

# Government Defeat in Lords on Health Bill [HL]

Tuesday 12/05/2009

On 12/05/2009 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Health Bill [HL]: To insert a clause allowing the Secretary of State to make regulations to permit exceptions to the rules governing the private patient income cap for NHS foundation trusts, on condition that any exception is in the interests of the National Health Service.

This was defeat number 9 in the parliamentary session.

<b>Breakdown of Votes</b>	<b>For Govt</b>	<b>Against Govt</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>No vote</b>
<b>Conservative</b>	0	92	92	104
<b>Labour</b>	126	2	128	87
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	49	49	23
<b>Crossbench</b>	5	46	51	151
<b>Bishops</b>	0	1	1	24
<b>Other</b>	2	1	3	14
<b>Total</b>	<b>133</b>	<b>191</b>	<b>324</b>	<b>403</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

### Conservative Votes against the Government

Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Lord Astor of Hever	Lord Baker of Dorking
Lord Bates	Lord Blackwell	Lord Bowness
Viscount Bridgeman	Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville	Lord Brougham and Vaux
Baroness Byford	Earl Caithness	Baroness Carnegy of Lour
Earl Cathcart	Lord Colwyn	Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Crathorne	Lord Crickhowell	Lord De Mauley
Lord Denham	Lord Dixon-Smith	Earl Dundee
Viscount Eccles	Lord Elliott of Morpeth	Lord Elton
Earl Ferrers	Baroness Fookes	Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Fowler	Baroness Gardner of Parkes	Lord Geddes
Lord Glenarthur	Lord Glentoran	Lord Goodlad
Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach	Baroness Hanham	Lord Hayhoe
Lord Henley	Lord Higgins	Baroness Hooper
Lord Howard of Rising	Earl Howe	Lord Howe of Aberavon
Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Inglewood	Lord James of Blackheath
Lord Jenkin of Roding	Lord Kimball	Lord Kingsland
Lord Lamont of Lerwick	Lord Lawson of Blaby	Earl Liverpool
Lord Lucas	Lord Luke	Lord Lyell
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market	Lord Mackay of Clashfern	Lord Mancroft
Lord Marlesford	Lord Mayhew of Twysden	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness Miller of Hendon	Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Neville-Jones	Lord Norton of Louth	Baroness O'Cathain
Earl Onslow	Lord Pilkington of Oxenford	Baroness Rawlings
Lord Renton of Mount Harry	Lord Roberts of Conwy	Lord Ryder of Wensum
Baroness Seccombe	Earl Selborne	Lord Selkirk of Douglas
Lord Selsdon	Baroness Sharples	Lord Shaw of Northstead
Baroness Shephard of Northwold	Lord Skelmersdale	Lord Soulsby of Swaffham Prior
Lord Stewartby	Lord Strathclyde	Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord Tebbit	Lord Trimble	Baroness Trumpington
Lord Tugendhat	Viscount Ullswater	Baroness Verma
Lord Waddington	Baroness Warsi	

