

Mail - O'Brien, Am... x How to Use the Int... x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi... x UCL Molecular and... x

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 1 / 4 100%

INDEPENDENT CONSULTANTS 'ARE CONSIDERING' S4C'S CONTROVERSIAL PROGRAMME

The S4C Authority has appointed an independent editorial consultant to investigate complaints that the series *DNA Cymru* has misled people with scientific information.

But even though the doubts have been raised since before a programme to introduce the concept on St David's Day this year, the entire series is about to be broadcast on the channel beginning on Sunday night.

Some of the criticism of the concept has been that people are being encouraged to spend between £160 and £190 on a DNA test that cannot, according to its critics, give anything other than general information.

Academics at the University of London allege that 'it appears public money is being misused to promote a commercial company.

In March, a letter was sent to the Authority listing a number of concerns about the nature of the programme, which shows DNA being used to 'attempt to define what is to be Welsh'.

18°C Mostly sunny 17:01 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Am... x How to Use the Int... x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi... x UCL Molecular and... x

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 1 / 4 100%

is to be Welsh'.

In the autumn the complainant, Iwan Standley, who works as a freelancer in new media and is the author of a blog called *Syndod*, was told in an email from the secretary of the Authority that the S4C Complaint Committee was considering the consultant's report into the complaints.

In a statement, S4C said "the complaints committee will consider the report in the coming weeks".

The *DNA Cymru* series was the idea of Ian Jones, S4C chief executive, and has been put together by CymruDNAWales, a joint project between S4C, Greenbay Media and Media Wales (owner of the *Daily Post* and *Western Mail*) and the Moffat Partnership.

The Moffat Partnership is a private company that sells DNA ancestry tests, with a DNA test for a man costing £190 and £160 for a woman.

But the tests are controversial amongst scientists, and on his blog earlier this year, Iwan Standley revealed that he had aired some of the doubts about the *DNA Cymru* programme with the Welsh channel.

'In correspondence, S4C have acknowledged that they were aware beforehand of strong doubts among scientists about DNA tests of this kind,' said the 38-year-old blogger, 'but they decided not to reveal those doubts to the audience when marketing the tests to them.'

18°C Mostly sunny 17:01 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Am... x How to Use the Int... x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi... x UCL Molecular and... x

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 2 / 4 100%

Every individual inherits billions of DNA [sic] from their parents, and the experts at the Moffat Partnership claim they can say which DNA comes from different geographic areas.

In promoting the series, CymruDNAWales used the DNA of well-known people including Dafydd Iwan, Angharad Mair and Bryn Terfel, to connect them to people who lived hundreds or thousands of years ago.

In the CymruDNAWales launch ceremony in Cardiff Bay last September, the singer Dafydd Iwan was told he had DNA that is rare in Wales.

According to an S4C press release at the time, the DNA tests 'strongly suggest that the singer and politician... is a descendant of Welsh-speaking kings that at one time controlled lands in England' before they had to retreat West 'in the 5th century' when

18°C Mostly sunny 17:01 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Am... x How to Use the Int... x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi... x UCL Molecular and... x

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 2 / 4 100%

the singer and politician... is a descendant of Welsh-speaking kings that at one time controlled lands in England' before they had to retreat West 'in the 5th century' when the Saxons arrived.

But according to one expert on evolutionary genetics, there is no basis to the claim that genetic ancestry can be traced directly back to the 5th century. The academic is one of the fiercest critics of the CymruDNA project.

"The claims are mad, they are invented stories to all intents and purposes," said Professor Mark Thomas of the Department of Genetics, Evolution and Environment at UCL.

Discussing the claim that Dafydd Iwan is a descendant of 5th-century kings, he said: "he is certainly related to warriors from the 5th century, but so is everyone else in Europe".

"There is nothing in the DNA test they have run that says that to them specifically."

"If you go back 1,500 years to the 5th century, how many ancestors do you think you have? It's a lot.

"Everyone who lived in the British Isles, everyone who lived in western Europe at the time, is probably an ancestor of yours."

THE SCIENTIFIC DEBATE

18°C Mostly sunny 17:01 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Am... | How to Use the Int... | Wayback Machine | Wayback Machine | My Edits | UCL Divi... | UCL Molecular and... | +

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE | Wayback Machine | 1 capture | 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint | 2 / 4 | 100% | + | -

THE SCIENTIFIC DEBATE

On the website of Sense About Science, a charitable trust that enables people to understand scientific matters, Professor Mark Thomas argues that a genetic profile cannot provide accurate information about an individual's ancestors.

Alistair Moffat, chief executive of the DNA testing company that is cooperating on the project with S4C, has said that only a "small minority" oppose the work and that "combining history and science is completely new... and bound to attract criticism".

But Mark Thomas says there are no experts – beyond those employed by Alistair Moffat's company – that agree with the theories of the Moffat Partnership.

"If they can name one scientist working in this field, who is willing to go on record and say 'I believe that the claims being made are reasonable and scientific'... then I will eat my house," he said.

