

THE MILL NEWS LETTER

JOHN M. ROBSON, editor

Published by University of Toronto Press
in association with Victoria College



Please address communications to the Editor, Victoria College, University of Toronto, Toronto, 5, Canada

Volume I, Number 1

Fall, 1965

With the constant proliferation of journals, the point of diminishing returns has probably been passed long ago, and to add to the mass of material yet another publication may seem indefensible, especially when its principal interest is in one man. But in the case of John Stuart Mill the proliferation of journals is itself a justification for this news letter. No other writer spanned so many fields, and those studying one aspect of his thought have been largely cut off not only from distant but often from cognate studies. While no one can guarantee that an economist will gasp in delight at a philosopher's insights, we all can hope to find the pleasure that lies beneath true utility, and true utility will be our aim.

Quite simply, then, the chief purpose of this news letter is to provide a clearing-house for information about nineteenth-century studies, centring on Mill, but including related work on any subject that interested him, such as economics, philosophy, history, and literature. We intend to publish twice a year, and for the present there will be no charge. Perhaps later a paid subscription will be necessary.

Editors of news letters have a distressing habit of coupling agonizing reappraisals with requests for help. Wishing to begin in the proper tradition, but hoping that generous and industrious readers will save me from it, I should like to solicit your continuing aid through contributions of news, articles, notes, offprints, review copies, and queries, and also through comments on the range and subject matter. The plan is illustrated in this number: a short article, news of recent and forthcoming books and articles, work in progress, book reviews and notices, notes and queries, and a continuing bibliography of works on Mill. My question--and I stay for an answer--is: Does this plan meet your needs, or are there other kinds of information you would like to have, and would like to pass on to others?

* * * * *

Karl Britton and John M. Robson

In 1922, at the first of the two Sotheby sales of Mary Taylor's effects, Harold J. Laski bought a collection of Mill's debating speeches which, he told Justice Holmes, contained thirty MSS. (Holmes-Laski Letters, I, 420.) Soon after he sold two of them (which, we do not know) to recover his expense (£2!). He hoped to publish them through the Fabian Society, announcing his intention in his edition of the Autobiography (which contains six of them). But the project was never completed because, according to Professor James McCrimmon, "so many lacunae were discovered in the manuscripts" that it was thought publication would be unwise. Subsequently Laski edited and published a considerable number of the speeches in a surprising variety of journals (see the list below), and began to distribute the MSS among his friends. In 1935 Professor Ney MacMinn of Northwestern University purchased from the Fabian Society a set of typescript carbon copies made from the Laski MSS, and James McCrimmon included a selection from these in his Ph.D. dissertation (Northwestern, 1937), noting that there were then eighteen speeches, plus "some fragments of rebuttals." The Fabian Society still has another set of carbon copies, but the original copies are not known. John B. Ellery used McCrimmon's work in the preparation of his thesis on Mill's speeches (Wisconsin, 1954), and in his recent biography of Mill, but added nothing new.

The following list, incorporating information subsequent to McCrimmon's thesis, is intended not as a definitive account, but as a guide to the materials. The principal sources for dates, speakers, and titles are the Laws and Transactions of the London Debating Society (up to the debate of 16 June, 1826), Henry Cole's Diary (from 19 Feb., 1827, with gaps, to 18 Feb., 1831), and the Fourth Supplement to the Laws and Transactions of the London Debating Society (13 Nov., 1829 to 2 July, 1830). The three intervening supplements have not been located. The debating speeches will be included in Vol. I of the Collected Works, with the Autobiography and related materials.

The list is divided according to the place where the speech was delivered. For ease of reference, those speeches which are represented by an extant MS and/or typescript are indicated by an asterisk after the number.

A. Mutual Improvement Society.

- 1* 1823 (Laski). "On the Utility of Knowledge." Fabian Society transcript (subsequently identified as FS). Printed: Autobiography, ed. Laski (London, 1924), 267-74 (subsequently identified as A).
- 2* 1823 or 1824 (JSM's dating). "On Parliamentary Reform." MS: London School of Economics (subsequently identified as LSE). FS. Printed: Realist, 1 (1929), 51-62.

- B. Co-operative Society. These speeches all derive from the two series of debates on Population and Co-operation which Mill says stretched over about three months in 1825 (Autobiography [Columbia, 1924], 86-8).
- 3* "Proaemium of a Speech on Population." FS.
 - 4* "Population." MacMinn typescript, carbon on British quarto rather than on the foolscap of the other FS and MacMinn typescripts. Printed: Journal of Adult Education, 4 (1929), 38-48.
 - 5* "Population. Reply." FS. Printed: Journal of Adult Education, 4 (1929), 48-58. See next entry.
 - 6* "Second Speech on Population in answer to Thirlwall." MS: LSE. FS. Printed: Journal of Adult Education, 4 (1929), 58-61, in part. MacMinn and McCrimmon, following Laski, connect this with the previous speech, but the first part of the MS differs from that text except for a few words; probably JSM collated the two versions.
 - 7* "First Speech on the Co-operative System" (fragment). MS: LSE.
 - 8* "Intended Speech at the Co-operation Society, never delivered." MS: Connecticut College for Women.
 - 9* "Closing Speech on the Co-operative System." MS: LSE (in part); Connecticut College for Women (remainder). Printed: Archiv für Sozialwissenschaft und Sozialpolitik, 62 (1929), 225-39, 466-7 (subsequently identified as Archiv). The printed version is erroneously entitled "Further Reply to the Debate on Population."

C. London Debating Society. (The name was changed from the original London Union Debating Society on 3 Feb., 1826.)

- 10* 9 Dec., 1825 (the second debate; JSM did not speak in the first, 25 Nov., 1825). "On the Influence of the Aristocracy." MS: LSE. FS. Printed: Archiv, 62 (1929), 239-50.
- 11* 20 Jan., 1826. "On Primogeniture, intended to have been spoken, and in part actually spoken." FS.
- 12 17 Feb., 1826. Topic: "That it is expedient that the New Catholic Association be suppressed." JSM opened in the negative.
- 13 28 Feb., 1826. Topic: "That the Character of Catiline has been calumniated by the Roman Historians." JSM spoke in the negative against Roebuck.
- 14 16 Mar., 1826. Topic: "That the resolution lately moved by the Chancellor of the Exchequer for the Suppression of One and Two Pound Notes was inexpedient." Proposed and opened by JSM.
- 15* 7 Apr., 1826. "On the Universities." FS.
- 16* 7 Apr., 1826 (?). "On the Universities, the latter part of which was spoken." FS.
- 17* 19 May, 1826 (debate adjourned from previous meeting). "On the British Constitution." FS (2 typescripts). Printed: 1st part, A, 275-87; conclusion, Archiv, 62 (1929), 460-6. See next entry.
- 18* 19 May, 1826. "Never Spoken on the British Constitution." MSS: University of Hull (in part); University of Toronto (conclusion). FS (of Hull MS). On internal evidence this was prepared for the same debate as no. 17, and the union of the two MSS of this speech

