Government Defeat in Lords on Health Bill [HL]
Tuesday 12/05/2009

On 12/05/2009 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Health Bill [HL]: To insert a clause allowing the Secretary of State to make regulations to permit exceptions to the rules governing the private patient income cap for NHS foundation trusts, on condition that any exception is in the interests of the National Health Service.

This was defeat number 9 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of Votes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conservative</th>
<th>For Govt</th>
<th>Against Govt</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>No vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Democrat</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossbench</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishops</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conservative Votes with the Government

Baroness Anelay of St Johns  Lord Astor of Hever  Lord Baker of Dorking
Lord Bates  Lord Blackwell  Lord Bowness
Viscount Bridgeman  Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville  Lord Brougham and Vaux
Baroness Byford  Earl Caithness  Baroness Carnegy of Lour
Earl Cathcart  Lord Colwyn  Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Crathorne  Lord Crickhowell  Lord De Mauley
Lord Denham  Lord Dixon-Smith  Earl Dundee
Viscount Eccles  Lord Elliott of Morpeth  Lord Elton
Earl Ferrers  Baroness Fookes  Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Fowler  Baroness Gardner of Parkes  Lord Geddes
Lord Glaister  Lord Glentoran  Lord Goodlad
Lord Griffiths of Forestfach  Baroness Hanham  Lord Hayhoe
Lord Henley  Lord Higgins  Baroness Hooper
Lord Howard of Rising  Earl Howe  Lord Howe of Aberavon
Lord Howell of Guildford  Lord Inglewood  Lord James of Blackheath
Lord Jenkin of Roding  Lord Kimball  Lord Kingsland
Lord Lamont of Lerwick  Lord Lawson of Blaby  Earl Liverpool
Lord Lucas  Lord Luke  Lord Lyell
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market  Lord Mackay of Clashfern  Lord Mancroft
Lord Marlesford  Lord Mayhew of Twysden  Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness Miller of Hendon  Duke of Montrose  Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Neville-Jones  Lord Norton of Louth  Baroness O'Cathain
Earl Onslow  Lord Pilkington of Oxenford  Baroness Rawlings
Lord Renton of Mount Harry  Lord Roberts of Conwy  Lord Ryder of Wensum
Baroness Seccombe  Earl Selborne  Lord Selkirk of Douglas
Lord Selsdon  Baroness Sharples  Lord Shaw of Northstead
Baroness Shephard of Northwold  Lord Skelmersdale  Lord Soulsby of Swaffham Prior
Lord Stewardby  Lord Strathclyde  Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord Tebbit  Lord Trimble  Baroness Trumpington
Lord Tugendhat  Viscount Ullswater  Baroness Verma
Lord Waddington  Baroness Warsi
Labour Votes with the Government

Baroness Andrews — Lord Archer of Sandwell
Lord Bassam of Brighton — Lord Barnett
Lord Blatch — Lord Bhattacharyya
Lord Bragg — Lord Borrie
Lord Campbell-Savours — Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Clarke of Hampstead — Lord Clark of Windermere
Baroness Corston — Lord Corbett of Castle Vale
Lord Darzi of Denham — Lord Cunningham of Felling
Lord Davies of Oldham — Lord Davies of Coity
Lord Dubs — Lord Desai
Lord Evans of Parkside — Lord Elder
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton — Lord Evans of Watford
Baroness Ford — Lord Filkin
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield — Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Lord Gilbert — Lord Gavron
Baroness Gould of Potternewton — Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Lord Grocott — Lord Grantham
Lord Haworth — Lord Hart of Chilton
Baroness Howells of St Davids — Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Lord Hughes of Woodside — Lord Hoyle
Lord Jones — Lord Irvine of Lairg
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaw — Lord Judd
Lord Kirkhill — Baroness Kingsmill
Lord Lothian of Pontefract — Lord Lipton
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston — Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord Malloch-Brown — Baroness Massey of Darwen
Lord Maxton — Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall
Lord McKenzie of Luton — Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Lord Parekh — Lord Myners
Lord Paul — Lord Patel of Blackburn
Lord Plant of Highfield — Lord Patel of Blackpool
Lord Puttnam — Baroness Pikethailey
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale — Lord Pris-Davies
Lord Rosser — Lord Puttnam
Lord Sawyer — Baroness Quin
Viscount Simon — Lord Radice
Lord Soley — Lord Richard
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean — Baroness Royall of Blaisdon
Lord Temple-Morris — Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Lord Tunnicliffe — Lord Strabolgi
Lord West of Spithead — Baroness Taylor of Bolton