The genetics professor is also critical of the fact that the details of CymruDNA's

18°C Mostly sunny | 17:02 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Am... | How to Use the Int... | Wayback Machine | Wayback Machine | My Edits | UCL Divi... | UCL Molecular and... | +

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE | Wayback Machine | 1 capture | 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint | 3 / 4 | 100% | + | -

research has not been published in an authoritative publication.

"Absolutely nothing they have said has been published in a scientific journal, which is the minimum needed for scientific credibility for this kind of thing."

On their website Wednesday morning, S4C stated that the DNA tests 'are dependable and scientific', and that 'the results can be used to identify genetic patterns in today's population'.

But they acknowledged that 'the usefulness of the tests' was disputed, and that 'some academics have questioned the interpretation of the results to draw conclusions about the movement of historical people across the old world; and the usefulness of the test to an individual is the subject of debate'.

In a statement to *Go!wg* a spokesperson for the channel said:

'S4C's complaints committee, which includes members of the S4C Authority, have commissioned independent advice about Iwan Standley's complaint regarding the *DNA Cymru* programme. The work of finalising the report is ongoing and the complaints committee will consider the report's contents in the coming weeks'.

Although we asked the Moffat Partnership about the complaints, they did not respond.

'EDUCATION AND CORRECT LESSONS' OF S4C SERIES

18°C Mostly sunny | 17:02 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Ama x How to Use the Int x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi x UCL Molecular and x +

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 3 / 4 100%

The *DNA Cymru* series starts on S4C Sunday night with more of the project's research being revealed.

In the first of the series, which explained and introduced the concept on St David's Day this year, Bryn Terfel was told he had DNA common in Germany, Scandinavia, southern Scotland and Ulster.

Deri Tomos, professor of physiological biochemistry, said: "at heart, the great thing about the programme in March was that they used popular images like Bryn Terfel and his connection to Germany, and Dafydd Iwan and his connection to Welsh natives of the 5th century.

"And that was from the standpoint of providing entertainment to people, but the programme was also educational and there were correct and complex lessons about DNA and about the fact that it's possible to see where our ancestors lived.

"And it's incontrovertible that our ancestors lived in Africa, and Dafydd Iwan definitely has ancestors who lived in Wales in the 5th century."

Professor Deri Tomos of Bangor University doesn't believe the St David's Day programme misled viewers and he says that it is possible to identify pieces of DNA that are unique to Wales.

"There are definitely patterns to be seen. If you look at the collection of Welsh genes,

18°C Mostly sunny 17:02 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Ama x How to Use the Int x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi x UCL Molecular and x +

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 4 / 4 100%

they will be different to the collection of genes of the English.

"Within Wales, you can definitely see this. The people of the south are different to the people of the north. There has been less mixing between them [in the south and north] because there are mountains in the way.

"You're more likely to marry someone you can walk to fairly easily, than someone you have to climb a mountain to get to. That stands to reason.

"And in Wales our geography means that maybe there's been less movement than in the Middle East, for example.

"So there will be more conservatism. But you don't need many immigrants over the centuries to change the pattern significantly."

[BOX]

THE DNA OF THE GREAT AND THE GOOD

Many prominent people in Wales have taken part in the project.

According to CymruDNA, it's possible to trace the DNA of Ian Jones, chief executive of S4C and originally from Swansea, to ancestors in Denmark, Norway and Sweden – "perhaps even to Svein himself, the invading Scandinavian warlord from whom Swansea first got its name" according to the *Western Mail*.

18°C Mostly sunny 17:02 05/08/2022

Mail - O'Brien, Arma... x How to Use the Int... x Wayback Machine x Wayback Machine x My Edits | UCL Divi... x UCL Molecular and... x

web.archive.org/web/20160410063956/https://www.ucl.ac.uk/mace-lab/genetic-ancestry/guff_documents/S4Ccomplaint

INTERNET ARCHIVE Wayback Machine 1 capture 10 Apr 2016

S4Ccomplaint 4 / 4 100%

of S4C and originally from Swansea, to ancestors in Denmark, Norway and Sweden –“perhaps even to Svein himself, the invading Scandinavian warlord from whom Swansea first got its name”, according to the *Western Mail*.

Discussing the project in February, Ian Jones said the CymruDNAWales project “breaks new ground and shines new light on the history of Wales and the countries of Britain. The project is an essential part of our multiplatform strategy and by collaborating with a number of other dynamic institutions, we are helping to create an inheritance that will endure as our nation and culture flourishes”.

According to the tests, the Wales star and Scarlets captain, Ken Owens, is “Welsh to the core” with DNA showing his ancestors came to Europe from western Asia at the end of the New Stone Age around 2,000 BC.

The ancestors of rugby icon Gareth Edwards hail from Germany, Scandinavia and Russia.

Siân Lloyd was connected with Tsar Nicholas II of Russia and the English royal family.

The presenter of *Heno*, Angharad Mair, is a descendant of women “whose children were said to have had immense influence on the cultural and intellectual life of Western Europe and the world,” according to the *Western Mail*.

Max Boyce, Rhod Gilbert and Michael Sheen have all agreed to be tested too.

18°C Mostly sunny 17:02 05/08/2022