- establishes the union of the two typescripts of no. 17.
- 19 16 June, 1826. Topic: "That the Residence of the Irish Landlords upon their Estates would not alleviate any one of the Evils of Ireland." JSM spoke in the affirmative.
- 20 19 Jan., 1827. Topic: "Whether the writings of Lord Byron had an immoral tendency" (Cole). The speech of Roebuck, the opener, is in the possession of Professor Francis Hyde. Laski mentions in his letter to Holmes the MS of a speech by Mill, presumably on this occasion, which he describes as "an able, if Puritan attack on Byron." This MS may have been destroyed during World War II.
- 21* 30 Feb., 1827 (Cole). "On the Influence of Lawyers." FS (with gaps). Printed: Economica, 5 (1925), 1-6. See next entry.
- 22* 30 Feb., 1827 (?). "Fragments and notes of a speech or speeches on the legal system." MS: LSE. Probably relates to the final part of no. 21. (Other possible but not likely dates are 24 Apr. and 19 June, 1829.)
- 23* 29 June, 1827 (Cole). "On the Coalition Ministry." MS: LSE. FS. Printed: Archiv, 62 (1929), 449-60.
- 24* 16 Nov., 1827 (Cole). "On the Present State of Literature." MS: University College, London. Printed: Adelphi, 1 (1924), 681-93.
- 25* 15 Feb., 1828 (Cole). "On the Church." MS: LSE. FS. Printed: A, 310-25. (This was an adjourned debate; Sterling spoke for the first time on the first evening, 1 Feb., according to Cole.)
- 26* 2 May, 1828 (Cole). "On Perfectibility." FS. Printed: A, 288-99.
- 27 30 May, 1828. Topic: "That the laws relating to cruelty to animals have arisen in a misconception of the objects and without the scope of Legislation" (Cole). Gustave d'Eichthal first attended the LDS on this date, and heard JSM speak. (In describing the next debate, 13 June, 1828, on the East India Company, d'Eichthal does not mention JSM.)
- 28 14 Nov., 1828 (Cole). Topic: "That the Constituent Assembly deserve the eulogy of Posterity." Proposed by Roebuck; "a most elaborate speech of John Mill's somewhat lengthy 1 hour & half" (Cole).
- 29* 30 Jan., 1829 (Cole). "On Wordsworth." MS: LSE. See Karl Britton, "John Stuart Mill: A Debating Speech on Wordsworth, 1829," Cambridge Review, 79 (1958), 418ff. Cole comments: "Mill delivered a most excellent essay which from its length (2 hours) caused some squabbling at the end of the debate."
- 30* 3 Apr., 1829 (Cole). "Notes of my speech against Sterling." MSS: LSE; University of Toronto (fragment). FS (fragments). Printed: A, 300-9 (in part). Topic: "That Montesquieu as a political & philosophical writer is not worthy of the character he usually bears" (Cole). The MS portion omitted in A is completed by the Toronto fragment; an earlier version of the omitted portion is also at the LSE. JSM undoubtedly spoke on the adjourned debate, Sterling having spoken two weeks earlier. This debate led to Sterling's withdrawal from the LDS, and also to the intimate friendship between JSM and Sterling. (See Earlier Letters, ed. Francis E. Mineka, in Collected Works, XII, 29.)
- 31 27 Nov., 1829. Topic: "That Persons refusing to contribute to the Defence of a State, ought not to be considered criminal." JSM

spoke in the affirmative.

32 18 Feb., 1831 (Cole). "Mill made a good explanatory speech on the progress of the French Revolution" (Cole). This must represent a special return by Mill to the LDS; in his Autobiography (Columbia ed., 110) he says he withdrew after 1829, and Cole comments in his Diary, 19 Feb., 1830: "Attended the Debating Society--which I fear to be in a bad way--doubtless owing to the secession of Mill & his friends" (not, it may be noted, including Roebuck). It might also be relevant to Mill's return that on 4 Feb., 1831, a disruptive motion that the LDS transform itself into a "Society of Young Men for the Purpose of Aiding Reform" was introduced and lost.

D. Occasion not known.

33* "On the Use of History." FS. Printed: Bermondsey Book, 6 (1929), 11-17. Laski says it was delivered before the Utilitarian Society in 1823, but cites no proof. A note on the typescript more plausibly suggests the LDS in 1827.

34* "On Reform." MacMinn typescript, as in no. 4. May be dated from the as yet unidentified reference to the "case of John Franks in the Morning Chronicle of last Tuesday" (prior to Canning's death in Aug., 1827). Not LDS, as JSM says he is not a member of this debating society, which a "multiplicity of occupations...prevent and... will long prevent" him from joining.

35* Two fragments. FS. One almost certainly derives from the debate of 19 May, 1826 (nos. 17 & 18); the other may derive from that of 15 Feb., 1828 (no. 25), or that of 17 Feb., 1826 (no. 13).

36* "Speech on Secular Education. Not delivered." FS. Printed: A, 326-30. Clearly not a debating speech, and mentioned here only because it was in the collection bought by Laski. Probably prepared for the Association for Unsectarian Education, supported by Cobden, in the 1840s. (This speech will appear in the Collected Works with JSM's later speeches.)

Queries:

1. Of the missing materials, the most important are the MSS of those speeches which, once in Laski's possession, are now known only through the typescripts and published texts. The originals of the typescripts would also be useful, as they may have corrections and additional information. The three missing Supplements to the Laws and Transactions of the London Debating Society would be of considerable interest, especially as Mill was Secretary during the period covered by the 1st Supplement, and Treasurer during the periods covered by the 2nd and 3rd.

2. We would appreciate information about extant speeches or accounts by other members of these societies. (Henry Taylor's Correspondence gives some information, and one of his speeches is in the British Museum collection; there is a useful letter in Reid's Life of Lord

Houghton, treated in Britton's article mentioned under 32 above; Professor Hyde has four speeches of Roebuck in addition to the one mentioned under 22 above.)

3. What little we know about the Mutual Improvement Society is referred to in Robson, "John Stuart Mill and Jeremy Bentham, with some Observations on James Mill," in Essays in English Literature from the Renaissance to the Nineteenth Century, ed. McLure and Watt (Toronto, 1964), 254n. More information would be welcome.

4. Also useful would be information about the Co-operative Society during 1825. The Cooperative Magazine and Monthly Herald, which lists the subjects of "Public Discussion" in the Society's rooms at 36, Red Lion Square, did not begin publication until Jan., 1826.

For help in gathering material and facts, we should like to thank Ney MacMinn, Francis Mineka, Francis Hyde, Joseph Hamburger, C. G. Allen, Eileen Curran, John Butt, Lord Robbins, Peter Jackson, and John Hagan.

* * * * *

Recent Publications (1964 and 1965).

