
Lord Pannick	Lord Patel	Baroness Prashar
Lord Ramsbotham	Earl Sandwich	Lord Scott of Foscote
Baroness Stern	Lord Trees of the Ross in Perth and Kinross	Lord Walpole
Baroness Warnock	Lord Williamson of Horton	Lord Wilson of Tillyorn
Lord Woolf	Baroness Young of Hornsey	

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

-

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

Bishop of Bath and Wells	Bishop of Chester	Bishop of Hereford
Bishop of Newcastle	Bishop of Wakefield	

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Browne of Belmont	Lord Empey
------------------------	------------

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood	Lord Maginnis of Drumglass	Lord Rogan
Lord Smith of Finsbury	Lord Stoddart of Swindon	Baroness Tonge
Baroness Uddin	Lord Wigley	

Ref: 1696