

From: bbc_complaints_website@bbc.co.uk
To: debbiekennett@aol.com
Sent: Wed 17/04/2013 9:11
Subject: BBC Complaints - Case number CAS-2008159-XZ5VLN

Dear Mrs Kennett

Reference CAS-2008159-XZ5VLN

Thank you for your further email regarding The One Show on 7 March, which I have discussed with the production team.

First, I should correct an error in the first response. The commentary in Michael Moseley's film does state that Jim Wilson works for a genetics history company so it was incorrect to suggest otherwise.

However, we cannot agree with your suggestion that there was any breach of the Editorial Guidelines concerning Product Prominence. As the first response pointed out, BritainsDNA is not named in commentary. There are four extremely brief shots of pages containing the results of Michael Moseley's DNA test. The name "BritainsDNA" and the company logo do feature on some of these pages but they are certainly not the central focus of the shots and would very likely go unnoticed by the vast majority of viewers.

In terms of accuracy, the film was broadcast on the day the Sense about Science report was published. The studio introduction referred to the report and its criticisms of companies which claim that DNA can be used to trace people's ancestry in detail and, in some cases, link them to famous historical figures.

The film made clear that the commercially available tests could make very limited claims for individuals: that they could only "suggest" where some of an individual's ancestors "might" have come from, and that they are limited by the reliance solely on the Y chromosome from the father line and Mitochondrial DNA from the mother line. The film explicitly stated that despite recent publicity, these tests cannot identify individual ancestors with any certainty. These are all points made in the Sense about Science report. The price tag of £170 was given to highlight the fact that these tests are not cheap either.

The film went on to explain that the information revealed by such tests could however help build up a picture of broader patterns within a wider population – an area where Jim Wilson has academic expertise. In this section it was made clear that labels such as "Germanic" were not scientific terms, but were being used as "nicknames" for specific markers.

We hope this sets out clearly our position; however, if you wish to take your complaint further you can contact Stage 2 of the complaints process, the BBC's Editorial Complaints Unit, within 20 working days and they will carry out an independent investigation. You can email them at: ecu@bbc.co.uk , or alternatively write to them at the following address:

Editorial Complaints Unit

BBC Broadcast Centre

201 Wood Lane

London

W12 7TP

Should you choose to escalate your complaint we would ask that you include the reference number provided above in your correspondence.

Kind Regards

Stuart Webb

BBC Complaints

www.bbc.co.uk/complaints

NB This is sent from an outgoing account only which is not monitored. You cannot reply to this email address but if necessary please contact us via our webform quoting any case number we provided.