- Alexander, Edward. Matthew Arnold and John Stuart Mill. New York: Columbia University Press, 1965. (Reviewed below.)
- "Mill's Theory of Culture: The Wedding of Literature and Democracy," University of Toronto Quarterly, 35 (Oct., 1965), 75-88.
- Amano, Keitaro. John Stuart Mill, Bibliography of the Classical Economists. Vol. III, Part 4. Tokyo: Science Council of Japan, 1964.
- Annan, Noel. "John Stuart Mill," in Hugh Sykes Davies and George Watson, eds., The English Mind. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1964.
- Cockshut, A. O. J. "John Stuart Mill: The Half Circle," in his The Unbelievers: English Agnostic Thought, 1840-1890. London: Collins, 1964.
- Cranston, Maurice. "John Stuart Mill," in Bonamy Dobrée, ed., British Writers and Their Work. Vol. II. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1964.
- Cumming, Robert D. "Mill's History of His Ideas," Journal of the History of Ideas, 25 (Apr.-June, 1964), 235-56.
- Day, Patrick. "J. S. Mill," in D. J. O'Connor, ed., A Critical History of Western Philosophy. London: Macmillan, 1964.
- Ellery, John B. John Stuart Mill. New York: Twayne, 1964.
- Hall, Roland. "The Diction of John Stuart Mill," Notes & Queries, n.s. 11 (1964), 29-34, 102-7, 183-8, 218-23, 307-12, 379-85, 423-9.
- Hamburger, Joseph. Intellectuals in Politics: John Stuart Mill and the Philosophic Radicals. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1965. (To be reviewed in the next issue.)
- Hollander, Samuel. "Technology and Aggregate Demand in J. S. Mill's Economic System," Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science, 30 (May, 1964), 175-84.

- Hyde, William J. "Theoretic and Practical Unconventionality in Jude the Obscure," Nineteenth-Century Fiction, 20 (Sept., 1965), 155-64. Hardy's use of Mill, especially On Liberty, in Jude.
- Juleus, Nels. Abstract of "The Rhetorical Theory and Practice of John Stuart Mill" (Dissertation, Western Reserve, 1963), Speech Monographs (Aug., 1964).
- Mill, Anna J. "The First Ornamental Rector at St. Andrews University: John Stuart Mill," Scottish Historical Review, 43 (Oct., 1964), 131-44.
- Morris, John Nelson. "Versions of the Self: Studies in English Autobiography from John Bunyan to John Stuart Mill." Dissertation, Columbia University, 1964.
- Pappé, H. O. "Mill and Tocqueville," Journal of the History of Ideas, 25 (Apr.-June, 1964), 217-34.
- Randall, John Herman. "John Stuart Mill and the Working-Out of Empiricism," Journal of the History of Ideas, 26 (Jan.-Mar., 1965), 59-88.
- Robson, John M. "John Stuart Mill and Jeremy Bentham, with some Observations on James Mill," in M. MacLure and F. W. Watt, eds., Essays in English Literature from the Renaissance to the Victorian Age. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1964.
- . "Mill's Autobiography: The Public and the Private Voice," College Composition and Communication, 16 (May, 1965), 97-101.
- . "A Note on Mill Bibliography," University of Toronto Quarterly, 34 (Oct., 1964), 93-7.
- , ed. John Stuart Mill's Principles of Political Economy, with an introduction by Vincent Bladen. Vols. II and III of the Collected Works. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1965.
- Ryan, Alan. "Mr. McCloskey on Mill's Liberalism," Philosophical Quarterly, 14 (July, 1964), 253-60.
- Schwartz, Pedro. "Aspects of the Theory of Economic and Social Policy in the Works of John Stuart Mill." Dissertation, London, 1964.
- . "Distribucion e Instituciones en J. S. Mill," Anales de Economía (Madrid), n.s. 8 (Oct.-Dec., 1964), 709-40.
- . "John Stuart Mill y el 'laissez-faire,'" Moneda y Crédito (Madrid), 91 (Dec., 1964), 59-130.
- Sharpless, F. Parvin. "William Johnson Fox and Mill's Essays on Poetry," Victorian Newsletter, 27 (Spring, 1965), 18-21.
- West, E. G. "Liberty and Education: John Stuart Mill's Dilemma," Philosophy, 40 (Apr., 1965), 129-42.

Anthologies.

- Schneewind, J. B., ed. Mill's Essays on Literature & Society. New York: Collier, 1965.
- . Mill's Ethical Writings. New York: Collier, 1965.

Translations.

- Mill, J. S. La Libertad, el Gobierno Representativo, y la Esclavitud Femenina. Intro. Pablo Lucas Verdú. Trans. Marta C. C. de Iturbe. Madrid: Tecnos, 1965.

----- . L'Utilitarisme. Intro. and trans. Georges Tanesse.
Toulouse: Privat, 1964.

Forthcoming Works.

- Houghton, Walter E. The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals, 1824-1900. Vol. I. University of Toronto Press, 1966.
- Randall, John Herman. From Leibniz to Marx, Comte, and Mill. Vol. II of Career of Philosophy in Modern Times.
- Robson, John M. "Harriet Taylor and John Stuart Mill: Artist and Scientist," Queen's Quarterly.
- Ryan, Alan. Article on the naturalistic fallacy and Mill's proof of utility, Mind.
- Schneewind, J. B. Article on Mill's philosophy in the Encyclopedia of Philosophy, ed. Paul Edwards.
- Schwartz, Pedro. "J. S. Mill and Laissez Faire: the Case of London Water," Economica.
- . Política social y economía en J. S. Mill. Madrid, 1966? (Trans. of Ph.D. Dissertation listed above.)
- Vincent, John R. Chapter on Mill and Liberal politics in his The Formation of the Liberal Party, 1859-1868. London: Constable, 1965.
- Winch, Donald, ed. The Selected Economic Writings of James Mill. Oliver and Boyd, for the Scottish Economic Society.
- . Classical Political Economy and Colonies. London: Bell.

Anthologies.

- Alexander, Edward, ed. Mill's Writings on Literature and Society. Bobbs-Merrill.
- Cowling, Maurice, ed. Selected Writings of J. S. Mill. Mentor Books.
- Robson, John M. J. S. Mill: Selected Writings. Macmillan of Canada.

Work in Progress.

- Alexander, Edward. Biography of John Morley for Twayne English Authors Series.
- Day, Patrick. Edition of James Fitzjames Stephen's Liberty, Equality, Fraternity (Pall Mall Press).
- Hill, Roland. Articles on Mill's reading of Hume and on Utilitarianism.
- Hollander, Samuel. A study of some economic themes relating to technology in the early classical literature.
- Raphael, D. D. A new selection of British moralists of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.
- Rees, John C. Enlarged and revised version of Mill and his Early Critics, incorporating material from his articles on Mill; article on Mill's political thought for the new Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences.
- Robson, John M. A study of Mill's thought.
- Ryan, Alan. A book on Mill's philosophy.
- Steintrager, James. An analysis of the views of political education

for the masses in Bentham, James Mill, and J. S. Mill.

