

# Government Defeat in Lords on NHS Redress Bill [HL]

Wednesday 15/02/2006

On 15/02/2006 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the NHS Redress Bill [HL]: To confine redress investigations to "investigation of the facts of cases and not to consider the issues of liability in tort".

This was defeat number 22 in the parliamentary session.

<b>Breakdown of Votes</b>	<b>For Govt</b>	<b>Against Govt</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>No vote</b>
<b>Conservative</b>	0	64	64	141
<b>Labour</b>	117	0	117	89
<b>Liberal Democrat</b>	0	40	40	34
<b>Crossbench</b>	6	20	26	163
<b>Bishops</b>	0	0	0	26
<b>Other</b>	2	2	4	9
<b>Total</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>126</b>	<b>251</b>	<b>462</b>

## Conservative Votes with the Government

### Conservative Votes against the Government

Earl Attlee	Lord Biffen	Baroness Bottomley of Nettlestone
Lord Bowness	Lord Brougham and Vaux	Baroness Buscombe
Lord Campbell of Alloway	Baroness Carnegy of Lour	Lord Colwyn
Lord Cope of Berkeley	Earl Courtown	Baroness Cumberlege
Lord Dean of Harptree	Lord Denham	Lord Elliott of Morpeth
Baroness Fookes	Lord Fowler	Lord Fraser of Carmyllie
Lord Garel-Jones	Lord Geddes	Lord Glenarthur
Lord Glentoran	Lord Hamilton of Epsom	Baroness Hanham
Lord Hanningfield	Baroness Hooper	Lord Howard of Rising
Lord Howe of Aberavon	Earl Howe	Lord Kimball
Lord Kingsland	Baroness Knight of Collingtree	Lord Lucas
Lord Luke	Lord Lyell	Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market
Lord MacLaurin of Knebworth	Lord Marlesford	Lord Mayhew of Twysden
Lord McColl of Dulwich	Duke of Montrose	Baroness Morris of Bolton
Lord Naseby	Lord Newton of Braintree	Lord Northbrook
Lord Norton of Louth	Baroness O'Cathain	Earl Onslow
Lord Patten	Lord Rees	Lord Roberts of Conwy
Baroness Seccombe	Lord Selsdon	Lord Shaw of Northstead
Baroness Shephard of Northwold	Lord Steinberg	Lord Stewartby
Lord Taylor of Warwick	Lord Tebbit	Viscount Ullswater
Lord Waddington	Lord Wakeham	Baroness Wilcox
Lord Windlesham		

## Labour Votes with the Government

Lord Acton	Baroness Adams of Craigielea	Lord Adonis
Lord Alli	Baroness Amos	Lord Anderson of Swansea

