Government Defeat in Lords on Mental Health Bill [HL]
Wednesday 10/01/2007

On 10/01/2007 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Mental Health Bill [HL]: To insert a clause stating that before being subjected to compulsory treatment it should be a requirement that a patient's mental disorder means their 'ability to make decisions about the provision of medical treatment is significantly impaired'.

This was defeat number 1 in the parliamentary session.

Breakdown of Votes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>For Govt</th>
<th>Against Govt</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>No vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Democrat</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossbench</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishops</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>344</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conservative Votes with the Government

Conservative Votes against the Government

Baroness Anelay of St Johns
Lord Bell
Viscount Bridgeman
Lord Brougham and Vaux
Baroness Carnegy of Lour
Lord Colwyn
Lord Crickhowell
Earl Dundee
Lord Eden of Winton
Lord Elton
Baroness Fookes
Lord Fraser of Carmyllie
Lord Geddes
Lord Hamilton of Epsom
Lord Hayhoe
Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts
Lord Howe of Aberavon
Lord Hunt of Wirral
Baroness James of Holland Park
Lord Jopling
Lord Kingsland
Lord Lang of Monkton
Lord Luke
Lord MacLaurin of Knebworth

Earl Arran
Lord Blaker
Lord Brittan of Spennithorne
Lord Bruce-Lockhart
Lord Cavendish of Furness
Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord De Mauley
Baroness Eccles of Moulton
Baroness Elles
Earl Ferrers
Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Freeman
Lord Glentoran
Baroness Hanham
Lord Henley
Baroness Hooper
Earl Howe
Lord Hurd of Westwell
Lord James of Blackheath
Lord Kalms
Baroness Knight of Collingtree
Earl Lindsay
Lord Lyell of Markyate
Lord Marlesford

Lord Astor of Hever
Lord Bowness
Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville
Lord Campbell of Alloway
Lord Chadlington
Earl Countown
Lord Dixon-Smith
Viscount Eccles
Lord Elliot of Morpeth
Baroness Flather
Lord Fowler
Baroness Gardner of Parkes
Lord Goodlad
Lord Hanningfield
Lord Higgins
Lord Howard of Rising
Lord Howell of Guildford
Lord Inglewood
Lord Jenkin of Roding
Lord Kimball
Lord Laidlaw
Lord Lucas
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market
Lord McAlpine of West Green
Lord McColl of Dulwich
Duke of Montrose
Lord Naseby
Baroness O’Cathain
Lord Parkinson
Baroness Perry of Southwark
Lord Plumb
Lord Reay
Lord Saatchi
Lord Selby
Baroness Shephard of Northwold
Lord St John of Fawsley
Lord Strathclyde
Baroness Thatcher
Baroness Verma
Lord Wolfson

Baroness Miller of Hendon
Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Noakes
Lord Patten
Lord Pilkington of Oxenford
Lord Plummer of St Marylebone
Lord Renton of Mount Harry
Lord Sanderson of Bowden
Baroness Sharples
Lord Skelmersdale
Lord Steinberg
Lord Taylor of Warwick
Viscount Trenchard
Lord Wakeham

Lord Montagu of Beaulieu
Lord Murton of Lindisfarne
Lord Norton of Louth
Baroness Park of Monmouth
Lord Patten of Barnes
Baroness Platt of Writtle
Lord Quinton
Lord Roberts of Conwy
Baroness Seccombe
Lord Shaw of Northstead
Lord Soulsby of Swaffham Prior
Lord Stewardby
Lord Taylor of Holbeach
Lord Tugendhat
Lord Windlesham

Labour Votes with the Government

Lord Acton
Lord Ahmed
Baroness Andrews
Lord Bach
Lord Berkeley
Lord Borrie
Lord Brennan
Lord Brooks of Tremorfa
Lord Carter of Coles
Baroness Crawley
Lord Davidson of Glen Clova
Lord Donoughue
Lord Elder
Baroness Falkender
Lord Filkin
Baroness Gale
Lord Goldsmith
Baroness Gould of Potternewton
Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Haworth
Lord Howarth of Newport
Lord Hoyle
Baroness Jay of Paddington
Lord King of West Bromwich
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston
Lord McIntosh of Haringey
Lord Moonie
Lord Morris of Aberavon
Lord Pendry
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale
Lord Rosser
Baroness Scotland of Asthal
Viscount Simon
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean
Lord Truscott
Baroness Uddin
Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe
Lord Woolmer of Leeds
Baroness Adams of Craigiele
Baroness Amos
Lord Archer of Sandwell
Lord Barnett
Baroness Billingham
Lord Boyd of Duncansby
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Burlison
Lord Christopher
Lord Clinton-Davis
Lord Cunningham of Felling
Lord Davies of Oldham
Lord Drayson
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton
Lord Foukus of Cumnock
Lord Gavron
Lord Gordon of Strathblane
Lord Graham of Edmonton
Lord Harrison
Baroness Henig
Baroness Howells of St Davids
Lord Hughes of Woodside
Baroness Howells of St Davids
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein
Lord McKenzie of Luton
Baroness Morgan of Huyton
Lord O’Neill of Clackmannan
Baroness Prosser
Baroness Rendell of Babergh
Baroness Royall of Blaisdell
Lord Sewel
Baroness Smith of Gilmorehill
Lord Tomlinson
Lord Tunkincliffe
Baroness Wall of New Barnet
Baroness Whetaker
Lord Young of Norwood Green