* * * * *

Bibliography of Writings on Mill

This annotated checklist of writings, assiduously prepared by Dudley L. Hascall (English, Oregon), with the editor, will continue through successive issues. The length of this issue, and other difficulties make it necessary to limit this first list to the Anon's and A's; we hope to get through about three letters in each succeeding issue.

The list of Anon's is clearly defective in many ways, but we wish to let you see it, hoping for help; please let us have corrections and omissions. We plan to publish a complete bibliography, with cross-references, more complete annotation, and an index, on the completion of this serial publication. Many of the items in this first list have not been checked; our performance will improve, we promise. Reviews of books on Mill and of editions after his death are not included, except when they contain independently important information. The list is confined to English, Germanic, Romance, and Scandinavian titles.

Anonymous Books:

- An Alphabetical List of the Philosophers and Discoverers of John Stuart Mill's System of Logic. Oxford: Shrimpton, 1871.
- An Answer to Mr. J. Stuart Mill's "Subjection of Women." The Advance of Transcendentalism. Female Suffrage: An Answer to Mrs. H. Fawcett on the Electoral Disabilities of Women. The Grosvenor Papers, Nos. 1-3. London: Darton, 1869, 1870.
- The Battle of the Two Philosophies. By an Inquirer. London: Longmans, Green, 1866. On Mill and Hamilton.
- A Century of Books. How More than 100 Famous Books of the Past Century were judged by contemporary critics...in Reviews Gleaned from the pages of the "New York Times." New York, 1951.
- Gneist und Stuart Mill. Alt-Englische und Neu-Englische Staatsanschauungen. Eine Politische Parallele. Berlin: Adolf, 1869.
- The Gospel for the Nineteenth Century. 4th ed. London: Longmans, Green, 1880. (First ed., 1876, published as Leaving Us an Example: Is it Living--and Why? An Enquiry suggested by certain passages in John Stuart Mill's 'Essays on Religion.' Second and subsequent editions as above.)
- Hamilton versus Mill. A thorough discussion of each chapter in Mr. John S. Mill's Examination of Hamilton's Logic and Philosophy Beginning with the Logic. Part I. Edinburgh: Maclachlan and Stewart, 1866. Part II. London, 1867.
- Is Theism Immoral? An Examination of Mr. J. S. Mill's Arguments against Mansel's View of Religion. Swansea: Rowse, 1877.
- Jamaica; Who is to Blame? London: Wilson, [1866]. Reprinted from The Eclectic Review.
- The Jesus Christ of John Stuart Mill. By Antichrist. London: Truelove, 1875.

- J. S. Mill's Psychological Theory. By a Philosophical Conservative. [London?], 1867.
- Leaving Us an Example.... See The Gospel of the Nineteenth Century....
- Mr. John Stuart Mill and the Ballot: A Criticism of his opinions as expressed in 'Thoughts on Parliamentary Reform.' By a Westminster Elector. London: Ridgway, 1869.
- Mr. Mill's Subjection of Women, from a Woman's Point of View. London, 1870.
- Odd Bricks from a tumbledown private building. By a Retired Constructor. London: Newby, 1866. On Mill's An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy.
- Observations on the Royal Commission. By Jamaica. London: Hardwicke, 1866.
- Opinions on the Admission of Dissenters and on University Reform (Lord Palmerston, Lord John Russell, Sir William Hamilton, J. S. Mill, and others). [London?], 1847.
- Remarks, with reference to the Land-laws of England, on some passages in Mr. John Stuart Mill's 'Principles of Political Economy,' and M. Louis Blanc's 'Letters on England.' London, 1867.
- A Review of Mr. J. S. Mill's essay 'On Liberty,' and an investigation of his claim to be considered one of the leading philosophers and thinkers of the age; also a refutation of his two statements:--I. That Christian morality teaches us to be selfish. II. That the working classes of this country are mostly habitual liars. By a liberal. London: Watson and Gardiner, 1867.
- True and false democracy. Representation of all, and representation of the majority only. A brief synopsis of recent publications on this subject, by John Stuart Mill and Thomas Hare. Boston: Prentiss, 1862. Reprinted from North American Review, 1862.
- Utilitarianism Explained and Exemplified in Moral and Political Government. Being a reply to J. S. Mill's 'Utilitarianism.' London: Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts, & Green, 1864.
- Who is the "Reformer" John Stuart Mill or John Bright? London: Bosworth and Harrison, 1859.

Anonymous Articles:

- Appletons Journal. "John Stuart Mill," 3 (1870), 126-9.
- Athenaeum. "Mr. John Stuart Mill," 17 May, 1873, 632, 662.
- Bentley's Quarterly Review. "Mill on Liberty," 2 (1859), 434-73.
- Bibliotheca Sacra (Andover). "Mill versus Hamilton," 25 (July, 1868), 501-35.
- Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. "Musings without Method," 187 (1910), 881-92.
- Bodleian Library Record. "Letters of G. Bancroft, J. A. Froude, S. R. Gardiner, A. W. Kinglake, J. S. Mill, John Morley, J. E. T. Rogers and others to Richard and George Bentley, 1835-89," 2 (1948), 229. Note of a recent acquisition of MSS.
- British Critic. "Mill's Logic," 4th ser., 34 (1843), 349-427.
- British Quarterly Review. "Mill's Autobiography," 59 (1874), 195-215.
- Bulletin of the John Rylands Library. "Notes and News," 42 (1960), 259-72. Concerns the acquisition of the press-copy of the Autobiography.

- Christian Observer. "Autobiography of John Stuart Mill," 74 (1874), 37-50.
- Church Herald. "John Stuart Mill," 4 (14 May, 1873).
- La Critique philosophique. "Autobiography by John Stuart Mill," 13 Nov., 1873, 227-33.
- . "Ce qu'il y a de possible en fait d'attributs de la Divinité, selon Stuart Mill," 15 Apr., 1875, 172-6.
- . "La Crise du développement mental de Stuart Mill d'après son Autobiographie," 22 Jan., 1874, 385-94.
- . "L'Education de Stuart Mill, d'après son Autobiography," 25 Dec., 1873, 321-31.
- . "Mill et M. J. Morley.--Note sur l'introduction des possibilités dans les analyses de Stuart Mill," 17 June, 1875, 317-9.
- . "La Mort de J. Stuart Mill," 15 May, 1873, 235-6.
- . "La Personnalité divine et la création dans la pensée de Stuart Mill," 1 Apr., 1875, 132-6.
- . "Polémique de M. Mahaffy contre Stuart Mill au sujet des jugements mathématiques," 28 Aug., 1873, 58-64.
- . "La Question de l'immortalité dans la philosophie de Stuart Mill," 15 Apr., 1875, 187-92.
- . "La Révélation et les espérances chrétiennes dans la philosophie de Stuart Mill," 3 June, 1875, 279-88.
- Current Literature (New York). "The Political Faith of John Stuart Mill," 49 (1910), 60-2.
- . "The Saint of Rationalism," 41 (1906), 74-6.
- The Daily Free Press. "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 20 Oct., 1874.
- Daily News (London). "Mr. Mill's Autobiography," 18 Oct., 1873, 2.
- . "A Visit to the Late Mr. Mill's Grave," 29 July, 1874, 5.
- The Daily Telegraph (London). "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 20 and 22 Oct., 1874.
- Démocratie du Midi (Avignon). Packe refers to 8 May-4 June, 1873.
- Dublin Morning Mail. "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 21 Oct., 1874.
- Dublin Review. "Calderwood and Mill Upon Hamilton," n.s. 7 (1865), 474-504.
- . "Christian Charity and Political Economy.--Part II," n.s. 30 (1878), 89-110. Purportedly a review of Mill's Principles among other books.
- . "Inaugural Address...By John Stuart Mill," n.s. 8 (1867), 505-9. "Address on its (ir)religious [sic] side is remarkable for nothing so much as its singular godlessness.... At the same time it is bare justice to say, that no writer more carefully abstains from indulgence in any kind of contemptuous or bitter expression towards those who differ from him ever so fundamentally" (505).
- . "Mill on Liberty," n.s. 13 (1869), 62-75. "In this paper we are only engaged in showing Mr. Mill's inconsistencies" (74).
- . "Modern Ideals and the Liberty of the Press," n.s. 29 (1877), 191-222. Review of On Liberty and Milton's Areopagitica, among others.
- . "The Rule and Motive of Certitude," n.s. 17 (1871), 40-66.