**Labour Votes with the Government**

Lord Adonis	Baroness Amos	Lord Anderson of Swansea
Baroness Andrews	Lord Archer of Sandwell	Lord Barnett
Lord Bassam of Brighton	Lord Berkeley	Lord Bhattacharyya
Lord Bilston	Baroness Blood	Lord Borrie
Lord Bragg	Lord Brett	Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Campbell-Savours	Lord Christopher	Lord Clark of Windermere
Lord Clarke of Hampstead	Lord Clinton-Davis	Lord Corbett of Castle Vale
Baroness Corston	Baroness Crawley	Lord Cunningham of Felling
Lord Darzi of Denham	Lord Davidson of Glen Clova	Lord Davies of Coity
Lord Davies of Oldham	Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde	Lord Desai
Lord Dubs	Lord Eatwell	Lord Elder
Lord Evans of Parkside	Lord Evans of Temple Guiting	Lord Evans of Watford
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton	Lord Faulkner of Worcester	Lord Filkin
Baroness Ford	Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland	Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield	Baroness Gale	Lord Gavron
Lord Gilbert	Baroness Golding	Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Baroness Gould of Potternewton	Lord Graham of Edmonton	Lord Grantchester
Lord Grocott	Lord Harrison	Lord Hart of Chilton
Lord Haworth	Baroness Hilton of Eggardon	Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Baroness Howells of St Davids	Lord Howie of Troon	Lord Hoyle
Lord Hughes of Woodside	Lord Hunt of Kings Heath	Lord Irvine of Lairg
Lord Jones	Baroness Jones of Whitchurch	Lord Judd
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws	Lord King of West Bromwich	Baroness Kingsmill
Lord Kirkhill	Lord Lea of Crondall	Lord Lipsey
Lord Lofthouse of Pontefract	Lord Macdonald of Tradeston	Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord Malloch-Brown	Lord Mandelson	Baroness Massey of Darwen
Lord Maxton	Baroness McDonagh	Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall
Lord McKenzie of Luton	Lord Mitchell	Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Baroness Morris of Yardley	Lord Morris of Aberavon	Lord Myners
Lord Parekh	Lord Patel of Bradford	Lord Patel of Blackburn
Lord Paul	Lord Pendry	Baroness Pitkeathley
Lord Plant of Highfield	Baroness Prosser	Lord Prys-Davies
Lord Puttnam	Baroness Quin	Lord Radice
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Baroness Rendell of Babergh	Lord Richard
Lord Rosser	Lord Rowlands	Baroness Royall of Blaisdon
Lord Sawyer	Baroness Scotland of Asthal	Lord Sheldon
Viscount Simon	Lord Smith of Leigh	Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Lord Soley	Lord Stone of Blackheath	Lord Strabolgi
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean	Lord Taylor of Blackburn	Baroness Taylor of Bolton
Lord Temple-Morris	Baroness Thornton	Lord Tomlinson
Lord Tunnicliffe	Baroness Vadera	Baroness Wall of New Barnet
Lord West of Spithead	Baroness Whitaker	Lord Williams of Elvel

**Labour Votes against the Government**

Lord Moonie	Lord Warner
-------------	-------------

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government****Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Avebury	Baroness Barker
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury	Lord Bradshaw	Lord Carlile of Berriew
Lord Chidgey	Lord Clement-Jones	Lord Dholakia
Lord Dykes	Viscount Falkland	Baroness Falkner of Margravine
Lord Fearn	Baroness Garden of Frognal	Earl Glasgow
Lord Goodhart	Lord Greaves	Baroness Hamwee
Baroness Harris of Richmond	Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope	Lord Lee of Trafford
Baroness Linklater of Butterstone	Lord Livsey of Talgarth	Lord Mackie of Benshie
Baroness Maddock	Earl Mar and Kellie	Lord McNally
Lord Methuen	Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer	Baroness Neuberger
Baroness Northover	Lord Razzall	Lord Redesdale
Lord Roberts of Llandudno	Lord Shutt of Greetland	Lord Smith of Clifton
Lord Steel of Aikwood	Lord Teverson	Baroness Thomas of Walliswood
Baroness Thomas of Winchester	Lord Thomas of Gresford	Lord Tope
Lord Tyler	Lord Thallance of Tummel	Lord Wallace of Saltaire
Lord Wallace of Tankerness	Baroness Walmsley	Lord Watson of Richmond
Baroness Williams of Crosby		

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Lord Armstrong of Ilminster  
Baroness Deech

Lord Bhatia  
Lord Elystan-Morgan

Lord Browne of Belmont

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Viscount Allenby of Megiddo  
Lord Best  
Lord Bridges  
Lord Cameron of Dillington  
Lord Condon  
Lord Currie of Marylebone  
Baroness Emerton  
Lord Greenway  
Lord Kerr of Kinlochard  
Lord Luce  
Baroness Meacher  
Baroness Murphy  
Lord Ramsbotham  
Viscount Slim  
Lord Walpole  
Lord Williamson of Horton

Lord Alton of Liverpool  
Lord Bew  
Viscount Brookeborough  
Baroness Campbell of Surbiton  
Baroness Coussins  
Baroness D'Souza  
Baroness Finlay of Llandaff  
Lord Hannay of Chiswick  
Lord Lewis of Newnham  
Countess of Mar  
Lord Monson  
Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve  
Lady Saltoun of Abernethy  
Earl Stair  
Lord Walton of Detchant

Lord Amptill  
Lord Boyce  
Baroness Butler-Sloss  
Lord Cobbold  
Lord Craig of Radley  
Lord Eames  
Baroness Greengross  
Baroness Howarth of Breckland  
Earl Listowel  
Baroness Masham of Ilton  
Viscount Montgomery of Alamein  
Lord Palmer  
Earl Sandwich  
Lord Tanlaw  
Baroness Warnock

**Bishop Votes with the Government****Bishop Votes against the Government**

Bishop of Southwark

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Ahmed

Baroness Young of Old Scone

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Stoddart of Swindon