Government Defeat in Lords on Health and Social Care Bill
Monday 14/11/2011

On 14/11/2011 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Health and Social Care Bill: To insert a clause requiring the Secretary of State to report to parliament on the VAT treatment of supplies by charities providing health care services for the NHS.

This was defeat number 24 in the parliamentary session.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Breakdown of Votes</th>
<th>For Govt</th>
<th>Against Govt</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>No vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservative</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Democrat</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossbench</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishops</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conservative Votes with the Government

Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon  Baroness Anelay of St Johns  Lord Ashton of Hyde
Lord Astor of Hever  Earl Atlee  Lord Baker of Dorking
Lord Bell  Baroness Berridge  Lord Blackwell
Lord Boswell of Aynho  Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone  Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville
Lord Brougham and Vaux  Baroness Browning  Baroness Byford
Earl Cathcart  Lord Colwyn  Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Cormack  Earl Courtown  Lord Crickhowell
Baroness Cumberlege  Lord De Mauley  Lord Denham
Lord Dixon-Smith  Lord Dobbs  Baroness Eaton
Baroness Eccles of Moulton  Viscount Eccles  Lord Elton
Lord Faulks  Lord Feldman  Lord Fellowes of West Stafford
Lord Flight  Baroness Fookes  Lord Fowler
Lord Framlingham  Lord Freud  Lord Gardiner of Kimble
Baroness Gardner of Parkes  Lord Geddes  Lord Gold
Lord Goodlad  Baroness Hanham  Lord Henley
Lord Higgins  Lord Hill of Oareford  Earl Howe
Lord Howell of Guildford  Lord Hurd of Westwell  Lord James of Blackheath
Lord Jenkin of Roding  Baroness Jenkin of Kennington  Lord Jopling
Baroness Knight of Collingtree  Lord Lamont of Lerwick  Lord Lexden
Earl Lindsay  Lord Lingfield  Earl Liverpool
Lord Lucas  Lord Luke  Lord Lyell
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market  Lord Marland  Lord Marlesford
Lord Mawhinney  Lord Mayhew of Twysden  Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness Miller of Hendon  Baroness Morris of Bolton  Baroness Newton of Braintree
Baroness Noakes  Baroness O’Cathain  Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes
Baroness Perry of Southwark  Lord Plumb  Lord Popat
Baroness Rawlings  Lord Reay  Lord Ribeiro
Lord Risby  Baroness Ritchie of Brompton  Lord Roberts of Conwy
Lord Ryder of Wensum  Lord Sassoon  Baroness Seccombe
Earl Seilhan  Lord Selborne  Baroness Shackleton of Belgravia
Baroness Sharples  Baroness Shepherd of Northwold  Earl Shrewsbury
Lord Skelmersdale  Lord St John of Fawsley  Baroness Stedman-Scott
Lord Stewartby  Baroness Stowell of Beeston  Lord Swinfen
Lord Taylor of Holbeach  Lord Trefgarne  Lord Trimble
Lord True  Baroness Trumpington  Viscount Ulftwater
Baroness Verma  
Baroness Warsi  
Lord Wasserman  
Viscount Younger of Leckie  
Baroness Wheatcroft  
Baroness Wilcox  
Lord Wei  
Baroness Wei  
Baroness Wilcox  
Conervatives Votes against the Government  
Labour Votes against the Government  
Labour Votes against the Government  
Baroness Adams of Craigielea  
Lady Adonis  
Baroness Armstrong of Hill Top  
Lady Ahmed  
Lord Ahmed  
Baroness Bakewell  
Lady Basam of Brighton  
Lady Bach  
Lord Bach  
Baroness Billingham  
Lady Bilston  
Baroness Blackstone  
Lord Berkeley  
Lord Brodie  
Lord Brookman  
Lady Brooks of Tremorfa  
Lady Brooke of Alverthorpe  
Lord Campbell-Savours  
Lord Christopher  
Lady Clark of Windermere  
Lady Clarke of Hampstead  
Lady Collins of Highbury  
Baroness Crawley  
Lady Davies of Oldham  
Lady Davies of Coyle  
Lady Davies of Stamford  
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde  
Lady Dixon  
Baroness Donaghy  
Baroness Drake  
Lady Dubs  
Lord Elder  
Lord Evans of Watford  
Lady Evans of Temple Guiting  
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  
Lady Foster of Bishop Auckland  
Lord Gavron  
Lord Gordon of Strathblane  
Lady Howie of Troon  
Baroness Gould of Potternewton  
Lady Harrington  
Lady Harris of Haringey  
Baroness Hayter of Kentish Town  
Lady Hart of Chilton  
Lady Haskel  
Lady Hunt of Kings Heath  
Baroness Healey of Primrose Hill  
Lady Henig  
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon  
Baroness Howells of St Davids  
Baroness Hughes of Stratford  
Baroness Jay of Paddington  
Lady Hutton of Furness  
Lady Irvine of Lairg  
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch  
Lady Jones  