- Review of An Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy.
 ----- . "Tendencies of Modern Logic," 36 (1854), 436-45. This review article of A System of Logic quarrels with Mill's philosophy because his system does not require a "First, Great, Efficient Cause, or God..." (438).
- . "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), n.s. 24 (1875), 223.
- . "Tillage--Waste Lands--Fixity and Tenure," 25 (1848), 332-4. This section of the article is on Mill and the Irish question.
- Eclectic Magazine. "Autobiography of John Stuart Mill," n.s. 19 (Jan., 1874), 55-9. Reprinted from Saturday Review.
- . "John Stuart Mill, M. P.," n.s. 4 (1866), 120-2. With portrait. Brief laudatory biographical sketch on Mill's entry into Parliament.
- . "Mr. J. S. Mill's Religious Confession," n.s. 21 (Jan., 1875), 108-11. Reprinted from Spectator; reprinted in Littell's Living Age.
- Economist. "The Late Mr. Mill," 17 May, 1873, 588-9.
- Encyclopedia Britannica. "John Stuart Mill," (1955), 15, 490-3.
- Everybody's Magazine (New York). "Politics, Woman's Special Sphere," 33 (1915), 9.
- Every Saturday. "Mr. John Stuart Mill," 3rd ser., 3 (1873), 668-70. Reprinted from Spectator.
- . "Mr. John Stuart Mill's Autobiography," 3rd ser., 4 (1873), 583-5. Reprinted from Spectator.
- Forkskaren (Washington). "John Stuart Mill: Ein Charakteristik," Jg. 15, no. 3 (1907). Reference from Amano.
- . "John Stuart Mill, son politker och sozialist," Jg. 13, no. 3 (1907). Reference from Amano.
- Fraser's Magazine. "The Autobiography of Consciousness; or, The Experiences of an Indoor Servant," 80 (1869), 119-28. An account of the history of consciousness from Descartes to Mill.
- . "The Comtist Utopia," 80 (1869), 1-21. A survey of Comtist doctrine and a discussion of J. S. Mill's points of disagreement with the Comtists.
- . "John Stuart Mill," n.s. 8 (1873), 663-81. Review article of the Autobiography, written shortly after Mill's death; vitriolic. "Both Rousseau and Mill were fanatics in the cause of progress, and both, from mistaken philanthropy, did an infinity of harm" (664). The writer is enraged about Mill's early stand on birth control.
- . "Parliamentary Reform and the Government," 73 (1866), 684-704. Contains an account of the Parliamentary duels between J. S. Mill and Robert Lowe over reform in 1866.
- Gunton's Magazine. "Mill," 15 (1898), 342-4.
- Harper's New Monthly Magazine. "John Stuart Mill," 47 (1873), 528-34.
- Harvard Quarterly Journal of Economics. "The Austrian Economists and Their View of Value, 3 (Oct., 1888), 1-31.
- . "Some Aspects of the Tariff Question," 3 (Apr., 1889), 259-92.
- Illustrated London News. "Mr. John Stuart Mill," 24 Mar., 1866, 280.
- Independent (New York). "Mill, Spencer and Socialism," 61 (1906), 525-6.

----- . "Portrait," 68 (1910), 297.
Journal of Sacred Literature. "Mr. J. S. Mill and the Inductive Origin of First Principles," 4th ser., 9 (1866), 1-35.
The Leisure Hour. "John Stuart Mill," 23 (1874), 73-7.
----- . "John Stuart Mill's Essays," 24 (1875), 117-9.
Littell's Living Age. "Caroline Fox, John Sterling, and John Stuart Mill," 154 (1882), 667-81. Reprinted from Westminster Review.
----- . "Mr. J. S. Mill's Religious Confession," 123 (1874), 508-12. Reprinted from Spectator; reprinted in Eclectic Magazine.
----- . "Social Freedom," 254 (1907), 323-36.
Macmillan's Magazine. "The Ladies in Parliament, A Fragment after the Manner of an Old Athenian Comedy," 15 (1866), 1-14. In rhymed couplets of varying line lengths interspersed with quatrains.
Manchester Guardian. "Mill's Manuscript of 'Autobiography' in John Rylands Library," 19 Aug., 1959, 5.
----- . "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), pre 20 Oct., 1874. Reprinted in Morning Post.
More Books. "Emerson to John Stuart Mill," 15 (1940), 436-7. A letter of introduction, dated May 6, 1865, from Emerson to John Stuart Mill concerning George Walker. Printed in full.
Morning Post (London). "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 20 Oct., 1874. Reprinted from Manchester Guardian.
----- . "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 22 Oct., 1874.
The Nation. "In the Driftway: Youthful Genius," 139 (1934), 709.
----- . "John Stuart Mill," 91 (1910), 217-9.
----- . "Mr. Mill and the Land-Laws," 16 (1873), 71-2.
The Nation and Athenaeum. "John Stuart Mill," 33 (Apr., 1923), 111-2.
Nature. "John Stuart Mill," 8 (May, 1873), 47.
New Englander. "Examination of Mill's Philosophy of Necessary Truth and of Causation," 8 (1850), 161-86.
----- . "John Stuart Mill's Autobiography," 33 (1874), 193-5.
North American Review (New York). "Education, Personally Supervised," 184 (1907), 447-8.
----- . "Mill on Representative Government," 196 (1862), 3-4. Reprinted in True and false democracy.
Outlook (New York). "The Testimony of John Stuart Mill to Mysticism," 95 (1910), 818-20.
Pall Mall Gazette. "The Death of Mr. Mill," 10 May, 1873, 1-2.
----- . "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 22 Oct., 1874, 10, and 29 Oct., 1874, 9-10.
Popular Science Monthly. "Autobiography of John Stuart Mill," 4 (1874), 376-7.
----- . "Mill, Education, and Science," 4 (1874), 368-73.
Preussische Jahrbücher (Berlin). "John Stuart Mills Politische Schriften," Bd. 10 (Aug., 1862), 152-69.
Quotidien du Midi (Avignon). 12 Apr., 1913. Reference from Packe.
Revue britannique (Paris). "John Stuart Mill," 6 (Nov., 1873), 238-40.
----- . "John Stuart Mill et ses doctrines," 2 (Mar., 1874), 65-97.
----- . "M. Mill et le droit politique des femmes," 1 (Jan., 1869), 233-4.
Saturday Review. "Autobiography of John Stuart Mill," 1 Nov., 1873, 570-1. Reprinted in Eclectic Magazine.