Baroness Andrews	Lord Archer of Sandwell	Lord Ashley of Stoke
Lord Bach	Lord Bassam of Brighton	Lord Bhattacharyya
Baroness Billingham	Lord Bilston	Baroness Blackstone
Lord Borrie	Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe	Lord Brookman
Lord Brooks of Tremorfa	Lord Burlison	Lord Carter of Coles
Lord Carter	Lord Christopher	Lord Clark of Windermere
Lord Clarke of Hampstead	Lord Clinton-Davis	Lord Corbett of Castle Vale
Baroness Crawley	Lord Cunningham of Felling	Lord Davies of Oldham
Lord Davies of Coity	Lord Dixon	Lord Donoughue
Lord Dubs	Lord Elder	Lord Evans of Temple Guiting
Lord Evans of Parkside	Lord Falconer of Thoroton	Baroness Falkender
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton	Lord Filkin	Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock	Lord Fyfe of Fairfield	Baroness Gale
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen	Lord Gilbert	Baroness Golding
Lord Goldsmith	Baroness Goudie	Baroness Gould of Potternewton
Lord Gould of Brookwood	Lord Grocott	Lord Harris of Haringey
Lord Harrison	Lord Hart of Chilton	Lord Haworth
Baroness Hayman	Baroness Henig	Baroness Hilton of Eggardon
Lord Hogg of Cumbernauld	Baroness Hollis of Heigham	Lord Howarth of Newport
Lord Hughes of Woodside	Lord Hunt of Kings Heath	Lord Irvine of Lairg
Lord Jones	Baroness Kennedy of The Shaws	Lord King of West Bromwich
Lord Kirkhill	Lord Lea of Crondall	Lord Lofthouse of Pontefract
Lord Macaulay of Bragar	Lord Macdonald of Tradeston	Lord MacKenzie of Culkein
Baroness Massey of Darwen	Lord Maxton	Baroness McDonagh
Lord McIntosh of Haringey	Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall	Lord McKenzie of Luton
Lord Mitchell	Lord Moonie	Lord Morris of Aberavon
Lord Patel of Blackburn	Lord Pendry	Baroness Pitkeathley
Lord Plant of Highfield	Baroness Prosser	Lord Prys-Davies
Lord Randall of St Budeaux	Baroness Rendell of Babergh	Lord Rooker
Lord Rosser	Baroness Royall of Blaisdon	Lord Sawyer
Lord Sewel	Viscount Simon	Lord Smith of Finsbury
Lord Soley	Lord Stone of Blackheath	Lord Strabolgi
Baroness Taylor of Bolton	Lord Taylor of Blackburn	Baroness Thornton
Lord Tomlinson	Lord Triesman	Lord Truscott
Lord Turnberg	Baroness Turner of Camden	Lord Warner
Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe	Baroness Whitaker	Baroness Wilkins
Lord Williams of Elvel	Lord Woolmer of Leeds	Lord Young of Norwood Green

#### **Labour Votes against the Government**

#### **Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government**

#### **Liberal Democrat Votes against the Government**

Lord Addington	Lord Alderdice	Lord Avebury
Baroness Barker	Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury	Lord Bradshaw
Lord Chidgey	Lord Clement-Jones	Lord Dykes
Viscount Falkland	Baroness Falkner of Margravine	Lord Garden
Earl Glasgow	Baroness Hamwee	Baroness Harris of Richmond
Lord Holme of Cheltenham	Lord Jones of Cheltenham	Lord Livsey of Talgarth
Lord MacLennan of Rogart	Earl Mar and Kellie	Lord McNally
Lord Methuen	Lord Newby	Baroness Nicholson of Winterbourne
Lord Oakeshott of Seagrove Bay	Lord Razzall	Lord Redesdale
Lord Roberts of Llandudno	Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank	Lord Roper
Lord Russell-Johnston	Baroness Scott of Needham Market	Baroness Sharp of Guildford
Lord Shutt of Greetland	Lord Smith of Clifton	Lord Taverne
Lord Thomas of Gresford	Lord Tyler	Lord Wallace of Saltaire
Baroness Walmsley		

**Crossbench Votes with the Government**

Viscount Allenby of Megiddo      Lord Elystan-Morgan  
Lord Patel      Lord Rees of Ludlow

Lord Moser  
Lord Williamson of Horton

**Crossbench Votes against the Government**

Lord Alton of Liverpool      Lord Ballyedmond  
Viscount Craigavon      Lord Dearing  
Baroness Finlay of Llandaff      Lord Greenway  
Lord Maginnis of Drumglass      Countess of Mar  
Viscount Montgomery of Alamein      Lord Palmer  
Viscount Slim      Baroness Stern  
Lord Walpole      Baroness Young of Hornsey

Lord Bridges  
Baroness D'Souza  
Baroness Howe of Idlicote  
Baroness Masham of Ilton  
Earl Sandwich  
Lord Thomas of Swynnerton

**Bishop Votes with the Government**

**Bishop Votes against the Government**

**Other Votes with the Government**

Lord Brett      Lord Stoddart of Swindon

**Other Votes against the Government**

Lord Beaumont of Whitley      Lord Pearson of Rannoch