

# 1 The Paper

The philosophy of mind is concerned with metaphysical and epistemological issues which arise in reflecting on the mind. You will also find the Philosophy of Psychology section of this Guide useful, and various parts of the Logic and Metaphysics, and Epistemology and Methodology sections.

## 2 Basic Reading

### A. INTRODUCTORY TEXTS

There are many introductions to the philosophy of mind currently available. The following three are reliable and useful:

McGinn, C. 1991. *The Character of Mind: an Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. (Originally published 1982.)

Kim, J. 1996. *The Philosophy of Mind*. Oxford: Westview Press.

Braddon-Mitchell, D., and F. Jackson, eds. 1996. *The Philosophy of Mind and Cognition*. Oxford: Blackwell.

### B. ANTHOLOGIES

Some basic anthologies. These collections contain quite a lot of the required reading.

Rosenthal, D., ed. 1991. *The Nature of Mind*. New York: Oxford University Press. probably the best anthology around.

Beakley, B., and S. Ludlow, eds. 1992. *The Philosophy of Mind: Classical Problems/Contemporary Issues*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. This collection covers a number of central themes on the metaphysics of mind and on mental phenomena, organised historically.

Block, N. ed. 1980-81. *Readings in the Philosophy of Psychology*, 2 vols. London: Methuen. The first volume contains many central papers on the metaphysics of mind. The papers in the second volume are more concerned with issues in the philosophy of psychology, such as mental imagery and the language of thought. Still very useful.

Lycan, W. ed. 1990. *Mind and Cognition: a Reader*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell. This anthology contains some papers on the metaphysics of mind, but most of it is concerned with issues about mental representation, mental processing and folk psychology.

Warner, R., and T. Szubka, eds. 1994. *The Mind-Body Problem: A Guide to the Current Debate*. Oxford: Blackwell. Handy collection of recent papers on the mind-body problem, some new and some reprinted articles which have already become essential reading.

Guttenplan, S., ed. 1994. *A Companion to the Philosophy of Mind*. Oxford: Blackwell Reference. A collection of short survey articles, written especially for this volume, on the central topics in the philosophy of mind.

More specialised collections

Stich, S., and T. Warfield, eds. 1994. *Mental Representation: a Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Lepore, E., and B. McLaughlin, eds. 1985. *Actions and Events: Perspectives on the Philosophy of Donald Davidson*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Tomberlin, J. ed. 1989. *Philosophy of Mind and Action Theory*. Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 3. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview.

———, ed. 1990. *Action Theory and Philosophy of Mind*. Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 4. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview.

Wollheim, R., and J. Hopkins, eds. 1982. *Philosophical Essays on Freud*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Heil, J., and A. Mele, eds. 1993. *Mental Causation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Moser, P., and J.D. Trout, eds. 1995. *Contemporary Materialism: a Reader*. London: Routledge.

Charles, D., and K. Lennon, eds. 1992. *Reduction, Explanation and Realism*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

O'Hear, A., ed. 1998. *Current Issues in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## 3 Topics

The questions on this course can be broadly divided into three kinds.

(a) The metaphysics of mind: questions about dualism, physicalism, functionalism, mental causation and so on.

(b) The epistemology of mind: how do we know about our own minds? How do we know about the minds of others?

(c) Mental phenomena: questions about (for example) consciousness, intentionality, action, self-deception, weakness of will, perception and memory (for which see also the entries under Epistemology & Methodology).

N.B. In the reading lists which follow

Items marked PP are in N. Block, ed. *Readings in the Philosophy of Psychology*, 2 Vols.

Items marked MC are in W. Lycan, ed. *Mind and Cognition*.

Items marked NM are in D. Rosenthal, ed. *The Nature of Mind*.

## A. THE METAPHYSICS OF MIND

### *i. Physicalism/Materialism*

Physicalism says that reality is physical. So if the mind exists, it must be physical. There are broadly two sorts of physicalist view of the mind:

(i) The first claims that mental items are identical with physical items. Such identity theories come in two kinds: 'type' identity theories those which claim that mental properties (types) are physical properties (types) and token identity theories those that claim that mental particulars (events, objects: 'tokens') are identical with physical particulars.

(ii) The second kind of physicalism claims that mental items—events, states, properties, property instances, facts or objects—are realised by, constituted out of, or ontologically dependent or supervenient upon physical items.

#### *On type identity theory*

For statements of the theory see

Smart, J.J.C. 1959. 'Sensations and Brain Processes', *Philosophical Review* 68: 141-156.

Lewis, D. 1966. 'An Argument for the Identity Theory', *Journal of Philosophy* 63:17-25. Reprinted in his *Philosophical Papers*, Vol.I. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983.

Armstrong, D.M. 1977. 'The Causal Theory of Mind'. Reprinted in NM.

Lewis, D. 1994. 'Reduction of Mind', in S. Guttenplan, ed., *A Companion to the Philosophy of Mind*. Reprinted in D. Lewis. *Papers in Metaphysics and Epistemology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.

One question for the type identity theory is whether it can accommodate the apparent fact that mental states are variably or multiply 'realisable' in creatures with different physical natures.

Putnam, H. 1979. 'The Nature of Mental States', in *Mind Language and Reality*. *Philosophical Papers*, Vol.2.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in PP Vol.I and MC.

Lewis, D. 'Review of Putnam', in PP Vol.I.

Jackson, F. 1995. 'Essentialism, Mental Properties and Causation', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 95:253-68.