- . "Mr. Mill," 17 May, 1873, 638-9.
- . "Mr. Mill on Education," 9 Feb., 1867, 165-6.
- . "The Recreation of Mill--Botany," 101 [?], 615ff.
- Saturday Review of Literature. "Safety without Jitters: Prescription for America," 32 (1949), 24.
- Scribner's Monthly. "The Autobiography of an Atheist," 7 (1874), 600-11.
- Spectator. "Mr. John Stuart Mill," May, 1873. [?]
- . "Mr. John Stuart Mill's Autobiography," 25 Oct., 1873. [?]
- . "Mr. J. S. Mill's Religious Confession," 47 (1874), 1325-7. Reprinted in Littell's Living Age; Eclectic Magazine. Review article of the posthumous Three Essays on Religion.
- . "Mill's Essays on Some Unsettled Questions of Political Economy," 17 (1844), 810-1.
- Stimmen der Zeit (Freiburg i. B.). "J. St. Mill, Ueber die Freiheit," Nov., 1859. [?]
- Theological Eclectic (Cincinnati). "The Philosophy of John Stuart Mill," 4 (1868), 289ff.
- The Times. "Mr. Mill on Land Tenure," 19 Mar., 1873, 6.
- . "England and Ireland" (Review), 20 Feb., 1868, 10.
- . "Housing Drive Takes Toll of History: J. S. Mill's House at Avignon," 31 Aug., 1960, 7.
- . "Three Essays on Religion" (Review), 21 Oct., 1874.
- Times Literary Supplement. "A Great and Good Man," 16 Apr., 1964, 301-3.
- . "Mill's Life and Thought," 7 May, 1954, 291.
- . "Three Political Philosophers," 29 Dec., 1950, 821-2.
- . "Utilitarianism," 11 Nov., 1949, 733. An article occasioned by Plamenatz's Mill's 'Utilitarianism'.
- . "The Wood and the Trees," 10 Mar., 1961, 153. A leading article on recent interpretations of Mill's Liberty.
- Union de Vaucluse (Avignon). May, 1873. Reference from Packe.
- The United States Magazine and Democratic Review. "Mill's Logic. The Theory of Proof--The Science of Evidence," n.s. 15 (1844), 441-53. Very favourable review of A System of Logic.
- The Universal Review. "Mill On Liberty," 1 (1859), 224-44.
- Unsere Zeit (Leipzig). "John Stuart Mill als Philosoph und Nationalökonom," N.F., 1 Jg., 1865, 919-39.
- Victoria Magazine. "J. S. Mill's Autobiography," 22 (1873), 181-9.
- Vorwärts (Berlin). "John Stuart Mill als Politiker und Sozialist," 20 May, 1906.
- The Western (St. Louis). "John Stuart Mill," n.s. 3 (Sept., 1877), 555-61.
- Westminster Review. "Caroline Fox, John Sterling, and John Stuart Mill," n.s. 62 (July, 1882), 156-81. Reprinted in Littell's Living Age. Review article of Memories of Old Friends. "In Caroline Fox's memories of him and in his own letters to Barclay Fox, JSM appears in a far more genial light than in his 'Autobiography'..." (167). References to Mill throughout the article.
- . "Causes of Poverty," 50 (1849), 62-76. Compares Mill's opinions favourably to those of M. Thiers in a discussion of the French revolution of 1848.

- . "Contemporary Literature: Philosophy and Theology," 150 (July, 1898), 107-8.
- . "Essays on Some Unsettled Questions of Political Economy" (Review), 41 (June, 1844), 616ff.
- . "Examination of Sir William Hamilton's Philosophy" (Review), n.s. 28 (1865), 513-6.
- . "Goethe and Mill: A Contrast," n.s. 46 (1874), 38-70. Exactly described by the title.
- . "Irish Clearances, and Improvement of Waste Lands," 50 (1849), 173-4. This small portion of the article quotes Mill on the Irish problem.
- . "John Stuart Mill," n.s. 45 (1874), 122-59. Review of Autobiography.
- . "J. S. Mill on the Philosophy of Sir William Hamilton," n.s. 29 (1866), 1ff.
- . "John Stuart Mill's Three Essays on Religion," n.s. 47 (1875), 1-28.
- . "Mill's Inaugural Address," n.s. 31 (1867), 623ff.
- . "Mr. Mill on Representative Government," n.s. 20 (1861), 91ff.
- . "Mr. Mill on Utilitarianism," n.s. 24 (1863), 45ff.
- . "Mr. Mill's Speech on Capital Punishment," n.s. 35 (1868), 429-36. "The next best thing to having Mr. Mill for a friend is to have him for an opponent. You may not learn from him the full strength of your own case, but you, at least, have all the difficulties to be encountered arrayed in the clearest and most forcible manner, without taint from sophism or exaggeration" (430). Controvers Mill's argument (most respectfully).
- . "Parliament and Reform," n.s. 27 (1865), 503-33. Includes review of Mill's Representative Government.
- . "The Positive Philosophy of Auguste Comte" (Review), n.s. 27 (1865), 339ff.
- . "Principles of Political Economy" (Review), 50 (1848), 289-314.
- . "Principles of Political Economy" (Review), 52 (1849), 408-19.
- . "Rationale of Judicial Evidence," 9 (1828), 198-250. There is one paragraph (p. 216) on John Stuart Mill's editing of Bentham's MSS. Does not mention him by name.
- . "Utilitarianism," n.s. 25 (1864), 243ff.
- . "What is Death," 56 (1851), 168ff. Quotes Mill.

Bibliography: A.

