

# Government Defeat in Lords on Personal Care at Home Bill

Wednesday 17/03/2010

On 17/03/2010 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Personal Care at Home Bill: To prevent the Act coming into force until the Secretary of State has commissioned an independent review of the affordability of the provisions and laid its report before both Houses of Parliament.

This was defeat number 12 in the parliamentary session.

<b>Breakdown of Votes</b>	<b>For Govt</b>	<b>Against Govt</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>No vote</b>
<b>Conservative</b>	0	94	94	95
<b>Labour</b>	108	2	110	101
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	47	47	25
<b>Crossbench</b>	8	23	31	151
<b>Bishops</b>	2	1	3	22
<b>Other</b>	2	4	6	20
<b>Total</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>171</b>	<b>291</b>	<b>414</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

### Conservative Votes against the Government

Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Viscount Astor	Lord Astor of Hever
Earl Attlee	Lord Ballyedmond	Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone
Lord Bowness	Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville	Lord Brougham and Vaux
Baroness Buscombe	Baroness Byford	Earl Caithness
Earl Cathcart	Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Lord Colwyn
Lord Cope of Berkeley	Earl Courtown	Lord Crickhowell
Lord De Mauley	Lord Dixon-Smith	Earl Dundee
Lord Eden of Winton	Lord Elton	Lord Feldman
Earl Ferrers	Baroness Fookes	Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Fowler	Lord Freud	Baroness Gardner of Parkes
Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glentoran	Lord Goodlad
Viscount Goschen	Lord Hamilton of Epsom	Baroness Hanham
Lord Henley	Lord Higgins	Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts
Lord Howard of Rising	Lord Howe of Aberavon	Earl Howe
Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Hunt of Wirral	Lord Inglewood
Lord James of Blackheath	Lord Jopling	Baroness Knight of Collingtree
Lord Lamont of Lerwick	Lord Lawson of Blaby	Earl Lindsay
Lord Lucas	Lord Lyell	Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market
Lord Marland	Lord Marlesford	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morris of Bolton	Lord Moynihan
Lord Naseby	Baroness Neville-Jones	Lord Newton of Braintree
Lord Northbrook	Lord Norton of Louth	Baroness O'Cathain
Lord Patten	Lord Pilkington of Oxenford	Lord Plumb
Baroness Rawlings	Lord Reay	Lord Renton of Mount Harry
Lord Roberts of Conwy	Lord Ryder of Wensum	Baroness Seccombe
Lord Selkirk of Douglas	Lord Selsdon	Baroness Sharples
Lord Shaw of Northstead	Lord Sheikh	Earl Shrewsbury
Lord Skelmersdale	Lord Soulsby of Swaffham Prior	Lord Stewartby
Lord Taylor of Holbeach	Lord Tebbit	Lord Trimble
Baroness Trumpington	Lord Tugendhat	Viscount Ullswater
Baroness Verma	Lord Waddington	Lord Wade of Chorlton
Baroness Wilcox		