Labour Votes against the Government

Lord Adonis — Lord Anderson of Swansea
Baroness Andrews — Lord Barnett
Lord Bassam of Brighton — Lord Bhattacharyya
Lord Blatch — Lord Borrie
Lord Bragg — Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Campbell-Savours — Lord Clark of Windermere
Lord Clarke of Hampstead — Lord Corbett of Castle Vale
Baroness Corston — Lord Cunningham of Felling
Lord Darzi of Denham — Lord Davies of Coity
Lord Davies of Oldham — Lord Desai
Lord Dubs — Lord Elder
Lord Evans of Parkside — Lord Evans of Watford
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton — Lord Filkin
Baroness Ford — Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield — Lord Gavron
Lord Gilbert — Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Baroness Gould of Potternewton — Lord Grantham
Lord Grocott — Lord Hart of Chilton
Lord Haworth — Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Baroness Howells of St Davids — Lord Hoyle
Lord Hughes of Woodside — Lord Irvine of Lairg
Lord Jones — Lord Judd
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaw — Baroness Kingsmill
Lord Kirkhill — Lord Lipton
Lord Lothian of Pontefract — Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston — Baroness Massey of Darwen
Lord Malloch-Brown — Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall
Lord Maxton — Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Lord McKenzie of Luton — Lord Myners
Lord Parekh — Lord Patel of Blackburn
Lord Paul — Baroness Pikethailey
Lord Plant of Highfield — Lord Pris-Davies
Lord Puttnam — Lord Puttnam
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale — Lord Puttnam
Lord Rosser — Lord Puttnam
Lord Sawyer — Lord Puttnam
Viscount Simon — Lord Puttnam
Lord Soley — Lord Puttnam
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean — Lord Puttnam
Lord Temple-Morris — Lord Puttnam
Lord Tunnicliffe — Lord Puttnam
Lord West of Spithead — Lord Puttnam

Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government

Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government

Lord Addington — Lord Avebury
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury — Baroness Barker
Lord Chidgey — Lord Carile of Berriew
Lord Dykes — Lord Dholakia
Lord Fearn — Baroness Falkner of Margravine
Lord Goodhart — Earl Glasgow
Baroness Harris of Richmond — Baroness Hamwee
Baroness Linklater of Butterstone — Lord Lee of Trafford
Baroness Maddock — Lord Mackie of Benshie
Baroness Methuen — Lord McNally
Baroness Northover — Baroness Neuberger
Lord Roberts of Llandudno — Lord Redesdale
Lord Steel of Aikwood — Lord Smith of Clifton
Baroness Thomas of Winchester — Baroness Thomas of Walliswood
Lord Tyler — Lord Tope
Lord Wallace of Tankerness — Lord Wallace of Saltaire
Baroness Williams of Crosby — Lord Watson of Richmond
### Crossbench Votes with the Government
- Lord Armstrong of Ilminster
- Baroness Deech
- Lord Bhatia
- Lord Elystan-Morgan
- Lord Browne of Belmont

### Crossbench Votes against the Government
- Viscount Allenby of Megiddo
- Lord Best
- Lord Bridges
- Lord Cameron of Dillington
- Lord Condon
- Lord Currie of Marylebone
- Baroness Emerton
- Lord Greenway
- Lord Kerr of Kinlochard
- Lord Luce
- Baroness Meacher
- Baroness Murphy
- Lord Ramsbotham
- Viscount Slim
- Lord Walpole
- Lord Williamson of Horton
- Lord Alton of Liverpool
- Lord Bew
- Viscount Brookeborough
- Baroness Campbell of Surbiton
- Baroness Coussins
- Baroness D'Souza
- Baroness Finlay of Llandaff
- Lord Hannay of Chiswick
- Lord Lewis of Newnham
- Countess of Mar
- Lord Monson
- Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve
- Lady Saltoun of Abernethy
- Earl Stair
- Lord Walton of Detchant
- Bishop of Southwark

### Bishop Votes with the Government
- Bishop of Southwark

### Bishop Votes against the Government
- Bishop of Southwark

### Other Votes with the Government
- Lord Ahmed
- Lord Stoddart of Swindon
- Baroness Young of Old Scone

### Other Votes against the Government
- Lord Stoddart of Swindon
- Lord Tanlaw

Ref: 1341