- Abb, E. Kritik des Kantischen Apriorismus vom Standpunkte des reinen Empirismus aus, unter besonderer Berücksichtigung von J. St. Mill und Mach. Dissertation, Zurich, 1906.
- Abel, Henry George. "John Stuart Mill and Socialism," Fortnightly Review, n.s. 144 (1938), 343-8. A partisan piece, presenting fragmentary quotes to support the claim that Mill was not, and could not ever have been, a socialist. Refutes statements made about

- Mill by Shaw in An Intelligent Woman's Guide to Socialism.
 ----- "Mill and Socialism," The Nation and Athenaeum, 44 (2 Feb., 1929), 613-4. A letter to the editor objecting to Shaw's statement that "John Stuart Mill from being an eminent Ricardian became an avowed Socialist."
- Abraham, J. H. "J. S. Mill and 'Utilitarianism,'" Listener, 20 June, 1963, 1031-2.
- Abrams, M. H. The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition. New York: Oxford University Press, 1953. Discusses Mill's theory of poetry and art, pp. 23-5. References passim.
- Acton, H. B. "Comte's Positivism and the Science of Society," Philosophy, 26 (1951), 291-310.
- Acton, John E. E. "Mill on Liberty," The Rambler (London), n.s. 2 (1859, 1860). Reprinted in W. Ebenstein, ed., Political Thought in Perspective. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1957. Pp. 501-23.
- Adams, Lyell. "John Stuart Mill," New Englander, 36 (1877), 92-114, 425-44, 740-84. The last instalment was published after Adams' death. An extensive sketch.
- Adamson, J. W. English Education, 1789-1902. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930. Pp. 302-9 on JSM.
- Adamson, Robert. "Professor Jevons on Mill's Experimental Methods," Mind, 3 (1878), 415-7. Discussion of Jevon's review of Mill's theory of induction in Contemporary Review, 31 (q.v.). Defends Mill's method.
- Adler, Mortimer J. The Idea of Freedom. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1958. Citations to Mill listed in annotated index, p. 684.
- Aiken, Henry David. "Definitions, Factual Premises, and Ethical Conclusions," The Philosophical Review, 61 (1952), 331-48.
 -----, ed. The Age of Ideology: The Nineteenth Century Philosophers. Boston: Houghton-Mifflin, 1957. Selections from and comment on Mill, pp. 138-60. References passim.
- Albee, Ernest. A History of English Utilitarianism. London: Sonnenschein; New York: Macmillan, 1902. Pp. 191-267 on JSM, with many other references.
- Alexander, Bernat. J. St. Mill und der Empirismus. 1927.
- Alexander, Edward. Matthew Arnold and John Stuart Mill. New York: Columbia University Press, 1965. (Dissertation, Columbia, 1962.)
 -----, "Mill's Theory of Culture: The Wedding of Literature and Democracy," University of Toronto Quarterly, 35 (Oct., 1965), 75-88.
- Alexander, Patrick Proctor. Mill and Carlyle: An Examination of Mr. John Stuart Mill's Doctrine of Causation in Relation to Moral Freedom. With an Occasional Discourse on Sauerteig, by Smelfungus. Edinburgh: Nimmo, 1866.
 -----, Moral Causation; or notes on Mr. Mill's Notes to the Chapter on "Freedom," in the third edition of his "Examination of Sir W. Hamilton's Philosophy." Edinburgh: Nimmo, 1868. 2d ed., revised and extended. Edinburgh, London: Blackwood, 1875. Alexander criticized Mill's chapter on "Freedom" in Mill and Carlyle. Mill replied; here Alexander answers his reply.
- Althaus, Friedrich. Englische Charakterbilder. 2 vols. Berlin: Decker, 1869.

- . "John Stuart Mill," Unsere Zeit (Leipzig), N.F., Jg. 10, 1874.
- Amano, Keitaro. "A Bibliography of John Stuart Mill," Keizai Ronshu [The Economic Review of Kansai University], 6 (Nov., 1956), 621-61. See next entry.
- . John Stuart Mill, Bibliography of the Classical Economists. Vol. III, Part 4. Tokyo: Science Council of Japan, 1964. This bibliography, listing Mill's writings as well as works on him, includes works in Japanese omitted from the present bibliography. It lists works alphabetically by author under subject headings.
- Ames, Van Meter. "Kant and Mill Visit an Old Lady," Open Court (Chicago), 42 (1928), 528-36. A heuristic question is here posed to illustrate the differences between Kant's and Mill's ethical theories.
- Anderson, John P. Bibliography of Writings on John Stuart Mill. See Wm. Leonard Courtney, Life of John Stuart Mill, Appendix. (Comprehensive bibliography to 1889.)
- Anderson, William. "John Stuart Mill and the Model City Charter," National Municipal Review, 11 (1922), 321-6. "Mill, writing more than a generation before our Committee on a Municipal Program reported the Model Charter, advanced the same principles which we now advocate." (Headnote, 321.) Compares Considerations on Representative Government with Model Charter.
- Annan, Noel. "John Stuart Mill," in Hugh Sykes Davies and George Watson, eds., The English Mind. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1964.
- . "J. S. Mill and Intellectual Liberty," Listener, 53 (14 Dec., 1950), 727-8. We "are usually thought...to regard" On Liberty "as full of noble sentiment but also of bad philosophy. This is true" (727). Liberty "as a philosophic principle in Mill's sense has vanished" (728).
- . "Landmarks of Political Thought: On Liberty," Listener, 43 (28 Jan., 1960), 171-2. Centennial review.
- Anoyaut, Marcel. L'Etat progressif et l'état stationnaire de la richesse nationale chez A. Smith and St. Mill. Paris: Croville-Morant, 1907. (Dissertation.)
- Anschutz, Richard Paul. "John Stuart Mill," Encyclopaedia Britannica (1962), 15, 490-3.
- . "J. S. Mill, Carlyle, and Mrs. Taylor," Political Science, 7 (1955), 65-75.
- . "J. S. Mill: Philosopher of Victorianism," in Arthur Sewell, ed., 1840 and After. Auckland: University College, 1939.
- . "The Logic of J. S. Mill," Mind, 58 (1949), 277-305.
- . The Philosophy of J. S. Mill. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1953. One of the best general discussions of JSM's thought.
- Anthony, Charles. The Social and Political Dependence of Women. By John Stuart Mill. Boston: Spencer, 1868.
- Apchié, Madeleine. Les Sources françaises de certains aspects de la pensée économique de John Stuart Mill. Paris: Hartmann, 1931.
- Appadorai, Angadipuram. Revision of Democracy. London: Milford, 1940. References to JSM throughout this pamphlet.
- Appleman, Philip, William A. Madden, and Michael Wolff, eds. 1859:

