Government Defeat in Lords on Charities Bill
Wednesday 12/10/2005

On 12/10/2005 the government had a defeat in the House of Lords on an amendment to the Charities Bill: To ensure the independence of the Charity Commission so that terms and conditions of staff, (not including the Chief Executive) do not require the approval of the Secretary of State.

This was defeat number 1 in the parliamentary session.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Breakdown of Votes</th>
<th>For Govt</th>
<th>Against Govt</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>No vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Democrat</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossbench</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishops</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conservative Votes with the Government

Conservative Votes with the Government
Baroness Anelay of St Johns
Lord Astor of Hever
Lord Biffen
Viscount Bridgeman
Baroness Carnegy of Lour
Lord Cope of Berkeley
Lord Crickhowell
Lord Denham
Baroness Eccles of Moulton
Baroness Fookes
Lord Freeman
Lord Glentoran
Lord Henley
Baroness Hooper
Lord Howe of Aberavon
Lord Jopling
Lord Kingsland
Lord Laidlaw
Earl Liverpool
Lord Lyell of Markyate
Lord Mackay of Clashfern
Lord Mayhew of Twysden
Duke of Montrose
Lord Naseby
Lord Norton of Louth
Lord Patten
Earl Arran
Earl Attlee
Lord Blackwell
Lord Brookes of Sutton Mandeville
Lord Chadlington
Earl Courtown
Lord De Mauley
Earl Dundee
Lord Elliott of Morpeth
Lord Forsyth of Drumlean
Lord Garel-Jones
Lord Goodlad
Lord Higgins
Lord Howard of Rising
Lord Howell of Guildford
Lord Kimball
Lord Kirkham
Lord Lang of Monkton
Lord Lucas
Lord Lyell
Lord Marlesford
Lord McColl of Dulwich
Baroness Morris of Bolton
Baroness Noakes
Baroness O’Cathain
Earl Peel
Lord Ashcroft
Lord Baker of Dorking
Lord Bowness
Earl Caithness
Lord Colwyn
Lord Crathorne
Lord Dean of Harptree
Viscount Eccles
Lord Elton
Lord Fraser of Carmyllie
Lord Glenarthur
Lord Hayhoe
Lord Hodgson of Astley Abbotts
Earl Howe
Lord Inglewood
Lord King of Bridgwater
Baroness Knight of Collingtree
Lord Lawson of Blaby
Lord Luke
Lord MacGregor of Pulham Market
Lord Mawhinney
Lord Monro of Langholm
Lord Moyhiana
Earl Northesk
Baroness Park of Monmouth
Baroness Platt of Writtle
Labour Votes with the Government