(See also the relevant sections of Braddon-Mitchell and Jackson, *The Philosophy of Mind and Cognition*.)

Kim, J. 1998. *Mind in a Physical World: an Essay on the Mind-body Problem and Mental Causation*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch. 4.

Kripke has criticised the type identity theory by employing his well-known arguments about the necessity of identity.

Kripke, S.1971. 'Identity and Necessity', in *Identity and Individuation*, ed., M. Munitz. New York: New York University Press. Reprinted in Honderich & Burnyeat, eds., *Philosophy as it is*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1979; and in PP.

— 1980. *Naming and Necessity*. Oxford: Blackwell. See esp. Lecture 3, reprinted in NM.

McGinn, C. 1977. 'Anomalous Monism and Kripke's Cartesian Intuitions', *Analysis* 37: 78-80. Reprinted in PP Vol.I.

#### *On token identity theory*

Davidson, D. 1980. 'Mental Events', in his *Essays on Actions and Events*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Reprinted in PP and NM. For a good commentary on Davidson see:

Evnine, S. 1991. *Donald Davidson*. Cambridge: Polity. Ch.4.

McGinn, C. 1991. *The Character of Mind: an Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. (Originally published 1982.). Ch.2.

Peacocke, C. 1979. *Holistic Explanation: Action, Space, Interpretation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Ch.III, §§2, 3.

#### *On physicalism and subjectivity*

A central objection to physicalism of any form is whether it can account for the subjective nature of experience.

Nagel, T. 1974. 'What is it like to be a Bat?', *Philosophical Review* 83: 435-50. Reprinted in T. Nagel. *Mortal Questions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.

Jackson, F. 1982. 'Epiphenomenal Qualia', *Philosophical Quarterly* 32: 127-36. Reprinted in MC.

— 1986. 'What Mary didn't Know', *Journal of Philosophy* 83: 291-5. Reprinted in NM.

Lewis, D. 'What Experience Teaches', in MC.

Jackson, F. 'Postscript', in P.K. Moser and J.D. Trout, eds. 1995. *Contemporary Materialism: a Reader*. London: Routledge.

See also Consciousness, below (section C.i).

#### *On supervenience*

There are various versions of the claim that the mental supervenes on the physical ('no mental difference without a physical difference'). Supervenience is often claimed to be the most non-committal form of physicalism.

Kim, J. 1983. 'Concepts of Supervenience', *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 45: 153-76. Reprinted in J. Kim, *Supervenience and Mind: Selected Philosophical Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Charles, D. 1992. 'Supervenience, Composition and Physicalism', in D. Charles and K. Lennon, eds. *Reduction, Explanation and Realism*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Papineau, D. 1990. 'Why Supervenience?', *Analysis* 50: 66-71.

Horgan, T. 1993. 'From Supervenience to Superdupervenience: Meeting the Demands of the Material World', *Mind* 102: 555-86.

Jackson, F. 1998. *From Metaphysics to Ethics: a Defence of Conceptual Analysis*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Ch. 1

Kim, J. 1998. *Mind in a Physical World*. Chs. 1 & 4.

See Logic & Metaphysics for further reading.

### *Eliminative materialism*

Eliminative materialists claim that the commonsense theory we use to attribute mental states to others is false, and that therefore the entities it talks about do not exist.

Feyerabend, P.K. 1963. 'Mental Events and the Brain', *Journal of Philosophy* 60: 295-6. Reprinted in MC and in NM.

Churchland, P.M. 1981. 'Eliminative Materialism and the Propositional Attitudes', *Journal of Philosophy* 78: 67-90. Reprinted in MC.

Quine, W.V. 1966. 'On Mental Entities', in *The Ways of Paradox and Other Essays*. New York: Random House.

Horgan, T., and J. Woodward. 1985. 'Folk Psychology is Here to Stay', *Philosophical Review* 94: 197-226. Reprinted in MC.

Stich, S. 1996. *Deconstructing the Mind*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Ch. 1.

### *On the issue of physicalism in general*

What is the problem to which physicalism is supposed to be a solution? Is the issue of physicalism clearly formulated?

Snowdon, P. 1989. 'On Formulating Materialism and Dualism', in J. Heil, ed., *Cause, Mind and Reality: essays honoring C.B. Martin*. Dordrecht; Boston: Kluwer Academic.

Stroud, B. 1986-87. 'The Physical World', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 87: 263-277.

Wilson, M. 1985. 'What is This Thing Called "Pain"?'', *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly* 66: 227-67. A difficult paper.

Crane, T., and D.H. Mellor. 1990. 'There is No Question of Physicalism', *Mind* 99: 185-206. Reprinted in D.H. Mellor, *Matters of Metaphysics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989; and in P. Moser and J.D. Trout, eds., *Contemporary Materialism*.

Blackburn, S. 1993. 'Losing Your Mind', in *Essays in Quasi-Realism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Pettit, P. 1993. 'A Definition of Physicalism', *Analysis* 53: 213-23.

Papineau, D. 2000. 'The Rise of Physicalism', in M.W.F. Stone & J. Wolff, eds., *The Proper Ambition of Science*. London: Routledge.

### *ii. Dualism*

Traditionally dualists have claimed that mental substances are distinct from physical or material substances. Some philosophers also talk about property dualism.

Foster, J. 1996. *The Immaterial Self: a Defence of the Cartesian Dualist Conception of the Mind*. London: Routledge.