**Labour Votes with the Government**

Lord Acton	Baroness Adams of Craigielea	Lord Anderson of Swansea
Baroness Andrews	Lord Archer of Sandwell	Lord Bach
Lord Barnett	Lord Bassam of Brighton	Lord Bhattacharyya
Lord Bilston	Lord Borrie	Lord Boyd of Duncansby
Lord Bradley	Lord Brett	Lord Brookman
Lord Brooks of Tremorfa	Lord Campbell-Savours	Lord Christopher
Lord Clinton-Davis	Baroness Crawley	Lord Davidson of Glen Clova
Lord Davies of Oldham	Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde	Lord Desai
Lord Dubs	Lord Evans of Parkside	Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton
Lord Faulkner of Worcester	Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland	Baroness Gale
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen	Lord Gilbert	Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Baroness Goudie	Baroness Gould of Potternewton	Lord Grantchester
Lord Grenfell	Lord Grocott	Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Harrison	Lord Haskel	Lord Hattersley
Baroness Henig	Baroness Hilton of Eggardon	Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Lord Howarth of Newport	Baroness Howells of St Davids	Lord Hoyle
Lord Hughes of Woodside	Lord Hunt of Kings Heath	Lord Janner of Braunstone
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch	Lord Jones	Lord Jordan
Lord Judd	Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws	Lord King of West Bromwich
Baroness Kinnock Holyhead	Lord Kinnock	Lord Kirkhill
Lord Lea of Crondall	Lord Levy	Lord Macdonald of Tradeston
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein	Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate	Baroness Massey of Darwen
Lord Maxton	Baroness McDonagh	Lord McIntosh of Haringey
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton	Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Baroness Morgan of Huyton	Lord Morris of Handsworth	Lord Morris of Aberavon
Lord Morris of Manchester	Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan	Lord Parekh
Lord Patel of Blackburn	Baroness Pitkeathley	Baroness Prosser
Baroness Quin	Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Baroness Rendell of Babergh
Lord Richard	Lord Robertson of Port Ellen	Lord Rosser
Lord Rowlands	Baroness Royall of Blaisdon	Lord Sawyer
Viscount Simon	Lord Snape	Lord Soley
Lord Strabolgi	Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean	Baroness Taylor of Bolton
Lord Taylor of Blackburn	Lord Temple-Morris	Baroness Thornton
Lord Tunnicliffe	Baroness Turner of Camden	Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe
Lord Wedderburn of Charlton	Baroness Whitaker	Lord Whitty
Lord Williams of Elvel	Lord Woolmer of Leeds	Lord Young of Norwood Green

**Labour Votes against the Government**

Lord Lipsey	Lord Warner
-------------	-------------

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government****Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Alderdice	Lord Avebury
Baroness Barker	Lord Bradshaw	Lord Burnett
Lord Chidgey	Lord Cotter	Lord Dholakia
Lord Dykes	Viscount Falkland	Baroness Garden of Frogna
Earl Glasgow	Lord Goodhart	Lord Greaves
Baroness Hamwee	Baroness Harris of Richmond	Lord Jones of Cheltenham
Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope	Lord Lee of Trafford	Lord Lester of Herne Hill
Lord Livsey of Talgarth	Baroness Maddock	Lord McNally
Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer	Baroness Neuberger	Lord Newby
Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne	Baroness Northover	Lord Oakeshott of Seagrove Bay
Lord Redesdale	Lord Rennard	Lord Roberts of Llandudno
Baroness Scott of Needham Market	Baroness Sharp of Guildford	Lord Shutt of Greetland
Lord Steel of Aikwood	Lord Taverne	Baroness Thomas of Walliswood
Baroness Thomas of Winchester	Baroness Tonge	Lord Tope
Lord Tordoff	Lord Tyler	Lord Vallance of Tummel
Lord Wallace of Saltaire	Baroness Walmsley	

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Baroness Afshar	Baroness Boothroyd	Lord Cameron of Dillington
Baroness Campbell of Surbiton	Baroness D'Souza	Lord Elystan-Morgan
Baroness Finlay of Llandaff	Lord Martin Springburn	

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Aberdare	Lord Alton of Liverpool	Lord Armstrong of Ilminster
Viscount Craigavon	Lord Dear	Lord Hylton

Lord Kerr of Kinlochard  
Lord Mawson  
Baroness O'Loan  
Lord Powell of Bayswater  
Lord St John of Bletso  
Lord Turnbull

Earl Listowel  
Baroness Murphy  
Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve  
Lord Ramsbotham  
Lord Stevens of Kirkwhelpington  
Baroness Warnock

Lord Low of Dalston  
Lord Northbourne  
Lord Patel  
Earl Sandwich  
Lord Thomas of Swynnerton

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

Bishop of Ripon and Leeds                      Archbishop of York

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

Bishop of Norwich

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Watson of Invergowrie                      Baroness Young of Old Scone

**Other Votes against the Government**

Baroness Cox                      Lord Maginnis of Drumglass                      Lord Rogan

Lord Stoddart of Swindon

Ref: 1422