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch  
Lady Kennedy of Southwark  
Lady Jordan  
Lord Judd  
Lady Kinock  
Lady Jordan  
Lord King of West Bromwich  
Baroness Kinnock of Holyhead  
Baroness Lister of Burtersett  
Lord Kirkhill  
Lord Knight of Weymouth  
Baroness Lister of Burtersett  
Lady Liddle  
Lord Lipsey  
Baroness List of Aberavon  
Baroness Maclean of Framwellgate  
Baroness Massey of Darwen  
Baroness List of Aberavon  
Lady McAvoy  
Baroness McDonagh  
Lady McIntosh of Sketty  
Baroness Morgan of Ely  
Lady Morgan  
Lord Monks  
Baroness Myers  
Lady Noon  
Baroness Nye  
Lord Patel of Bradford  
Lady Patel of Blackburn  
Lord Peston  
Baroness Pitkeathley  
Lady Plant of Highbury  
Lord Prescott  
Baroness Prosser  
Baroness Quin  
Lord Radice  
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale  
Lady Rea  
Baroness Rendell of Babergh  
Lord Richard  
Lady Rosser  
Lord Rowlands  
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon  
Lady Sawyer  
Baroness Scotland of Asthal  
Lord Sewel  
Viscount Simon  
Lord Soley  
Lord Stevenson of Balmacara  
Baroness Syms of Vernham Dean  
Lord Taylour of Blackburn  
Baroness Thornton  
Lord Touhig  
Lord Triesman  
Baroness Wall of New Barnet  
Lord Turner  
Baroness Turner of Camden  
Baroness Wesley of Spitlehead  
Lady Warner  
Baroness Warwicke of Undercliffe  
Baroness Wilkins  
Lord Williams of Elvel  
Lord Willis  
Lord Wood of Anfield  
Baroness Worthington  
Lord Young of Norwood Green  
Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government  
Lord Addington  
Lord Alderdice  
Lord Avebury  
Baroness Barker  
Baroness Benjamin  
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury  
Lord Bradshaw  
Baroness Brinton  
Lord Clement-Jones  
Lord Dholakia  
Baroness Doocy  
Baroness Garden of Frognal  
Lord German  
Earl Glasgow  
Lord Goodhart  
Lord Greaves  
Baroness Hamwee  
Baroness Harris of Richmond  
Lord Hussain  
Baroness Hussein-Ece  
Baroness Jolly  
Lord Jones of Cheltenham  
Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope  
Baroness Kramer  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Crossbench Votes with the Government</th>
<th>Crossbench Votes against the Government</th>
<th>Bishop Votes with the Government</th>
<th>Bishop Votes against the Government</th>
<th>Other Votes with the Government</th>
<th>Other Votes against the Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lord Craig of Radley</td>
<td>Lord Bichard</td>
<td>Bishop of Chichester</td>
<td>Bishop of Norwich</td>
<td>Baroness Cox</td>
<td>Lord Stoddart of Swindon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Greenway</td>
<td>Lord Chorley</td>
<td></td>
<td>Arch Bishop of York</td>
<td>Lord Empey</td>
<td>Lord Truscott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Kakkar</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lord Wigley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Ramsbotham</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Moff</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Fan of Llandaff</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Hannay of Chiswick</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Hennessy of Nympsfield</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Imbert</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earl Listowel</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Martin of Springburn</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord McCluskey</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Owen</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Richardson of Calow</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Tanlaw</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Williamson of Horton</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Fellowes</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Jay of Ewelme</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness O’Neill of Bengarve</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Eames</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Greengross</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Hayman</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Howe of Idicote</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Laming</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countess of Mar</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Mashon</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness O’Loan</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Prashar</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Warmock</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Young of Hornsey</td>
<td>Lord Elystan-Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ref: 1583