

Government Defeat in Lords on Health Bill [HL]

Tuesday 28/04/2009

On 28/04/2009 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Health Bill [HL]: To insert a clause incorporating provision for making changes to the NHS Constitution into the Bill in order to give Parliament a role in determining the principles of the NHS Constitution.

This was defeat number 7 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of Votes	For Govt	Against Govt	Total	No vote
Conservative	0	95	95	101
Labour	96	0	96	119
Liberal Democrat	1	2	3	69
Crossbench	19	23	42	160
Bishops	0	0	0	26
Other	2	2	4	13
Total	118	122	240	488

Conservative Votes with the Government

Conservative Votes against the Government

Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Lord Astor of Hever	Earl Attlee
Lord Baker of Dorking	Lord Bowness	Lord Brittan of Spennithorne
Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville	Lord Brougham and Vaux	Earl Caithness
Lord Campbell of Alloway	Baroness Carnegy of Lour	Earl Cathcart
Baroness Chalker of Wallasey	Lord Cope of Berkeley	Earl Courtown
Lord Crathorne	Lord Crickhowell	Lord De Mauley
Lord Denham	Lord Dixon-Smith	Earl Dundee
Viscount Eccles	Baroness Eccles of Moulton	Lord Elliott of Morpeth
Lord Elton	Lord Feldman	Earl Ferrers
Baroness Fookes	Lord Freeman	Baroness Gardner of Parkes
Lord Geddes	Lord Glentoran	Lord Goodlad
Lord Hanningfield	Lord Henley	Lord Higgins
Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts	Lord Howard of Rising	Earl Howe
Lord Howe of Aberavon	Lord Hunt of Wirral	Lord Hurd of Westwell
Lord James of Blackheath	Lord Jenkin of Roding	Lord Kingsland
Lord Lawson of Blaby	Earl Lindsay	Lord Lucas
Lord Luke	Lord Lyell	Lord Macfarlane of Bearsden
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market	Lord Mackay of Clashfern	Lord Mancroft
Lord Marlesford	Lord Mayhew of Twysden	Lord McAlpine of West Green
Lord McColl of Dulwich	Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Lord Naseby	Baroness Neville-Jones	Lord Newton of Braintree
Baroness Noakes	Baroness O' Cathain	Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes
Lord Parkinson	Lord Patten	Baroness Perry of Southwark
Baroness Rawlings	Lord Reay	Lord Renfrew of Kaimsthorn
Lord Roberts of Conwy	Lord Ryder of Wensum	Baroness Seccombe
Earl Selborne	Lord Selsdon	Baroness Sharples
Lord Shaw of Northstead	Lord Sheikh	Earl Shrewsbury
Lord Skelmersdale	Lord Soulsby of Swaffham Prior	Lord Stewartby
Lord Taylor of Holbeach	Lord Trefgarne	Lord Trimble
Baroness Trumpington	Viscount Ullswater	Baroness Verma
Lord Vinson	Lord Waddington	Lord Wade of Chorlton
Baroness Warsi	Baroness Wilcox	

Labour Votes with the Government

Baroness Amos	Lord Archer of Sandwell	Lord Bach
Lord Barnett	Lord Bassam of Brighton	Baroness Billingham
Lord Bilston	Baroness Blood	Lord Borrie
Lord Bradley	Lord Brett	Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Brookman	Lord Campbell-Savours	Lord Christopher
Lord Clark of Windermere	Lord Clarke of Hampstead	Lord Clinton-Davis
Baroness Corston	Lord Darzi of Denham	Lord Davidson of Glen Clova
Lord Davies of Coity	Lord Davies of Oldham	Lord Desai
Lord Donoughue	Lord Dubs	Lord Eatwell
Lord Elder	Lord Evans of Parkside	Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton
Lord Filkin	Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland	Lord Foulkes of Cumnock
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield	Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen	Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Baroness Gould of Potternewton	Lord Graham of Edmonton	Lord Gregson
Lord Grocott	Lord Harris of Haringey	Lord Hart of Chilton
Lord Haworth	Baroness Hilton of Eggardon	Lord Howarth of Newport
Baroness Howells of St Davids	Lord Hughes of Woodside	Lord Hunt of Kings Heath
Lord Irvine of Lairg	Baroness Jay of Paddington	Lord Jones
Lord Judd	Baroness Kingsmill	Lord Lea of Crondall
Lord Levy	Lord Lipsey	Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate
Lord Malloch-Brown	Baroness Massey of Darwen	Lord Maxton
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton	Lord Mitchell
Lord Moonie	Baroness Morgan of Huyton	Lord Morris of Aberavon
Lord Morris of Manchester	Lord Morris of Handsworth	Lord Myners
Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan	Lord Patel of Blackburn	Lord Patel of Bradford
Lord Pendry	Baroness Pitkeathley	Lord Plant of Highfield
Baroness Prosser	Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale	Baroness Rendell of Babergh
Lord Richard	Lord Rooker	Lord Rowlands
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon	Baroness Scotland of Asthal	Lord Sewel
Lord Sheldon	Viscount Simon	Lord Smith of Leigh
Lord Soley	Lord Strabolgi	Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean
Lord Temple-Morris	Baroness Thornton	Lord Tunnicliffe
Lord Warner	Baroness Wilkins	Lord Williams of Elvel

Labour Votes against the Government**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

Lord Jones of Cheltenham

Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government

Baroness Neuberger Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank

Crossbench Votes with the Government

Lord Ampt Hill	Lord Best	Baroness Boothroyd
Lord Broers	Lord Craig of Radley	Baroness Deech
Baroness D'Souza	Lord Elystan-Morgan	Baroness Flather
Baroness Greengross	Lord Hannay of Chiswick	Baroness Howarth of Breckland
Viscount Montgomery of Alamein	Lord Moser	Baroness O'Neill of Bengarve
Viscount Slim	Lord Williamson of Horton	Lord Wilson of Tillyorn
Baroness Young of Hornsey		

Crossbench Votes against the Government

Lord Alton of Liverpool
Viscount Craigavon
Lord Greenway
Countess of Mar
Baroness Murphy
Lord Ramsbotham
Lord Tanlaw
Lord Walton of Detchant

Lord Bridges
Baroness Emerton
Lord Krebs
Baroness Masham of Ilton
Lord Palmer
Lord Rogan
Viscount Tenby
Baroness Warnock

Lord Cobbold
Baroness Finlay of Llandaff
Lord Luce
Lord May of Oxford
Lord Patel
Lady Saltoun of Abernethy
Lord Walpole

Bishop Votes with the Government**Bishop Votes against the Government****Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Ahmed

Lord Watson of Invergowrie

Other Votes against the Government

Lord Stoddart of Swindon

Lord Willoughby de Broke

Ref: 1330