

# Government Defeat in Lords on Criminal Defence Service Bill [HL]

Monday 17/10/2005

On 17/10/2005 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Criminal Defence Service Bill [HL]: To remove exemptions from receiving legal aid.

This was defeat number 2 in the parliamentary session.

<b>Breakdown of Votes</b>	<b>For Govt</b>	<b>Against Govt</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>No vote</b>
<b>Conservative</b>	0	86	86	122
<b>Labour</b>	130	0	130	82
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	42	42	32
<b>Crossbench</b>	6	17	23	163
<b>Bishops</b>	0	0	0	25
<b>Other</b>	1	0	1	12
<b>Total</b>	<b>137</b>	<b>145</b>	<b>282</b>	<b>436</b>

## **Conservative Votes with the Government**

### **Conservative Votes against the Government**

Baroness Anelay of St Johns	Lord Astor of Hever	Earl Attlee
Lord Baker of Dorking	Lord Biffen	Lord Blaker
Viscount Bridgeman	Lord Brooke of Sutton Mandeville	Lord Brougham and Vaux
Baroness Buscombe	Lord Campbell of Alloway	Lord Colwyn
Lord Cope of Berkeley	Earl Courtown	Lord Crathorne
Lord Crickhowell	Lord De Mauley	Lord Denham
Lord Dixon-Smith	Earl Dundee	Viscount Eccles
Lord Elton	Lord Feldman	Baroness Flather
Lord Fowler	Lord Freeman	Baroness Gardner of Parkes
Lord Goodlad	Lord Griffiths of Fforestfach	Lord Hamilton of Epsom
Lord Hanningfield	Lord Hayhoe	Lord Henley
Lord Higgins	Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbots	Lord Howe of Aberavon
Earl Howe	Lord Howell of Guildford	Lord Hunt of Wirral
Lord Jenkin of Roding	Lord Kalms	Lord Kimball
Lord Kingsland	Lord Laidlaw	Earl Liverpool
Lord Lucas	Lord Luke	Lord Lyell
Lord Lyell of Markyate	Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market	Lord Mancroft
Lord Mayhew of Twysden	Lord McAlpine of West Green	Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness Miller of Hendon	Lord Monro of Langholm	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Noakes	Lord Northbrook	Earl Northesk
Baroness O'Cathain	Earl Onslow	Baroness Oppenheim-Barnes
Baroness Park of Monmouth	Lord Plumb	Baroness Rawlings
Lord Renton	Lord Roberts of Conwy	Baroness Seccombe
Earl Selborne	Lord Selsdon	Baroness Sharples
Lord Shaw of Northstead	Baroness Shephard of Northwold	Lord Skelmersdale
Lord St John of Fawsley	Lord Stewartby	Lord Strathclyde
Lord Swinfen	Lord Taylor of Warwick	Lord Tebbit

Viscount Trenchard  
Lord Wakeham

Viscount Ullswater  
Lord Windlesham

Lord Waddington

**Labour Votes with the Government**

Baroness Adams of Craigielea  
Baroness Amos  
Lord Archer of Sandwell  
Lord Barnett  
Lord Bernstein of Craigweil  
Baroness Blood  
Lord Brookman  
Lord Carter  
Baroness Clark of Calton  
Baroness Cohen of Pimlico  
Baroness David  
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde  
Lord Elder  
Lord Falconer of Thoroton  
Lord Filkin  
Lord Fyfe of Fairfield  
Lord Giddens  
Lord Gould of Brookwood  
Lord Grocott  
Lord Haskel  
Baroness Hilton of Eggardon  
Baroness Howells of St Davids  
Lord Irvine of Lairg  
Lord Jordan  
Lord King of West Bromwich  
Lord Lipsey  
Lord MacKenzie of Culkein  
Baroness McDonagh  
Lord McKenzie of Luton  
Lord Moonie  
Lord Morgan  
Baroness Nicol  
Lord Plant of Highfield  
Lord Prys-Davies  
Lord Rowlands  
Baroness Scotland of Asthal  
Lord Snape  
Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean  
Lord Temple-Morris  
Lord Triesman  
Lord Turnberg  
Lord Warner  
Lord Whitty  
Lord Woolmer of Leeds