Hart, W.D. 1988. *Engines of the Soul*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chs.1-3.

Strawson, P.F. 1974. 'Self, Mind & Body', in *Freedom & Resentment and other essays*. London: Methuen.

Shoemaker, S. 1983. 'On an Argument for Dualism', in C. Ginet, and S. Shoemaker, eds., *Knowledge and Mind: Philosophical Essays*. New York: Oxford University Press. Reprinted in S. Shoemaker, *Identity, Cause & Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.

Bealer, G. 1994. 'Mental Properties', in *Journal of Philosophy* 53: 213-23.

See Logic & Metaphysics for further reading.

### *iii. Functionalism*

Functionalism is the view that mental states (types/properties) are individuated by their causal roles: that is their characteristic patterns of relations to their inputs (e.g. perceptions), their outputs (e.g. actions) and other mental states. There are various kinds of functionalism: for example, some versions of functionalism take the position to be recommended by common sense (Lewis), others as its being a product of scientific psychology. Functionalists also differ about whether mental states are to be seen as identical with functional states or rather with what realises such states.

Block, N. 'What is Functionalism?', in PP Vol.I.

Putnam, H. 1979. 'The Nature of Mental States', in *Mind Language and Reality: Philosophical Papers*, Vol.2. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in PP and MC.

Lewis, D. 1972. 'Psychophysical and Theoretical Identification', *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 50: 249-58. Reprinted in PP Vol.I, and NM.

———. 1999. 'Reduction of Mind', in *Papers in Metaphysics and Epistemology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University

Press; reprinted in S. Guttenplan, ed., *A Companion to the Philosophy of Mind*.  
Shoemaker, S. 1981. 'Some Varieties of Functionalism', *Philosophical Topics* 12: 83-118; reprinted in his *Identity, Cause and Mind*.

One of the main threats facing functionalism is whether it can account for the qualitative character of mental states.

Block, N. 'Troubles with Functionalism', in PP and MC.

Shoemaker, S. 1975. 'Functionalism and Qualia', *Philosophical Studies* 27: 291-315; reprinted in his *Identity, Cause and Mind*, PP and NM.

Lewis, D. 1983. 'Mad Pain and Martian Pain', in *Philosophical Papers*, Vol.I. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Reprinted in PP and NM.

Zuboff, A. 1995. 'What is a Mind?', in P.A. French, T.E. Uehling, Jr., and H.K. Wettstein, eds., *Philosophical Naturalism*. Midwest Studies in Philosophy 19. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press.

#### *iv. Causal theories of mind*

Many accounts of the mind treat mental concepts as causal concepts. There is a common pattern in the arguments offered in the case of each mental phenomenon, and a common problem of 'deviant causal chains'.

Davidson, D. 1980. 'Actions, Reasons and Causes', in *Essays on Actions and Events*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Grice, H.P. 1961. 'The Causal Theory of Perception', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume* 35: 121-52. Abridged in J. Dancy, ed. *Perceptual Knowledge*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.

Martin, C.B., and M. Deutscher. 1966. 'Remembering', *Philosophical Review* 75: 161-96.

Owens, D. 1992. *Causes and Coincidences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Ch.7.

Peacocke, C. 1979. *Holistic Explanation*, Ch.2.

Armstrong, D. 1980. 'The Causal Theory of Mind', in *The Nature of Mind and Other Essays*. Brighton: Harvester. Reprinted in MC.

#### *v. Mental causation*

Do states of mind have effects in the physical world? If so, how is this compatible with a physicalist or a naturalistic world view? Some see this as a special problem for Davidson's Anomalous Monism; others see a problem for physicalism in general.

Honderich, T. 1982. 'The Argument for Anomalous Monism', *Analysis* 16: 59-64.

Davidson, D. 1993. 'Thinking Causes', in J. Heil and A. Mele, eds., *Mental Causation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Kim, J. 1984. 'Epiphenomenal and Supervenient Causation', reprinted in his *Supervenience and Mind: Selected Philosophical Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993; and in NM.

Yablo, S. 1992. 'Mental Causation', *Philosophical Review* 101: 245-80.

Crane, T. 1995. 'The Mental Causation Debate', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume* 69: 211-36.

Kim, J. 1998. *Mind in a Physical World*, Chs. 2 & 3.

## **B. EPISTEMOLOGY OF MIND**

### *i. The Problem of Other Minds*

Do we know that others have minds as we do? Can we know how alike the minds of others are to us? Traditionally this has been conceived as a sceptical problem about our knowledge of minds, or even our ability to conceive of there being minds other than our own. This topic has now become one of more specific interest within developmental psychology, with the question: how and when we do acquire or apply mental concepts? For this topic see the section immediately below.

Ayer, A.J. 1954. 'The Problem of Other Minds', in *Philosophical Essays*. London: Macmillan.

Putnam, H. 1979. 'Other Minds', reprinted in *Mind, Language & Reality*.

Carruthers, P. 1986. *Introducing Persons: Theories and Arguments in the Philosophy of Mind*. London: Croom Helm. Ch.1.

Austin, J.L. 1970. 'Other Minds', in J.O. Urmson and G.J. Warnock, eds. *Philosophical Papers of J. L. Austin*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Investigations*, translated by G.E.M. Anscombe. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Oxford: Blackwell, 1972. Pt.I, secs. 243-315, Pt.II, iv.

