

# Government Defeat in Lords on Public Bodies Bill [HL]

Tuesday 23/11/2010

On 23/11/2010 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Public Bodies Bill [HL]: Paving amendment to allow for a new clause which places restrictions on ministerial powers to abolish or modify public bodies by delegated legislation, including requirements to protect judicial independence and human rights.

This was defeat number 5 in the parliamentary session.

| Breakdown of Votes      | For Govt   | Against Govt | Total      | No vote    |
|-------------------------|------------|--------------|------------|------------|
| <b>Conservative</b>     | 137        | 0            | 137        | 59         |
| <b>Labour</b>           | 0          | 171          | 171        | 64         |
| <b>Liberal Democrat</b> | 54         | 0            | 54         | 25         |
| <b>Crossbench</b>       | 8          | 59           | 67         | 114        |
| <b>Bishops</b>          | 0          | 2            | 2          | 23         |
| <b>Other</b>            | 2          | 3            | 5          | 21         |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>201</b> | <b>235</b>   | <b>436</b> | <b>306</b> |

## Conservative Votes with the Government

|                                  |                                |                                 |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Baroness Anelay of St Johns      | Earl Arran                     | Lord Astor of Hever             |
| Earl Attlee                      | Lord Baker of Dorking          | Lord Ballyedmond                |
| Lord Bates                       | Lord Bell                      | Lord Black Brentwood            |
| Lord Boswell Aynho               | Lord Bowness                   | Viscount Bridgeman              |
| Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville | Lord Brougham and Vaux         | Baroness Browning               |
| Baroness Buscombe                | Earl Caithness                 | Lord Carrington                 |
| Earl Cathcart                    | Lord Cavendish of Furness      | Lord Chadlington                |
| Lord Colwyn                      | Lord Cope of Berkeley          | Earl Courtown                   |
| Lord Crathorne                   | Lord Crickhowell               | Lord De Mauley                  |
| Lord Deben                       | Lord Denham                    | Lord Dixon-Smith                |
| Viscount Eccles                  | Baroness Eccles of Moulton     | Lord Eden of Winton             |
| Lord Elton                       | Lord Faulks                    | Lord Feldman                    |
| Baroness Fookes                  | Lord Forsyth of Drumlean       | Lord Fowler                     |
| Lord Fraser of Carmyllie         | Lord Freeman                   | Lord Freud                      |
| Lord Gardiner Kimble             | Lord Garel-Jones               | Lord Geddes                     |
| Lord Glenarthur                  | Lord Glentoran                 | Lord Goodlad                    |
| Viscount Goschen                 | Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach  | Baroness Hanham                 |
| Lord Henley                      | Lord Higgins                   | Lord Hill Oareford              |
| Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbots    | Baroness Hooper                | Lord Howard Lympne              |
| Lord Howard of Rising            | Lord Howe of Aberavon          | Earl Howe                       |
| Lord Howell of Guildford         | Lord Hunt of Wirral            | Lord Hurd of Westwell           |
| Lord Inglewood                   | Baroness James of Holland Park | Lord Jenkin of Roding           |
| Lord Jopling                     | Lord Kerr Monteviot            | Lord Kimball                    |
| Baroness Knight of Collingtree   | Lord Lang of Monkton           | Lord Lawson of Blaby            |
| Earl Lindsay                     | Earl Liverpool                 | Lord Lucas                      |
| Lord Luke                        | Lord Lyell                     | Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market |
| Lord Mackay of Clashfern         | Lord Mancroft                  | Lord Maples                     |
| Lord Marland                     | Lord Mawhinney                 | Lord McColl of Dulwich          |
| Duke of Montrose                 | Lord Moore of Lower Marsh      | Baroness Morris of Bolton       |
| Lord Naseby                      | Baroness Neville-Jones         | Lord Newton of Braintree        |
| Baroness Noakes                  | Lord Norton of Louth           | Baroness O'Cathain              |
| Lord Palumbo                     | Lord Patten of Barnes          | Lord Patten                     |
| Baroness Perry of Southwark      | Lord Pilkington of Oxenford    | Lord Popat                      |

Baroness Rawlings  
Lord Renton of Mount Harry  
Lord Ryder of Wensum  
Earl Selborne  
Lord Shaw of Northstead  
Earl Shrewsbury  
Lord St John of Fawsley  
Lord Taylor of Holbeach  
Viscount Trenchard  
Lord Tugendhat  
Lord Waddington  
Lord Waldegrave of North Hill  
Baroness Wilcox

Lord Reay  
Baroness Ritchie Brompton  
Lord Sassoon  
Lord Selkirk of Douglas  
Lord Sheikh  
Lord Skelmersdale  
Baroness Stedman-Scott  
Lord Tebbit  
Lord Trimble  
Viscount Ullswater  
Lord Wade of Chorlton  
Baroness Warsi  
Viscount Younger Leckie

Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn  
Lord Roberts of Conwy  
Baroness Seccombe  
Baroness Sharples  
Baroness Shephard of Northwold  
Lord Spicer  
Lord Strathclyde  
Lord Trefgarne  
Baroness Trumpington  
Baroness Verma  
Lord Wakeham  
Lord Wei

#### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

#### **Labour Votes with the Government**

#### **Labour Votes against the Government**

Lord Adonis  
Baroness Andrews  
Lord Bach  
Lord Berkeley  
Lord Bilston  
Lord Borrie  
Lord Bragg  
Lord Brookman  
Lord Christopher  
Lord Clinton-Davis  
Baroness Crawley  
Lord Davies of Coity  
Lord Dixon  
Baroness Drake  
Lord Elder  
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  
Baroness Ford  
Baroness Gale  
Baroness Golding  
Baroness Gould of Potternewton  
Lord Grenfell  
Lord Harris of Haringey  
Lord Haworth  
Baroness Henig  
Baroness Hollis of Heigham  
Lord Hoyle  
Lord Hunt of Kings Heath  
Lord Janner of Braunstone  
Lord Judd  
Lord King of West Bromwich  
Lord Kirkhill  
Lord Lea of Crondall  
Lord Liddle  
Lord Lympne  
Lord Maxton  
Lord McFall Alcluth  
Lord Mitchell  
Baroness Morgan of Drefelin  
Baroness Morris of Yardley  
Lord Myners  
Lord Parekh  
Lord Pendry  
Lord Plant of Highfield  
Baroness Prosser  
Lord Reid Cardowan  
Lord Rosser  
Lord Sawyer  
Baroness Sherlock  
Lord Smith of Leigh  
Lord Stevenson Balmacara

Lord Ahmed  
Lord Archer of Sandwell  
Lord Barnett  
Lord Bhattacharyya  
Baroness Blackstone  
Lord Boyd of Duncansby  
Lord Brett  
Lord Brooks of Tremorfa  
Lord Clark of Windermere  
Baroness Cohen of Pimlico  
Lord Cunningham of Felling  
Lord Davies of Oldham  
Baroness Donaghy  
Lord Dubs  
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting  
Lord Faulkner of Worcester  
Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland  
Lord Gavron  
Lord Gordon of Strathblane  
Lord Graham of Edmonton  
Lord Griffiths of Burry Port  
Lord Hart of Chilton  
Baroness Hayter Kentish Town  
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon  
Lord Howarth of Newport  
Baroness Hughes Stretford  
Lord Hutton Furness  
Baroness Jay of Paddington  
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws  
Lord Kinnock  
Lord Knight Weymouth  
Lord Leitch  
Lord Lipsey  
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein  
Lord McAvoy  
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall  
Lord Moonie  
Lord Morgan  
Lord Morris of Handsworth  
Baroness Nye  
Lord Patel of Blackburn  
Lord Peston  
Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede  
Baroness Quin  
Baroness Rendell of Babergh  
Lord Rowlands  
Baroness Scotland of Asthal  
Viscount Simon  
Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill  
Lord Stone of Blackheath

Lord Anderson of Swansea  
Baroness Armstrong Hill Top  
Lord Bassam of Brighton  
Baroness Billingham  
Lord Boateng  
Lord Bradley  
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe  
Lord Browne Ladyton  
Lord Clarke of Hampstead  
Lord Corbett of Castle Vale  
Lord Davidson of Glen Clova  
Lord Desai  
Lord Donoghue  
Lord Eatwell  
Lord Falconer of Thoroton  
Lord Filkin  
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock  
Lord Gilbert  
Baroness Goudie  
Lord Grantchester  
Lord Grocott  
Lord Haskel  
Baroness Healy Primrose Hill  
Lord Hollick  
Lord Howie of Troon  
Lord Hughes of Woodside  
Lord Irvine of Lairg  
Lord Jones  
Lord Kennedy Southwark  
Baroness Kinnock Holyhead  
Lord Layard  
Baroness Liddell Coatdyke  
Lord Lofthouse of Pontefract  
Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate  
Lord McConnell Glenscorrodale  
Lord MacKenzie of Luton  
Baroness Morgan of Huyton  
Lord Morris of Aberavon  
Lord Morris of Manchester  
Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan  
Lord Patel of Bradford  
Baroness Pitkeathley  
Lord Prescott  
Lord Radice  
Lord Richard  
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon  
Lord Sewel  
Baroness Smith Basildon  
Lord Soley  
Lord Strabolgi

|                                 |                             |                             |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean | Lord Taylor of Blackburn    | Baroness Taylor of Bolton   |
| Baroness Thornton               | Lord Tomlinson              | Lord Touhig                 |
| Lord Triesman                   | Lord Tunnicliffe            | Lord Turnberg               |
| Baroness Turner of Camden       | Baroness Wall of New Barnet | Lord Warner                 |
| Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe | Lord West of Spithead       | Baroness Wheeler            |
| Baroness Whitaker               | Lord Whitty                 | Lord Williams of Elvel      |
| Lord Wills                      | Lord Woolmer of Leeds       | Lord Young of Norwood Green |