- Entering an Age of Crisis. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1959. Bib. references in notes, pp. 291-314. Many references to Mill; R. B. McCallum, "The Individual in the Mass: Mill on Liberty and the Franchise," pp. 147-61, q.v.
- Archambault, Paul. Stuart Mill. Choix de textes et étude du système philosophique. Paris: Louis-Michaud, 1912.
- Archer, Mildred. "India and Natural History: The Role of the East India Company, 1785-1858," History Today, 9 (1959), 736-43.
- Arias, Gino. "Il pensiero economico di Giovanni Stuart Mill," Annali di Economia (Milan), 2 (1925), 107-65.
- Armstrong, Richard Acland. Latter-day Teachers: Six Lectures. London: Paul, 1881. JSM, Arnold, Parker, Tyndall, Farrar.
- Ashley, Myron Lucius. "The Nature of Hypothesis," in John Dewey, ed. Studies in Logical Theory, pp. 142-83. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1903. JSM's doctrine of the hypothesis is treated on pp. 160-8.
- Ashley, W. J. "The Present Position of Political Economy in England," in Die Entwicklung der deutschen Volkswirtschaftslehre im neunzehnten Jahrhundert, I, xv, pp. 1-26. 2 vols. Leipzig: Dunker und Humblot, 1908. On Mill's economics and inductive method, pp. 5-10.
- , ed. John Stuart Mill. Principles of Political Economy with some of their Applications to Social Philosophy. London, New York: Longmans, Green, 1909. With introduction, notes, bibliographical appendix, by W. J. Ashley. Index by Miss M. A. Ellis. Text is that of the 7th ed. All significant changes, additions, and deletions from the 1st to the 7th ed. are indicated in notes.
- Ashworth, M. "The Marriage of John Stuart Mill," Englishwoman, 30 (1916), 159-72.
- Aster, Ernst von. "James und John Stuart Mill, Bain, Hamilton," and "Die Entwicklung der Ethic und Moralphilosophie (Bentham und Mill)," in his Geschichte der Englishchen Philosophie. Bielefeld and Leipzig: Velhagen and Klasing, 1927. Pp. 139-60; 160-76. And *passim*.
- Atkinson, R. F. "J. S. Mill's 'Proof' of the Principle of Utility," Philosophy, 32 (1957), 158-67.
- Atwater, L. H. "McCosh on J. S. Mill and Fundamental Truth," Biblical Repertory and Princeton Review, 38 (1866), 416-24. Review article, hostile to JSM, friendly to McCosh's Examination of Mr. J. S. Mill's Philosophy.

* * * * *

Review.

Matthew Arnold and John Stuart Mill. By Edward Alexander. New York: Columbia University Press; London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1965. Pp. 313. \$6.50.

On the arresting dust cover of this book, two familiar photographs of Arnold and Mill confront the reader through a broad band of twentieth-century tinting, a roseate fireplace glow of retrospective and

harmonising warmth. Yet Arnold gazes with uplifted eyes past Mill into the distance, an aloof poet-prophet who would rather not be reminded that he made Mill's name a synonym (as he did) for a "somewhat degenerated and inadequate form of Hellenism." And Mill in profile looks directly at Arnold, with a touch of the logician's puzzled irritation at hearing (as he did) that Arnold was "enumerating [him] among the enemies of culture."

Arnold retracted the slur, and by reading and reference paid Mill the compliment all along of being far more interested in Mill than Mill was in Arnold. It was high praise from Arnold that in spite of reservations he could find Mill "a writer deserving all attention and respect," one of those rare and true liberals who are "lovers of free and clear thought."

Giving credit to the many who have already found in the relationship of Arnold and Mill "a key to the intellectual life of the Victorian age," Mr. Alexander modestly announces the purpose of his book, to "show the surprising extent to which the suggestions of Abrams and Leavis are fruitful." This purpose he carries out thoroughly and well. He treats the two Victorians as "representative thinkers" of an "eclectic and synthesizing" turn, rather than as "seminal minds" like the Bentham and Coleridge of Mill's own essay. At the same time he offers enough comment on their independence of mind and their influence to show their importance and their essential modernity. For one thing, they combined, together with their desire for "an ideal which would harmonize and synthesize hitherto opposed forces" (36), a relativistic and flexible view of history, dialectically expressed (Hellenism and Hebraism, Benthamism and Coleridgeanism). For another, they resisted the longing for certitude that caused so many of their contemporaries to cling to authority, to exalt half-truths, or to substitute action for thought. "It would have pleased Arnold and Mill to know that their stubborn refusal to relieve the paralysis of action into which the age had thrown them by the illegitimate anodynes used by their contemporaries had been vindicated, even partially, by posterity" (151). The comment here is interesting enough to make one wish that it were more clearly expressed.

The parallel treatment of contrasting yet supplementary figures has a fascination. It also has dangers--the mechanical listing of sources and comments, the suspiciously neat phrase, the incomplete statement. If Mr. Alexander does not entirely avoid these faults, their presence is minimal, not such as to interfere with that pleasure which, as Dryden said, goes with instruction. We note the one-sided picture of Arnold (13) as always "bemoaning his lot as Inspector of Schools"; the curious interpretation (72) of the sonnet "In Harmony With Nature" (surely "Nature is cruel, man is sick of blood" suggests something other than rising above "bathos"?); the failure to quote Clough's poignant cry in Perché Pensò to support the (quite proper) treatment of him as a prime example of the dilemma which Arnold and Mill understood and resolved; the need to adjust one's view from the equation of Mill and Arnold as both clinging to "the ideal of synthesis, harmony, and stability" (64), to the later distinction between them as in the one case committed to a continuing dialectic, and in the other yearning for the best self to arise and say, "l'état, c'est moi!"

Yet if both equation and distinction seem at times a bit oversimplified, it is on these two lines that Mr. Alexander ably develops his double thesis. By both exposition and analysis he puts the student of Arnold and Mill and of the Victorian period in his debt. On the one hand, he draws the comparison fully, with reference to such matters as the nature and limits of parental influence; the attitudes to France and to Ireland and to ancient Greece; the attacks on insularity; the awareness of the problem of the "two cultures"; the impact of Wordsworth; the common elements in the estimate of poetry ("they sought to provide a moral justification for poetry that did not rely upon rhetoric and didacticism"; "they hoped not only to defend poetry from science, but to substitute it for religion"; for both men "the problem of attaining an equilibrium between thought and feeling was the central problem of the modern poet").

On the other hand, Mr. Alexander draws attention increasingly as the book proceeds to the difference of emphasis in the key concepts of Culture and Liberty, the primacy accorded to the state by Arnold, to the individual by Mill. Their response to phenomena as diverse as the persecution of Christians by Marcus Aurelius, American society, and the Hyde Park riots, is presented and analyzed. The reader is carried on to the best kind of conclusion, that which opens vistas of thought. He should also be impelled, whether he agrees or disagrees, to pick up the book again. "When the time to institute democracy arrived, Arnold still looked upon the state, and Mill upon liberty, as the only instrument which could make democracy conducive to human perfection. Their argument was to continue after their deaths, and it has not yet been settled."

William Robbins,
University of British Columbia

* * * * *

Collected Edition of Mill's Works: Volumes IV and V, Essays on Economics and Society, ed. Robson with an introduction by Aaron Director (Law, Chicago), are in proof, and will appear early in the spring of 1966. The next volume will be Essays on Ethics and Society, due about a year hence; it will be followed by the System of Logic. Francis Mineka and Dwight Lindley, the editors of the Later Letters, report considerable progress, and hope to have their manuscripts in final state towards the end of 1966. Several reviewers having been misled about the eventual size of the edition by the list of titles in preparation on the back of the dust jacket, it might be helpful to point out that there will eventually be at least twenty-two volumes; it is hoped that the pace of publication may be increased to two works a year before long. As a guide, the Spring number of this news letter will list the tables of contents for the next few volumes.

Printed in Canada