Nagel, T. 1986. *The View from Nowhere*. New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press. Ch.II.

Kripke, S. 1982. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language: an Elementary Exposition*. Oxford: Blackwell. Appendix.

### *ii. Theory versus simulation*

What is it to attribute mental states to others? Some philosophers say that it is a matter of applying a theory,

commonsense or 'folk' psychology. (This is sometimes known as the 'theory theory'.) Others say that it is a matter of a kind of imaginative projection into others' minds, which they call 'simulation' or 'replication'. A simple introduction to the issue can be found in T. Crane. 1995. *The Mechanical Mind: a Philosophical Introduction to Minds, Machines and Mental Representation*. London: Penguin. Ch.2.

For the 'theory theory'

Sellars, W. 1997. *Empiricism and the Philosophy of Mind*, with an introduction by Richard Rorty, and a study guide by Robert Brandom. Cambridge, Mass.; London: Harvard University Press. Originally published in H. Feigl and M. Scriven, eds., *Minnesota Studies in the Philosophy of Science*, vol. 1. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1956. Reprinted W. Sellars, *Science, Perception and Reality*. New York: Humanities Press, 1963. Difficult, but influential starting point of the debate.

Rorty, R. 1980. *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature*. Oxford: Blackwell. Ch.2, easier summary and discussion of Sellars; an abridged version is in NM.

Churchland, P. 1991. 'Folk Psychology and the Explanation of Human Behaviour', in J. Greenwood, ed., *The Future of Folk Psychology: Intentionality and Cognitive Science*. Cambridge University Press.

Dennett, D. 1971. 'Intentional Systems', *Journal of Philosophy* 68: 87-106. Reprinted in *Brainstorms: Philosophical Essays on Mind and Psychology*. London: Penguin, 1977.

———. 1975. 'True Believers: the Intentional Strategy and Why it Works', reprinted in his *The Intentional Stance*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1987; and in MC and NM.

The simulation approach is defended by

Gordon, R.M. 1986. 'Folk Psychology as Simulation', *Mind and Language* 1: 158-71.

Heal, Jane. 1986. 'Replication and Functionalism', in J. Butterfield, ed., *Language, Mind and Logic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in M. Davies and T. Stone, eds., *Folk Psychology: the Theory of Mind Debate*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1995.

See also

*Mind and Language*, special issue 1992: Mental Simulation, reprinted in modified form in the following two volumes: Davies, M., and T. Stone, eds., 1995. *Folk Psychology: the Theory of Mind Debate*.

———, 1995. *Mental Simulation: Evaluations and Applications*. Oxford: Blackwell. These contain important papers both by philosophers and psychologists.

Peacocke, C. ed. 1996. *Objectivity, Simulation and the Unity of Consciousness: Current Issues in the Philosophy of Mind*. Proceedings of the British Academy 83 (1994). Oxford: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press. See the essays by J. Heal and M. Davies.

Smith, P., and P. Carruthers, eds. 1996. *Theories of Theories of Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. This too is an interdisciplinary volume, with contributions by both philosophers and psychologists.

### iii. Introspection and First Person Authority.

How do we know what we think? What is it to introspect our own mental states? Do we have some form of special inner observation, do we infer it from our own behaviour, or is there no special way of knowing at all? We seem to have a kind of authority ('first person authority') about the contents of our own minds. What is this authority? (See also the entry under externalism and self-knowledge below.)

Cassam, Q. ed. 1994. *Self Knowledge*. Oxford Readings in Philosophy. Oxford: Oxford University Press. This is an excellent anthology which contains most of the essential reading.

Descartes, R. *Meditations*. Second meditation.

Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Investigations*, translated by G.E.M. Anscombe. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Oxford: Blackwell, 1972. §§243-308, §§412-427.

Budd, M. 1989. *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology*, London: Routledge. Introduction and Ch.3.

Heal, J. 1994. 'Moore's Paradox: a Wittgensteinian Approach', *Mind* 103: 5-24.

Ryle, G. 'Self-Knowledge', in Cassam.

Armstrong, D.M. 1968. *A Materialist Theory of the Mind*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul. Ch.15. Reprinted in Cassam.

Shoemaker, S. 1986. 'Introspection and the Self', in P.A. French, T.E. Uehling, Jr., and H.K. Wettstein, eds. *Studies in the Philosophy of Mind*. Midwest Studies in Philosophy 10. Reprinted in his *First Person Perspective and Other Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996; and in Cassam.

———. 1989. 'First-Person Access', in Tomberlin, ed., *Philosophy of Mind and Action Theory*. Philosophical Perspectives 3. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview. Reprinted in his *First Person Perspective and Other Essays*.

Davidson, D. 1984 'First-Person Authority', in *Dialectica* 38: 101-12.

———. 1987. 'Knowing One's Own Mind', *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association* 60: 441-58. Reprinted in Cassam.

Burge, Tyler. 1988. 'Individualism and Self Knowledge', *Journal of Philosophy* 85: 649-63. Reprinted in Cassam.

Evans, G. 1982. *The Varieties of Reference*. J. McDowell., ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press. See pp.205-233, reprinted in Cassam.

Peacocke, C. 1992. *A Study of Concepts*, Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.6.

Burge, Tyler. 1996. 'Our Entitlement to Self-Knowledge', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 96: 91-116.  
Also have a look at Peacocke, Burge and Davies in C. Macdonald, B. Smith, C. Wright, eds., *On Knowing Our Own Minds*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.