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

|                                    |                                  |                                   |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Lord Addington                     | Lord Alderdice                   | Lord Ashdown of Norton-sub-Hamdon |
| Lord Avebury                       | Baroness Barker                  | Baroness Benjamin                 |
| Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury | Lord Bradshaw                    | Lord Burnett                      |
| Lord Chidgey                       | Lord Cotter                      | Lord Dholakia                     |
| Lord Dykes                         | Viscount Falkland                | Lord Fearn                        |
| Baroness Garden of Frognal         | Lord German                      | Baroness Hamwee                   |
| Baroness Harris of Richmond        | Baroness Hussein-Ece             | Lord Jones of Cheltenham          |
| Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope          | Lord Lee of Trafford             | Lord Lester of Herne Hill         |
| Baroness Linklater of Butterstone  | Lord MacLennan of Rogart         | Earl Mar and Kellie               |
| Lord McNally                       | Lord Methuen                     | Lord Newby                        |
| Baroness Northover                 | Baroness Parminter               | Lord Phillips of Sudbury          |
| Lord Razzall                       | Lord Rennard                     | Lord Roberts of Llandudno         |
| Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank        | Baroness Scott of Needham Market | Lord Sharman                      |
| Lord Shipley                       | Lord Shutt of Greetland          | Lord Smith of Clifton             |
| Lord Steel of Aikwood              | Lord Taverne                     | Lord Thomas of Gresford           |
| Baroness Thomas of Walliswood      | Baroness Tonge                   | Lord Tope                         |
| Lord Tordoff                       | Lord Tyler                       | Lord Vallance of Tummel           |
| Lord Wallace of Tankerness         | Lord Wallace of Saltaire         | Baroness Walmsley                 |

**Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

|                        |                           |                    |
|------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|
| Lord Bew               | Viscount Brookeborough    | Viscount Craigavon |
| Lord Greenway          | Lord Kilclooney           | Lord Luce          |
| Lord St John of Bletso | Lord Thomas of Swynnerton |                    |

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

|                               |                             |                            |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|
| Lord Aberdare                 | Viscount Allenby of Megiddo | Lord Alton of Liverpool    |
| Lord Armstrong of Ilminster   | Lord Best                   | Lord Bichard               |
| Baroness Boothroyd            | Baroness Butler-Sloss       | Lord Cameron of Dillington |
| Baroness Campbell of Surbiton | Lord Carey of Clifton       | Lord Chorley               |
| Earl Clancarty                | Lord Cobbold                | Lord Condon                |
| Baroness Coussins             | Lord Craig of Radley        | Lord Crisp                 |
| Baroness Deech                | Baroness D'Souza            | Lord Elystan-Morgan        |
| Lord Fellowes                 | Baroness Finlay of Llandaff | Baroness Grey-Thompson     |
| Lord Hannay of Chiswick       | Lord Harries of Pentregarth | Baroness Hollins           |
| Baroness Howarth of Breckland | Baroness Howe of Idlicote   | Lord Hylton                |
| Lord Krebs                    | Lord Laming                 | Lord Lewis of Newnham      |
| Lord Lloyd of Berwick         | Lord Low of Dalston         | Countess of Mar            |
| Lord Martin Springburn        | Baroness Masham of Ilton    | Lord May of Oxford         |
| Baroness Meacher              | Lord Northbourne            | Baroness O'Loan            |
| Lord Pannick                  | Lord Patel                  | Lord Ramsbotham            |
| Lord Rix                      | Lord Rowe-Beddoe            | Earl Sandwich              |
| Lord Scott of Foscote         | Earl Stair                  | Baroness Stern             |
| Lord Sutherland of Houndwood  | Viscount Tenby              | Lord Walpole               |
| Lord Walton of Detchant       | Baroness Warnock            | Lord Williamson of Horton  |
| Lord Woolf                    | Baroness Young of Hornsey   |                            |

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

|                   |                  |
|-------------------|------------------|
| Bishop of Chester | Bishop of Exeter |
|-------------------|------------------|

**Other Votes with the Government**

|            |            |
|------------|------------|
| Lord Laird | Lord Rogan |
|------------|------------|

**Other Votes against the Government**

|             |                        |                          |
|-------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Lord Rooker | Lord Smith of Finsbury | Lord Stoddart of Swindon |
|-------------|------------------------|--------------------------|