

Government Defeat in Lords on Justice and Security Bill [HL]

Wednesday 21/11/2012

On 21/11/2012 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Justice and Security Bill [HL]: To introduce judicial discretion rather than obligation in the ordering of a closed material procedure where national security is considered to be involved.

This was defeat number 4 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of	For Govt	Against Govt	Total	No vote
Conservative	130	2	132	81
Labour	0	141	141	83
Liberal Democrat	12	55	67	23
Crossbench	15	53	68	108
Bishops	0	4	4	21
Other	2	9	11	21
Total	159	264	423	337

Conservative Votes with the Government

Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon	Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Earl Arran
Lord Ashcroft	Lord Ashton of Hyde	Lord Astor of Hever
Earl Attlee	Lord Bates	Lord Black of Brentwood
Lord Blencathra	Lord Bowness	Viscount Bridgeman
Lord Brittan of Spennithorne	Lord Brougham and Vaux	Baroness Browning
Baroness Byford	Earl Caithness	Lord Campbell of Alloway
Earl Cathcart	Lord Cavendish of Furness	Lord Chadlington
Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Lord Colwyn	Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Cormack	Earl Courtown	Lord Crathorne
Lord Crickhowell	Lord De Mauley	Lord Dixon-Smith
Lord Dobbs	Baroness Eaton	Viscount Eccles
Baroness Eccles of Moulton	Lord Eden of Winton	Lord Elton
Lord Faulks	Lord Feldman of Elstree	Baroness Fookes
Lord Forsyth of Drumlean	Lord Framlingham	Lord Fraser of Carmyllie
Lord Freeman	Lord Freud	Lord Gardiner of Kimble
Baroness Gardner of Parkes	Lord Garel-Jones	Lord Geddes
Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glentoran	Lord Goodlad
Viscount Goschen	Lord Green of Hurstpierpoint	Lord Hamilton of Epsom
Baroness Hanham	Lord Harris of Peckham	Lord Henley
Lord Heseltine	Baroness Heyhoe Flint	Lord Hill of Oareford
Baroness Hooper	Lord Howard of Rising	Earl Howe
Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Hunt of Wirral	Lord James of Blackheath
Baroness Jenkin of Kennington	Lord Jenkin of Roding	Lord Jopling
Lord King of Bridgwater	Lord Kirkham	Baroness Knight of Collingtree
Lord Lexden	Earl Lindsay	Lord Lingfield
Earl Liverpool	Lord Luke	Lord Magan of Castletown
Lord Mancroft	Lord Marland	Lord Marlesford
Lord Mayhew of Twysden	Lord McColl of Dulwich	Duke of Montrose
Lord Moore of Lower Marsh	Baroness Morris of Bolton	Lord Moynihan
Lord Naseby	Baroness Neville-Jones	Baroness Newlove
Lord Northbrook	Lord Norton of Louth	Baroness O'Cathain
Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes	Lord Patten	Baroness Perry of Southwark
Lord Popat	Baroness Rawlings	Lord Ribeiro
Lord Roberts of Conwy	Lord Saatchi	Lord Sanderson of Bowden
Lord Sassoon	Baroness Seccombe	Lord Selkirk of Douglas
		Lord Selsdon

Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia
Lord Shaw of Northstead
Earl Shrewsbury
Lord Stewartby
Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord True
Baroness Verma
Lord Wasserman
Viscount Younger of Leckie

Baroness Sharples
Lord Sheikh
Lord Spicer
Baroness Stowell of Beeston
Lord Trefgarne
Lord Tugendhat
Lord Wakeham
Baroness Wheatcroft

Baroness Shephard of Northwold
Baroness Stedman-Scott
Lord Strathclyde
Lord Trimble
Viscount Ullswater
Baroness Warsi
Baroness Wilcox

Conservative Votes against the Government

Baroness Berridge Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts

Labour Votes with the Government

-

Labour Votes against the Government

Baroness Adams of Craigielea
Lord Anderson of Swansea
Lord Bassam of Brighton
Lord Borrie
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Campbell-Savours
Lord Clark of Windermere
Baroness Corston
Lord Davidson of Glen Clova
Lord Davies of Stamford
Baroness Donaghy
Lord Elder
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleson
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Baroness Golding
Baroness Gould of Potternewton
Lord Griffiths of Burry Port
Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Haskel
Baroness Healy of Primrose Hill
Lord Hollick
Baroness Howells of St Davids
Lord Hughes of Woodside
Lord Janner of Braunstone
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch
Lord Kennedy of Southwark
Baroness Kinnock of Holyhead
Lord Lea of Crondall
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston
Baroness Mallalieu
Baroness McDonagh
Lord McKenzie of Luton
Lord Morgan
Baroness Nye
Lord Patel of Blackburn
Lord Plant of Highfield
Baroness Prosser
Lord Rosser
Baroness Sherlock
Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean
Lord Temple-Morris
Lord Touhig
Baroness Turner of Camden
Baroness Whitaker
Lord Williams of Elvel
Lord Woolmer of Leeds

Lord Adonis
Lord Bach
Lord Berkeley
Lord Bradley
Lord Brookman
Lord Carter of Coles
Lord Clinton-Davis
Baroness Crawley
Lord Davies of Coity
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde
Lord Donoghue
Lord Evans of Parkside
Lord Faulkner of Worcester
Baroness Gale
Lord Goldsmith
Lord Grantchester
Lord Grocott
Lord Harrison
Lord Haworth
Baroness Henig
Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Lord Howie of Troon
Baroness Hughes of Stretford
Baroness Jay of Paddington
Lord Judd
Lord King of West Bromwich
Lord Kirkhill
Lord Levy
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein
Lord Maxton
Lord McFall of Alcluith
Lord Mitchell
Baroness Morris of Yardley
Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan
Lord Pendry
Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede
Lord Radice
Lord Rowlands
Viscount Simon
Lord Soley
Baroness Taylor of Bolton
Baroness Thornton
Lord Triesman
Lord Warner
Lord Whitty
Lord Wills
Baroness Worthington