## C. MENTAL PHENOMENA

### *i. Consciousness and experience*

Consciousness has traditionally been considered the mark of the mental. But what exactly is consciousness? Is there a univocal notion of consciousness, or is the notion of consciousness applied to experience different from the notion applied to thought? Can there be a unified theory of consciousness? Some doubt whether there can be a theory of consciousness at all, on account of its ineffability. A good general collection is *The Nature of Consciousness: Philosophical Debates*, eds., N. Block, O. Flanagan & G. Güzeldere. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1997.

#### *The conscious and the unconscious*

What is the link between consciousness and mentality? How should consciousness in general be understood? How should we understand the notion of an unconscious mental state?

Gardner, S. 1991. 'The Unconscious', in J. Neu, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Freud*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rosenthal, D. 1986. 'Two Concepts of Consciousness', *Philosophical Studies* 94: 329-59. Reprinted in NM.

Mellor, D.H. 1991. 'Consciousness and Degrees of Belief', in *Matters of Metaphysics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Davies, M., and G. Humphreys, eds. 1993. *Consciousness: Psychological and Philosophical Essays*. Oxford: Blackwell. Introduction.

Searle, J. 1992. *The Rediscovery of the Mind*, Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.7.

Dennett, D. 1978. 'Towards a Cognitive Theory of Consciousness', in his *Brainstorms*. London: Penguin.

#### *Phenomenal consciousness and qualia*

Some argue that consciousness involves being aware of ineffable, non-intentional properties, known as 'qualia'. Others doubt whether there are such properties. (See also Physicalism/Materialism, above.)

Shoemaker, S. 1990. 'Qualities and Qualia: What's in the Mind?', *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 50 (Supplement): 109-31. Reprinted in Shoemaker, *The First-Person Perspective and Other Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

———. 1991. 'Qualia and Consciousness', *Mind* 100: 507-24. Reprinted in Shoemaker, *The First-Person Perspective and Other Essays*.

Harman, G. 1990. 'The Intrinsic Quality of Experience', J. Tomberlin, ed., *Action Theory and Philosophy of Mind*. Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 4. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview.

Davies, M., and G. Humphreys, eds. 1993. *Consciousness: Psychological and Philosophical Essays*. Oxford: Blackwell. Introduction.

Dennett, D. 1988. 'Quining Qualia' in A. Marcel, and E. Bisiach, eds., *Consciousness and Contemporary Science*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Reprinted in MC.

See also

Peacocke, C. 1983. *Sense & Content: Experience, Thought and their Relations*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Ch.1.

O'Shaughnessy, B. 2000. *Consciousness and the World*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Pts. I & II.

Dretske, F. 1995. *Naturalizing the Mind*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.3.

Tye, M. 1995. *Ten Problems of Consciousness: a Representational Theory of the Phenomenal Mind*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.1.

Chalmers, D. 1996. *The Conscious Mind: in Search of a Fundamental Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

#### *Bodily sensations*

What is it to be aware of the states of one's own body? Is bodily awareness simply a kind of perception?

Armstrong, D.M. 1968. *A Materialist Theory of the Mind*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul. Ch.14.

O'Shaughnessy, Brian. 1980. *The Will: a Dual Aspect Theory*. Vol.I. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Ch.5.

———. 2000. *Consciousness and the World*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Pt. IV.

Wittgenstein, L. *The Blue and Brown Books*. (Preliminary studies for the Philosophical investigations: generally known as the blue and brown books.) Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1958. pp.48-57.

———, *Philosophical Investigations*, translated by G.E.M. Anscombe. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Oxford: Blackwell, 1972. §§243-315.

Anscombe, G.E.M. 1962. 'On Sensations of Position', *Analysis* 22: 55-8. Reprinted in *The Collected Philosophical Papers of G.E.M. Anscombe*, Vol. II: *Metaphysics & the Philosophy of Mind*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1981.

#### *Perceptual content*

Many contemporary writers claim that experiences involve intentional content in something like the way beliefs and other intentional states do (see Intentionality, below). If this is so, then how should perception be distinguished from belief?

Searle, J.R. 1983. *Intentionality: an Essay in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Ch.2.

- Harman, G. 1990. 'The Intrinsic Quality of Experience', in *Philosophical Perspectives*, 4: 31-52; and in *Reasoning, Meaning and Mind*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999.
- Burge, Tyler. 1991. 'Vision and Intentional Content', in E. Lepore and R. van Gulick, eds., *John Searle and his Critics*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Peacocke, C. 1983. *Sense and Content*, Oxford: Clarendon Press. Ch.1.
- See also
- Peacocke, C. 1992. *A Study of Concepts*, Ch.3.
- McDowell, J. 1982. 'Criteria, Defeasibility and Knowledge', *Proceedings of the British Academy* 68: 455-79. Reprinted in J. McDowell, *Meaning, Knowledge, and Reality*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998. Reprinted and abridged in J. Dancy, ed., *Perceptual Knowledge*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- . 1994. *Mind and World*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Chs.1-3, 6, Appendices 1 & 2.

### *Imagery*

What is it to form a mental image of something? Some claim that images have the structure of pictures, others that they are structured like sentences. What does this distinction amount to? How does it relate to the phenomenology of mental imagery?