Lord Adonis  
Lord Anderson of Swansea  
Baroness Ashton of Upholland  
Lord Bassam of Brighton  
Lord Bhattacharyya  
Lord Borrie  
Lord Campbell-Savours  
Lord Christopher  
Lord Clarke of Hampstead  
Baroness Corston  
Lord Davies of Oldham  
Lord Desai  
Lord Evans of Parkside  
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  
Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland  
Baroness Gale  
Baroness Goudie  
Lord Graham of Edmonton  
Lord Harrison  
Lord Haworth  
Baroness Hollis of Heigham  
Lord Howie of Troon  
Baroness Jay of Paddington  
Lord Judd  
Lord Kirkhill  
Baroness Lockwood  
Lord Mackenzie of Framwellgate  
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall  
Lord Merlyn-Rees  
Baroness Morgan of Huyton  
Lord Morris of Manchester  
Lord O'Neill of Clackmannan  
Lord Ponsonby of Shulbrede  
Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale  
Baroness Royall of Blaisdon  
Lord Sewel  
Lord Stone of Blackheath  
Baroness Taylor of Bolton  
Baroness Thornton  
Lord Truscott  
Baroness Turner of Camden  
Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe  
Lord Williams of Elvel

Lord Ahmed  
Baroness Andrews  
Lord Bach  
Lord Berkeley  
Lord Bilston  
Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe  
Lord Carter of Coles  
Lord Clark of Windermere  
Lord Clinton-Davis  
Baroness Crawley  
Lord Davies of Coity  
Lord Drayson  
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting  
Lord Faulkner of Worcester  
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock  
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen  
Baroness Gould of Potternewton  
Lord Grantchester  
Lord Hart of Chilton  
Baroness Hayman  
Lord Howarth of Newport  
Lord Hoyle  
Lord Jones  
Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws  
Lord Lea of Crondall  
Lord Macdonald of Tradeston  
Lord Mason of Barnsley  
Lord McIntosh of Haringey  
Lord Mitchell  
Baroness Morgan of Drefelin  
Lord Morris of Aberavon  
Baroness Pitkeathley  
Baroness Prosser  
Baroness Rendell of Babergh  
Lord Sainsbury of Turville  
Viscount Simon  
Lord Stratford  
Lord Taylor of Blackburn  
Lord Tomlinson  
Lord Tunnicliffe  
Baroness Uddin  
Baroness Whitaker  
Lord Winston

**Labour Votes against the Government**

**Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

**Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington  
Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury  
Lord Dykes

Lord Avebury  
Lord Bradshaw  
Baroness Falkner of Margravine

Baroness Barker  
Lord Dholakia  
Lord Fearn

Lord Garden  
Baroness Hamwee  
Lord Jones of Cheltenham  
Baroness Maddock  
Baroness Neuberger  
Baroness Northover  
Lord Rennard  
Baroness Scott of Needham Market  
Lord Smith of Clifton  
Baroness Tonge  
Lord Vallance of Tummel

Earl Glasgow  
Baroness Harris of Richmond  
Lord Lester of Herne Hill  
Earl Mar and Kellie  
Lord Newby  
Lord Razzall  
Lord Roberts of Llandudno  
Baroness Sharp of Guildford  
Lord Taverne  
Lord Tope  
Lord Wallace of Saltaire

Lord Goodhart  
Lord Jacobs  
Lord Mackie of Benshie  
Lord McNally  
Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne  
Lord Redesdale  
Lord Russell-Johnston  
Lord Shutt of Greetland  
Baroness Thomas of Walliswood  
Lord Tordoff  
Baroness Walmsley

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Baroness Boothroyd  
Baroness Howarth of Breckland

Lord Condon  
Viscount Tenby

Baroness Darcy de Knayth  
Baroness Young of Hornsey

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Viscount Allenby of Megiddo  
Lord Cobbold  
Lord Freyberg  
Lord Laird  
Lord Palmer  
Lord Walpole

Lord Amptill  
Earl Erroll  
Lord Hannay of Chiswick  
Baroness Masham of Ilton  
Lord Ramsbotham  
Lord Williamson of Horton

Viscount Bledisloe  
Baroness Finlay of Llandaff  
Baroness Howe of Idlicote  
Lord Monson  
Lady Saltoun of Abernethy

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Brett

**Other Votes against the Government**