Lord Ahmed
Baroness Bakewell
Lord Bilston
Lord Bragg
Lord Browne
Lord Christopher
Lord Collins of Highbury
Lord Cunningham of Felling
Lord Davies of Oldham
Lord Desai
Lord Dubs
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting
Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland
Lord Gilbert
Baroness Goudie
Lord Grenfell
Viscount Hanworth
Lord Hart of Chilton
Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon
Lord Howarth of Newport
Lord Hoyle
Lord Irvine of Lairg
Lord Jones
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws
Lord Kinnock
Lord Knight of Weymouth
Lord Lympe
Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord McAvoy
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall
Baroness Morgan of Huyton
Lord Morris of Handsworth
Lord Patel of Bradford
Baroness Pitkeathley
Lord Prescott
Lord Richard
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon
Baroness Smith of Basildon
Lord Stevenson of Balmacara
Lord Taylor of Blackburn
Lord Tomlinson
Lord Tunnicliffe
Baroness Wheeler
Baroness Wilkins
Lord Wood of Anfield
Lord Young of Norwood Green

Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government

Baroness Garden of Frognal
Lord McNally
Baroness Northover

Baroness Hussein-Ece
Lord Newby
Baroness Randerson

Baroness Maddock
Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne
Lord Sharkey

Lord Stoneham of Droxford

Lord Wallace of Tankerness

Lord Wallace of Saltaire

Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government

Lord Addington

Lord Avebury

Lord Bradshaw

Lord Chidgey

Lord Dholakia

Lord German

Baroness Hamwee

Lord Jones of Cheltenham

Lord Lee of Trafford

Lord Macdonald of River Glaven

Lord Marks of Henley-on-Thames

Lord Phillips of Sudbury

Lord Roberts of Llandudno

Baroness Scott of Needham Market

Lord Smith of Clifton

Lord Strasburger

Lord Thomas of Gresford

Lord Tyler

Lord Willis of Knaresborough

Lord Alderdice

Baroness Barker

Baroness Brinton

Lord Clement-Jones

Baroness Doocey

Lord Goodhart

Lord Hussain

Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope

Lord Lester of Herne Hill

Lord MacLennan of Rogart

Lord Palmer of Childs Hill

Lord Razzall

Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank

Lord Shipley

Lord Steel of Aikwood

Lord Taverne

Baroness Thomas of Winchester

Baroness Tyler of Enfield

Lord Ashdown of Norton-sub-Hamdon

Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury

Lord Burnett

Lord Cotter

Baroness Falkner of Margravine

Lord Greaves

Baroness Jolly

Baroness Kramer

Baroness Linklater of Butterstone

Earl Mar and Kellie

Baroness Parminter

Lord Rennard

Lord Roper

Lord Shutt of Greetland

Lord Stephen

Lord Teverson

Lord Tordoff

Baroness Walmsley

Crossbench Votes with the Government

Lord Armstrong of Ilminster

Lord Condon

Lord Janvrin

Baroness Manningham-Buller

Viscount Slim

Lord Bew

Viscount Craigavon

Lord Kakkar

Lord Mawson

Lord Thomas of Swynerton

Lord Butler of Brockwell

Baroness Deech

Lord Lloyd of Berwick

Lord Powell of Bayswater

Lord Wright of Richmond

Crossbench Votes against the Government

Lord Aberdare

Lord Bilimoria

Baroness Butler-Sloss

Earl Clancarty

Baroness Coussins

Baroness Emerton

Baroness Greengross

Lord Harries of Pentregarth

Baroness Kidron of Angel in the London borough of Islington

Lord Low of Dalston

Lord Martin of Springburn

Baroness Meacher

Lord Owen

Baroness Prashar

Lord Scott of Foscote

Lord Sutherland of Houndwood

Baroness Warnock

Lord Woolf

Lord Alton of Liverpool

Lord Blair of Boughton

Lord Cameron of Lochbroom

Lord Cobbold

Lord Crisp

Viscount Falkland

Baroness Grey-Thompson

Baroness Hayman

Earl Lytton

Baroness Masham of Ilton

Baroness O'Loan

Lord Pannick

Lord Ramsbotham

Lord St John of Bletso

Lord Trees of the Ross in Perth and Kinross

Lord Williamson of Horton

Baroness Young of Hornsey

Lord Bichard

Baroness Boothroyd

Lord Carswell

Viscount Colville of Culross

Lord Elystan-Morgan

Lord Freyberg

Lord Hannay of Chiswick

Lord Hylton

Lord Kilclooney Lord Laming

Countess of Mar

Lord May of Oxford

Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve

Lord Patel

Earl Sandwich

Baroness Stern

Lord Walpole

Lord Wilson of Tillyorn

Bishop Votes with the Government

-

Bishop Votes against the Government

Bishop of Bath and Wells

Bishop of Newcastle

Bishop of Chester

Bishop of Hereford

Other Votes with the Government

Lord Browne of Belmont

Lord Empey

Other Votes against the Government

Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood

Lord Pearson of Rannoch

Baroness Tonge

Lord Laird

Lord Smith of Finsbury

Baroness Uddin

Lord Maginnis of Drumglass

Lord Stoddart of Swindon

Lord Wigley

Ref: 1695