For some classic readings, see the relevant section of PP Vol. II. See also

- Dennett, D. 1978. 'Two Approaches to Mental Images', in *Brainstorms*. London: Penguin.
- Tye, M. 1991. *The Imagery Debate*, Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Chs.1, 3, 5 & 6.
- Ishiguro, H. 1966. 'Imagination', in B.A.O. Williams and A. Montefiore, eds, *British Analytical Philosophy*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Williams, B.A.O. 1966. 'Imagination and the Self', reprinted in his *Problems of the Self: Philosophical Papers 1956-1972*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1973.
- Peacocke, C. 1985. 'Imagination, Experience and Possibility', in J. Foster, and H. Robinson, eds., *Essays on Berkeley: a Tercentennial Celebration*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Block, N. 'Mental Pictures and Cognitive Science', in MC.
- Sterelny, K. 'The Imagery Debate', in MC.
- Eilan, N. 1993. 'Review of Tye, The Imagery Debate,' *Philosophical Books*.
- Akins, K. 1994. 'Review of Tye, The Imagery Debate,' *Philosophical Review*.
- Kosslyn, S. 1995. 'Mental Imagery', in S. Kosslyn, and D. Osherson, eds., *Visual Cognition*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. A brief introduction to the psychological debate.
- , 1994. *Image and Brain: the Resolution of the Imagery Debate*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. A more detailed account of his approach.

### *ii. Intentionality*

Many mental states, like beliefs, desires and hopes, are 'directed' upon, or about, things in the world. 'Intentionality' is a technical term for the directedness or 'aboutness' of these states of mind. There are many problems which such 'intentional states' pose for philosophy of mind.

#### *The nature of intentionality*

Are all mental phenomena intentional? Is intentionality the 'mark' of the mental? How should intentionality be characterised? Is it a relation? But one can think about something that does not exist, so to what is one related in this case? What is the relation between intentionality and the logical notion of intentionality?

- Crane, T. 1995. *The Mechanical Mind: a Philosophical Introduction to Minds, Machines and Mental Representation*. London: Penguin. Ch.1.
- Stalnaker, R. 1984. *Inquiry*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Chs.1 and 2.
- Searle, J.R. 1983. *Intentionality: an Essay in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Ch.1.
- Anscombe, G.E.M. 1981. 'The Intentionality of Sensation: a Grammatical Feature', in *The Collected Philosophical Papers of G.E.M. Anscombe*, Vol. II: *Metaphysics & the Philosophy of Mind*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Haugeland, J. 1990. 'The Intentionality All-Stars', in J. Tomberlin, ed., *Action Theory and Philosophy of Mind*. Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 4. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview.
- Chisholm, R.M. 1961 *Perceiving: A Philosophical Study*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press. Ch.11, reprinted in NM.
- Mackie, J.L. 1975. 'Problems of Intentionality', in E. Pivcevic, ed., *Phenomenology and Philosophical Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in Mackie, *Logic & Knowledge: Selected Papers*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985.
- Crane, T. 1998. 'Intentionality as the mark of the mental', in A. O'Hear, ed., *Current Issues in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

#### *Intentionality and propositional attitudes*

Many intentional states are usefully characterised as attitudes to propositions. Can all intentionality be characterised in this way? (See Emotion, below) Can the different types of attitude be distinguished in terms of 'direction of fit'?

- Russell, B. 1912. *Problems of Philosophy*, Oxford: Oxford University Press. Ch.5.
- Fodor, J. 1978. 'Propositional Attitudes', *The Monist* 61: 501-23. Reprinted in his *Representations: Philosophical Essays on the Foundations of Cognitive Science*. Brighton: Harvester Press, 1981, and in NM.
- Dennett, D. 1982. 'Beyond Belief', in A. Woodfield, ed., *Thought and Object: Essays on Intentionality*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, and reprinted in his *The Intentional Stance*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1987.
- Anscombe, G.E.M. 1976. *Intention*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Basil Blackwell. §2.
- Humberstone, I.L. 1992. 'Direction of Fit', *Mind* 101: 59-83.

#### *The reduction of intentionality*

Many physicalists think that intentionality must be explained in wholly non-intentional and non-mental terms. A central problem for these explanations is how to account for misrepresentation.

Stich, S., and T. Warfield, eds. 1994. *Mental Representation: a Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell. A very useful collection, which contains examples of all the reductive theories of intentional content.

Crane, T. 1995. *The Mechanical Mind*, London: Penguin. Ch.5, an elementary introduction.

Fodor, J. 1987. *Psychosemantics: the Problem of Meaning in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge, Mass.:MIT Press. Ch.4.

Dretske, F. 1980. 'The Intentionality of Cognitive States', in P. French, T. Uehling, and H. Wettstein, eds., *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, vol. 5. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. Reprinted in NM.

———. 1986. 'Misrepresentation', in R. Bogdan, ed., *Belief: Form, Content, and Function*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Papineau, D. 1993. *Philosophical Naturalism*, Oxford: Blackwell. Ch.3.

Millikan, R. 'Thoughts Without Laws', and 'Biosemantics', reprinted in her *White Queen Psychology and Other Essays for Alice*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1993.

Cummins, R. 1989. *Meaning and Mental Representation*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.8 gives Cummins's own view; the rest of the book is a useful survey of other views.

#### *The language of thought*

See chapter on Philosophy of Psychology.

#### *Internalism/Externalism*

How do a thinker's intentional states depend on the social and physical environment of the thinker? Externalists claim that there is a necessary or constitutive dependence of thoughts upon environment; internalists deny this.