Lord Adonis
Lord Anderson of Swansea
Baroness Ashton of Upholland
Lord Bassam of Brighton
Lord Bilston
Lord Bradley
Lord Brookman
Lord Campbell-Savours
Lord Clark of Windermere
Lord Corbett of Castle Vale
Baroness David
Lord Davies of Coity
Lord Dubs
Lord Falconer of Thoroton
Lord Faulkner of Worcester
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen
Baroness Goudie
Baroness Hollis of Heigham
Lord Howie of Troon
Lord Hunt of Kings Heath
Baroness Jones of Whitchurch
Lord Lipsey
Lord Maxton
Lord Mitchell
Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Lord Parekh
Baroness Quin
Lord Rooker
Lord Sawyer
Lord Sheldon
Lord Soley
Lord Triesman
Baroness Turner of Camden
Lord Warner
Lord Whitty
### Labour Votes against the Government
- Lord Bragg
- Baroness Wilkins
- Lord Winston

### Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government
### Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government
- Lord Addington
- Lord Alderdice
- Lord Avebury
- Baroness Barker
- Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury
- Lord Bradshaw
- Lord Clement-Jones
- Lord Carville of Berriew
- Lord Chidgey
- Lord Dykes
- Viscount Falkland
- Baroness Falkner of Margravine
- Lord Garden
- Lord Goodhart
- Baroness Hamwee
- Baroness Harris of Richmond
- Lord Jones of Cheltenham
- Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope
- Lord Lee of Trafford
- Lord Lester of Herne Hill
- Baroness Linklater of Butterstone
- Baroness Ludford
- Lord Maclennan of Rogart
- Baroness Maddock
- Earl Mar and Kellie
- Lord Methuen
- Baroness Miller of Chilthorne Domer
- Baroness Neuberger
- Lord Newby
- Baroness Northover
- Lord Oakeshott of Seagrove Bay
- Lord Razzall
- Lord Redesdale
- Lord Roberts of Llandudno
- Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank
- Lord Roper
- Lord Russell-Johnston
- Baroness Scott of Needham Market
- Baroness Sharp of Guildford
- Lord Shutt of Greentown
- Lord Smith of Clifton
- Lord Steel of Aikwood
- Lord Teverson
- Lord Thomas of Gresford
- Baroness Thomas of Winchester
- Baroness Tonge
- Lord Tops
- Lord Tordoff
- Lord Tyler
- Lord Wallace of Saltaire
- Baroness Walmsley

### Crossbench Votes with the Government
- Lord Boston of Faversham

### Crossbench Votes against the Government
- Lord Alton of Liverpool
- Lord Best
- Viscount Bledisloe
- Lord Broers
- Viscount Colville of Culross
- Viscount Craigavon
- Lord Currie of Marylebone
- Baroness Darcy de Knayth
- Lord Dear
- Baroness D’Souza
- Baroness Finlay of Llandaff
- Baroness Greengross
- Baroness Howe of Idlicote
- Lord Hylton
- Lord Jay of Ewelme
- Lord Kilclooney
- Lord Laird
- Earl Listowel
- Lord Luce
- Countess of Mar
- Baroness Masham of Ilton
- Baroness Meacher
- Lord Monson
- Baroness Murphy
- Lord Nickson
- Lord Owen
- Lord Palmer
- Lord Patel of Bradford
- Lord Patel
- Lord Powell of Bayswater
- Lord Ramsbotham
- Lord Rogan
- Lady Saltoun of Abernethy
- Earl Sandwich
- Lord St John of Bletso
- Baroness Stern
- Lord Stevens of Kirkwhelpington
- Viscount Tenby
- Lord Trimble
- Lord Walton of Detchant
- Lord Wedderburn of Charlton
- Lord Williamson of Horton
- Baroness Young of Hornsey

### Bishop Votes with the Government

### Bishop Votes against the Government
- Bishop of Exeter
- Bishop of Southwark
- Bishop of Southwell
- Bishop of Worcester

### Other Votes with the Government
- Lord Brett
- Lord Watson of Invergowrie

### Other Votes against the Government
- Lord Beaumont of Whitley
- Lord Stoddart of Swindon

Ref: 1077