Baroness Adams of Craigielea  Lord Adonis  Lord Ahmad of Wimbledon
Lord Anderson of Swansea  Baroness Andrews  Lord Archer of Sandwell
Lord Bach  Lord Bassam of Brighton  Lord Berkeley
Lord Bernstein of Craigweil  Lord Bhattacharyya  Lord Blent
Lord Borrie  Lord Bragg  Lord Brooke of Alverthorpe
Lord Brookman  Lord Brooks of Tremorfa  Lord Burt
Lord Campbell-Savours  Lord Carter of Coles  Lord Carter-Mears
Viscount Chandos  Lord Christopher  Lord Clark of Windermere
Baroness Clark of Calton  Lord Clarke of Hampstead  Lord Corbett of Castlemere
Baroness Corston  Baroness Crawley  Lord Cunningham of Felling
Baroness David  Lord Davies of Oldham  Lord Davies of Coity
Baroness Dean of Thornton-le-Fylde  Lord Desai  Lord Drayson
Lord Dubs  Lord Eatwell  Lord Elder
Lord Evans of Temple Guiting  Lord Evans of Parkside  Lord Falconer of Thoroton
Baroness Farrington of Ribbleton  Lord Filkin  Lord Foster of Bishop Auckland
Lord Foulkes of Cumnock  Baroness Gale  Lord Gavron
Baroness Gibson of Market Rasen  Lord Giddens  Lord Gilbert
Baroness Gould of Brookwood  Lord Gordon of Strathblane  Baroness Goudie
Baroness Grantchester  Baroness Gould of Potternewton  Lord Graham of Edmonton
Lord Harris of Haringey  Lord Griffiths of Burry Port  Lord Grocott
Lord Haworth  Lord Haworth  Lord Hunt of Kings Heath
Lord Hoyle  Lord Hughes of Woodside  Lord Hunt of Kings Heath
Lord Hunt of Chesterton  Lord Jones  Lord Jordan
Lord Judd  Lord King of West Bromwich  Lord Kinnock
Lord Kirkhill  Lord Lea of Crondall  Lord Lipsey
Lord MacKenzie of Framwellgate  Lord MacKenzie of Culkein  Baroness Mallalieu
Baroness Massey of Darwen  Lord Maxton  Lord McIntosh of Haringey
Baroness McIntosh of Hudnall  Lord McKenzie of Luton  Lord Merlyn-Rees
Lord Moonie  Baroness Morgan of Huyton  Baroness Morgan of Drefelin
Lord Morris of Aberavon  Baroness Morris of Yardley  Lord Morris of Manchester
Baroness Nicoll  Lord Peston  Baroness Pitkeathley
Lord Plant of Highfield  Lord Prosser  Baroness Ramsay of Cartvale
Lord Randall of St Budeaux  Baroness Rendell of Babergh  Lord Richard
Lord Rooker  Lord Rowlands  Baroness Royall of Blaisdon
Lord Sainsbury of Turville  Lord Sawyer  Lord Sewel
Lord Sheldon  Viscount Simon  Lord Snape
Lord Speaker  Lord Stone of Blackheath  Baroness Symons of Vernham Dean
Lord Taylor of Blackburn  Lord Temple-Morris  Baroness Thornton
Lord Tomlinson  Lord Truscott  Lord Tunnicliffe
Baroness Turner of Camden  Baroness Uddin  Baroness Wall of New Barnet
Lord Warner  Baroness Warwick of Undercliffe  Baroness Whitaker
Baroness Wilkins  Lord Williams of Elvel  Lord Woolmer of Leeds

Labour Votes against the Government
### Liberal Democrat Votes with the Government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lord Addington</th>
<th>Lord Avebury</th>
<th>Baroness Barker</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Bonham-Carter of Yarnbury</td>
<td>Lord Bradshaw</td>
<td>Lord Chidgey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Dholakia</td>
<td>Lord Dykes</td>
<td>Baroness Falkner of Margravine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Garden</td>
<td>Baroness Hamwee</td>
<td>Baroness Harris of Richmond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Holme of Cheltenham</td>
<td>Lord Hooson</td>
<td>Lord Jones of Cheltenham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Kirkwood of Kirkhope</td>
<td>Lord Lester of Herne Hill</td>
<td>Baroness Linklater of Butterstone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Livsey of Talgarth</td>
<td>Baroness Maddock</td>
<td>Earl Mar and Kellie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord McNally</td>
<td>Baroness Miller of Chithorne Dormer</td>
<td>Lord Newby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Phillips of Sudbury</td>
<td>Lord Razzall</td>
<td>Lord Redesdale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Rennard</td>
<td>Lord Roberts of Llandudno</td>
<td>Lord Rodgers of Quarry Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Roper</td>
<td>Baroness Scott of Needham Market</td>
<td>Lord Shutt of Greystones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Smith of Clifton</td>
<td>Lord Steel of Aikwood</td>
<td>Baroness Thomas of Walliswood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroness Tonge</td>
<td>Lord Tordoff</td>
<td>Lord Tyler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Wallace of Saltaire</td>
<td>Baroness Walmsley</td>
<td>Baroness Williams of Crosby</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Crossbench Votes with the Government

| Lord Cobbold                      | Viscount Colville of Culross | Lord Craig of Radley          |
| Viscount Craigavon                | Lord Dahrendorf              | Baroness Darcy de Knayth      |
| Baroness D'Souza                  | Baroness Howarth of Breckland | Baroness Howe of Idlicote     |
| Lord Maginnis of Drumglass        | Baroness Masham of Ilton     | Viscount Montgomery of Alamein|
| Lord Palmer                       | Lord Ryder of Wensum         | Earl Sandwich                 |
| Lord Skidelsky                    | Viscount Tenby               | Lord Thomas of Swynnerton     |
| Lord Walpole                      | Lord Weatherill              | Lord Williamson of Horton     |

### Bishop Votes with the Government

### Other Votes with the Government

| Baroness Young of Old Scone       |

### Other Votes against the Government

| Lord Beaumont of Whitley          | Lord Stoddart of Swindon     |

Ref: 876