Three useful collections of papers are

Pessin, A., and S. Goldberg, eds. 1996. *The Twin Earth Chronicles: Twenty Years of Reflection on Hilary Putnam's "The meaning of 'meaning'"*. Armonk, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe. Contains most of the classic papers on the subject, and some more recent work.

McDowell, J., and P. Pettit, eds. 1986. *Subject, Thought and Context*, Oxford: Clarendon Press. The Introduction is particularly useful.

Woodfield, A. ed. 1982. *Thought and Object*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

#### Basic Reading

Putnam, H 1975. 'The Meaning of "Meaning"', reprinted in his *Philosophical papers, Vol.2: Mind Language and Reality*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979; OR 'Meaning and Reference', *Journal of Philosophy*, 1973, 70: 699-711, reprinted in S.P. Schwarz, ed., *Naming, Necessity, and Natural Kinds*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1977.

Burge, Tyler. 1979. 'Individualism and the Mental', in P. French, T. Uehling, and H. Wettstein, eds., *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, vol. 4. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. Reprinted in NM.

Fodor, J. 1987. *Psychosemantics: the Problem of Meaning in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge, Mass.:MIT Press. Ch.2.

Stalnaker, R. 1989. 'On What's In the Head', in J. Tomberlin, ed., *Philosophy of Mind and Action Theory*.

Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 3. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview. Reprinted in NM.

#### Further Reading

McCulloch, G. 1995. *The Mind and Its World*. London: Routledge. Pt.II.

Boghossian, P. 1994. 'The Transparency of Mental Content', in J. Tomberlin, ed., *Logic and Language*. Philosophical Perspectives, vol. 8. Atascadero, Calif.: Ridgeview.

McGinn, C. 1989. *Mental Content*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell. Ch.1.

#### *Object-dependent thought*

One variety of externalism holds that certain thoughts cannot be had unless the objects they concern actually exist. Internalists object that this thesis leaves unexplained certain features of the role of thought in the explanation of action.

Evans, G. 1982. *The Varieties of Reference*. J. McDowell., ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Chs.1-6.

McDowell, J. 1986. 'Singular Thought and the Extent of Inner Space', in J. McDowell, and P. Pettit, eds., *Subject, Thought and Context*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Reprinted in J. McDowell, *Meaning, Knowledge, and Reality*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998.



- Segal, G. 1990. 'The Return of the Individual', *Mind* 98: 39-57.
- Noonan, H. 1986. 'Russellian Thoughts and Methodological Solipsism', in J. Butterfield, ed., *Language, Mind and Logic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burge, Tyler. 1983. 'Russell's Problem & Intentional Identity', in J. Tomberlin, ed., *Agent, Language & the Structure of the World: Essays Presented to Hector-Neri Castañeda, with his Replies*. Indianapolis: Hackett.
- Blackburn, S. 1984. *Spreading the Word: Groundings in the Philosophy of Language*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Ch. 9.
- Externalism and self-knowledge*
- If a thinker's states of mind constitutively depend on facts in their environment, how can thinkers have any epistemic authority over what they are thinking?
- Davidson, D. 1987. 'Knowing One's Own Mind', *Proceedings and Addresses of the American Philosophical Association* 60: 441-58. Reprinted in Q. Cassam., ed., *Self-Knowledge*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Burge, Tyler. 1988. 'Individualism and Self Knowledge', *Journal of Philosophy* 85: 649-663; reprinted in Cassam, ed., *Self-Knowledge*.
- McKinsey, M. 1991. 'Anti-Individualism and Privileged Access', *Analysis* 51: 9-16.
- Brueckner, A. 1992. 'What an Anti-Individualist Knows A Priori', *Analysis* 52: 111-18.
- Boghossian, P. 'What the Externalist Can Know A Priori', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 97: 161-175.
- See also the essays in P. Ludlow, and N. Martin, eds., 1998, *Externalism & Self-Knowledge*. Stanford, Calif.: CSLI Publications.

### iii. Emotion

How should a theory of mind explain emotions? Are they akin to cognitive states, like beliefs? What is the relation between kinds of emotion and the feelings or sensations associated with them? Should we appeal to psychoanalytic or psychological theories of the mind to explain emotion?

- Sartre, J-P. *Sketch for a Theory of the Emotions* (Esquisse d'une théorie des émotions), translated by Philip Mairet; with a preface by Mary Warnock. London: Methuen, 1962.
- Budd, M. 1985. *Music and the Emotions: the Philosophical Theories*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul. Ch.1.
- Greenspan, P. 1988. *Emotion and Reasons: an Inquiry into Emotional Justification*. London: Routledge. Chs.1, 5 & 6.
- Robinson, J. 1995. 'Startle', *Journal of Philosophy* 92: 53-74.
- Gordon, R. 1990. *The Structure of Emotion: Investigations in Cognitive Philosophy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- . 1980. 'Fear', *Philosophical Review* 89: 560-78.
- Walton, K. 1978. 'Fearing Fictions', *Journal of Philosophy* 75: 5-27.
- Goldie, P. 2000. *Emotions: A Philosophical Exploration*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Oatley, K. & J. Jenkins. 1995. *Understanding Emotions*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Frijda, N. 1987. *The Emotions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wollheim, R. 1999. *On the Emotions*. London: Yale University Press.
- Griffiths, P. 1997. *What Emotions Really Are*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

### iv. Action and intention

There are three main groups of issues in the study of action. The first is whether actions are caused by the mental states which rationalise them. The second is about the relation between trying and acting. The third is about the special relations which agents bear to their own actions. Intention, a closely related topic, is also a subject of interest in its own right. A useful collection here is A. Mele, ed., *The Philosophy of Action*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.

#### Causation and action

- Davidson, D. 'Actions, Reasons and Causes', and 'Agency', reprinted in his *Essays on Actions and Events*, and in A. Mele, ed., *The Philosophy of Action*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Melden, A.I. 1961. *Free Action*. Routledge & Kegan Paul. Chs.3-5.
- Anscombe, G.E.M. 1983. 'The Causation of Behaviour', in C. Ginet, and S. Shoemaker, eds., *Knowledge and Mind: Philosophical Essays in honour of Norman Malcolm*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Ginet, C. 1990. *On Action*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

#### Agency

Is human action to be characterised, like animal action, as a product of motivations? Or is it to be explained in terms of a distinctive practical rationality? Does human action need to appeal to a special kind of causation, agent-causation, in order to accommodate free will or the special role of their agent in their actions?

- Chisholm, R.M. 1975. 'The Agent as Cause', in M. Brand, and D. Walton eds., *Action Theory*. Dordrecht: Reidel.
- Davidson, D. 'Agency', reprinted in his *Essays on Actions and Events*.
- Frankfurt, H. 1988. 'The Problem of Action', in his *The Importance of What We Care About: Philosophical Essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pink, T. 1996-7. 'Reason and Agency', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 97: 263-80.

- Velleman, J. David. 1992. 'What Happens When Someone Acts?', *Mind* 101: 461-81.
- O'Shaughnessy, Brian. 1980. *The Will: a Dual Aspect Theory*. Vol.I. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Pt.I.
- The ontology of action*
- What are the relations between trying and action, and the bodily movements it involves? Is bodily movement essential to action?
- Davis, L. 1979. *The Theory of Action*. Englewood Cliffs; London: Prentice-Hall. Chs.1-2.
- McGinn, C. 1991. *The Character of Mind: an Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. (Originally published 1982.). Ch.3.
- Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Investigations*, translated by G.E.M. Anscombe. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Oxford: Blackwell, 1972. Secs. 611-32.
- Anscombe, G.E.M. 1976. *Intention*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Basil Blackwell. See esp. secs. 1-16; and 'Intention', in *The Collected Philosophical Papers of G.E.M. Anscombe*, Vol. II: *Metaphysics & the Philosophy of Mind*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1981.
- Danto, A. 1965. 'Basic Actions', *American Philosophical Quarterly* 2: 141-48.
- O'Shaughnessy, B. 1974. 'Trying (as the Mental Pineal Gland)', *Journal of Philosophy* 70: 365-86.
- Hornsby, J. 1980. *Actions*, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul. Chs.1-4.
- Smith, M. 1983 'Actions, Attempts & Internal Events', in *Analysis* 43: 142-46.
- Goldman, A. 1971. 'The Individuation of an Action', *Journal of Philosophy* 68: 761-74.
- Davidson, D. 'Agency', in his *Essays on Actions and Events*.

### *Intention*

Are intentions a distinctive kind of mental state, or can they be fully explained in terms of beliefs and desires?

- Bratman, M. 1987. *Intention, Plans and Practical Reason*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Chs.1-3, 8 & 9.

Davidson, D. 'Intending', in *Essays on Actions and Events*.

Harman, G. 1986. *Change in View: Principles of Reasoning*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press. Ch.8.

Charles, D. 1989. 'Intention', in J. Heil, ed., *Cause, Mind and Reality: Essays honoring C.B. Martin*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic.

Pink, T. 1991 'Purposive Intending', *Mind*, 99:343-359.

———. 1996. *The Psychology of Freedom*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

### *v. Irrationality: self-deception and weakness of will*

The phenomenon of self-deception seems common enough. Yet surely I must know something in order to hide it from someone. How then can I hide it from or deceive myself? Connected to this is the problem of weakness of will (or akrasia): how is it possible that I rightly take my reasons for action to favour one course of action but chose another?

Freud, S. *Introductory Lectures in Psychoanalysis* (Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die Psychoanalyse), translated by James Strachey. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1974. Lectures 16-19

Davidson, D. 1985. 'Deception and Division', in E. Lepore, and B. McLaughlin, eds., *Actions and Events: Perspectives on the Philosophy of Donald Davidson*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Davidson, D. 1982. 'Paradoxes of Irrationality', in R. Wollheim, and J. Hopkins, eds., *Philosophical Essays on Freud*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Johnston, M. 1988. 'Self-Deception and the Nature of the Mind', in B. McLaughlin, and A.O. Rorty, eds., *Perspectives on Self-Deception*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Davidson, D. 'How is Weakness of the Will Possible?', in his *Essays on Actions and Events*.

Watson, G. 1977. 'Scepticism about Weakness of the Will', *Philosophical Review* 86: 316-39.

Thalberg, I. 1985. 'Questions about Motivational Strength', in E. Lepore, and B. McLaughlin, eds., *Actions and Events*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Pears, D. 1984. *Motivated Irrationality*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Mele, A. 1987. *Irrationality*. New York: Oxford University Press.

See also

Entries under Mind and Nature in Logic & Metaphysics; Perception and Memory in Epistemology & Methodology; and the entries under Cognitive Psychology and Philosophy of Psychoanalysis in Philosophy of Psychology.